

Cambridge University Press

0521534801 - Contesting Citizenship in Latin America: The Rise of Indigenous Movements and the Postliberal Challenge

Deborah J. Yashar

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

Contesting Citizenship in Latin America

Indigenous people in Latin America have mobilized in unprecedented ways. By taking to the streets, forging new agendas, and fielding political candidates, indigenous movements have come to shape national political debates about multiethnic democracies, political equality, and subnational autonomy. These are remarkable developments in a region where ethnic cleavages were once universally described as weak.

Deborah Yashar explains the contemporary and uneven emergence of Latin American indigenous movements – addressing both why indigenous identities have become politically salient in the contemporary period and why they have translated into significant political organizations in some places and not others. She argues that ethnic politics can best be explained through a comparative historical approach that analyzes three factors: changing citizenship regimes, social networks, and political associational space. Her argument provides insight into the fragility and unevenness of Latin America's third wave democracies and has broader implications for the ways in which we theorize the relationship between citizenship, states, identity, and collective action.

Deborah J. Yashar is Associate Professor of Politics and International Affairs at Princeton University and the Director of Princeton's Program in Latin American Studies. She is the author of *Demanding Democracy: Reform and Reaction in Costa Rica and Guatemala, 1870s–1950s*, as well as articles and chapters on democratization, ethnic politics, collective action, and globalization.

Cambridge University Press
0521534801 - Contesting Citizenship in Latin America: The Rise of Indigenous Movements
and the Postliberal Challenge

Deborah J. Yashar
Frontmatter

[More information](#)

Cambridge Studies in Contentious Politics

Editors

Jack A. Goldstone *George Mason University*

Doug McAdam *Stanford University and Center for Advanced Study in the
Behavioral Sciences*

Sidney Tarrow *Cornell University*

Charles Tilly *Columbia University*

Elisabeth J. Wood *Yale University*

Ronald Aminzade et al., *Silence and Voice in the Study of Contentious Politics*

Charles D. Brockett, *Political Movements and Violence in Central America*

Gerald Davis, Doug McAdam, W. Richard Scott, and Mayer Zald, editors,
Social Movements and Organization Theory

Jack A. Goldstone, editor, *States, Parties, and Social Movements*

Doug McAdam, Sidney Tarrow, and Charles Tilly, *Dynamics of Contention*

Charles Tilly, *The Politics of Collective Violence*

Charles Tilly, *Contention and Democracy in Europe, 1650–2000*

Cambridge University Press

0521534801 - Contesting Citizenship in Latin America: The Rise of Indigenous Movements
and the Postliberal Challenge

Deborah J. Yashar

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

Contesting Citizenship in Latin America

THE RISE OF INDIGENOUS
MOVEMENTS AND THE
POSTLIBERAL CHALLENGE

DEBORAH J. YASHAR

Princeton University



CAMBRIDGE
UNIVERSITY PRESS

Cambridge University Press
 0521534801 - Contesting Citizenship in Latin America: The Rise of Indigenous Movements
 and the Postliberal Challenge

Deborah J. Yashar
 Frontmatter

[More information](#)

CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY PRESS
 Cambridge, New York, Melbourne, Madrid, Cape Town, Singapore, São Paulo

Cambridge University Press
 40 West 20th Street, New York, NY 10011-4211, USA

www.cambridge.org
 Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9780521827461

© Deborah J. Yashar 2005

This book is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception
 and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements,
 no reproduction of any part may take place without
 the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2005

Printed in the United States of America

A catalog record for this publication is available from the British Library.

Library of Congress Cataloging in Publication Data

Yashar, Deborah J., 1963–
 Contesting citizenship in Latin America : the rise of indigenous movements and the
 postliberal challenge / Deborah J. Yashar.

p. cm. – (Cambridge studies in contentious politics)
 Includes bibliographical references and index.

