> "Balogh's splendid synthesis convincingly describes how the federal government unobtrusively shaped the growth of the nation. Along the way, he also reveals the vital relationship between high political theory and policy implementation in the making of the American state."

- Richard Bensel, Cornell University

"In this pathbreaking book, Brian Balogh brings *into* sight the hidden wellsprings of national political authority in America's supposedly stateless nineteenth century. Combining revealing new historical research with a deft grasp of both historical and political science scholarship, Balogh not only untangles the mystery of how a national government so putatively weak could govern so powerfully in advance of modern bureaucracy; he also offers an extraordinary historical vista on the governing challenges of our own era."

- Jacob S. Hacker, University of California, Berkeley

"Brian Balogh recasts our understanding of the role of government in the United States. His ambitious and elegant interpretation changes the plot line of American history, replacing fantasies of ungoverned freedom and iconoclastic reformers with a deeper story, cutting against some of the most enduring myths of American history."

- Edward L. Ayers, University of Richmond

"Returning political history to a pride of place and combining rich assessments of federalism, political thought, territorial expansion, political economy, and judicial decision making, this synoptic inquiry convincingly solves a great mystery. By explaining why the vigorous activities of American federal governance were elusive and hard to credit despite the wide arc of public authority, this powerfully argued and deeply researched book puts to rest the myth of a weak nineteenth-century state."

- Ira Katznelson, Columbia University

### A Government Out of Sight

Although it is obvious that America's state and local governments were consistently active during the nineteenth century, a period dominated by laissez-faire, political historians of twentieth-century America have assumed that the national government did very little during this period. A Government Out of Sight challenges this premise, chronicling the ways in which the national government intervened powerfully in the lives of nineteenth-century Americans through the law, subsidies, and the use of third parties (including state and local governments), while avoiding bureaucracy. Americans have always turned to the national government – especially for economic development and expansion – and in the nineteenth century even those who argued for a small, nonintrusive central government demanded that the national government expand its authority to meet the nation's challenges. In revising our understanding of the ways in which Americans turned to the national government throughout this period, this study fundamentally alters our perspective on American political development in the twentieth century, shedding light on contemporary debates between progressives and conservatives about the proper size of government and government programs and subsidies that even today remain "out of sight."

Brian Balogh is an associate professor in the Department of History at the University of Virginia and Chair of the Governing America in a Global Era Program at the Miller Center of Public Affairs. He is author of Chain Reaction: Expert Debate and Public Participation in American Commercial Nuclear Power, 1945-1975 and editor of Integrating the Sixties: The Origins, Structures and Legitimacy of Public Policy in a Turbulent Decade. He has published articles and essays about Progressive Era politics, the link between interest groups and public policy, and the legacy of Vietnam - some of which have appeared in the Journal of Policy History, Studies in American Political Development, and Social Science History and Environmental History. He also serves on the editorial board of the Journal of Policy History and Studies in American Political Development. Balogh is a frequent commentator on politics in the national media. He co-hosts a radio show, Backstory with the American History Guys, that is carried on several NPR-affiliated stations. Before receiving his Ph.D. in history at The Johns Hopkins University, Balogh ran several welfare programs for the City of New York and was an adviser to New York City Council President Carol Bellamy.

# A Government Out of Sight

The Mystery of National Authority in Nineteenth-Century America

**BRIAN BALOGH** 

University of Virginia and the Miller Center of Public Affairs



> CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY PRESS Cambridge, New York, Melbourne, Madrid, Cape Town, Singapore, São Paulo, Delhi

> > Cambridge University Press 32 Avenue of the Americas, New York, NY 10013-2473, USA

www.cambridge.org Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9780521527866

© Brian Balogh 2009

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2009

Printed in the United States of America

A catalog record for this publication is available from the British Library.

Library of Congress Cataloging in Publication data

Balogh, Brian.

A government out of sight: the mystery of national authority in nineteenth-century America/Brian Balogh.

p. cm.

Includes bibliographical references and index.

