THE ASSUMED AUTHORIAL UNITY OF LUKE AND ACTS

For nearly 1,900 years, few have questioned the single authorship of Luke and Acts. A careful reassessment of the internal and external evidence, however, reveals this assumption to be built on a shakier foundation than was previously thought. Patricia Walters’ innovative study offers a newly designed statistical analysis of Luke and Acts, pointing to the existence of highly significant differences in their prose style. In particular, a comprehensive survey and re-examination of the two books’ least contested authorial stratum – their seams and summaries – brings to light ancient prose compositional patterns that distinguish Luke and Acts beyond a reasonable doubt. Walters’ application of statistical analysis is unique in biblical scholarship and will provide impetus for using similar methods in other areas of the field. This book will therefore be of great interest to academic researchers and students of early Christianity, classical literature and rhetoric, and New Testament studies.

PATRICIA WALTERS is an assistant professor and Coordinator of the Religious Studies program at Rockford College, Illinois.
SOCIETY FOR NEW TESTAMENT STUDIES

MONOGRAPH SERIES

Recent titles in the series

   T O D D  K L U T Z
   978 0521 83804 7

130. Jews, Gentiles and Ethnic Reconciliation
   T E T - L I M  N .  Y E E
   978 0521 83831 3

131. Ancient Rhetoric and Paul’s Apology
   F R E D R I C K  J .  L O N G
   978 0521 84233 4

132. Reconstructing Honor in Roman Philippi
   J O S E P H  H .  H E L L E R M A N
   978 0521 84909 8

133. Theological Hermeneutics and 1 Thessalonians
   A N G U S  P A D D I S O N
   978 0521 84983 8

134. Greco-Roman Culture and the Galilee of Jesus
   M A R K  A .  C H A N C E Y
   978 0521 84647 9

135. Christology and Discipleship in the Gospel of Mark
   S U Z A N N E  W A T T S  H E N D E R S O N
   978 0521 85906 6

136. The Judean Poor and the Fourth Gospel
   T I M O T H Y  J .  M .  L I N G
   978 0521 85722 2

137. Paul, The Stoics, and the Body of Christ
   M I C H E L L E  V .  L E E
   978 0521 86454 1

138. The Bridegroom Messiah and the People of God
   J O C E L Y N  M C - W H I R T E R
   978 0521 86425 1

139. The Torn Veil
   D A N I E L  M .  G U R T N E R
   978 0521 87064 1

140. Discerning the Spirits
   A N D R É  M U N Z I N G E R
   978 0521 87594 3

141. The Sheep of the Fold
   E D W A R D  W .  K L I N K  I I I
   978 0521 87582 0

142. The Psalms of Lament in Mark’s Passion
   S T E P H E N  P .  A H E R N E - K R O L L
   978 0521 88191 3

143. Cosmology and Eschatology in Hebrews
   K E N N E D Y  L .  S C H E N C K
   978 0 521 88323 8

144. The Speeches of Outsiders in Acts
   O S V A L D O  P A D I L L A
   978 0 521 89981 9
The Assumed Authorial Unity of Luke and Acts
A Reassessment of the Evidence

PATRICIA WALTERS
CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY PRESS
Cambridge, New York, Melbourne, Madrid, Cape Town, Singapore, São Paulo, Delhi

Cambridge University Press
The Edinburgh Building, Cambridge CB2 8RU, UK

Published in the United States of America by Cambridge University Press, New York

www.cambridge.org
Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9780521509749

© Patricia Walters 2008

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception
and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements,
no reproduction of any part may take place without
the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2008

Printed in the United Kingdom at the University Press, Cambridge

A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library

Library of Congress Cataloguing in Publication data
Walters, Patricia, 1947–
The assumed authorial unity of Luke and Acts : a reassessment of the evidence / Patricia Walters.
p. cm. – (Society for New Testament studies monograph series ; 145)
Includes bibliographical references and index.

BS2589.W35 2008
226.4’066 – dc22 2008034149


Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this publication and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.
CONTENTS

List of figures page xi
Acknowledgments ??
List of abbreviations ??