ISBN 0-521-82746-9 (hardback : alk. paper) – ISBN 0-521-53480-1 (pbk. : alk. paper)

1. Indians of South America – Politics and government. 2. Indians of South America –
 Civil rights. 3. Indians of South America – Government relations. 4. Indigenous peoples –
 South America – Politics and government. 5. Indigenous peoples – Civil rights – South
 America. 6. Indigenous peoples – South America – Government relations. 7. Political
 rights – South America. 8. Citizenship – South America. 9. South America – Politics and
 government. 10. South America – Race relations. 11. South America – Social policy.
 I. Title. II. Series.

F2230.I.P65Y37 2005

323.1198–dc22 2004055293

ISBN-13 978-0-521-82746-1 hardback

ISBN-10 0-521-82746-9 hardback

ISBN-13 978-0-521-53480-2 paperback

ISBN-10 0-521-53480-1 paperback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for
 the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or
 third-party Internet Web sites referred to in this book
 and does not guarantee that any content on such
 Web sites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.

Cambridge University Press
0521534801 - Contesting Citizenship in Latin America: The Rise of Indigenous Movements
and the Postliberal Challenge

Deborah J. Yashar
Frontmatter

[More information](#)

*For My Parents,
Audrey and John Yashar*

Contents

<i>List of Tables</i>	<i>page</i>	xi
<i>Acknowledgments</i>		xiii
<i>List of Acronyms</i>		xix
Part I: Theoretical Framing		
1	QUESTIONS, APPROACHES, AND CASES	3
2	CITIZENSHIP REGIMES, THE STATE, AND ETHNIC CLEAVAGES	31
3	THE ARGUMENT: INDIGENOUS MOBILIZATION IN LATIN AMERICA	54
Part II: The Cases		
4	ECUADOR: LATIN AMERICA'S STRONGEST INDIGENOUS MOVEMENT	85
	Part I: The Ecuadorian Andes and ECUARUNARI	87
	Part II: The Ecuadorian Amazon and CONFENAIE	109
	Part III: Forming the National Confederation, CONAIE	130
5	BOLIVIA: STRONG REGIONAL MOVEMENTS	152
	Part I: The Bolivian Andes: The Kataristas and Their Legacy	154
	Part II: The Bolivian Amazon and CIDOB	190
6	PERU: WEAK NATIONAL MOVEMENTS AND SUBNATIONAL VARIATION	224
	Part I: Peru, Ecuador, and Bolivia: Most Similar Cases	225

Cambridge University Press

0521534801 - Contesting Citizenship in Latin America: The Rise of Indigenous Movements
and the Postliberal Challenge

Deborah J. Yashar

Frontmatter

[More information](#)**Contents**

Part II: No National Indigenous Movements: Explaining the Peruvian Anomaly	240
Part III: Explaining Subnational Variation	250
<i>Part III: Conclusion</i>	
7 DEMOCRACY AND THE POSTLIBERAL CHALLENGE IN LATIN AMERICA	281
<i>Bibliography</i>	309
<i>Index</i>	351

Cambridge University Press

0521534801 - Contesting Citizenship in Latin America: The Rise of Indigenous Movements
and the Postliberal Challenge

Deborah J. Yashar

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

List of Tables

1.1	Estimates of Indigenous Peoples in Latin America (1978–1991)	<i>page</i> 21
2.1	Principles for Allocating Citizenship	36
2.2	Citizenship Regimes in Latin America	48
3.1	Emergence of Indigenous Movements in Latin America: Scoring of Variables and Cases	56
3.2	Emergence of Indigenous Movements in Latin America: Description of Variables and Cases	58
3.3	Latin American Indigenous Movements in the Context of Contemporary Challenges to Local Autonomy	79
4.1	Indigenous Peoples in Ecuador	86
4.2	Distribution of Agricultural Lands, Ecuador (1954 and 1974 Censuses)	93
4.3	Ecuador: Number of Families/Beneficiaries and Hectares of Land Distributed through Colonization and Land Reform (1964–1985)	114
4.4	Ecuador: Central Government Social Sector Expenditures (1980–1993)	138
5.1	Distribution of Agricultural Property in Bolivia before Land Reform	157
5.2	Collective Protests in Bolivia (1970–2002)	172
5.3	Evolution of Social Public Spending in Bolivia (1980–1989) (as percentage of GNP)	183
5.4	Indigenous Territories in Bolivia (1990–1992)	213
5.5	Beni: Land Area of Indigenous Territories (2000)	219
6.1	Peru: Number of Peasant and Native Communities, by Region and Department (1997)	234

