

Cambridge University Press

978-0-521-51603-7 - The Law of Charitable Status: Maintenance and Removal

Robert Meakin

Table of Contents

[More information](#)

## Contents

|          |   |                |
|----------|---|----------------|
|          | <i>Table of Cases</i>   | <i>page xi</i> |
|          | <i>Table of Statutes</i>  | <i>xviii</i>   |
| <b>1</b> | <b>Introduction</b>   | <b>1</b>       |
|          | Introduction  | 1              |
|          | Basic propositions  | 1              |
|          | Summary of the book   | 3              |
|          | Why the power to remove charities from the register is important          | 4              |
|          | The importance of the charity sector in the delivery of public services   | 4              |
|          | Tax reliefs   | 6              |
|          | Donors  | 6              |
|          | Law reform  | 7              |
|          | Introduction to the general law   | 8              |
|          | The register of charities   | 8              |
|          | The Commission's powers of removal  | 8              |
|          | General approach to writing the book                                      | 10             |
| <b>2</b> | <b>Essential indicia of charitable status</b>                             | <b>12</b>      |
|          | Introduction  | 12             |
|          | A legal obligation to carry out the charitable purposes                   | 14             |
|          | One or more of the three certainties is lacking                           | 18             |
|          | Certainty of words  | 18             |
|          | Certainty of subject matter   | 19             |
|          | Certainty of objects  | 19             |
|          | Express clauses in a governing instrument which prevent charitable status | 20             |
|          | The charitable objects are too widely drafted                             | 22             |
|          | Jurisdiction  | 23             |
|          | Charitable purposes   | 23             |
|          | What are charitable purposes?   | 24             |
|          | The Commission's dilemma  | 26             |
|          | Objects or activities?  | 27             |

Cambridge University Press

978-0-521-51603-7 - The Law of Charitable Status: Maintenance and Removal

Robert Meakin

Table of Contents

[More information](#)

## Contents

|  |           |
|--|-----------|
| The objects are ambiguous  | 28        |
| There is a doubt about whether the objects are charitable                        | 29        |
| The objects do not pass the public benefit test                                  | 30        |
| Sham charities   | 31        |
| Objects or activities: Conclusion  | 31        |
| Fine distinctions  | 32        |
| Public benefit   | 34        |
| Introduction   | 34        |
| What is public benefit?  | 34        |
| Why is public benefit important to the question of removal now?                  | 34        |
| Problem areas in the law of public benefit                                       | 35        |
| Little analysis by the court   | 35        |
| Public benefit differs from one head of charity to another                       | 36        |
| The balance between public and private benefit                                   | 37        |
| Harm or benefit?   | 37        |
| Emphasis on form over substance  | 38        |
| Anomalous decisions  | 41        |
| The concept of public benefit changes with time                                  | 41        |
| Public benefit conclusion  | 42        |
| Viability  | 42        |
| Independence from the state  | 43        |
| Conclusion   | 43        |
| <b>3 The powers of the Commission to remove charities from the register</b>      | <b>45</b> |
| Introduction   | 45        |
| ‘No longer considers is a charity’   | 45        |
| ‘Ceased to exist’  | 50        |
| ‘Does not operate’   | 50        |
| Rectification  | 52        |
| Summary  | 52        |
| ‘No Longer considers is a charity’   | 52        |
| Never a charity  | 53        |
| Never had the essential indicia of charitable status                             | 53        |
| Sham charities   | 54        |
| Change in the law  | 57        |
| Mistaken understanding of the law  | 59        |
| Distinguishing decisions of the court  | 60        |
| Removal on a different ground  | 65        |
| Making law   | 65        |
| <i>Cy-pres</i> application of property where the institution was never a charity | 67        |
| Special trusts   | 69        |
| Rectification  | 69        |

