

PRACTICES OF BELIEF

Practices of Belief, the second volume of Nicholas Wolterstorff's collected papers, brings together his essays in epistemology from 1983 to 2008. It includes not only the essays which first presented "Reformed epistemology" to the philosophical world, but also Wolterstorff's latest work on the topic of entitled (or responsible) belief and its intersection with religious belief. The volume presents five new essays and a retrospective essay that chronicles the changes in the course of philosophy over the last fifty years. Of interest to epistemologists, philosophers of religion, and theologians, Practices of Belief should engage a wide audience of those interested in the topic of whether religious belief can be responsibly formed and maintained in the contemporary world.

NICHOLAS WOLTERSTORFF is Noah Porter Professor Emeritus of Philosophical Theology, Yale University, and Senior Fellow, Institute for Advanced Studies in Culture, University of Virginia. His many publications include *Divine Discourse: Philosophical Reflections on the Claim that God Speaks* (1995), *John Locke and the Ethics of Belief* (1996), and *Thomas Reid and the Story of Epistemology* (2001, 2004).

TERENCE CUNEO is Assistant Professor of Philosophy at the University of Vermont. He is author of *The Normative Web: An Argument for Moral Realism* (2007) and editor of six books including *The Cambridge Companion to Thomas Reid*, co-edited with René van Woudenberg (2004).



PRACTICES OF BELIEF

Selected Essays, Volume 2

NICHOLAS WOLTERSTORFF

EDITED BY

TERENCE CUNEO







Shaftesbury Road, Cambridge CB2 8EA, United Kingdom
One Liberty Plaza, 20th Floor, New York, NY 10006, USA
477 Williamstown Road, Port Melbourne, VIC 3207, Australia
314–321, 3rd Floor, Plot 3, Splendor Forum, Jasola District Centre, New Delhi – 110025, India
103 Penang Road, #05–06/07, Visioncrest Commercial, Singapore 238467

Cambridge University Press is part of Cambridge University Press & Assessment, a department of the University of Cambridge.

We share the University's mission to contribute to society through the pursuit of education, learning and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

www.cambridge.org Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9780521514620

© Nicholas Wolterstorff and Terence Cuneo 2010

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press & Assessment.

First published 2010

A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library

ISBN 978-0-521-51462-0 Hardback

Cambridge University Press & Assessment has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this publication and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.



Contents

Editor's introduction Acknowledgments Introduction		<i>page</i> vii ix 1
2	Does the role of concepts make experiential access to ready-made reality impossible?	41
3	Ought to believe – two concepts	62
4	Entitlement to believe and practices of inquiry	86
5	Historicizing the belief-forming self	118
6	Epistemology of religion	144
7	The migration of the theistic arguments: from natural theology to evidentialist apologetics	173
8	Can belief in God be rational if it has no foundations?	217
9	Once again, evidentialism – this time social	265
Ю	The assurance of faith	289
II	On being entitled to beliefs about God	313
12	Reformed epistemology	334
13	Are religious believers committed to the existence of God?	350
14	Reid on common sense	372

v



vi	Contents	
15	What sort of epistemological realist was Thomas Reid?	394
	Postscript: a life in philosophy	409
Bik	oliography	426
Ina	lex	432



Editor's introduction

This is the companion volume to another collection of Nick Wolterstorff's papers, *Inquiring about God: Selected Essays Volume I*, also published by Cambridge University Press (2009). As with *Inquiring about God*, Nick and I had many essays to choose from when assembling the present volume, indeed, over forty-five years' worth of them! In choosing the essays for this volume, we have employed the same principle of selection used with its companion: include only those essays that have minimal overlap with each other and with the content of the various books that Nick has published. There are, however, two differences between this volume and *Inquiring about God* worth noting.

First, most of the essays in *Inquiring about God* saw only light revisions. While all of the essays included in this collection have also been revised, some essays, such as "Ought to believe - two concepts," "Religious epistemology," and "Once again, evidentialism - this time social" have been either revised or amended substantially. Second, this volume includes five essays that were previously unpublished and represent Nick's latest views on the topics they cover. Chapter 1, "The world ready-made," is a revised version of one of Nick's Gifford Lectures, delivered in St. Andrews during the spring of 1995. Chapter 2, "Does the role of concepts make experiential access to ready-made reality impossible?" is a revised version of a paper Nick delivered at a conference on realism and anti-realism hosted by William Alston at Calvin College in the spring of 2000. (These papers are better characterized as papers in metaphysics and philosophy of mind, broadly speaking. Still, as Nick notes in his introduction, his aim has been to develop a position that is a combination of metaphysical realism and non-classical foundationalism. These essays give the reader a fuller picture of that view.) Chapters 4 and 11, "Entitlement to believe and practices of inquiry" and "On being entitled to beliefs about God," are also revised versions of parts of Nick's 1995 Gifford Lectures. When combined with Alvin Plantinga's work on warrant and William Alston's



viji Editor's introduction

work on justification and perception of God, they provide the most complete picture of so-called Reformed epistemology to date. Finally, chapter 13, "Are religious believers committed to the existence of God?" is a condensed and revised version of the Tate-Willson lectures Nick delivered on Wittgensteinian fideism and Reformed epistemology at Southern Methodist University in 1991.

