Police Innovation

Over the last three decades American policing has gone through a period of significant change and innovation. In what is a relatively short historical time frame the police began to reconsider their fundamental mission, the nature of the core strategies of policing, and the character of their relationships with the communities that they serve. This volume brings together leading police scholars to examine eight major innovations which emerged during this period: community policing, broken windows policing, problem oriented policing, pulling levers policing, third party policing, hot spots policing, Compstat and evidence-based policing. Including advocates and critics of each of the eight police innovations, this comprehensive book assesses the evidence on impacts of police innovation on crime and public safety, the extent of the implementation of these new approaches in police departments, and the dilemmas these approaches have created for police management. This book will appeal to students, scholars and researchers.

DAVID WEISBURD is Walter E. Mayer Professor of Law and Criminal Justice at the Hebrew University Law School in Jerusalem, and Professor of Criminology and Criminal Justice at the University of Maryland, College Park. He is the author or editor of eleven books and more than sixty scientific articles that cover a wide range of criminal justice topics.

ANTHONY A. BRAGA is Senior Research Associate in the Program in Criminal Justice Policy and Management at Harvard University’s John F. Kennedy School of Government. His research focuses on working with criminal justice agencies to develop crime prevention strategies to deal with gang violence, illegal firearms markets, and violent crime hot spots.
Cambridge Studies in Criminology

Edited by
Alfred Blumstein, H. John Heinz School of Public Policy and Management, Carnegie Mellon University
David P. Farrington, Institute of Criminology, University of Cambridge

The Cambridge Studies in Criminology series aims to publish the highest quality research on criminology and criminal justice topics. Typical volumes report major quantitative, qualitative, and ethnographic research, or make a substantial theoretical contribution. There is a particular emphasis on research monographs, but edited collections may also be published if they make an unusually distinctive offering to the literature. All relevant areas of criminology and criminal justice are included; for example, the causes of offending, juvenile justice, the development of offenders, measurement and analysis of crime, victimization research, policing, crime prevention, sentencing, imprisonment, probation, and parole. The series is global in outlook, with an emphasis on work that is comparative or holds significant implications for theory or policy.

Other books in the series

Life in the Gang: Family, Friends, and Violence, by Scott H. Decker and Barrik Van Winkle
Delinquency and Crime: Current Theories, edited by J. David Hawkins
Recriminalizing Delinquency: Violent Juvenile Crime and Juvenile Justice Reform, by Simon I. Singer
Mean Streets: Youth Crime and Homelessness, by John Hagan and Bill McCarthy
The Framework of Judicial Sentencing: A Study in Legal Decision Making, by Austin Lovegrove
The Criminal Recidivism Process, by Edward Zamble and Vernon L. Quinsey
Violence and Childbirth in the Inner City, by Joan Cord
Schools and Delinquency, by Denise C. Gottfredson
The Crime Drop in America, edited by Alfred Blumstein and Joel Wallman
Delinquent-Prone Communities, by Don Weatherburn and Bronwyn Lind
White-Collar Crime and Criminal Careers, by David Weisburd and Elin Waring, with Ellen F. Chayet
Sex Differences in Antisocial Behaviour: Conduct Disorder, Delinquency, and Violence in the Dunedin Longitudinal Study, by Terrie Moffitt, Avshalom Caspi, Michael Rutter, and Phil A. Silva
Delinquent Networks: Youth Co-Offending in Stockholm, by Jerzy Sarnecki
Criminality and Violence among the Mentally Disordered: The Stockholm Metropolitan Project, by Shelagh Hodgins and Carl-Gunnar Janson
David Weisburd: For Ariel Yehuda, who achieves whatever he sets his mind to, yet always finds time for the needs of others.

Anthony A. Braga: To Cassie, my friend and companion
## Contents

| List of figures | page xii |
| List of tables | xiii |
| Notes on contributors | xiv |
| 1 Introduction: understanding police innovation | 1 |
| **DAVID WEISBURD AND ANTHONY A. BRAGA** |

### Part I Community policing

| Advocate | The promise of community policing | 27 |
| **WESLEY G. SKOGAN** |

| Critic | Community policing: a skeptical view | 44 |
| **STEPHEN MASTROFSKI** |

### Part II Broken windows policing

| Advocate | Of “broken windows,” criminology, and criminal justice | 77 |
| **WILLIAM H. SOUSA AND GEORGE L. KELLING** |

| Critic | Incivilities reduction policing, zero tolerance, and the retreat from coproduction: weak foundations and strong pressures | 98 |
| **RALPH B. TAYLOR** |
Part III  Problem-oriented policing