Cambridge University Press

0521534801 - Contesting Citizenship in Latin America: The Rise of Indigenous Movements
and the Postliberal Challenge

Deborah J. Yashar

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

List of Tables

6.2	Peru's Central Government Expenditure by Economic Sector, as Percentage of GDP	236
6.3	Estimated Distribution of Peruvian Peasants by Type of Agricultural Work (1977)	242
6.4	Distribution of SAIS in Peru by Department (1971–1988)	269

Cambridge University Press
 0521534801 - Contesting Citizenship in Latin America: The Rise of Indigenous Movements
 and the Postliberal Challenge
 Deborah J. Yashar
 Frontmatter
[More information](#)

Acknowledgments

In the summer of 1996, I traveled to Chiapas, Mexico, to take part in a Zapatista conference entitled “The Intercontinental Conference for Humanity and Against Neoliberalism.” Thousands of people from all over the world traveled to this conference, later dubbed the “Intergalactic Conference,” to learn about the Zapatistas, make common cause with this movement, and strategize about a global fight for democracy and justice. The conference provided an opportunity to bear witness to extraordinary developments in Mexico. It also raised themes that resonated throughout Latin America. As I subsequently traveled to Guatemala, Ecuador, Bolivia, and Peru, I often recalled the speech read by the indigenous leader, Ana María, at the opening event. To the thousands of people who had traveled to La Realidad, Chiapas, she said:

Below in the city and the plantations, we did not exist. Our lives were worth less than the machines and the animals. We were like rocks, like plants along the road. We did not have voices. We did not have faces. We did not have names. We did not have tomorrow. We did not exist.

... Then we went to the mountains. . . . The mountains told us to take up arms to have a voice, it told us to cover our faces to have a visage, it told us to forget our names so that we could be named, it told us to protect our past so that we could have a tomorrow.

... Behind our black faces, behind our armed voice, behind our unnamed name, behind those of us that *you* see, behind us is *you*, behind us are the same simple and ordinary men and women that are found in all ethnic and racial groups, that paint themselves in all colors, that speak in all languages, and that live in all places.

The same forgotten men and women.
 The same excluded people.

Cambridge University Press

0521534801 - Contesting Citizenship in Latin America: The Rise of Indigenous Movements and the Postliberal Challenge

Deborah J. Yashar

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

Acknowledgments

The same people who are not tolerated.

The same people who are persecuted.

We are the same as you. Behind us is you.¹

The rights to be heard, to be seen, to be recognized, and to be respected are at the core of much indigenous organizing throughout the Americas – from Mexico, to Guatemala, to Ecuador, to Bolivia, and beyond. This book sets out to explain the unprecedented and uneven emergence of these Latin American indigenous movements. They have assumed a dominant role in social movements and have increasingly come to shape political agendas throughout the region. In the process, they have demanded a voice and a seat in places that once ignored indigenous peoples. They have struggled for equal treatment, just as they have demanded local autonomy.

I thank, first and foremost, the indigenous activists who spent so many hours talking with me about indigenous communities, movements, and politics in Ecuador, Bolivia, and Peru – the countries that form the core of this book. While those conversations took place several years ago, they are still very much alive for me. I would particularly like to acknowledge Ampam Karakras, José María Cabascango, and Leonardo Viteri, in Ecuador; Jenaro Flores, Constantino Lima, and Marcial Fabricano in Bolivia; and Bonifacio Cruz and Evaristo Nukjuag in Peru. Some among this list welcomed me into their homes; others brought me to conferences and workshops; others sat down countless times to talk with me about indigenous movements and democracy; they all opened up doors that allowed me to talk to other indigenous activists and leaders. I am indebted to them all for their insight and generosity, without which I could not have written this book.

