Works of art in the Middle Ages were best experienced as communal, often multimedia events. Liturgies, books, song, architecture, prayers and poetry were performed as collaborative activities in which performers and audience together realized their work anew. Eleven essays by leading scholars of music, liturgy, literature, manuscript production and architecture analyse how the medieval arts invited and delighted in collaborative performances designed to persuade. The essays cast fresh light on subjects ranging from pilgrim proces- sions within Chartres cathedral, to Hildegard of Bingen's hymns, to polyphonic song, to the oral delivery of diplomatic letters, and the 'rhetoric of silence' perfected by the Cistercians. Rhetoric is defined broadly in this book to encompass its relationship to its sister arts of music, architecture and painting, all of which use materials and media in addition to words -- sometimes altogether without words. Contributors have concentrated on those aspects of formal rhetoric that are performative in nature: the sound, gesture and facial expressions of persuasive speech in action. Delivery (performance) is shown to be at the heart of rhetoric, that aspect of it which is indeed beyond words.

MARY CARRUTHERS is Remarque Professor of Literature, New York University, and a Fellow of All Souls College, Oxford.
This series of critical books seeks to cover the whole area of literature written in the major medieval languages – the main European vernaculars, and medieval Latin and Greek – during the period c. 1100–1500. Its chief aim is to publish and stimulate fresh scholarship and criticism on medieval literature, special emphasis being placed on understanding major works of poetry, prose and drama in relation to the contemporary culture and learning which fostered them.

Recent titles in the series

Mary Carruthers The Book of Memory: A Study of Memory in Medieval Culture (Second Edition)

J. A. Burrow The Poetry of Praise

Andrew Cole Literature and Heresy in the Age of Chaucer

Suzanne M. Yeager Jerusalem in Medieval Narrative

Nicole R. Rice Lay Piety and Religious Discipline in Middle English Literature

D. H. Green Women and Marriage in German Medieval Romance

Peter Godman Paradoxes of Conscience in the High Middle Ages: Abelard, Heloise and the Archpoet

Edwin D. Craun Ethics and Power in Medieval English Reformist Writing

David Matthews Writing to the King: Nation, Kingship, and Literature in England, 1250–1350

Mary Carruthers (ed.) Rhetoric Beyond Words: Delight and Persuasion in the Arts of the Middle Ages

A complete list of titles in the series can be found at the end of the volume.
Contents

List of illustrations  page vii
List of contributors  x
List of abbreviations and primary sources  xi

Editor’s introduction  1

1 ‘Working by words alone’: the architect, scholasticism and rhetoric in thirteenth-century France  14
   Paul Binski

2 Grammar and rhetoric in late medieval polyphony: modern metaphor or old simile?  52
   Margaret Bent

3 Nature’s forge and mechanical production: writing, reading and performing song  72
   Elizabeth Eva Leach

4 Rhetorical strategies in the pictorial imagery of fourteenth-century manuscripts: the case of the Bohun psalters  96
   Lucy Freeman Sandler

5 Do actions speak louder than words? The scope and role of pronuntiatio in the Latin rhetorical tradition, with special reference to the Cistercians  124
   Jan M. Ziolkowski

6 Vultus adest (the face helps): performance, expressivity and interiority  151
   Monika Otter
Contents

7 Special delivery: were medieval letter writers trained in performance? 173
   Martin Camargo

8 The concept of ductus, or journeying through a work of art 190
   Mary Carruthers

9 Ductus and memoria: Chartres cathedral and the workings of rhetoric 214
   Paul Crossley

10 Ductus figuratus et subtilis: rhetorical interventions for women in two twelfth-century liturgies 250
    William T. Flynn

11 Terribilis est locus iste: the Pantheon in 609 281
    Susan Rankin

Index 311
Illustrations

1.1 Reims cathedral, former labyrinth, after J. Cellier  page 16

1.2 Amiens cathedral, nave. Conway Library, Courtauld Institute of Art, London. Photograph by A. F. Kersting  17

1.3 Incised tomb slab of Hugues Libergier, Reims cathedral: After W. R. Lethaby, Medieval Art (London: Duckworth, 1904)  30


1.5 Saint-Denis, triforium and clerestory. After E. Viollet-le-Duc, Dictionnaire raisonné de l’architecture française (Paris, 1875), figure 24  39

3.1 Texts and translations of Jacob Senleches double balade, Je me merveill/J’ay plusieurs fois  80

4.1 Writing bear. London, British Library MS Egerton 3277, fol. 13v, detail. Photograph © The British Library Board. All Rights Reserved  100

4.2 Psalm 42, Nabal’s men before Abigail. London, British Library MS Egerton 3277, fol. 32v, detail. Photograph © The British Library Board. All Rights Reserved  101

