Elements of Justice

What is justice? Questions of justice are questions about what people are due, but what that means in practice depends on context. Depending on context, the formal question of what people are due is answered by principles of desert, reciprocity, equality, or need. Justice, thus, is a constellation of elements that exhibit a degree of integration and unity, but the integrity of justice is limited, in a way that is akin to the integrity of a neighborhood. A theory of justice is a map of that neighborhood.

David Schmidtz is Professor of Philosophy, joint Professor of Economics, and Director of the Program in Philosophy of Freedom at the University of Arizona. He is the author of *Rational Choice and Moral Agency* and coauthor, with Robert Goodin, of *Social Welfare and Individual Responsibility*. He is editor of *Robert Nozick* and coeditor, with Elizabeth Willott, of *Environmental Ethics: What Really Matters, What Really Works*. His lectures on justice have taken him to twenty countries and six continents.
Elements of Justice

DAVID SCHMIDTZ

University of Arizona
## Contents

**Acknowledgements**

**PART 1  WHAT IS JUSTICE?**

1. The Neighborhood of Justice  
2. The Basic Concept  
3. A Variety of Contestants  
4. Contextual Functionalism  
5. What Is Theory?  

**PART 2  HOW TO DESERVE**

6. Desert  
7. What Did I Do to Deserve This?  
8. Deserving a Chance  
9. Deserving and Earning  
10. Grounding Desert  
11. Desert as Institutional Artifact  
12. The Limits of Desert  

**PART 3  HOW TO RECIPROCATE**

13. Reciprocity  
14. What Is Reciprocity?  
15. Varieties of Reciprocity  
16. Debts to Society and Double Counting  
17. The Limits of Reciprocity
## Contents

**PART 4  EQUAL RESPECT AND EQUAL SHARES**

18  Equality  
19  Does Equal Treatment Imply Equal Shares?  
20  What Is Equality for?  
21  Equal Pay for Equal Work  
22  Equality and Opportunity  
23  On the Utility of Equal Shares  
24  The Limits of Equality  

**PART 5  MEDITATIONS ON NEED**

25  Need  
26  Hierarchies of Need  
27  Need as a Distributive Principle  
28  Beyond the Numbers  
29  What Do We Need?  

**PART 6  THE RIGHT TO DISTRIBUTE**

30  Intellectual Debts  
31  Rawls  
32  Nozick  
33  Rectification  
34  Two Kinds of Arbitrary  
35  Procedural versus Distributive Justice  

*References*  
*Index*
Whenever I would run into James Rachels at a conference, he always seemed acutely aware of how much fun it is to be a philosopher. I could not match the masterful simplicity of Jim’s introductory text, *The Elements of Moral Philosophy*, but I did pretty much borrow his title, conceiving the tribute before I learned he was dying of bladder cancer. To my astonishment, Jim e-mailed me from his hospital bed only days before he died, saying one of his few regrets was not getting to know me better. I have no idea how many such e-mails Jim sent, but that’s the kind of man he was, thoughtful and in love with life, no matter what.

I want to thank Marty Zupan for inviting me to a fundraiser in Palm Beach in February of 2003. I thank Randy Kendrick, whom I met in Palm Beach, for calling a week later to invite Elizabeth and me to dinner with her and her husband Ken in Phoenix. I declined, saying I had been diagnosed with a brain tumor two days before and was not feeling very social. Randy demanded that I consult her friend, Dr. Robert Spetzler. As one neurosurgeon described Spetzler, it is hard to explain what makes one pianist merely excellent and the next one a virtuoso, but Spetzler is a virtuoso. His patients simply do better than other people’s patients. So, I thank Dr. Spetzler. Even as brain surgeries go, this was a delicate procedure. I may well have died, or survived as a shell, if not for him.

