The Political Economy of the United Nations Security Council

Money and Influence

Trades of money for political influence persist at every level of government. Not surprisingly, governments themselves trade money for political support on the international stage. Strange, however, is the tale of this book: In this study, legitimacy stands as the central political commodity at stake. The book investigates the ways governments trade money for favors at the United Nations Security Council, the body endowed with the international legal authority to legitimize the use of armed force to maintain or restore peace. With a wealth of quantitative data, the book shows that powerful countries, such as the United States, Japan, and Germany, extend financial favors to the elected members of the Security Council through direct foreign aid and through international organizations, such as the International Monetary Fund and the World Bank. In return, developing countries serving on the Security Council must deliver their political support – or face the consequences.

James Raymond Vreeland is Professor of International Relations at Georgetown University’s School of Foreign Service and holds a joint appointment in the Department of Government.

Axel Dreher is Professor of International and Development Politics at Heidelberg University.
For our godsons
The Political Economy of the United Nations Security Council

Money and Influence

JAMES RAYMOND VREELAND
Georgetown University

AXEL DREHER
Heidelberg University
Cambridge University Press
32 Avenue of the Americas, New York, NY 10013-2473, USA

Cambridge University Press is part of the University of Cambridge.
It furthers the University’s mission by disseminating knowledge in the pursuit of
education, learning, and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

www.cambridge.org
Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9780521740067

© James Raymond Vreeland and Axel Dreher 2014

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception
and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements,
no reproduction of any part may take place without the written
permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2014

Printed in the United States of America

A catalog record for this publication is available from the British Library.

Library of Congress Cataloging in Publication Data
Vreeland, James Raymond, 1971–
James Raymond Vreeland, Georgetown University; Axel Dreher, Heidelberg University.
pages cm
Includes bibliographical references and index.
JZ5006.7.V74 2014
341.23′23–dc23 2013043783

ISBN 978-0-521-51841-3 Hardback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs
for external or third-party Internet Web sites referred to in this publication and does not
guarantee that any content on such Web sites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.
Contents

Figures ix
Tables xi
Acknowledgments xiii

1. Money and Politics on the International Stage 1
   1.1 Trading Favors 1
   1.2 Do UNSC Votes Matter? 6
   1.3 Do UN Ambassadors Have Political Leverage over Bilateral and Multilateral Channels of Influence? 17
   1.4 What Are the Consequences of Politically Motivated Aid? 26
   1.5 Plan of the Book 27

   2.1 Introducing a Logic of Trading Favors on the International Stage 35
   2.2 The Vote-Aid Trade Game 38
   2.3 The Extended Form Game and Payoffs 40
       2.3.1 No Request or No Offer 41
       2.3.2 The Vote-Aid Trade Subgame 41
       2.3.3 The Vote-Aid Trade Payoffs 42
   2.4 A Solution to the Game 42
       2.4.1 To Cut or to Disburse 43
       2.4.2 To Comply or to Defect 43
       2.4.3 To Offer or Not 44
       2.4.4 To Request or Not 46
   2.5 Summarizing Equilibrium Strategies 47
   2.6 Archetypes: Too Close, Too Far, and Just Right 48
       2.6.1 Too Close 48
2.6.2 Or Too Far