ISBN 978-0-521-82097-4 (hbk.) – ISBN 978-0-521-52786-6 (pbk.) I. United States – Politics and government – 19th century. 2. Conservatism – United

States – History – 19th century. 3. Liberalism – United States – History – 19th

century. 4. Progressivism (United States politics) 5. Free enterprise -

United States - History - 19th century. I. Title.

JK216.B33 2009

320.97309'034–dc22 2008054803

ISBN 978-0-521-82097-4 hardback ISBN 978-0-521-52786-6 paperback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party Internet Web sites referred to in this publication and does not guarantee that any content on such Web sites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate. Information regarding prices, travel timetables, and other factual information given in this work are correct at the time of first printing, but Cambridge University Press does not guarantee the accuracy of such information thereafter.

For CMB, JEB, DAB, and KC

Cambridge University Press
978-0-521-52786-6 - A Government Out of Sight: The Mystery of National Authority in
Nineteenth-Century America
Brian Balogh
Frontmatter
More information

### Contents

Acknowledgments		<i>page</i> ix
I	Introduction: Why Look Back?	I
2	How Americans Lost Sight of the State: Adapting Republican Virtue to Liberal Self-Interest	18
3	Between Revolutions: The Promise of the Developmental Vision	53
4	"To Strengthen and Perpetuate that Union": Republican Political Economy	112
5	Outside the Boundaries: "Powers and Energies in the Extreme Parts"	151
6	The Uncontested State: Letters, Law, Localities	219
7	Restoring "Spontaneous Action and Self-Regulation": Civil War and Civil Society	277
8	Judicial Exceptions to Gilded Age Laissez-Faire	309
9	"A Special Form of Associative Action": New Liberalism and the National Integration of Public and Private	352
10	Conclusion: Sighting the Twentieth-Century State	379
Index		401

## Acknowledgments

I could not have written this book without the support of friends and colleagues. Several individuals stand out as both. Ed Ayers provided enthusiasm, encouragement, and insight when I most needed it. He even let me score a few points on a variety of sporting surfaces. Mel Leffler balanced Ed's optimism with keen critical skepticism. He, too, provided extraordinary levels of friendship and scholarly insight over the years, except after a loss by the New York football Giants. Ed Russell, like Mel and Ed, read multiple drafts of the manuscript and offered smart criticism and invaluable personal guidance during our weekly walks. Lou Galambos continued the wise, incisive guidance that he has now provided for more than twenty years. The late Steve Innes was a source of inspiration and insight. Were he still alive, I know that he would be urging me to push the story back, well into the sixteenth century.

As readers who venture into the footnotes will soon discover, the work of two other friends and colleagues at the University of Virginia provided the intellectual framework for a good portion of my argument. Peter Onuf's brilliant conceptualization of Jeffersonian democracy and Americans' shared developmental quest provided a foundation for *A Government Out of Sight*. Chuck McCurdy's inspired reinterpretation of the independent authority of the law informed my understanding of state-society relations throughout the last two thirds of the nineteenth century. Many other colleagues in the Corcoran Department of History served as guides to the nineteenth century. Gary Gallagher, Michael Holt, and Olivier Zunz read the entire manuscript and drew on their expertise to make this a better book.

x

Cambridge University Press 978-0-521-52786-6 - A Government Out of Sight: The Mystery of National Authority in Nineteenth-Century America Brian Balogh Frontmatter More information

#### Acknowledgments

I benefitted greatly from commentary provided by my readers at Cambridge University Press. Bruce Schulman drew upon his mastery of twentieth-century U.S. history to offer criticism and suggestions that I hope will resonate with readers in our field. Bruce illuminated many of the connections between the nineteenth and twentieth centuries. Few scholars know the nineteenth century better than Richard John. Richard spared no effort in sharing his knowledge with me. A small army of other scholars have read the entire manuscript or portions of it and offered valuable criticism and suggestions. I am grateful for the guidance offered by Alan Brinkley, Richard Bensel, Lis Clemens, Gareth Davies, Robin Einhorn, Mary Furner, Patrick Griffin, John Mark Hansen, Ira Katznelson, Sid Milkis, Bill Novak, Dorothy Ross, Herman Schwartz, and Jim Sparrow.