In the aftermath, Kit Wellman and John Tomasi, among many others, called to ask whether there was anything they could do. I probably was supposed to say, “No thanks, it’s enough that you called, but if I think of anything . . .” Instead, emboldened by awareness that life is indeed short, I said, “How about a workshop on my book?” I’m especially grateful to Kit, John, and Dave Estlund for putting those events together. At the Georgia
State Workshop, Andrew Altman, Andrew I. Cohen, Bill Edmundson, George Rainbolt, Geoff Sayre-McCord, and Kit Wellman served as commentators. Alex Kaufman and Ani Satz were active participants. At the Brown workshop, my official commentators were John Tomasi, David Estlund, Neera Badhwar, Corey Brettschneider, Peter Vallentyne, and Arthur Applbaum.

I thank Galina Bityukova of the Central Asian Resource Center in Almaty, Kazakhstan, for assembling twenty-one faculty from nine post-Soviet republics to spend a week discussing the book. Giancarlo Ibarguen and Manuel Ayau, president and past president, respectively, of Francisco Marroquin University, organized a two-week visit to Guatemala where I presented nine lectures to various audiences. Michael Smith, Geoff Brennan, and Bob Goodin arranged for me to spend ten weeks at the Research School for Social Sciences at Australian National University in 2002. Thanks also to Jeremy and Pam Shearmur for welcoming me into their home outside Canberra.

I thank Michael Pendlebury for arranging a three-week visit to the University of Witwatersrand in 1999 where I presented early versions of several of these chapters. I thank Horacio Spector and Guido Pincione for the opportunity to present much of this material during visits to Torcuato di Tella School of Law in Buenos Aires. I thank David and Laura Truncellito for helping to arrange lectures at Chen Chi University, National Chung Cheng University, and University of Taiwan, and for an unforgettable week touring the island. I thank the Centre for Applied Ethics and Green College at the University of British Columbia for their splendid hospitality in the spring semester of 2000 and likewise the Social Philosophy and Policy Center at Bowling Green State University in the fall of 1999. For single lectures, I wish to thank audiences and organizers at Michigan, Yale, UNC-Chapel Hill, Ohio, Rochester Institute of Technology, Santa Clara, Auckland, Alabama-Birmingham, Tulane, Georgetown, West Virginia, and James Madison.

I wish to thank all the wonderful people at the Liberty Fund in Indianapolis for their stunningly generous support in the aftermath of my surgery when I needed peace and quiet so I could learn how to think again. I thank the Earhart Foundation and Institute for Humane Studies for sustaining not only me but several of the University of Arizona’s students over the years. Needless to say, my greatest debt is to the University of Arizona. It is home, and I thank my colleagues for making it feel that way. More than anyone else (which is saying a lot), Chris Maloney makes
life in the department a thing of joy, from when I arrive in the morning until we walk home together in the evening.

All these good people, in addition to those mentioned above and those I’ll credit more specifically in footnotes to follow, have done what they could to make this a better book: Scott Arnold, Lawrence Becker, Matt Bedke, Jeremy Bendik-Keymer, Jason Brennan, Gillian Brock, Chris Brown, Allen Buchanan, Tom Christiano, Andrew Jason Cohen, David Copp, Tyler Cowen, Peter Danielson, Jonathan Dancy, Stephen Darwall, Amitai Etzioni, James Fishkin, Ray Frey, Gerald Gaus, Allan Gibbard, Walter Glannon, Charles Goodman, Rob Gressis, Chris Griffin, Allen Habib, Rosalind Hursthouse, Jenann Ismael, Frances Kamm, Scott LaBarge, Jason Lesandrini, Loren Lomasky, Gerry Mackie, David Miller, Fred Miller, Chris Morris, Jan Narveson, Cara Nine, Guido Pincione, Steve Pink, Frances Fox Piven, Thomas Pogge, James Rachels, Peter Railton, Dan Russell, John T. Sanders, Steve Scalet, Daniel Shapiro, David Sobel, Horacio Spector, Christine Swanton, Mark Timmons, Mary Tjiattas, Kevin Vallier, David Velleman, Will Wilkinson, Elizabeth Willott, Matt Zwolinski, and those who toiled as anonymous readers for the Press.