2.6.3 Just Right

2.7 Changing the Value of the Vote and the Reputation Cost

2.8 Legitimizing Forceful Foreign Policy

2.8.1 Openly Paying Off UNSC Members

2.8.2 Obfuscation: Laundering Dirty Politics

2.8.3 Reputational Paradox

2.9 Testable Hypotheses

Appendix 2.1: A More Elegant Solution

3. Examples of Punishments, Threats, and Rewards

3.1 Types of Examples

3.2 Zimbabwe 1992

3.3 Yemen 1990

3.4 Zaire 1990–1991

3.5 So Close: Overdetermined Cases

3.6 And So Far: The Exception that “Proves the Rule”

3.7 Great Powers and Emerging Markets

3.8 Resolution 1441 and the Three Types: Too Close, Too Far, and Just Right

3.9 Circumstantial Evidence

3.10 Addressing Skepticism

4. Who Wins Election to Represent the World?

4.1 Myths versus Reality

4.2 The UNSC Election Rules

4.3 Conjectures

4.3.1 The UN Charter: International Peace and Security

4.3.2 Foreign Assistance

4.3.3 Power: A Realist View

4.3.4 Historical, Political, and Religious Connections

4.3.5 Taking Turns

4.3.6 Summary

4.4 The Statistical Model

4.5 Year, Country, and Cold War Effects

4.6 Model Estimation

4.7 Discussion of the Results

4.7.1 Commitment to Peace

4.7.2 Foreign Aid and Multilateral Lending

4.7.3 International Power and Political Connections

4.7.4 Colonial Heritage, Political Ideology, Religion, and Corruption
Contents

4.7.5 Turn-Taking and Rotation 133

4.8 The Way Forward 133

Appendix 4.1: Election Probabilities 135

5. Statistical Evidence of Trading Finance for Favors 137

5.1 Introduction 137

5.2 Background on Bilateral Aid: The United States, Japan, Germany, the United Kingdom, and France 137

5.3 Background on Multilateral Organizations: The IMF, the World Bank, the UN, and Regional Development Banks 139

5.4 Measuring the Effect of UNSC Membership 141

5.5 Addressing Potential Problems of UNSC Selection Bias 143

5.6 The Africa Solution 147

5.7 Data, Methods, and Analysis 148

5.7.1 Bilateral Aid 149

5.7.2 IMF and World Bank Programs 157

5.7.3 The UN 165

5.7.4 Regional Development Banks 169

5.7.5 Targeting Swing Voters 175

5.7.6 Voting Behavior on the UNSC 181

5.8 Conclusion: Summarizing the Main Findings 184

Appendix 5.1: Describing the Data Used in this Chapter 186

6. Consequences of Politically Motivated Aid 188

6.1 Does Foreign Aid Help or Hurt? 188

6.2 The Foreign Aid Debate 192

6.3 Pernicious Effects 194

6.4 A Conservative Analysis 198

6.5 Results 201

6.6 Democracy versus Dictatorship 209

6.7 Conclusion 218

Appendix 6.1: Describing the Data Used in this Chapter 219

7. Reforming the UNSC 220

7.1 And the World Will Live as One? 220

7.2 Cooperation and Sacrifice 222

7.3 Reforming Representation 229

7.3.1 Adding Elected Members 229

7.3.2 Adding Permanent Members without Veto Power 231

7.3.3 Adding Permanent Members with Veto Power 232

7.4 Representation, Accountability, and Term Limits 233

References 243

Author Index 271

Subject Index 279
Figures

1.1 Hypothetical threat level with “action” thresholds for three actors page 12
1.2 U.S. public support for a war to liberate Kuwait (UNSC Resolution 678, authorizing the use of force, November 29, 1990) 13
1.3 Public support of U.S. president before and after military action, without UNSC authorization versus with UNSC authorization 14
2.1 The vote-aid trade game 39
2.2 The reduced-form game 44
3.1 Average number of new World Bank projects per year for Zaire/Democratic Republic of Congo (1970–2004) 71
3.2 U.S. grants to Mauritius around the time of Resolution 1441 (November 8, 2002) 85
3.3 New World Bank projects in Argentina (1970–2000) 88
3.5 New World Bank projects in Algeria (1970–2000) 89
3.6 New World Bank projects in Indonesia (1970–2000) 89
3.7 New World Bank projects in Bangladesh (1971–2000) 90
4.1 Global participation on the UN Security Council (1946–2005) 112
5.1 Bilateral development aid to UNSC members and nonmembers (1960 to 2009) 150
5.2 Participation in IMF programs by UN Security Council member status over time 158
5.3 New World Bank projects by UN Security Council member status over time 161
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Figures</th>
<th>x</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>6.1 UNSC membership and economic growth (average four-year change in GDP/capita, 2000 US dollars) – global sample</td>
<td>194</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.2 UNSC membership and economic growth (average four-year change in GDP/capita, 2000 US dollars) – Asia sample</td>
<td>195</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.3 UNSC membership and economic growth (average four-year change in GDP/capita, 2000 US dollars) – Eastern Europe sample</td>