6 Advocate
Science, values, and problem-oriented policing: why problem-oriented policing?

JOHN E. ECK

7 Critic
Problem-oriented policing: the disconnect between principles and practice

ANTHONY A. BRAGA AND DAVID WEISBURD

Part IV  Pulling levers policing

8 Advocate
Old wine in new bottles: policing and the lessons of pulling levers

DAVID M. KENNEDY

9 Critic
Partnership, accountability, and innovation: clarifying Boston’s experience with pulling levers

ANTHONY A. BRAGA AND CHRISTOPHER WINSHIP

Part V  Third-party policing

10 Advocate
The case for third-party policing

LORRAINE MAZEROLLE AND JANET RANSLEY

11 Critic
Third-party policing: a critical view

TRACEY L. MEARES

Part VI  Hot spots policing

12 Advocate
Hot spots policing as a model for police innovation

DAVID WEISBURD AND ANTHONY A. BRAGA

13 Critic
The limits of hot spots policing

DENNIS P. ROSENBAUM
Contents xi

Part VII  Compstat

14  Advocate
Compstat’s innovation
ELI B. SILVERMAN 267

15  Critic
Changing everything so that everything can remain the same: Compstat and American policing
DAVID WEISBURD, STEPHEN D. MASTROFSKI, JAMES J. WILLIS, AND ROSANN GREENSPAN 284

Part VIII  Evidence-based policing

16  Advocate
Evidence-based policing for crime prevention
BRANDON C. WELSH 305

17  Critic
Improving police through expertise, experience, and experiments
MARK H. MOORE 322

18  Conclusion: Police innovation and the future of policing
ANTHONY A. BRAGA AND DAVID WEISBURD 339

Index 353
Figures

1.1 Total violent crime (trends in violent crime rates by city size) page 10
7.1 Continuum of police strategies to control high-crime places 146
9.1 Youth homicide in Boston, 1976–2003: victims ages 24 and under 175
12.1 The Minneapolis hot spots experiment 231
12.2 Cumulative distribution of computerized crime mapping 237
15.1 New York City homicide rate 1986–1998 296
15.2 Crime rates before and after Compstat implementation in three model Compstat departments 297
18.1 Dimensions of policing strategies 341
18.2 Index crime rates per 100,000 residents in the United States, 1990–2002 348
## Tables

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Table</th>
<th>Title</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>7.1</td>
<td>Problems and characteristics of twelve violent crime places</td>
<td>138</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7.2</td>
<td>Responses to problems at violent crime places</td>
<td>142</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10.1</td>
<td>Summary of third-party policing evaluation evidence</td>
<td>202</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12.1</td>
<td>Results of hot spots policing evaluations</td>
<td>233</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>16.1</td>
<td>Sherman and Eck’s (2002) conclusions on the effectiveness of police practices to prevent crime</td>
<td>311</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>16.2</td>
<td>Weisburd and Eck’s (2004) summary of findings on police effectiveness research</td>
<td>314</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Anthony A. Braga is Senior Research Associate in the Program in Criminal Justice Policy and Management of the Malcolm Wiener Center for Social Policy at Harvard University’s John F. Kennedy School of Government. He received his MPA from Harvard University and Ph.D. in Criminal Justice from Rutgers University. His research focuses on working with criminal justice agencies to develop crime prevention strategies to deal with urban problems such as firearms violence, street-level drug markets, and violent crime hot spots. He has served as a consultant on these issues to the Rand Corporation; National Academy of Sciences; US Department of Justice; US Department of the Treasury; Bureau of Alcohol, Tobacco, and Firearms; Boston Police Department; New York Police Department; and other state and local law enforcement agencies.

John Eck is a Professor in the Division of Criminal Justice at the University of Cincinnati where he teaches graduate courses on research methods, police effectiveness, crime prevention, and criminal justice policy. Dr. Eck is internationally known for his studies on problem-oriented policing, the prevention of crime at places, the analysis and mapping of crime hot spots, drug dealing and trafficking control, and criminal investigations. He was a member of the National Academy of Sciences Committee on Police Policy and Research, and a former Director of Research for the Police Executive Research Forum, where he helped pioneer the development and testing of problem-oriented policing. Dr. Eck is an Individual Affiliate of the Center for Problem-Oriented Policing and a judge for the British Home Office’s Tilley Award for Excellence in Problem Solving. He earned his Ph.D. in criminology from the University of Maryland and his bachelors and masters degrees from the University of Michigan.

