The Search for Reconciliation

Why have some former enemy countries established durable peace, whereas others remain mired in animosity? When and how does historical memory matter in postconflict interstate relations? Focusing on two case studies, Yinan He argues that the key to interstate reconciliation is the harmonization of national memories. Conversely, memory divergence resulting from national mythmaking harms long-term prospects for reconciliation.

After World War II, Sino-Japanese and West German–Polish relations were both antagonized by the Cold War structure, and pernicious myths prevailed in national collective memory. In the 1970s, China and Japan brushed aside historical legacy for immediate diplomatic normalization. But the progress of reconciliation was soon impeded in the 1980s by elite mythmaking practices that stressed historical animosities. In contrast, from the 1970s West Germany and Poland began to demythify war history and narrow their memory gap through restitution measures and textbook cooperation, paving the way for significant progress toward reconciliation after the Cold War.

Yinan He received her Ph.D. in political science from the Massachusetts Institute of Technology in 2004 and is currently Assistant Professor at the John C. Whitehead School of Diplomacy and International Relations at Seton Hall University. She was a postdoctoral research associate of the Princeton-Harvard China and the World Program in 2007–2008, an An Wang Postdoctoral Fellow in Chinese Studies at Harvard University in 2004–2005, a John M. Olin Predoctoral Fellow in National Security at Harvard University in 2003–2004, and a research student at the University of Tokyo in 1999–2001, sponsored by the Japanese Government Mombushō Scholarship. She holds a B.A. from Peking University and an M.A. from Fudan University in international politics.
The Search for Reconciliation

Sino-Japanese and German-Polish Relations since World War II

YINAN HE
To my husband, Wang Pei, with love and gratitude
Contents

Tables and Illustrations  ix
Acknowledgments   xi
List of Abbreviations xv
List of Postwar Japanese Prime Ministers and (West) German Chancellors xvii
Chronology       xix

Introduction   1
1. Explaining Deep Interstate Reconciliation  12
2. When East Meets West: Postwar German-Polish Reconciliation  46
3. Initial Isolation: Pre-Normalization Sino-Japanese Relations 115
5. An Old Feud Comes Back: Sino-Japanese Relations in the 1980s  206
6. Volatility and Downward Spiral: Sino-Japanese Relations from the 1990s to the Present  234
Conclusion        289

Appendix         313
Bibliography   315
Index           351
Tables and Illustrations

TABLES

1.1. Measuring Interstate Reconciliation  
1.2. Competing Theoretical Predictions for Interstate Reconciliation  
2.1. Poland’s Imports from Major Trade Partners, 1937–1970  
2.2. Foreign Tourists to Poland, 1960–1970  
3.1. The Composition of Japan’s Foreign Trade by Market, 1952–1970  
3.2. Japanese Worry about War Entanglement in the 1960s  
3.3. Visitors between Japan and China, 1964–1971  
4.1. China’s Share in Japan’s Total Imports of Natural Resources, 1972–2000  
4.2. Japan’s Societal Contacts with China, Taiwan, and South Korea, 1972–1980  
7.1. Summary of Theory Tests

FIGURES

1.1. National Mythmaking: The Impact of Emotion and Intention  
2.1. German-Polish Trade Relations, 1953–2004  
2.2. Polish Polls: The Possibility of German-Polish Reconciliation  
3.1. Japanese Public Feeling about China and the USSR in the 1960s  
4.1. Share of Sino-Japanese Trade in Each Other’s Total Trade, 1972–2004
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Table</th>
<th>Description</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>5.1</td>
<td>China-Japan Trade, 1981–1989</td>
<td>225</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.1</td>
<td>Chinese Strategic Studies of Japan that Made Superficial Historical Analogies, 1990–1997</td>
<td>256</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.2</td>
<td>China-Japan Mutual Contacts, 1981–1999</td>
<td>266</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*Tables and Illustrations*
Acknowledgments

In writing about the origins of interstate reconciliation in East Asia and Central Europe, I have had the support of many mentors, friends, and institutions. My greatest debt is to the committee at the Massachusetts Institute of Technology (MIT) that supervised my doctoral dissertation, of which this monograph is a revised version. Each committee member in his own way demonstrated to me what it means to be both a great scholar and superb teacher. Stephen Van Evera tirelessly guided me on all aspects of this project from its inception and advised me in every critical stage as I struggled to turn it into a book. Over the years, he has become my spiritual pillar and the role model for my academic life. This book originated from a research note I prepared for Richard Samuels as a graduate research assistant. It was with his encouragement and support that I undertook to pursue a specialization in Japan, a country that I had little prior knowledge of; learn the Japanese language from the basic alphabets; and conduct extended fieldwork in Japan. I am most fortunate to have had the opportunity to work with Thomas Christensen on the project from the initial research stage until its completion. From him I received extremely constructive, sharp, and comprehensive comments. Barry Posen always pushed me for deeper and more sophisticated thinking, yet he was also generous and kind, giving me enormous amounts of time and guidance to help me approach his high standards.