So too, several Latin American scholar-activists helped me to navigate new and uncharted waters, helping me to decipher and to amplify the wealth of experiences, books, and ideas. In particular, I want to thank Xavier Albó, Ricardo Calla, María Eugenia Choque, Carlos Mamani, and Ramiro Molina in Bolivia and Juan Bottasso, Ampam Karakras, Diego Iturralde, Jorge León, and Galo Ramón in Ecuador. Each of these scholars helped me to better understand contemporary politics in the region and to make sense of the political similarities and differences among the countries situated in the Andean-Amazon corridor.

¹ This speech was reprinted in *Crónicas intergalácticas. EZLN. Primer Encuentro Intercontinental por la Humanidad y contra el Neoliberalismo*. Chiapas, Mexico. 1996, pp. 23–9.

Cambridge University Press

0521534801 - Contesting Citizenship in Latin America: The Rise of Indigenous Movements and the Postliberal Challenge

Deborah J. Yashar

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

Acknowledgments

In the United States, several people helped to lay the foundation for this project. Jorge Domínguez was the intellectual catalyst for this book. At the time, I was completing my first book on democracy and authoritarianism in Central America. Jorge asked me to write a chapter on indigenous movements and democratic governance for his co-edited volume with Abraham Lowenthal. That fateful request sparked my fascination with ethnic politics and ultimately led me to pursue the research that culminated in this book. Ted MacDonald, in turn, provided me with my first contacts in the field. I thank him immensely for introducing me to people who proved to be so consequential as I conducted the research, particularly in Ecuador and Bolivia. And to Sid Tarrow and Kay Warren, who took an early interest in this project, read my work with care, challenged me intellectually to think about the fields of social movements and anthropology, respectively, and in turn invited me to take part in seminars that proved to be enormously productive.

In the process of writing this book, I have incurred many intellectual debts to colleagues and friends who have shared their work and provided critical and insightful feedback on related articles, book chapters, and conference presentations. I thank, in particular, Jeremy Adelman, Eva Bellin, Sheri Berman, Nancy Bermeo, Alyson Brysk, Valerie Bunce, Miguel Centeno, John Coatsworth, David Collier, Christian Davenport, Jorge I. Domínguez, Kent Eaton, Susan Eckstein, Jonathan Fox, Kevin Healy, Donald Horowitz, Courtney Jung, Ira Katznelson, Arang Keshavarzian, Margaret Keck, Atul Kohli, Roberto Laserna, Abraham Lowenthal, José Antonio Lucero, Beatriz Manz, Doug McAdam, Kathleen McNamara, Tali Mendelberg, Guillermo O'Donnell, Rachel Sieder, Paul Sigmund, Theda Skocpol, Lynn Stephen, Sidney Tarrow, Charles Tilly, Donna Lee Van Cott, Kay Warren, Lynn White, and Elisabeth Wood.

This book is deeply indebted to the crew of excellent researchers who helped me along the way. I want to thank those who assisted me in the gathering of materials in the United States, Ecuador, Bolivia, and Peru. Rafael de la Dehesa, Anna Dahlstein, Tyler Dickovick, Lily Jara, Esperanza Luján, Maritza Rodríguez-Seguí, Daniela Raz, Adam Webb, Jorje Valle, and Verouschka Zilveti provided assistance in scouring bibliographies, reviewing newspapers, and pulling together databases on socioeconomic indicators. Lily Jara, Verouschka Zilveti, and Maritza Rodríguez-Seguí played a particularly important role in Ecuador, Bolivia, and Peru, respectively – each of them compiling databases that were used in Part II of this book. A special

Cambridge University Press

0521534801 - Contesting Citizenship in Latin America: The Rise of Indigenous Movements and the Postliberal Challenge

Deborah J. Yashar

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

Acknowledgments

thanks, moreover, to those students at Harvard and Princeton and colleagues at the Institute for Popular Democracy who took seminars with me on power and protest, social movements, and ethnic politics and citizenship. All of these seminar discussions helped to crystallize many of the ideas discussed in these pages.