George L. Kelling, Ph.D., is a professor in the School of Criminal Justice, Rutgers University, Newark, faculty chair of the Police Institute at Rutgers University, Newark, and a Senior Fellow at the Manhattan Institute.
Institute. In 1972, he began work at the Police Foundation and conducted several large-scale experiments in policing, most notably the Kansas City Preventive Patrol Experiment and the Newark Foot Patrol Experiment. The latter was the source of his contribution to his most familiar publication in the *Atlantic*, “Broken Windows,” with James Q. Wilson. During the late 1980s, Dr. Kelling developed the order maintenance policies in the New York City subway that ultimately led to radical crime reductions. His areas of special interest are the police, the relationships among fear, crime, and disorder, community crime control, and the evolution of policing strategies and tactics. He consults with numerous major police departments in the United States, along with Australian, British, and Canadian police departments and oversight agencies.

David M. Kennedy joined the faculty of the John Jay College of Criminal Justice at the beginning of 2005. From 1991 to 2004, he was a senior researcher at the Program in Criminal Justice Policy and Management, Kennedy School of Government, Harvard University. He has written and consulted extensively in the areas of community and problem-solving policing, police corruption, and neighborhood revitalization. He has performed field work in police departments and troubled communities in many American cities, London, Sydney, and Puerto Rico. He is the co-author of a seminal work on community policing, *Beyond 911: A New Era for Policing*, and numerous articles on police management, illicit drug markets, illicit firearms markets, youth violence, and deterrence theory, including editorials in the *New York Times*, *Washington Post*, and elsewhere. He has advised the Justice Department, the Department of the Treasury, the Bureau of Alcohol, Tobacco, and Firearms, the Office of National Drug Control Policy, and the White House on these issues.

Stephen D. Mastrofski is Professor of Public and International Affairs at George Mason University, where he directs the Administration of Justice Program and the Center for Justice Leadership and Management. Research interests include measuring police performance and assessing police reforms. He has received the Academy of Criminal Justice Science’s O. W. Wilson Award for outstanding contributions to police education, research, and practice.

Lorraine Mazerolle is an Associate Professor in the Department of Criminology and Criminal Justice at Griffith University. She received her Ph.D. from Rutgers University, New Jersey in 1993 and spent an additional seven years as an academic in the USA (at Northeastern
Notes on contributors

Tracey Meares is Max Pam Professor of Law and Director, Center for Studies in Criminal Justice at the University of Chicago. She received her B.S. in General Engineering from the University of Illinois, and her J.D. from the University of Chicago Law School. She joined the University of Chicago faculty in 1994 after serving as an Honors Program Trial Attorney in the Antitrust Division of the United States Department of Justice. Prior to serving as a Department of Justice prosecutor, Ms. Meares clerked for Judge Harlington Wood, Jr. of the US Court of Appeals for the Seventh Circuit. Ms Meares’s teaching and research interests center on criminal procedure and criminal law policy, with a particular emphasis on empirical investigation of these subjects. In addition to teaching at the Law School, Ms Meares has an appointment as a Research Fellow at the American Bar Foundation. She is also a faculty member of the University of Chicago Center for the Study of Race, Politics, and Culture and an executive committee member of the Northwestern/University of Chicago Joint Center for Poverty Research.

Mark H. Moore is the Guggenheim Professor of Criminal Justice Policy and Management at Harvard’s Kennedy School of Government. He has written extensively in the fields of criminal justice, public management, and the voluntary sector. In the field of policing, his significant publications include Beyond 911: A New Era for Policing?, Recognizing Value in Public Policing: The Challenge of Measuring Police Performance, What Citizens Should Value (and Measure) in Police Department Performance. He was also one of the principal authors of the Urban
Institute’s evaluation of the Federal Government’s COPS Program responsible for the section of the report that used detailed case studies of twelve different police agencies to determine whether and how the grants they received from the COPS program helped them make the transition to a new strategy of policing. He was also a member of the National Academy of Sciences Panel on Policing that produced the report entitled: *Fairness and Effectiveness in Policing*.

**Janet Ransley** is a Senior Lecturer in the School of Criminology and Criminal Justice, Griffith University. Her areas of interest include policing and governance, white-collar crime, forensic mental health, and commissions of inquiry. Recent publications include: *Third Party Policing*, Cambridge University Press, forthcoming; and “Miscarriages of Justice” in T. Prenzler and J. Ransley (eds.) *Police Reform: Building Integrity* (2002). She is currently researching a book on government inquiries, and a project on counter-terrorist policing.

