

Cambridge University Press
0521537142 - The New Brain Sciences: Perils and Prospects
Edited by Dai Rees and Steven Rose
Frontmatter
[More information](#)

The New Brain Sciences

Perils and Prospects

The last twenty years have seen an explosion of research and developments in the neurosciences. Indeed, some have called this first decade of the twenty-first century 'the decade of the mind'. An all-encompassing term, neuroscience covers such fields as biology, psychology, neurology, psychiatry and philosophy and include anatomy, physiology, molecular biology, genetics and behaviour. It is now a major industry with billions of dollars of funding invested from both public and private sectors.

Huge progress has been made in our understanding of the brain and its functions. However, with progress comes controversy, responsibility and dilemma. *The New Brain Sciences: Perils and Prospects* examines the implications of recent discoveries in terms of our sense of individual responsibility and personhood. Aimed at neuroscientists, psychologists, philosophers, medical professionals, students and the general public alike, it is an attempt to kick-start a discussion of where neuroscience is going.

Sir DAI REES is Knight Bachelor, a Fellow of the Royal Society, an Honorary Fellow of the Royal College of Physicians and a founding Fellow of the Royal Academy of Medicine. He was President of the European Science Foundation (1993–9) and Secretary and Chief Executive of the UK Medical Research Council (1987–96).

Professor STEVEN ROSE has been Professor of Biology and Director of the Brain and Behaviour Research Group at the Open University since the inception of the university in 1969. His research focusses on the cellular and molecular mechanisms of learning and memory.

Cambridge University Press
0521537142 - The New Brain Sciences: Perils and Prospects
Edited by Dai Rees and Steven Rose
Frontmatter
[More information](#)

The New Brain Sciences

Perils and Prospects

EDITED BY

DAI REES AND STEVEN ROSE



CAMBRIDGE
UNIVERSITY PRESS

Cambridge University Press
 0521537142 - The New Brain Sciences: Perils and Prospects
 Edited by Dai Rees and Steven Rose
 Frontmatter
[More information](#)

PUBLISHED BY THE PRESS SYNDICATE OF THE UNIVERSITY OF CAMBRIDGE
 The Pitt Building, Trumpington Street, Cambridge, United Kingdom

CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY PRESS
 The Edinburgh Building, Cambridge, CB2 2RU, UK
 40 West 20th Street, New York, NY 10011-4211, USA
 477 Williamstown Road, Port Melbourne, VIC 3207, Australia
 Ruiz de Alarcón 13, 28014 Madrid, Spain
 Dock House, The Waterfront, Cape Town 8001, South Africa
<http://www.cambridge.org>

© Cambridge University Press 2004

This book is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception
 and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements,
 no reproduction of any part may take place without
 the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2004

Printed in the United Kingdom at the University Press, Cambridge

Typefaces Trump Mediaeval 9.5/15 pt. and Times *System* L^AT_EX 2_ε [TB]

A catalogue record for this book is available from the British Library

Library of Congress Cataloguing in Publication data

The new brain sciences: perils and prospects / edited by Dai Rees and Steven Rose.
 p. cm.

Includes bibliographical references and index.

ISBN 0 521 83009 5 – ISBN 0 521 53714 2 (paperback)

1. Neurosciences – Philosophy. 2. Neurosciences – Moral and ethical aspects.

I. Rees, David A. II. Rose, Steven P. R. (Steven Peter Russell), 1938–

RC341.N53 2004

612.8'01 – dc22 2004045660

ISBN 0 521 83009 5 hardback

ISBN 0 521 53714 2 paperback

The publisher has used its best endeavours to ensure that the URLs for external websites referred to in this book are correct and active at the time of going to press. However, the publisher has no responsibility for the websites and can make no guarantee that a site will remain live or that the content is or will remain appropriate.