<td>196</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.4 UNSC membership and economic growth (average four-year change in GDP/capita, 2000 US dollars) – GRULAC sample</td>
<td>196</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.5 UNSC membership and economic growth (average four-year change in GDP/capita, 2000 US dollars) – Africa sample</td>
<td>197</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.6 Marginal effect of UNSC on World Bank project evaluation for different values of short-term debt (from estimates of Table 6.2, column 1)</td>
<td>205</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.7 Marginal effect of UNSC on World Bank project evaluation for different values of debt service as a percentage of GNI (from estimates of Table 6.2, column 2)</td>
<td>206</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.8 UNSC membership and economic growth (average four-year change in GDP/capita, 2000 US dollars) by UNSC membership status and by political regime in Africa</td>
<td>214</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.9 The marginal effect of UNSC membership on four-year change in GDP/capita for different values of Democracy</td>
<td>216</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7.1 Ratio of power in international organizations – “great powers” to the “rest of the world”</td>
<td>224</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7.2 Accountability and the probability of continuing in power</td>
<td>235</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Tables

4.1 The Africa Group and UNSC Participation (1946–2009)  page 106
4.2 The Asia Group and UNSC Participation (1946–2009)  108
4.3 The GRULAC and UNSC Participation (1946–2009)  109
4.4 The Eastern Europe Group and UNSC Participation (1946–2009)  110
4.5 The WEOG and UNSC Participation (1946–2009)  111
4.6 Hypotheses and Variables Used in Testing the Determinants of UNSC Election  117
4.7 The Determinants of UNSC Election  124
5.1 The Effect of UNSC Membership on Bilateral Aid from the United States, Japan, Germany, the United Kingdom, and France – Global Data Sample  151
5.2 The Effect of UNSC Membership on Bilateral Aid from the United States, Japan, Germany, the United Kingdom, and France – Africa Data Sample  155
5.3 The Effect of UNSC Membership on World Bank Loan Disbursements – Global and Africa Data Samples  163
5.4 The Effect of UNSC Membership on UN Foreign Aid – Global Data Sample  167
5.5 The Effect of UNSC Membership on UN Foreign Aid – Africa Data Sample  168
5.6 The Effect of UNSC Membership on African Development Bank Lending  174
5.7 Swing-Voter Hypothesis  178
5.41 Descriptive Data  186
6.1 The Effect of UNSC Membership on World Bank Project Evaluation  202
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Table</th>
<th>Title</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>6.2</td>
<td>The Effect of UNSC Membership and Economic Vulnerability on World Bank Project Evaluation</td>
<td>204</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.3</td>
<td>The Effect of UNSC Membership and Political Regime on Economic Performance in Africa</td>
<td>215</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.a1</td>
<td>Descriptive Data</td>
<td>219</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Acknowledgments

*The Godfather*, a motion picture about families, presents a logic of trading favors that we use in this book. The book itself would never have taken shape if not for favors—countless favors—that we have received. We thus find ourselves in debt to many friends and colleagues around the world. We like to think of these people as part of various extended families to which we have the good fortune to belong. So, for their innumerable contributions to this book, we thank the “five families.”

Coauthors

Our coauthors stand as the first family to acknowledge. This book represents the culmination of several studies on the United Nations Security Council that we have undertaken with various colleagues. These collaborations have transformed our thinking and have thoroughly impacted the writing of this book. We owe our coauthors an enormous debt of gratitude.

We thank Jan-Egbert Sturm, the coauthor of our original studies on the effects of Security Council membership on World Bank and IMF loans. He also continued to work with us on our study of IMF conditionality. We also thank the Swiss Federal Institute of Technology (ETH) Zurich, where Jan-Egbert is “the boss” of the KOF family. Through our affiliations with the KOF Swiss Economic Institute, one of the leading economic think tanks in Switzerland, we first met and began our studies on the Security Council.