1 Background and methodology 1
State of the question 3
External evidence for single authorship 8
Internal evidence for single authorship 10
Stylistic evidence 11
Theological-thematic evidence 21
Challenges to the single authorship hypothesis 24
Challenge by Albert C. Clark (1933) 26
Rebuttal by Wilfred L. Knox (1942) 27
Category 1: Particle and preposition use: τε; μέν;
σύν/μετά+genitive; and the case of ἀνήρ and
ἀνθρώπος 27
Category 2: Lexical differences between Acts and
the four gospels 29
Category 3: The ἐγένετο argument 30
Category 4: Singular features of Acts 31
Assessment of Clark’s challenge and
Knox’s rebuttal 32
Challenge by A. W. Argyle (1974) 33
Rebuttal by B. E. Beck (1977) 33
Assessment of Argyle’s challenge and Beck’s
rebuttal 35
Why re-examine the single authorship hypothesis? 35
Methodology and precedents 36
Stage One: Select data appropriate for analysis of
authorial style 36
viii  Contents

Stage Two: Recover prose compositional conventions from antiquity 37
Stage Three: Analyze stylometrically the seams and summaries in light of the prose compositional conventions of antiquity 38
Stylometry defined 38
Precedents for the authorship analysis methodology 39
Concluding considerations 41

2 Authorial data: seams and summaries 43
Historical roots of “seam” and “summary” in Markan studies 44
Relevance to Luke and Acts research and resultant problems 48
Criterion of majority consensus 51
Definition of seam and summary functionality 53
Seam 53
Summary 54
Collected set of seams and summaries in Luke 54
The opening of sections; prefaces 55
Closing of sections; conclusions 55
Summaries of Jesus’ ministry and influence 56
Independent composition in introductory or concluding material 65
Collected set of seams and summaries in Acts 74
Summaries that demonstrate the clearest parallelism 79
Summaries that frame narrative panels 80
Summaries that display complicated parallelism 81
Summaries from causal participle constructions 82
Toward an authorship analysis 88

3 Authorial criteria: Greek prose compositional conventions 90
Prose composition in antiquity 94
Early critics of prose composition 96
Aristotle 96
Pseudo-Demetrius 97
Dionysius of Halicarnassus 98
Pseudo-Longinus 102
Euphonic elements in prose composition 103
Hiatus 104
Hiatus in Luke and Acts 107
Dissonance 109
Dissonance in Luke and Acts 110
Rhythmic elements in prose composition 110
Rhythm patterns in Luke and Acts 124
Structural elements in prose composition 126
Structural elements in Luke and Acts 134

4 Authorial unity: analysis results and probabilities 137
Raw data derived from the seams and summaries in Luke and Acts 138
Pre-analysis assumptions 139
Explaining differences: three possibilities 140
Explanation 1: Same author-editor but different genres or styles 141
Different genres 142
Differences in style but not necessarily in genre 145
Explanation 2: Same author-editor but different dates of composition 147
Explanation 3: Different author-editors? 149
Euphony analysis 149
Hiatus 150
The chi-square contingency table test explained 153
Details of the chi-square contingency table test 155
Observed count 157
Expected count 157
Chi-square contribution 158
Chi-square statistic for hiatus 160
Dissonance 160
Chi-square statistic for dissonance 164
Prose rhythm analysis 165
Prose rhythm problematics 167
Sequences of long syllables 170
“Non-long” sequences 172
“Long” sequences 173
Chi-square statistic for sequences of long syllables 173
Sentence structure analysis 175
Sentence structure problematics 176
Final syntactic element 179
Chi-square statistic for ending syntactic element 181
Clause and sentence segues 183
Chi-square statistic for clause and sentence segues 185
Interpreting the differences: Is there a “big picture”? 186
Euphony and prose rhythm 187
Ending syntactic element, and clause and sentence segues 188

5 Final considerations and future directions 190
Final considerations 190
Implications of different authorship 191
The dating of Acts 192
Resolution of conundra 194
Future directions 195
Concluding reflection 196

Appendix 197
Bibliography 211
Index of Biblical and Other Ancient Sources 224
Index of Modern Authors and Subjects 234
FIGURES