Cambridge University Press

978-0-521-51603-7 - The Law of Charitable Status: Maintenance and Removal

Robert Meakin

Table of Contents

[More information](#)

|   | Contents |
|---|----------|
| An institution was a charity but is no longer charitable  | 71       |
| Introduction  | 71       |
| <i>Cy-pres</i> where the institution was a charity but is no longer charitable                        | 71       |
| ‘Any change in its trusts’  | 73       |
| ‘Ceased to exist’   | 75       |
| Trusts  | 76       |
| Trusts without permanent endowment  | 76       |
| Trusts with permanent endowment   | 77       |
| Unincorporated associations   | 80       |
| Companies limited by guarantee  | 80       |
| Striking off  | 81       |
| Petitions to wind up a company  | 81       |
| The survival of charity following dissolution   | 81       |
| Restoration to the register   | 82       |
| <i>Bona vacantia</i> property applied <i>cy-pres</i> by the Crown                                     | 82       |
| Special trusts  | 83       |
| The survival of charity following dissolution – Conclusion  | 83       |
| ‘Does not operate’  | 83       |
| Conclusion  | 84       |
| <br>  |          |
| <b>4</b> <b>Limits on the Commission’s powers to remove controversial charities from the register</b> | 85       |
| Introduction  | 85       |
| Charities connected to the state  | 85       |
| Why are charities connected to the state controversial?   | 86       |
| Possible grounds for removal  | 86       |
| Critical analysis of the possible grounds for removal   | 87       |
| How the critical analysis supports the basic propositions   | 89       |
| Charitable schools which charge fees  | 89       |
| Why charitable schools which charge fees are controversial  | 89       |
| Possible grounds for removal  | 90       |
| Critical analysis of the possible grounds for removal   | 91       |
| How the critical analysis supports the basic propositions   | 93       |
| New religious movement charities  | 94       |
| Why new religious movement charities are controversial  | 94       |
| Possible grounds for removal  | 94       |
| Failure to demonstrate public benefit   | 94       |
| Not promoting a religion for the purposes of charity law  | 95       |
| Critical analysis of the possible grounds for removal   | 97       |
| Failure to demonstrate public benefit   | 97       |
| Not promoting a ‘Religion’ for the purpose of charity law   | 99       |
| How the critical analysis supports the basic propositions   | 102      |
| Conclusion  | 102      |
|   | vii      |

Cambridge University Press

978-0-521-51603-7 - The Law of Charitable Status: Maintenance and Removal

Robert Meakin

Table of Contents

[More information](#)

## Contents

|          |   |     |
|----------|---|-----|
| <b>5</b> | <b>Property</b>   | 103 |
|          | Introduction  | 103 |
|          | The position of the Commission  | 103 |
|          | What is 'charity'?  | 104 |
|          | The institution was never a charity   | 105 |
|          | The institution was a charity but has ceased to have charitable purposes  | 108 |
|          | What happens to the property of a charity which is removed from the register?   | 112 |
|          | Conclusion  | 113 |
| <b>6</b> | <b>The Commission's powers of investigation and the use of those powers to remove charities from the register</b>                   | 114 |
|          | Introduction  | 114 |
|          | Powers of investigation and protection  | 114 |
|          | Sections 18(1) and 19 protective powers   | 115 |
|          | Section 18(2) protective powers   | 116 |
|          | Appointment of additional trustees  | 116 |
|          | Appointment of an interim manager   | 117 |
|          | Making schemes  | 118 |
|          | Removal of trustees   | 119 |
|          | The institution of the inquiry leads the trustees to conclude that they should dissolve the charity                                 | 120 |
|          | New powers under the Charities Act 2006   | 120 |
|          | Documentary analysis  | 121 |
|          | Does not operate  | 121 |
|          | Ceased to exist   | 123 |
|          | Change in trusts  | 123 |
|          | No longer considers is a charity  | 124 |
|          | Conclusion  | 124 |
| <b>7</b> | <b>How the Commission's powers to remove charities from the register may be affected by changes to the law of charitable status</b> | 126 |
|          | Introduction  | 126 |
|          | The Human Rights Act 1998   | 128 |
|          | Public authorities  | 129 |
|          | Does the Human Rights Act 1998 apply to the removal of charities from the register?   | 130 |
|          | General principles and limitations  | 132 |
|          | Limits on Convention rights   | 133 |
|          | Prescribed by law   | 133 |
|          | Necessary in a democratic society   | 136 |