Contents

List of contributors	<i>page</i> viii
Part I Introduction: the new brain sciences	1
Introduction: the new brain sciences	3
STEVEN ROSE	
Part II Freedom to change	15
1 Do we ever really act?	17
MARY MIDGLEY	
2 The definition of human nature	34
MERLIN W. DONALD	
3 Consciousness and the limits of neurobiology	59
HILARY ROSE	
4 Mind metaphors, neurosciences and ethics	71
REGINE KOLLEK	
5 Genetic and generic determinism: a new threat to free will?	88
PETER LIPTON	
Part III Neuroscience and the law	101
6 Human action, neuroscience and the law	103
ALEXANDER MCCALL SMITH	
7 Responsibility and the law	123
STEPHEN SEDLEY	

vi CONTENTS

8	Programmed or licensed to kill? The new biology of femicide	131
	LORRAINE RADFORD	
9	Genes, responsibility and the law	149
	PATRICK BATESON	
	Part IV Stewardship of the new brain sciences	165
10	The neurosciences: the danger that we will think that we have understood it all	167
	YADIN DUDAI	
11	On dissecting the genetic basis of behaviour and intelligence	181
	ANGUS CLARKE	
12	Prospects and perils of stem cell repair of the central nervous system: a brief guide to current science	195
	HELEN HODGES, IRIS REUTER AND HELEN PILCHER	
13	The use of human embryonic stem cells for research: an ethical evaluation	213
	GUIDO DE WERT	
14	The Prozac story	223
	JOHN CORNWELL	
15	Psychopharmacology at the interface between the market and the new biology	232
	DAVID HEALY	
16	Education in the age of Ritalin	249
	PAUL COOPER	

Cambridge University Press
0521537142 - The New Brain Sciences: Perils and Prospects
Edited by Dai Rees and Steven Rose
Frontmatter
[More information](#)

CONTENTS vii

Part V Conclusion	263
Conclusion	265
DAI REES AND BARBRO WESTERHOLM	
References	276
Index	285

Contributors

Professor Patrick Bateson, The Provost's Lodge, King's College,
Cambridge CB2 1ST, UK.

Patrick Bateson is Professor of Ethology, and Provost of King's College, Cambridge. He was formerly Director of the Sub-Department of Animal Behaviour at Cambridge and later Head of the Department of Zoology. He is currently Biological Secretary and Vice-President of the Royal Society. His research is on the behavioural development of animals, and much of his scientific career has been concerned with bridging the gap between the studies of behaviour and those of underlying mechanisms, focussing on the process of imprinting in birds. He has also carried out research on behavioural development in mammals, particularly cats. His most recent book is *Design for a Life* (with Paul Martin, 1999).

Professor Angus Clarke, Department of Medical Genetics,
University of Wales College of Medicine, Heath Park, Cardiff CF4
4XN, UK.

Angus Clarke is a medically qualified geneticist and currently Professor in Clinical Genetics at the University of Wales, Cardiff. He has particular interests in the social and ethical issues raised by advances in human genetics and in the genetic counselling process, while also teaching and working as a clinician. He has worked on the clinical and molecular genetic aspects of ectodermal dysplasia, Rett syndrome and neuromuscular disorders. With his colleague Peter Harper, he wrote the book *Genetics, Society and Clinical Practice* (Harper and Clarke, 1997). He directs the Cardiff MSc course in Genetic Counselling.

Professor Paul Cooper, School of Education, University of Leicester,
21 University Road, Leicester LE1 7RF, UK.

Paul Cooper is Director of the Centre for Innovation in Raising Educational Achievement, University of Leicester School of Education. He is a chartered psychologist and was a schoolteacher for ten years before taking a succession of academic posts at the universities of Birmingham, Oxford and Cambridge. He is editor of the journal *Emotional and Behavioural Difficulties*, and was co-recipient of the 2001 *Times Educational Supplement*/NASEN Academic Book Award.

Dr John Cornwell, Jesus College, Cambridge CB5 8BL, UK.

John Cornwell has directed the Science and Human Dimension Project at Jesus College, Cambridge, since 1990. He is author of *The Power to Harm* (1996), and editor of *Nature's Imagination* (Oxford University Press, 1995) and *Consciousness and Human Identity* (Oxford University Press, 1998).

Professor Merlin W. Donald, Department of Psychology, Queen's University, Kingston, Ontario K7L 3N6, Canada.

Merlin Donald is Professor and Head of the Department of Psychology, Queen's University, Kingston, Ontario, Canada and Visiting Professor at the University of Toronto. A cognitive neuroscientist with a background in philosophy, he is the author of *Origins of the Modern Mind: Three Stages in the Evolution of Culture and Cognition* (Harvard University Press, 1991), and *A Mind So Rare: The Evolution of Human Consciousness* (Norton, 2001).

Professor Yadin Dudai, Department of Neurobiology, The Weizmann Institute of Science, 76100 Rehovot, Israel.