We thank Stephan Klasen and Eric Werker, who worked with us on a study of the effects of foreign aid contingent on Security Council...
Acknowledgments

We are particularly grateful to Stephan for sharing his expert knowledge on World Bank programs and evaluations, while Eric co-authored (with Ilyana Kuziemko) the original study on the Security Council and U.S. foreign aid that inspired this book.

Matthew Gould and Matthew Rablen (whom we have taken to affectionately calling “the Matthews”) coauthored a study on the election of Security Council members. We actually met and did all of our work through the Internet, and so this collaboration represents the most modern kind. We thank them for developing a sophisticated statistical model to estimate the determinants of Security Council elections, as well as for their patience in working with us without face-to-face contact.

B. Peter Rosendorff is currently coauthoring with us an ongoing study of Security Council voting. He provided us immense help with the formal model presented in Chapter 2 (remaining errors are our own).

We also thank Peter Nunnenkamp for coauthoring a study on German foreign aid and the Security Council. No one can write a paper faster.

Students

We have also had the privilege of researching and writing with the next generation of our family of coauthors, our students.

For coauthoring the study on the Security Council and the Asian Development Bank, we thank Daniel Lim, who developed the hypothesis himself. We thank Maya Schmaljohann for coauthoring the study on the Security Council and German foreign aid, and Vera Eichenauer and Kai Gehring for coauthoring the study on foreign aid to UNSC members and economic growth.

We have learned a great deal from our students in general. Many of them have studied drafts of our work and provided constructive feedback. The 2014 Krogh Students merit special note. We are particularly grateful to the numerous students who have taken our courses on international organizations over the years. There are hundreds of them, far too many to list, but we want them to know that they have played an important role in shaping our thoughts about this project and about international relations in general. They will always be a part of us. For helping us conduct our courses, we thank teaching assistants Raphael Cohen, Anjali Dayal, Dani Nedal, Fouad Pervez, Alexandra Rudolph, and Alexandra Stark.

Some of our students have taken the time to provide detailed written assistance on the project. We are especially indebted to Kate Anthony, Timothy Dee, Elisabeth Dorfmeister, Thomas Mancinelli, Hesham
Acknowledgments

Sallam, and Yuko Shimada. For carefully reading every single page of the manuscript and providing page-by-page suggestions, very special thanks go to Alyssa Huberts. And for incredible research assistance – from checking sources to proofreading our discussions of statistical results – we extend our gratitude to Soumyajit “Shom” Mazumder.

Colleagues in the Professions of Economics and Political Science

We next turn to our extended family of colleagues, a large group that has improved our work in countless ways. We thank them for making our work fun as they interact with us at conferences, seminars, and through e-mail. We have received helpful comments from seminar attendees in many places including Bond University, the Browne Center for International Politics at the University of Pennsylvania, the Centre for International Governance Innovation (CIGI), Chicago University, Columbia University, Duke University, Escuela Superior de Administración y Dirección de Empresas (ESADE), the European Central Bank, the Niehaus Center for Globalization and Governance at Princeton University, Essex University, Facultad Latinoamericana de Ciencias Sociales (FLACSO), Free University of Brussels, Fribourg University, Fundación Juan March, George Washington University, Institut Barcelona d’Estudis Internacionals (IEBI), Instituto de Relações Internacionais (Universidade de São Paulo), Korea University, London School of Economics (LSE), Lund University, Manhattan College, Minnesota University, New York University, Nova Southeastern University, Peking University, Penn State, Pittsburg University, RWI Essen, Solvay Brussels School, University of California at Los Angeles (UCLA), University of Dresden, University of Duisburg-Essen, University of Geneva, University of Giessen, University of Illinois at Urbana-Champaign, University of Kassel, University of Kiel, University of Lucerne, University of Marburg, University of Massachusetts Amherst, University of Milan-Bicocca, University of Osnabrück, University of Pittsburgh, University of St. Gallen, University of Texas at Austin, University of Virginia, University of Wisconsin-Madison, Vassar College, Vienna University of Economics and Business, Villanova University, the World Trade Institute, University of Bayreuth, University of Bergen, WIFO Vienna, and Yale University.