## Contents

|   |     |
|---|-----|
| General and particular Convention rights and the Commission's power |     |
| to remove charities from the register                               | 136 |
| Article 1, Protocol 1: Right to property                            | 137 |
| The peaceful enjoyment of property                                  | 137 |
| Deprivation of possessions  | 138 |
| The state is entitled to control the use of property                |     |
| in accordance with the general interest by enforcing                |     |
| such laws as it deems necessary for that purpose                    | 138 |
| Limits on Article 1, Protocol 1                                     | 138 |
| The public or general interest                                      | 138 |
| Proportionality   | 139 |
| Subject to conditions provided by law                               | 139 |
| Article 14: Freedom from discrimination                             | 140 |
| Do the facts fall within the ambit of one or more                   |     |
| of the substantive Convention rights?                               | 141 |
| Different treatment   | 141 |
| Comparable situation  | 143 |
| Justification   | 144 |
| Legitimate aim  | 144 |
| Proportionality   | 144 |
| Margin of appreciation  | 145 |
| Article 9: Freedom of thought, conscience and religion              | 145 |
| Religion or belief  | 146 |
| Limits on Article 9   | 149 |
| Prescribed by law   | 151 |
| Necessary in a democratic society                                   | 151 |
| For the protection of the rights and freedoms of others             | 151 |
| For the protection of health and morals                             | 151 |
| Article 2, Protocol 1: Right to education                           | 152 |
| Article 2, Protocol 1 and Article 14 together                       | 155 |
| Respect for the religious and philosophical convictions of parents  | 156 |
| Limits on Article 2, Protocol 1                                     | 157 |
| Article 10: Freedom of expression                                   | 157 |
| Think tanks   | 160 |
| Limits to Article 10: Freedom of expression                         | 162 |
| Prescribed by law   | 162 |
| Legitimate aims   | 163 |
| For the protection of the rights of others                          | 164 |
| Maintaining the authority and impartiality of the judiciary         | 164 |
| Necessary in a democratic society                                   | 165 |
| Article 10 and Article 14 together                                  | 165 |
| Reinterpretation of the rule against political objects              | 166 |
| The Charities Act 2006  | 167 |
| Conclusion  | 169 |

Cambridge University Press

978-0-521-51603-7 - The Law of Charitable Status: Maintenance and Removal

Robert Meakin

Table of Contents

[More information](#)

## Contents

|          |   |     |
|----------|---|-----|
| <b>8</b> | <b>Grounds for appeal</b>   | 171 |
|          | Introduction  | 171 |
|          | Appealing against direct removal under section 3(4) Charities Act 1993              | 174 |
|          | Appealing against indirect removal  | 175 |
|          | Direct and indirect removal, judicial review and common-law action                  | 177 |
|          | Direct removal, judicial review and common-law action                               | 179 |
|          | The right to be heard and the Human Rights Act 1998:                                |     |
|          | Article 6: A right to a fair trial  | 180 |
|          | Legitimate expectation  | 180 |
|          | Estoppel  | 182 |
|          | Negligent mis-statement   | 183 |
|          | Indirect removal, judicial review and common-law action                             | 184 |
|          | <i>Ultra vires</i> , <i>Wednesbury</i> unreasonableness and bias                    | 184 |
|          | The right to be heard and the Human Rights Act 1998:                                |     |
|          | Article 6: Right to a fair trial  | 185 |
|          | Natural justice   | 186 |
|          | Estoppel and negligent mis-statement  | 187 |
|          | Conclusion  | 187 |
|          | Costs   | 188 |
|          | Alternatives to an appeal to the court  | 191 |
|          | The Commission's internal review procedure  | 191 |
|          | The Commission's complaints procedure   | 192 |
|          | The Ombudsman   | 192 |
|          | Conclusion  | 193 |
| <b>9</b> | <b>Conclusion</b>   | 194 |
|          | Introduction  | 194 |
|          | Law reform  | 194 |
|          | The Commission's powers of removal are limited                                      | 194 |
|          | No powers of removal  | 195 |
|          | Greater powers of removal   | 196 |
|          | Powers to protect the property of removed institutions                              | 197 |
|          | The Commission's powers of removal should be further restricted                     | 198 |
|          | Conclusion: More or less removal?   | 199 |
|          | There is a distinction between a governing instrument of a charity and its property | 199 |
|          | The problem of legality   | 200 |
|          | The need for clarification  | 200 |
|          | Access to justice   | 200 |
|          | Overall conclusion  | 202 |
|          | <i>Bibliography</i>   | 203 |
|          | <i>Index</i>  | 208 |