Yadin Dudai is Professor of Neurobiology at the Weizmann Institute of Science, Rehovot, Israel. His main research interest is in the processes and mechanisms of the acquisition and consolidation of items in memory. He serves on a number of national and international committees on science, science policy

X LIST OF CONTRIBUTORS

and education and is engaged in popularisation of science. His most recent book is *Memory from A to Z: Keywords, Concepts and Beyond* (Dudai, 2002).

Dr David Healy, North Wales Department of Psychological Medicine, Hergest Unit, Ysbyty Gwynedd, Bangor LL57 2PW, UK. David Healy is Reader in Psychological Medicine in University of Wales College of Medicine and Director of the North Wales Department of Psychological Medicine. His books include *The Antidepressant Era* (Healy, 1998) and *The Creation of Psychopharmacology* (Healy, 2002).

Dr Helen Hodges, Department of Psychology, Institute of Psychiatry, King's College, De Crespigny Park, London SE5 8AF, UK. Helen Hodges is Professor Emeritus of Psychology, King's College London and previously Head of Functional Assessment at ReNeuron Ltd. She has worked for the past fourteen years in the field of neural transplantation, assessing effects of primary fetal and cultured cell grafts in animal models of neurodegenerative and ischaemic brain damage. She was a founder member of ReNeuron Ltd, a biotechnology company dedicated to the development of stem cells suitable for repair of brain damage, with twin aims of generating safe and stable cells, and assessing their functional effects.

Professor Regine Kollek, FG Medicine/Neurosciences, University of Hamburg, Falkenried 94, D-20251 Hamburg, Germany. Regine Kollek has a Ph.D. in molecular biology, but became increasingly involved in assessing technological risk. She is now Professor at the Research Centre for Biotechnology, Society and the Environment at the University of Hamburg. Her research focusses on the ethical and social implications of modern biotechnologies and aims to identify preconditions for compatibility of these scientific and technical developments with human dignity and social benefits. Her latest books are on genetic testing in health insurance and on pre-implantation genetic diagnosis. She is vice-chairperson of the German National Ethics

Council and a member of the International Bioethics Committee of UNESCO.

Professor Peter Lipton, Department of History and Philosophy of Science, Free School Lane, Cambridge CB2 3RH, UK.

Peter Lipton is Professor and Head of the Department of the History and Philosophy of Science at the University of Cambridge and a Fellow of King's College. His main philosophical interests lie in the theory of knowledge and the philosophy of science, especially questions concerning explanation and inference. He is also interested in topics in biomedical ethics and is a member of the Nuffield Council on Bioethics, having chaired its Working Party on Pharmacogenetics. He is the author of *Inference to the Best Explanation* (Routledge, 1991; 2nd edn, 2004).

Professor Alexander McCall Smith, Faculty of Law, University of Edinburgh, Old College, Edinburgh EH8 9YL, UK.

Alexander McCall Smith is Professor of Medical Law at the University of Edinburgh. He is vice-chairman of the Human Genetics Commission of the UK and a member of the International Bioethics Committee of UNESCO. He is the author of a number of books on criminal law and medical law, including *Errors, Medicine and the Law* (with Alan Merry), published by Cambridge University Press and, with J. K. Mason, *Law and Medical Ethics*, now in its sixth edition.

Dr Mary Midgley, 1a Collingwood Terrace, Newcastle upon Tyne NE2 2JP, UK.

Mary Midgley is a professional philosopher whose special interests are in the relations of humans to the rest of nature (particularly in the status of animals) in the sources of morality, and in the relation between science and religion (particularly in cases where science becomes a religion). Until retirement she was a Senior Lecturer in Philosophy at the University of Newcastle upon Tyne, where she still lives. Her best-known books are *Beast and Man*, *Evolution as a Religion*, *Science as Salvation*, *Wickedness* and, most recently, *Science and Poetry*.

Cambridge University Press
0521537142 - The New Brain Sciences: Perils and Prospects
Edited by Dai Rees and Steven Rose
Frontmatter
[More information](#)

xii LIST OF CONTRIBUTORS

Helen Pilcher, formerly of ReNeuron Ltd, 10 Nugent Road, Survey Research Park, Guildford, GU2 7AF, UK.

Helen Pilcher joined ReNeuron Ltd when it was founded in 1997, as a leading scientist in the cell biology group, tasked to make immortalised human stem cell lines. She then followed up her interests in public scientific debate as manager of the Royal Society 'Science in Society' team, and is now working as a writer for *Nature*.

