

### The Sins of the Nation and the Ritual of Apologies

In the last years of the twentieth century, political leaders the world over began to apologize for wrongs in their nations' pasts. Many dismissed these apologies as "mere words," cynical attempts to avoid more costly forms of reparation; others rejected them as inappropriate encroachments into politics or forms of action that belonged in personal relationships or religion. Yet political apologies have gripped nations and provoked tremendous resistance. To understand apology's extraordinary political emergence, we have to suspend our automatic interpretations of what it means for nations to apologize and interrogate the meaning afresh. Taking the reader on a journey through apology's religious history and contemporary apologetic dramas, this book argues that the apologetic phenomenon marks a new stage in our recognition of the importance of collective responsibility, the place of ritual in addressing national wrongs, and the contribution that practices that once belonged in the religious sphere might make to contemporary politics.

Danielle Celermajer is currently a Senior Lecturer in Sociology and Social Policy at the University of Sydney. She was formerly Director of Indigenous Policy at the Australian Human Rights Commission. She was the recipient of grants from the Fulbright Foundation and the Rockefeller Foundation, as well as a Mellon Fellowship. She has written extensively on transitional justice, human rights, religion, and the political thought of Hannah Arendt, and she recently co-edited a forthcoming book on Hannah Arendt and political judgement.



# The Sins of the Nation and the Ritual of Apologies

DANIELLE CELERMAJER

University of Sydney





#### CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY PRESS

Cambridge, New York, Melbourne, Madrid, Cape Town, Singapore, São Paulo, Delhi

Cambridge University Press 32 Avenue of the Americas, New York, NY 10013-2473, USA www.cambridge.org Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9780521516693

© Danielle Celermajer 2009

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2009

Printed in the United States of America

A catalog record for this publication is available from the British Library.

Library of Congress Cataloging in Publication Data

Celermajer, Danielle.

The sins of the nation and the ritual of apologies / Danielle Celermajer.

Includes bibliographical references and index.

ISBN 978-0-521-51669-3 (hardback)

1. Apologizing - Political aspects. 2. Restorative justice. I. Title.

JC578.C456 2009

320.01'I - dc22 2008044137

ISBN 978-0-521-51669-3 hardback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party Internet Web sites referred to in this publication and does not guarantee that any content on such Web sites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate. Information regarding prices, travel timetables, and other factual information given in this work are correct at the time of first printing, but Cambridge University Press does not guarantee the accuracy of such information thereafter.



For Isaac, Hela, and John before and Arielle after.



## Contents

Acknowledgements  Introduction: The Apology and Political Theory		page 1x	
		I	
1	The Apology Phenomenon	14	
2	Apologies as Speech Acts	43	
3	Judaism's Apology: Reconstituting the Community	65	
4	The Privatization of Repentance in Christianity	108	
5	Australia's Divided History	142	
6	Saying Sorry in Australia	171	
7	Apology's Responsibility	215	
8	Apology as Political Action	247	
Bibliography		265	
Index		279	

vii



## Acknowledgements

My first thanks go to the people who taught me about injustice, identity, and suffering beyond law and who planted the demand that motivated this work. They are, on one side, my blood family who told me our own Holocaust story from my very beginning, and on the other side my Aboriginal co-citizens who told me their story and showed me how it was also mine. My particular thanks to all the Indigenous and non-Indigenous people with whom I worked at the Australian Human Rights and Equal Opportunity Commission. It was through those relationships that I began to think deeply about the living politics of recognition and identity, and to understand that really addressing human rights violations requires entering deeply into the way we experience each other. Above all, my heartfelt thanks to Mick Dodson, the great Aboriginal leader who allowed me to enter deeply into his very personal political world and at the same time entered into mine.

More formally, I'd like to thank the Fulbright Commission for believing in my aspirations with such enthusiasm and practical support, and in particular Mrs. W. G. Walker, whose fellowship supported the early parts of this work. I would also like to thank Columbia University and the Mellon Foundation, both of which supported me while I worked on this project. Thank you also to the University of Sydney, where I completed the manuscript. My thanks also to my editor at Cambridge, Lew Bateman, who recognized the value of the project and coaxed it through to the final form in which it now rests, and to Emily Spangler, also at Cambridge, for her tireless and graceful assistance.

Bettina Cass, Moira Gatens, Paul Patton, and Jim Tully may no longer recall their connection with this work, but it was their encouragement that supported my shift from front-line political action to more reflective political theory. Without their confidence and passion I could not have taken the plunge. My deepest thanks to Ruti Teitel, who engaged with this project while it was still



Acknowledgements

X

but an abstract presence across the world on the end of the Internet and who has continued to enrich my intellectual engagement to this day.

At Columbia University, my foremost thanks go to my two principal advisors, Jean Cohen and Ira Katznelson. Their reflections and input enriched my thinking and this project enormously. I am particularly grateful for their having recognized that this project emerged from my own idiosyncratic intersection of interests, and for supporting me in working outside the box. Thank you also to Jeremy Waldron, who opened invaluable doors in my exploration of the link between politics and religion.

At the University of Sydney, I would like to thank Vrasidas Karalis, whose unique combination of humour, irreverence, and brilliance painted a unique intellectual context, and my wonderful colleague Rebecca Scott Bray, whose belief in me was so enriching. Thanks also to Tim Fitzpatrick, who provided important practical support for the completion of the manuscript, and most especially to Kathryn Leader, who went well beyond the call of duty in assisting me to complete the manuscript.

I would also like to acknowledge the contribution several teachers and colleagues made to my thinking: Susan Shapiro (Levinas), Jim Tully (recognition beyond tolerance), Brian Barry (endless fights on multiculturalism), Darius Rejali (for orienting my thinking), and Rabbi Roly Matalon (God). Thank you to Andrew Nathan, Julie Stone Peters, and Thomas Pogge for initiating and running the Human Rights colloquium, which provided those of us working on human rights at Columbia with an intellectual community.

Outside the academy, my undying thanks to Anni Parker, for being our family, for her practical love, and for making it possible for me to know my daughter would always have another home while I buried myself here. Thank you Lois Alexander, Andrew Hahn, Jill Hammer, Shoshana Jedwab, Naomi Meyer, Dinah Pokempner, Lester Ruiz, and Josh Saltzman for being friends who walked with me head and heart throughout this work and deepened my understanding more than they could know.

And of course, thank you to my family, who let me go so far away and supported me in so many ways – my mother, who never allowed me to doubt what I was capable of, and most especially my brother David who bore so much responsibility in my absence. Although he will never hold this book in his hands, my father's presence lies at the foundation of my search for a justice always beyond what we have.

This work would not have been written without the often silent support of Chris de Bono, who once said that he was always on my side, and really meant it. Nor would I have had the loving context in which to sustain the attention years into the project without Leonard McDonald, who both recognized what it means to create thinking and cooked me endless late dinners. Finally, every page would have been far duller without the ever-present colour and luminous love of my daughter, Arielle.