**Dennis P. Rosenbaum** is Professor of Criminal Justice and Director of the Center for Research in Law and Justice at the University of Illinois at Chicago. Previously, he served as Director of Graduate Studies, Department Head, and Dean. His primary areas of interest include the evaluation of police, community, school, and multiagency initiatives to prevent crime and delinquency. In the absence of a real hobby, he is working with the Chicago Police Department to develop geo-based Internet surveys that will “measure what matters” to community residents with respect to neighborhood problems, police performance, community performance, police–community relations, and related topics. He has written various books and articles on community crime prevention and community policing, and teaches graduate courses in policing, research methods, program evaluation, and community processes.

**Eli B. Silverman,** Ph.D., is Professor Emeritus at John Jay College of Criminal Justice and the Graduate Center of City University of New York. He has previously served with the US Department of Justice and the National Academy of Public Administration in Washington, DC and was a Visiting Exchange Professor at the Police Staff College in Bramshill, England. He has served as an expert witness, consultant to, and trainer with numerous criminal justice agencies. His areas of interest include: community policing, crime analysis and information systems, police management, training, operations, use of force, integrity control, comparative policing, policy analysis,
Notes on contributors


WESLEY G. SKOGAN is Professor of Political Science and a member of the research faculty at the University’s Institute for Policy Research. His research focuses on public encounters with the institutions of justice, including the police, crime prevention projects, and community-oriented policing. His most recent books on policing are Community Policing: Can it Work? (2004), On the Beat: Police and Community Problem Solving (1999) and Community Policing, Chicago Style (1997). Professor Skogan chaired the National Research Council’s Committee to Review Research on Police Policy and Practices. The Committee’s report, Fairness and Effectiveness in Policing: The Evidence, was published in 2004.

WILLIAM H. SOUSA is an Assistant Professor in the Department of Criminal Justice at the University of Nevada Las Vegas. He received his Ph.D. from Rutgers University (2003) and his M.S. in Criminal Justice from Northeastern University (1995). From 2000 to 2004, he was the Director of Evaluation for the Police Institute at Rutgers-Newark where he participated in studies related to violence and disorder in New Jersey neighborhoods. His current research projects involve police order-maintenance practices, police management, and community crime prevention.

research methods criminal justice course”; and Taylor (2002), “Fear of crime, local social ties, and collective efficacy: Maybe masquerading measurement, maybe d´ ej` a vu all over again.” His research has been funded by the National Science Foundation, the National Institute of Mental Health, the National Institute of Justice, and the National Institute of Corrections.

DAVID WEISBURD is the Walter E. Meyer Professor of Law and Criminal Justice at the Hebrew University Law School in Jerusalem and Professor of Criminology and Criminal Justice at the University of Maryland, College Park. Professor Weisburd also serves as a Senior Fellow at the Police Foundation, and Chair of its Research Advisory Committee. He was a member of the National Research Council working group on Evaluating Anti-Crime Programs and its panel on Police Practices and Policies. Professor Weisburd is author or editor of 11 books and more than 60 scientific articles, and is founding editor of the Journal of Experimental Criminology. He received his Ph.D. from Yale University.

BRANDON C. WELSH, Ph.D., is an Associate Professor in the Department of Criminal Justice, University of Massachusetts Lowell. His research interests include the prevention of delinquency and crime and economic analysis of prevention programs. Funded research has included studies on the monetary costs of juvenile offending in urban areas and the role of public health in the prevention of juvenile criminal violence. Dr. Welsh is an author or editor of six works, including Evidence-Based Crime Prevention (2002, with Lawrence Sherman, David Farrington, and Doris MacKenzie). Recent articles have appeared in Criminology & Public Policy, Justice Quarterly, Crime and Justice: A Review of Research, and Annals of the American Academy of Political and Social Science. He was a member of OJJDP’s Study Group on Very Young Offenders and a contributing author to its volume, and has been a consultant to the United Nations Office on Drugs and Crime and the British Home Office.

CHRISTOPHER WINSHIP is the Norman Tishman and Charles M. Diker Professor of Sociology in the Faculty of Arts and Sciences and a Fellow of the Hauser Center for Nonprofit Organizations. Prior to coming to Harvard in 1992, he was Professor of Sociology, Statistics, and Economics at Northwestern University and a senior faculty research associate in the Institute for Policy Research there. He is the author of a variety of articles on various statistical issues – the analysis of qualitative dependent variables, selection bias, and counterfactual
causal analysis. His research has also focused on changes in the social and economic status of African-Americans during the twentieth century. In particular, he has examined changes in youth unemployment, marital behavior, and prison incarceration. For the past eight years he has been working with and studying a group of black inner city ministers known as the Ten Point Coalition. He holds a Ph.D. in Sociology from Harvard.