Dr Lorraine Radford, School of Sociology and Social Policy, University of Surrey Roehampton, 80 Roehampton Lane, London SW15 5SL, UK.

Lorraine Radford is Reader in Social Policy at the University of Surrey Roehampton where she teaches courses on criminology and on violence. Her research interests and all of her publications are in the area of violence against women and children, particularly the impact of domestic violence upon children.

Sir Dai Rees, Ford Cottage, 1 High Street, Denford, Kettering NN14 4EQ, UK.

Dai Rees was previously President, European Science Foundation (1993–9); Secretary and Chief Executive, UK Medical Research Council (1987–96); Director, UK National Institute for Medical Research (1982–87). Prior to this he held various research and research management positions in industry, and was a lecturer in chemistry at the University of Edinburgh. He is a founding fellow of the Royal Academy of Medicine, a Fellow of the Royal Society and a member of Academia Europea.

Dr Iris Reuter, Department of Neuroscience, Institute of Psychiatry, King's College, DeCrespigny Park, London SE5 8AF, UK.

Iris Reuter is a consultant neurologist who is pursuing the clinical development of stem cell therapy by investigating graft efficacy and mechanisms in animals and supervising the assessment of Huntington's disease patients with primary fetal grafts.

Professor Hilary Rose, Department of Sociology, City University, 4 Lloyd Square, London WC1X 9BA, UK.

Hilary Rose is a feminist sociologist of science. She is Professor Emerita of Social Policy, University of Bradford, and Visiting Professor of Sociology at the City University, London. From 1999 to 2002 she was joint Professor of Physic at Gresham College, London. Books include *Love Power and Knowledge: Towards a Feminist Transformation of the Sciences* (Rose, 1994), cited as one of the 101 most important feminist books of the century, and (jointly with Steven Rose) *Alas Poor Darwin: Arguments against Evolutionary Psychology* (Rose and Rose 2000). Her current research interest is in biobanks, where genomics and social policy meet.

Professor Steven Rose, Brain and Behaviour Research Group, Department of Biological Sciences, The Open University, Walton Hall, Milton Keynes MK7 6AA, UK.

Steven Rose is Professor of Biology and Director of the Brain and Behaviour Research Group at the Open University, a position he has held since the inception of the university in 1969. His laboratory research focusses on the cellular and molecular mechanisms of learning and memory, with particular reference to Alzheimer's disease; a new edition of his prizewinning book *The Making of Memory* was published in 2003 and he is currently working on a book on 'the future of the brain.' In 2002 he received the Biochemical Society medal for excellence in public communication of science (see Rose, 2003).

The Rt. Hon. Lord Justice Sedley, Royal Courts of Justice, London WC2A 2LL, UK.

Stephen Sedley practised at the Bar for twenty-eight years, principally in the fields of civil liberties and discrimination law, until 1992 when he was appointed a judge of the Queen's Bench Division of the High Court. He became a Lord Justice of Appeal in 1999. He is an Honorary Professor of Law at Warwick University and the University of Wales at Cardiff, and Judicial Visitor at University College, London. He chaired the Judicial Studies Board's working party on the Human Rights Act 1998.

Cambridge University Press
0521537142 - The New Brain Sciences: Perils and Prospects
Edited by Dai Rees and Steven Rose
Frontmatter
[More information](#)

xiv LIST OF CONTRIBUTORS

He is President of the British Institute of Human Rights and chair of the British Council's advisory committee on governance.

Dr Guido de Wert, Institute for Bioethics, University of Maastricht, 3015 GD Rotterdam, The Netherlands.

Guido de Wert is Professor of Biomedical Ethics at the University of Maastricht, The Netherlands, and a member of the Standing Committee on medical ethics and health law of the Netherlands Health Council. His main research interest lies in the ethics of transplantation and reproductive medicine and genetics. His publications include *Ethics and Genetics: A Workbook for Practitioners and Students* (Berghahn, 2003).

Professor Barbro Westerholm, Swedish Association of Senior Citizens, Box 22574, S-104 22 Stockholm, Sweden.

Barbro Westerholm, M.D., has among other things been Adjunct Professor of Drug Epidemiology, Karolinska Institute, Director General of the Swedish National Board of Health and Welfare, Member of Parliament (Liberal Party) and Chairman of the Parliamentary Committee on Research Ethics. At present she is President of the Swedish Association of Senior Citizens, vice-chairman of the EU organisation AGE and chairman of the Board of Växjö University.