This book would not have been possible without the generous support provided by the following agencies and research institutes: The United States Institute of Peace; the Joint Committee on Latin American Studies of the American Council of Learned Societies and the Social Science Research Council; the Helen Kellogg Institute for International Studies at the University of Notre Dame; the Center for International Affairs and the Milton Grant, both at Harvard University; Class of 1934 University Preceptorship in the Woodrow Wilson School at Princeton University; Princeton University's Program in Latin American Studies; Princeton's Lichtenstein Institute on Self-Determination; the Center for Advanced Study in the Behavioral Sciences summer Seminar on Contentious Politics; and the Institute for Popular Democracy in the Philippines.

Lewis Bateman is a phenomenal editor: insightful, expedient, savvy, and witty. He made it a delight to work with Cambridge University Press and found two reviewers, Charles Tilly and Elisabeth Wood, who were characteristically wise, thoughtful, and provocative. Their critiques made this a much better book than it would have been otherwise. I also want to thank Edna Lloyd who helped me format the final manuscript with great diligence, speed, and kindness; Christine Dunn for the copyediting; Becky Hornyak for the index; Perna Singh and William T. Barndt for proofing; and Sorat Tungkasiri for sharpening the photograph pictured on the book's cover.

Finally, I turn to my family. Writing this book would not have been as fun, engaging, and thought provoking had it not been for John Gershman, my partner. John traveled with me throughout Latin America and then worked by my side in Cambridge, Massachusetts; Manila, the Philippines; South Bend, Indiana; and now Princeton, New Jersey. His unmatched intellectual curiosity, profound insight, and charming irreverence often made me look at old material in new ways; this book and my life are all the better for it. Sarah and Rebecca Yashar-Gershman, our daughters, came along relatively late in the game, both born after the research was done and at a point when I thought I needed just one more year to complete the writing. That one year turned into several more, years that have hands down been the most exciting, hilarious, warm, if exhausting years of my life.

Cambridge University Press

0521534801 - Contesting Citizenship in Latin America: The Rise of Indigenous Movements
and the Postliberal Challenge

Deborah J. Yashar

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

Acknowledgments

It is to my parents, Audrey and John Yashar, that I dedicate this book. They have been an unending source of love, support, and inspiration. With their commitment to education, independence, and politics, they have always encouraged me to chart my own path and pursue big questions – even when my answers differed from their own. By their example, they have highlighted the importance of seeking that mutually beneficial, if elusive, balance between family and community, work and play. In the face of repeated uncertainty and adversity, they have embodied strength, determination, wisdom, and grace. For all this and more, I dedicate this book to them.

Deborah J. Yashar
Princeton, New Jersey
February 2004

List of Acronyms

CEB	Comunidades Eclesiales de Base
COICA	Coordinadora de Organizaciones Indígenas de la Cuenca Amazónica
ILO	International Labor Organization
NAFTA	North American Free Trade Agreement
NGO	Nongovernmental Organization
UN	United Nations
<i>Bolivia</i>	
ALAS	Asesoría Legal y de Asistencia Social
APCOB	Apoyo para el Campesino-Indígena del Oriente Boliviano
APG	Asamblea del Pueblo Guaraní
ASP	Asamblea por la Soberanía de los Pueblos
CABI	Capitanía del Alto y Bajo Izozog
CANOB	Centro Ayoreo Nativo del Oriente Boliviano
CCTK	Centro Campesino Tupak Katari
CEJIS	Centro de Estudios Jurídicos e Investigación Social
CICC	Central Indígena de Comunidades de Concepción
CICOL	Central Indígena de Comunidades Originarias de Lomerío
CIDAC	Centro de Investigación, Diseño Artesanal y Comercialización Cooperativa
CIDDEBENI	Centro de Investigación y Documentación para el Desarrollo del Beni

Cambridge University Press
 0521534801 - Contesting Citizenship in Latin America: The Rise of Indigenous Movements
 and the Postliberal Challenge

Deborah J. Yashar
 Frontmatter

[More information](#)