I am especially thankful to John Dower, Alastair Iain Johnston, Melissa Nobles, and Roger Petersen for their tremendous inspiration and support throughout the project. John Dower, as well as Stephen Van Evera, taught me that a real scholar should have the courage and wisdom to critically evaluate the nationalist myths and biases in one’s own country.
John Dower opened many doors for me in exploring source materials and building research connections and kindly read and commented on various parts of the manuscript. Alastair Iain Johnston has been both a mentor and friend ever since we met in Beijing fifteen years ago. I am greatly indebted to him for a strong interest in ideational forces in international relations and the desire to pursue social scientific rigorosity. Melissa Nobles and Roger Petersen significantly shaped my understanding of some key concepts employed in the book, including reconciliation, historical memory, identity, and emotions, and gave valuable criticisms for my writings even after I had graduated from MIT.

I benefited greatly from the detailed comments made by Thomas Berger, William Callahan, Daniel Chirot, Taylor Fravel, Edward Friedman, Jacques Hymans, Gilbert Rozman, and Allen Whiting, who read, sometimes more than once, portions or the whole of the manuscript. Research advice and feedback from the following people at various stages of the project also had important influence: Amitav Acharya, Muthiah Alagappa, Verena Blechinger-Talcott, Paul Cohen, Peter Gries, Jan Gross, Wanda Jarzabek, Paul Midford, Peter Perdue, Dan Philpott, Robert Ross, Susan Shirk, Timothy Snyder, Shogo Suzuki, Peter Van Ness, Ezra Vogel, Xin Xu, Daqing Yang, Dingxing Zhao, Quansheng Zhao, and Suisheng Zhao. Two anonymous reviewers gave me numerous valuable suggestions that greatly helped me improve the manuscript. I am also grateful for the friendship and spiritual support of many colleagues as I worked on the project in Cambridge, Massachusetts; Tokyo; and Princeton. With Ariel David Adesnik, David Art, Mayling Birney, Ian Ja Chong, George Gavrilis, Michael Glasny, Ron Hassner, Eric Heginbotham, Llewelyn Hughes, Andrew Kennedy, Jennifer Lind, David Mendeloff, Paul Midford, Edward Miller, Manjari Miller, Conor O'Dwyer, James Reilly, Holger Schmidt, Shiqi Tang, Christopher Twomey, and Chikako Kawakatsu Ueki, I frequently bounced around research ideas and enjoyed their merciless but enormously helpful comments.

Numerous Chinese and Japanese scholars, diplomats, journalists, and social activists graciously accepted my interviews for this project. I want to thank those who helped me set up key interviews in China and/or locate critical source materials. They include Zhu Mingquan and Shen Dingli, both my former advisers at Fudan University, Sun Ru from the China Institute of Contemporary International Relations, Fan Shiming at Peking University, Li Dongyan and Wang Yizhou at the Chinese Academy of Social Sciences, Chen Qi at Tsinghua University, Wang Xuejun and Wu Yaokun from the China Reform Forum, Zhang Qingmin from the
Acknowledgments

China Foreign Affairs University, Marzenna James from Princeton University, Lu Haiyan from the Chinese National Library, Wang Chengzhi at the Columbia University library, and Zhong Shaohua from the Beijing Academy of Social Sciences. Quan Yuhong from China Radio International and Jin Yong helped me locate the historic photo for the cover of this book.

My field research in Japan would not have been possible had Shiroyama Hideaki at the Faculty of Law of the University of Tokyo not kindly sponsored my application for the Japanese Mombushō Scholarship. Chen Zhao-bin, Fujiwara Kiichi, Inoguchi Takashi, Ishii Akira, Kimijima Kazuhiko, Liu Jie, Mizuno Takaaki, Okonogi Masao, Ōnuma Yasuaki, Soeya Yoshihide, Sōma Masaru, Takasaki Sōji, Tanaka Akihiko, Yoshida Yutaka, and Yui Daizaburō let me attend their seminars and/or spent time with me discussing research. My Japanese tutor and colleague at the University of Tokyo, Machida Yuko, gave me immeasurable help regarding Japanese language, culture, and academic circles. Needless to say, the responsibility for any mistakes in this book lies solely with me.