I have learned more from the graduate students I have worked with over the years than they have learned from me. Those who deserve special thanks for their intellectual contributions to this project include Christy Chapin, Derek Hoff, Meg Jacobs, Chris Loss, Andrew McGee, Paul Milazzo, Alan Miller, Andy Morris, Brian Murphy, Johan Neem, Chris Nichols, Laura Phillips, Taylor Stoermer, Andy Trees, Drew Van de Creek, and Rai Wilson. Graduate students have also provided timely research assistance. I would like to thank Michael Broome, Vanessa May, Peter Norton, and Drew Van de Creek, and I offer special thanks to James Lawson, who never met a fact that did not need checking or a quotation that did not need correcting. I also want to thank Jim for preparing the index.

The Miller Center of Public Affairs has been a crucial source of institutional support and intellectual stimulation. Former director Phillip Zelikow, interim director Gene Fife, and current director Gerald L. Baliles were unwavering supporters of this project. I would also like to thank the staff at the Miller Center and offer a special shout-out to Sheila Blackford, Sean Gallagher, George Gilliam, Sarah Graham, Mike Greco, Stephanie Hassell, Maurice Jones, Chi Lam, Wistar Morris, Mike Mullen, Anne Mulligan, Taylor Reveley, and Joseph Taylor. My colleagues in the Governing America in a Global Era Program and many of the Miller Center Fellows and their "dream mentors" have been a great source of intellectual stimulation. I would also like to thank the panelists and audiences at the following conferences and seminars, where I presented portions of the manuscript: the American Political Development Workshop, University of Chicago; the Institute for Social and Economic Research and Policy Twentieth-Century American Politics and Society Workshop at Columbia University; the University of Texas Department of History

### Acknowledgments

Workshop on Politics and History; the Ecole Des Hautes Etudes En Sciences Sociales; and the Policy History Conference. I have received a generous fellowship from the Woodrow Wilson International Center for Scholars and generous research support from the National Endowment for the Humanities, the Bankard Fund for Political Economy, and the University of Virginia College of Arts and Sciences.

Frank Smith is a dream editor. Smart, *patient*, and extraordinarily well informed, he provided good counsel and valuable criticism from the inception of this project to its conclusion. The team at Newgen Imaging Systems made copy editing relatively painless and saved me from many errors. Thanks also to Cathy Felgar for overseeing the production process and to Jeanie Lee, for her assistance.

Friends also made this book possible. Among those who are scholars, I am indebted to Ed Berkowitz, Jack Brown, Bernie Carlson, Don Critchlow, Martha Derthick, Dall Forsythe, George Gilliam, Grace Hale, John Mark Hansen, Lisa Cobbs Hoffman, Phyllis Leffler, Doug Rossinow, Ed Sermier, Tom Sugrue, Julian Zelizer, and Jon Zimmerman. Among my friends who live in the fiscal year as opposed to the academic year, I would like to thank Robert Balogh, Greg Briehl, David Carley, Carol and Phil Cooper, David and Trish Crowe, Greg Doull, Claire Gargalli, Page Gilliam, Steve Golub, Thomas Hines, Dan Josephthal, John Muresianu, Karen Rockwell, Barbara Salisbury, Ted Small, and Marcy Wagner. I would also like to thank the entire team at *Backstory with the American History Guys* for making history fun as I drew near the end of this project.

If my family thought that writing these acknowledgments delayed the completion of the book for one minute, they would insist that I not bother. But having already bothered them for far too long, I want to thank Michael Balogh, Robert Balogh, Sonya Balogh, Julia Garcia, and Katie Tanaka. Dustin Balogh helped me turn three projected books into one real one. Jake helped me by promising to accompany me on a vacation when I finished the book. Carmen sat with me through many losing UVA football games, providing welcome relief from writing and editing. Kathy Craig, my wife, has been an enduring source of inspiration, even though the vast majority of her support was carefully hidden in plain sight.

xi