When viewed together, the essays in this book fall into three parts. The first part (chapters I through 5) is dedicated to systematic issues in epistemology, especially gaining a better picture of that epistemic merit that Nick calls *entitlement*. The second part (chapters 6 through 13) treats matters in the epistemology of religious belief. The third and shortest section is historical, being concerned to elucidate aspects of Thomas Reid's views on common sense and perception. Finally, we have included a postscript, "A life in philosophy," which Nick delivered as the first Dewey Lecture at the American Philosophical Association in 2006.

For their help, especially with knocking into shape some of the computer-scanned versions of the essays included here, I wish to thank the following people: Dan Christian, Sean Christy, Donna Kruithof, Klaas Wolterstorff, and Nancy Zylstra. Jim Bratt at the Calvin Center for Christian Scholarship was kind enough to provide a summer stipend to help defray costs associated with producing this book. Finally, thanks go to Nick himself. It has been a great pleasure to work together and especially to see the unpublished work included here finally see daylight.

TDC



Acknowledgments

"Ought to believe – two concepts" (chapter 3) is a revised version of "Obligations of belief – two concepts," which originally appeared in Paul A. Schlipp and Lewis E. Hahn, eds., *The Philosophy of Roderick Chisholm*. Portions of that essay are reprinted by permission of Open Court Publishing Company, a division of Carus Publishing Company, Peru, IL, from *The Philosophy of Roderick Chisholm*, edited by Paul A. Schlipp and Lewis E. Hahn, Library of Living Philosophers Series Volume XXV, copyright © 1997 by The Library of Living Philosophers.

"Entitlement to believe and practices of inquiry" (chapter 4) incorporates material from "Obligation, entitlement, and rationality," which originally appeared in Matthias Steup and Ernest Sosa, eds., *Contemporary Debates in Epistemology*, Oxford: Blackwell, 2005, 326–38. Reprinted with the permission of the publisher.

"Historicizing the belief-forming self" (chapter 5) is a revised version of an essay by the same title that originally appeared in Thomas Crisp, Matthew Davidson, and David Vander Laan, eds., *Knowledge and Reality: Essays in Honor of Alvin Plantinga*. Philosophical Studies Series 103, New York: Spring-Verlag, 2006, 111–35. Reprinted with the kind permission of Springer Science and Business Media.

"Epistemology of religion" (chapter 6) is a revised version of an essay by the same title that originally appeared in John Greco and Ernest Sosa, eds., *The Blackwell Guide to Epistemology*, Malden, MA: Blackwell, 1999, 303–24. Reprinted with the permission of the publisher.

"Epistemology of religion" (chapter 6) incorporates material from "Religious epistemology," which originally appeared in William J. Wainwright, ed., *The Oxford Handbook to the Philosophy of Religion*, Oxford University Press, 2005, 245–71. Used with the permission of the publisher.

"The migration of the theistic arguments: from natural theology to evidentialist apologetics" (chapter 7) originally appeared in Robert Audi



X

Cambridge University Press & Assessment 978-0-521-51462-0 — Practices of Belief Volume 2: Selected Essays Nicholas Wolterstorff, Edited by Terence Cuneo Frontmatter More Information

Acknowledgments

and William Wainwright, eds., *Rationality, Religious Belief and Moral Commitment*, Ithaca, NY: Cornell University Press, 1986. Reprinted with permission of the editors.

"Can belief in God be rational if it has no foundations?" (chapter 8) is a revised version of an essay by the same title that originally appeared in Alvin Plantinga and Nicholas Wolterstorff, eds., *Faith and Rationality*, Notre Dame, IN: University of Notre Dame Press, 1983, 135–86. Reprinted with permission of the publisher.

"Once again, evidentialism — this time social" (chapter 9) is a revised version of an essay by the same title that originally appeared in *Philosophical Topics* 16, 2 (Fall 1988): 53—74. Published by the University of Arkansas Press. Used with the permission of the publisher, www.uapress. com.

"The assurance of faith" (chapter 10) originally appeared in *Faith and Philosophy* 7 (1990): 396–417. Reprinted with permission of the publisher.

"Reformed epistemology" (chapter 12) is a revised version of an essay by the same title that originally appeared in D. Z. Phillips and T. Tessin, eds., *Philosophy of Religion in the 21st Century*, Basingstoke: Palgrave Macmillan, 2001, 33–63. Reproduced with permission of Palgrave Macmillan.

"What sort of epistemological realist was Thomas Reid?" (chapter 15) originally appeared in the *Journal of Scottish Philosophy* 4 (2006): 111–24. Reprinted with permission of the editor.

"A life in philosophy" (postscript) originally appeared in the *Proceedings* and Addresses of the American Philosophical Association 81 (2007): 93–106. Reprinted with the permission of the publisher.

The author, editor, and publisher would like to thank these publishers for permission to reproduce the essays in this volume.