MIT, the United States Institute of Peace, the MacArthur Foundation, the John M. Olin Institute of Strategic Studies at Harvard University, and the Horowitz Foundation for Social Policy supported the writing stage of the dissertation. Generous fellowships from the Fairbank Center for East Asian Research of Harvard University and the Princeton-Harvard China and the World Program funded the book manuscript revision and made possible its timely completion. This project also received financial support from the Faculty Development Grants of Seton Hall University and the American Association of University Women. I thank Harvey Sapolsky at the MIT Security Studies Program and Richard Samuels, Kenneth Oye, and Bill Keller at the MIT Center for International Studies; Stephen Rosen, Monica Toft, and Ann Townes at the Olin Institute; Wilt Idema, Ronald Suleski, and Wen-Hao Tien at the Fairbank Center; Lynn White and Rita Alpaugh at Princeton University; and Robert De Martino at Seton Hall University for facilitating my research. Many thanks to Eric Crahan at Cambridge University Press and Mary Paden at Aptara Inc., whose superb professionalism made a smooth production of this book possible.

No words are sufficient to express gratitude to my family back in China – my father, He Changsong; mother, Kuai Liming; sister, He Yijiang; and brother-in-law, Wang Guojian – for their understanding of and unfailing support for my academic career. Special thanks go to
Acknowledgments

my host parents, Joyce and Joe Baclawski, whose longtime love and care have stayed with me from the very first day I arrived in the United States as a graduate student. Dear friends Du Yanqing, Zhang Haiyan, Fu Guangyu, and Sharon Weiner assisted me in overcoming any hardships over the years and never let me miss a step.

No one, however, contributed more to this project than my husband, Wang Pei. Pei has endured the ordeal of being the life partner of an academic, including years of living apart when I was off to the field and countless lonely holidays and weekends when I immersed myself in work. He also comes in handy as my research assistant, book-carrying laborer, computer troubleshooter, indexer, proofreader, and in many other roles. Since the years we were undergraduate classmates at Peking University, Pei has always been on my side, protecting me, cheering me up, and sharing with me all the ups and downs in my life. This book is for Pei, who is the source of my happiness and strength.
List of Abbreviations

CASS Chinese Academy of Social Sciences
CCP Chinese Communist Party
CDU Christian Democratic Union (Germany)
CHINCOM China Committee
CoCom Coordinating Committee
CSU Christian Social Union (Germany)
EU European Union
FDP Free Democratic Party (Germany)
FRG Federal Republic of Germany
GDR German Democratic Republic
IJS Institute of Japanese Studies (CASS)
JCP Japan Communist Party
JSP Japan Socialist Party
KMT Kuomintang (Chinese Nationalist Party)
LDP Liberal Democratic Party (Japan)
MITI Ministry of International Trade and Industry (Japan)
NGO nongovernmental organization
PFT Peace and Friendship Treaty (China and Japan)
PLA People’s Liberation Army (China)
PPR Polish Workers’ Party
PRC People’s Republic of China
PZPR Polish United Workers’ Party
ROC Republic of China
ROK Republic of Korea
SCAP Supreme Command for the Allied Powers
List of Abbreviations

SDF Self-Defense Forces (Japan)
SPD Social Democratic Party (Germany)
UNSC United Nations Security Council

Chinese and Japanese personal names in this book are given in the traditional order of family name followed by given name unless a Chinese or Japanese author has reversed his or her name in a publication in English. Unless otherwise noted, all translations from the Chinese and Japanese are by the author. The Pinyin system is used for romanization of Chinese words except for a few cases, such as Chiang Kai-shek, Sun Yat-sen, Yenan, and Kuomintang, in which the alternative romanizations are better known in the West.
List of Postwar Japanese Prime Ministers and (West) German Chancellors