In addition to recognizing these institutions, we wish to acknowledge the following libraries around the world where we found a place to work during our travels and completed much of the work for this project: the Georgetown Neighborhood Library (Washington, DC), the
Joong-Ang Library (Korea University), the Kingston Library (Kingston, NY), the Lauinger Library (Georgetown University), the Lázaro Library (University of Puerto Rico, Río Piedras), the New York Public Library Main Branch (New York, NY), the O’Malley Library (Manhattan College), the Sachem Public Library (Holbrook, NY), the Soundview Library (Bronx, NY), the Weston Branch Library (Weston, FL), and the Zurich Central Library (University of Zurich).

We have received constructive feedback from participants at many conferences as well, including the Political Economy of International Organizations meetings in Geneva, Washington, Zurich, Mannheim/Heidelberg, and Philadelphia; the Beyond Basic Questions conferences in Göttingen and Lucerne; the Canadian Economic Association Meeting in Halifax; the Christmas Meeting of the German-Speaking Economists Abroad at Mannheim University; the Effectiveness of Aid for Development workshop in Barcelona; the European Economic Association meeting in Barcelona; the European Economic Association meeting in Budapest; the European Public Choice Society meeting in Amsterdam; the European Public Choice Society meeting in Izmir; the German Development Economics Association meeting in Frankfurt; the International Political Economy Society meeting in Philadelphia; the International Society for New Institutional Economics meeting in Reykjavik; the International Studies Association meeting in Chicago; the National Political Science Association meeting in Boston; the Royal Economic Society Annual Conference in Warwick; and the Silvaplana Workshop on Political Economy in Pontresina.

We are humbled by the valuable insights we have received from many of the participants at the aforementioned presentations and cannot possibly list them all. For specific and written comments, we would like to thank Faisal Ahmed, Tim Allen, Manuela Angelucci, David Bearce, Christian Bjørnskov, Thomas Bräuninger, Lawrence Broz, Tim Büthe, Eugenio Cano, Terrence Chapman, Pamela Chasek, Eunbin Chung, Mark Copelovitch, Christina Davis, Michael Doyle, Peter Egger, Chris Elbers, Ofer Eldar, Marcel Fafchamps, Songying Fang, Christina Fattore, John Freeman, Sumit Ganguly, Ingo Geishecker, Adam Glynn, Joanne Gowa, Lloyd Gruber, Jan Gunning, Birger Heldt, Simon Hug, Ian Hurd, Paul Huth, Nathan Jensen, Didac Queralt Jiménez, Silva Kantareva, Judith Kelley, Gary King, Stephen Knack, Jean Krasno, Quan Li, Dalton Lin, Phillip Lipsy, Andre Lowe, Colum Lynch, Thomas Markussen, Lisa Martin, Covadonga Meseguer,
Acknowledgments

Bessma Momani, Kevin Morrison, Hannes Müller, Connor Myers, Steve Nelson, Rich Nielsen, Martin Paldam, Jon Pevehouse, Pablo Pinto, Varun Piplani, Stephanie Rickard, Shanker Satyanath, Mark Sawyer, Holger Schmidt, Friedrich Schneider, Robert Schub, Ken Shadlen, Beth Simmons, Alastair Smith, Stefan Sperlich, Randall Stone, Daniel Y. J. Tan, Eva Terberger, Dustin Tingley, Nathaniel Tisa, Shawn Treier, Burcu Ucayer, Jürgen von Hagen, Robert Wade, Yuval Weber, Scott Wolford, and George L. C. Yin. We are particularly indebted to Christopher Kilby; in addition to reading and offering helpful suggestions on numerous working papers related to this project, Christopher helped us develop the book’s title and the title of the first chapter. We also thank the editors and anonymous reviewers of our journal articles on this subject matter, as well as the reviewers of this manuscript for Cambridge University Press.