4.3 Canticle of Anna, the Lord and the poor. Vienna, Österreichische Nationalbibliothek MS 1826*, fol. 129, detail. Photograph Österreichische Nationalbibliothek  102
List of illustrations


4.5 Matins of the Virgin, Annunciation. Copenhagen, Kongelige Bibliotek MS Thott 547.4o, fol. 1, detail. Reproduced with permission of the Kongelige Bibliotek 105


4.7 Psalm 68, scenes from life of Joseph. Baden-Baden, Lichtenthal Abbey Archiv MS 2, fol. 67 110

4.8 Psalm 80, marriage of Moses and Zipporah. Baden-Baden, Lichtenthal Abbey Archiv MS 2, fol. 83, detail 111

4.9 Psalm 75, marriage of Moses and Zipporah. Oxford, Exeter College MS 47, fol. 49v, detail. Reproduced by kind permission of the Rector and Fellows of Exeter College, Oxford 112

4.10 Psalm 1, birth of Abel. Baden-Baden, Lichtenthal Abbey Archiv MS 2, fol. 8, detail 114

4.11 Psalm 52, birth of Esau and Jacob. Baden-Baden, Lichtenthal Abbey Archiv MS 2, fol. 54v, detail 115


9.1 Chartres cathedral, plan (specially drafted by Stuart Whatling) 217

9.2 Chartres cathedral, Confessors portal, tympanum. Conway Library, Courtauld Institute of Art, London 218
### List of illustrations

9.3 Chartres cathedral, Portail Royal, general view. Conway Library, Courtauld Institute of Art, London. Photograph by A. F. Kersting 219

9.4 Chartres cathedral, Portail Royal, Incarnation portal. Conway Library, Courtauld Institute of Art, London 220


9.6 Chartres cathedral, ground plan of crypt. After Jan van der Meulen and Jürgen Hohmeyer, *Chartres: Biographie der Kathedrale* (Cologne: DuMont, 1984), with slight alterations by P. Crossley; the lettering and captions A–D as in the original list 222

9.7 Chartres cathedral, Northwest corner of the north transept, figures of St Potentien and St Modeste. Slide Library, Courtauld Institute of Art, London 224


9.9 Chartres cathedral, north transept rose window and lancets. Photograph: Hirmer Verlag, München; reproduced with permission 226

9.10 Chartres cathedral, interior of the nave looking west. Photograph: Conway Library, Courtauld Institute of Art, London 238

9.11 Strasbourg cathedral, north transept, plan of J. J. Arhardt (1643), SUB Göttingen, 2 Cod. MS Uffenbach 3, Bl. 12. Photograph reproduced with permission of Staats- and Universitätsbibliothek Göttingen 241
Contributors

Margaret Bent is Emeritus Fellow of All Souls College, Oxford.
Paul Binski is Professor of the History of Medieval Art at the University of Cambridge and Fellow of Gonville and Caius College, Cambridge.
Martin Camargo is Professor of English at the University of Illinois, Urbana-Champaign.
Mary Carruthers is Remarque Professor of Literature at New York University and quondam Fellow of All Souls College, Oxford.
Paul Crossley is Professor of the History of Art at The Courtauld Institute of Art.
William T. Flynn is Lecturer in Medieval Latin at the Institute for Medieval Studies in the University of Leeds.
Elizabeth Eva Leach is University Lecturer in Music at the University of Oxford and Fellow of St Hugh's College, Oxford.
Monika Otter is Associate Professor of English and Comparative Literature at Dartmouth College.
Susan Rankin is Professor of Medieval Music at the University of Cambridge and Fellow of Emmanuel College, Cambridge.
Lucy Freeman Sandler is Helen Gould Sheppard Professor of Art History, emerita, at New York University.
Jan M. Ziolkowski is Arthur Kingsley Porter Professor of Medieval Latin at Harvard University and Director of the Dumbarton Oaks Research Library and Collection in Washington, DC.
Abbreviations and primary sources commonly used

CCCMM Corpus Christianorum, continuatio medievalis
CCSL Corpus Christianorum, series latina
CLS Cistercian liturgy series
CSEL Corpus Scriptorum Ecclesiasticorum Latinorum
LCL Loeb Classical Library
MGH Monumenta Germaniae Historica
PIMS Pontifical Institute for Medieval Studies Press, Toronto
PL Patrologiae cursus completus, series latina
RLM Carolus Halm (ed.), *Rhetorici latini minores* (Leipzig: Teubner, 1863)
TLL *Thesaurus Linguae Latinae*.

The following editions and translations of texts discussed by more than one contributor have been used, unless otherwise specified in the notes.


Abbreviations and primary sources commonly used