1945. August Prince Higashikuni Naruhiko
       October Shidehara Kijūrō
1946. May Yoshida Shigeru
1947. May Katayama Tetsu
1948. March Ashida Hitoshi
       October Yoshida Shigeru
1949. September Konrad Adenauer
1954. December Hatoyama Ichirō
1956. December Ishibashi Tanzan
1957. February Kishi Nobusuke
1960. July Ikeda Hayato
1963. October Ludwig Erhard
1964. November Satō Eisaku
1966. December Kurt Georg Kiesinger
1969. October Willy Brandt
1972. July Tanaka Kakuei
1974. May Helmut Schmidt
       December Miki Takeo
1976. December Fukuda Takeo
1978. December Ōhira Masayoshi
1982. October Helmut Kohl
       November Nakasone Yasuhiro
1987. November Takeshita Noboru
1989. June Uno Sōsuke
       August Kaifu Toshiki
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Year</th>
<th>Month</th>
<th>PM</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1991</td>
<td>November</td>
<td>Miyazawa Kiichi</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1993</td>
<td>August</td>
<td>Hosokawa Morihiro</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1994</td>
<td>April</td>
<td>Hata Tsutomu</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>June</td>
<td>Murayama Tomiichi</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1996</td>
<td>January</td>
<td>Hashimoto Ryūtarō</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1998</td>
<td>July</td>
<td>Obuchi Keizō</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>October</td>
<td>Gerhard Fritz Kurt Schröder</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2000</td>
<td>April</td>
<td>Mori Yoshirō</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2001</td>
<td>April</td>
<td>Koizumi Junichirō</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2005</td>
<td>November</td>
<td>Angela Merkel</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2006</td>
<td>September</td>
<td>Abe Shinzō</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2007</td>
<td>September</td>
<td>Fukuda Yasuo</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2008</td>
<td>September</td>
<td>Aso Tarō</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Chronology

1945  World War II ended
1949  The FRG and the GDR were established
1950  Sino-Soviet Treaty of Friendship, Alliance and Mutual Assistance was signed
1951  San Francisco Peace Treaty and U.S.-Japan Security Treaty were signed
1952  Japan-ROC Treaty of Peace was signed
1955  West Germany joined NATO
       The Warsaw Pact was established
       West Germany declared the Hallstein Doctrine
1958  The Nagasaki Flag Incident
1962  China-Japan LT Trade Agreement was signed
1966  China’s Cultural Revolution began (ended in 1976)
1969  U.S.-Japan Joint Statement following the Nixon-Satō meeting
1970  Willy Brandt knelt down at the Warsaw Ghetto Memorial
       West Germany and Poland signed the Warsaw Treaty
1972  China and Japan issued the joint statement for diplomatic normalization
       German-Polish textbook cooperation began
1976  German-Polish Textbook Commission published the “Recommendations on History and Geography Textbooks in the Federal Republic of Germany and the People’s Republic of Poland”
1977  Schmidt spoke at Auschwitz-Birkenau
1978  China-Japan PFT was signed
Chronology

1979  Ohira visited China, providing the first yen loan package to China
1980  Solidarity movement began in Poland
1981  The Polish government adopted martial law
1982  Japanese textbook controversy erupted
       The Twelfth Party Congress of the CCP
1985  The Bitburg Affair in West Germany
       Nakasone worshiped at the Yasukuni Shrine on August 15 in official capacity
       Anti-Japanese student demonstrations erupted in China
1986  The Historikerstreit in West Germany began
1987  CCP general secretary Hu Yaobang stepped down
       The Kôkaryô controversy intensified
1989  The June Fourth Tiananmen Incident in China
1990  Germany and Poland signed the treaty on the confirmation of their existing border
       China-Japan disputes over the Diaoyu/Senkaku Islands
1991  Germany and Poland signed the Treaty on Good Neighborly Relations and Friendly Cooperation
       The Warsaw Pact was dissolved
1992  Emperor Akihito visited China
1994  Herzog attended the ceremony commemorating the fiftieth anniversary of the Warsaw Uprising
1995  Taiwan Strait Crisis began (ended in 1996)
       Japan froze grant aid to China in protest of Chinese nuclear tests
       The controversy over the Diet resolution on war history in Japan
       Kohl attended the ceremony commemorating the Nazi victims at Bergen-Belsen concentration camp
1996  Hashimoto worshiped at the Yasukuni Shrine
       China-Japan diplomatic crisis over the Diaoyu/Senkaku disputes
1999  Poland joined NATO
2001  Koizumi began annual worship at the Yasukuni Shrine (last one on August 15, 2006)
       Polish president apologized to Jews for the Jedwabne Massacre
2003  The controversy over the Center against Expulsions began in Germany
Chronology

2004    China-Japan disputes over East China Sea gas fields escalated
        Schröder attended the ceremony commemorating the sixtieth
        anniversary of the Warsaw Uprising
2005    Anti-Japanese mass demonstrations erupted in China
        Schröder spoke at Auschwitz
2006    Abe visited China
        China-Japan joint history project was launched
2007    Fukuda visited China
2008    Hu Jintao visited Japan
        China and Japan agreed on joint development of East China
        Sea gas fields