For supplying important information through interviews and correspondence, we are very grateful to Secretary Madeleine Albright, Ambassador John Bolton, Ben Chang, Andrew S. Natsios, and John Pilger. Their rich experience beyond the halls of academia makes them especially valuable colleagues. We stress that their consent to be quoted should not be taken as an endorsement of any of our conclusions. Indeed, in some cases they disagree with us. Their willingness to share their time and thoughts with us is a testament to their commitment to the free exchange of ideas.

We would also like to express thanks to our editorial team at Cambridge University Press, our editor Deborah Gershenowitz and her assistant Dana Bricken, as well as Joshua Penney, our production editor. We further thank our copy editor, Jane Voodikon, and our indexer, Julia Petrakis. For his patience, professionalism, and endless assistance, special thanks go to Shashank Shankar, our project manager at Aptara, the editorial and composition service company for our book.

Colleagues at Home Institutions

Both of us have moved around a bit while working on this project and thus have benefited from several families at home institutions. We thank all of our wonderful colleagues at these amazing universities. Again, we are humbled by the support that we have received from many people – too many to list here. We would like to make a public expression of gratitude to those colleagues who have provided specific and detailed comments.
Acknowledgments

From Yale University, we thank Keith Darden, Greg Huber, Stathis Kalyvas, David Mayhew, Harris Mylonas, Bruce Russett, and Kenneth Scheve. For administrative support, we thank Sandy Nuhn. We also thank participants in the Leitner Political Economy Seminar.

From Georgetown University, we thank Marc Busch, Donald Daniel, Raj Desai, Michael Green, Shareen Joshi, Rodney Ludema, Anna Maria Mayda, Kathleen McNamara, Abraham Newman, Anders Olofsgård, Dennis Quinn, Jennifer Tobin, Charles Udomsaph, and Erik Voeten. We acknowledge the William V. O’Brien Endowment for funding student research assistants. For administrative support, we thank Halley Lisuk, Moira Todd, and Eva Zamarippa of the Mortara Center for International Studies. We also thank participants in the Political Economy Tuesday Lunch Group and the Georgetown University International Theory and Research Seminar (GUITARS). Hoya Saxa!

From ETH Zurich, the Georg-August University of Göttingen, and Heidelberg University, we thank Christian Conrad, Andreas Fuchs, Martin Gassebner, Stephan Klasen, Michael Lamla, Christoph Moser, Frank Somogyi, and Jan-Egbert Sturm.

Family

We close our acknowledgments by thanking the people nearest and dearest to us, whose support has carried us through this demanding project and, more generally, our careers.

Vreeland thanks friends of ours, Zé Cheibub, Jennifer Gandhi, Fernando Limongi, Sebastian Saiegh, and the boss, Adam Przeworski.

Vreeland especially wishes to express his gratitude and love to his parents, James and Joan, who have shown unwavering support for him throughout his life. He further thanks his sister Kristen, his brother-in-law Aris, and his nephew Brian for all of their love and support. He also thanks his cousin Bill and his family – Maureen, Billy, and Jenn. Whenever he flew off to meet with colleagues to work on this project, they were always ready to put him up for a night and make runs to the old Idlewild Airport.

Dreher thanks Martin Gassebner, who probably most closely followed the ups and downs involved with working on this project over the years. He thanks his PhD supervisor, Roland Vaubel, for raising his interest in the political economy of international organizations. And most especially, he thanks Diana, not least for accepting the work on this project (and others) when he should have spent more time with her.
Acknowledgments

Finally, we acknowledge the next generation – for their inspiration to continue our work. We dedicate this book to Adam Michael Arcuik, Lukas Dreher, Alex Raymond Frias, Aris Vreeland Frias, Jonas König, and Juan Carlos Serrano – of course – our godsons.