List of Acronyms

CIDOB	Confederación Indígena del Oriente, Chaco y Amazonía de Bolivia
CIMAR	Centro de Investigación y Manejo de Recursos Naturales Renovables
CIPCA	Centro de Investigación y Promoción del Campesinado
CNRA	Consejo Nacional de Reforma Agraria
CNTCB	Confederación Nacional de Trabajadores Campesinos de Bolivia
COB	Central Obrera Boliviana
COPNAG	Central de Organizaciones de los Pueblos Nativos Guarayos
CPIB	Central de Pueblos Indígenas del Beni
CSUTCB	Confederación Sindical Unica de Trabajadores Campesinos de Bolivia
INRA	Instituto Nacional de Reforma Agraria
MAS	Movimiento al Socialismo
MBL	Movimiento Bolivia Libre
MITKA	Movimiento Indio Tupak Katari
MNR	Movimiento Nacionalista Revolucionario
MRTKL	Movimiento Revolucionario Tupak Katari de Liberación
MUJA	Movimiento Universitario Julián Apaza
NEP	New Economic Policy
SAE	Subsecretaría de Asuntos Etnicos
TAYPI	Taller de Apoyo a Ayllus y Pueblos Indígenas
TCO	Tierras Comunitarias de Origen
THOA	Taller de Historia Oral Andina

Ecuador

AIEPRA	Asociación de Indígenas Evangélicos de Pastaza
BNF	Banco Nacional de Fomento
CEDOC	Central Ecuatoriana de Organizaciones Clasistas
CEPCU	Centro de Estudios Pluriculturales
CESA	Central Ecuatoriana de Servicios Agrícolas
CONACNIE	Consejo de Coordinación de las Nacionalidades Indígenas del Ecuador

Cambridge University Press
 0521534801 - Contesting Citizenship in Latin America: The Rise of Indigenous Movements
 and the Postliberal Challenge

Deborah J. Yashar
 Frontmatter

[More information](#)

List of Acronyms

CONAIE	Confederación de Nacionalidades Indígenas del Ecuador
CONFENAIE	Confederación de Nacionalidades Indígenas de la Amazonía Ecuatoriana
CTE	Confederación de Trabajadores del Ecuador
ECUARUNARI	Ecuador Runacunapac Riccharimui (Awakening of the Ecuadorean Indian)
FEDECAP	Federación de Desarrollo Campesino de Pastaza
FEI	Federación Ecuatoriana de Indios
FEINE	Federación Ecuatoriana de Indígenas Evangélicos
FENOC	Federación Nacional de Organizaciones Campesinas
FENOC-I	Federación Nacional de Organizaciones Campesinas e Indígenas
FEPOCAN	Federación Provincial de Organizaciones Campesinas del Napo
FEPP	Fondo Ecuatoriano Populorum Progressio
FICI	Federación Indígena y Campesina de Imbabura
FOIN	Federación de Organizaciones Indígenas del Napo
FODERUMA	Fondo de Desarrollo Rural Marginal
IERAC	Instituto Ecuatoriano de Reforma Agraria y Colonización
MICH	Movimiento Indígena de Chimborazo
OPIP	Organización de Pueblos Indígenas de Pastaza

Guatemala

CERJ	Consejo de Comunidades Étnicas Runujel Junam (Council of Ethnic Communities “We Are All Equal”)
COMG	Consejo de Organizaciones Mayas de Guatemala
CONIC	Coordinadora Nacional Indígena y Campesina

Mexico

CNC	Confederación Nacional Campesina
EZLN	Ejército Zapatista de Liberación Nacional
PRI	Partido Revolucionario Institucional

Cambridge University Press
0521534801 - Contesting Citizenship in Latin America: The Rise of Indigenous Movements
and the Postliberal Challenge

Deborah J. Yashar
Frontmatter

[More information](#)

List of Acronyms

Peru

AIDSESEP	Asociación Interétnica de Desarrollo de la Selva Peruana
CAP	Cooperativa Agraria de Producción
CNA	Confederación Nacional Agraria
CONAP	Confederación de Nacionalidades de la Amazonía Peruana
SAIS	Sociedad Agrícola de Interés Social
SINAMOS	Sistema Nacional de Apoyo a la Movilización Nacional
SNA	Sociedad Nacional Agraria
UNCA	Unión de Comunidades Aymaras