1.1 Luke and Acts texts analyzed by Nigel Turner  page 20
1.2 Clark’s tabulations for the three types of ἐγένετο construction 30
  2.1 Cadbury’s list of seams and summaries in Luke 57
  2.2 Bultmann’s list of introductory and transitional passages 60
  2.3 Bultmann’s list of introduction, transition, and concluding formulations in Luke 61
  2.4 Fitzmyer’s list of introductory and concluding authorial composition, summaries, and refrains in Luke 66
  2.5 Bovon’s list of editorial transitions, allusions to Jesus’ journey to Jerusalem, summaries, and frame passages in Luke 68
  2.6 Co’s list of summaries in Luke 70
  2.7 Sterling’s list of summaries in Luke 71
  2.8 Dibelius’ list of summaries, independent sentences, and bridge passages in Acts 77
  2.9 Cadbury’s list of summaries in Acts 82
  2.10 Benoit’s list of summaries, notes, and a suture in Acts 84
  2.11 Conzelmann’s list of summaries, redactional links, and a connective in Acts 85
  2.12 Fitzmyer’s list of summaries and sutures in Acts 86
  3.1 Hiatus examples in Luke and Acts 107
  3.2 Hiatus conventions 108
  3.3 Dissonance conventions and examples in Luke and Acts 111
  3.4 Two-syllable rhythms 117
  3.5 Three-syllable rhythms 117
  3.6 Two possible rhythm sequences for Acts 5:14 125
  3.7 Prose rhythm conventions 126
  3.8 Sentence structure conventions 135
  4.1 Breakdown of SSD 139
  4.2 Examples of hiatus in the Luke and Acts SSD 151
4.3 Examples of hiatus following or preceding a seam or summary 152
4.4 Hiatus in the Luke and Acts SSD 153
4.5 Hiatus patterns in vertical bar graph format [white = Luke; shaded = Acts] 154
4.6 Calculating the chi-square output for hiatus 156
4.7 Null hypothesis testing chart 159
4.8 Chi-square output for hiatus 160
4.9 Examples and raw data totals of dissonance from the Luke and Acts SSD 162
4.10 Six-category table of dissonant combinations 163
4.12 Chi-square output for dissonant sound combinations 165
4.13 Syllable quantities in Lk 7:11 167
4.14 Possible rhythm sequences of Lk 7:11a 168
4.15 Possible rhythm sequences of Lk 7:11b 168
4.16 Number of long syllables in “long” and “non-long” sequences 172
4.17 Long syllables as a percentage of “long” and “non-long” sequences [white = Luke; shaded = Acts] 174
4.18 Chi-square for no. of long syllables in “long” and “non-long” sequences 175
4.20 Ending syntactic element 180
4.22 Chi-square output for ending syntactic elements 182
4.23 Post-positive particle vs. paratactic καί 184
4.24 Vertical bar graph of post-positive particle use vs. paratactic καί [white = Luke; shaded = Acts] 185
4.25 Chi-square output for post-positive particle and paratactic καί 186
4.26 Recapitulation of P-Values 186

© Cambridge University Press
www.cambridge.org
ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

Originating in a dissertation, awarded a PhD at Loyola University Chicago in May 2005, this book has been a total labor of love. The argument that evidence for the authorial unity of Luke and Acts ought to be reassessed and, if necessary, challenged has intrigued me since my early days in graduate school. Without the guidance and inspiration of those at Loyola, however, this book would not have come to fruition. Hence, it is with the most sincere gratitude and admiration that I wish to thank my dissertation director, Thomas H. Tobin, S.J., who steadfastly and patiently guided me through the process. Dr. James Keenan provided a classical studies perspective and inspired me to find precedents for my methodological approach. With inimitable conscientious guidance and support, Dr. Wendy Cotter, C. S. J. showed me how to reach beyond myself to produce not only a cogent argument but also, I hope, a worthy one. These three and Dr. Martin Buntinas of Loyola’s Department of Mathematics and Statistics, who generously helped on the statistical sections, as well as many other fine scholars in Loyola’s Department of Theology, formed the intellectual soil from which my ideas grew and developed.

This book is dedicated to my mother, Cleora Susan Wadsworth Walters, and in memoriam to my father, Robert Earl Walters. My parents taught me to pursue goals with diligence and loyalty, all the while allowing me to follow my own muses. Also, my five sisters have cheered me along the way more than they know. Finally, on the road of self-discovery, the trudge to Happy Destiny, many trusted friends have provided more spiritual, mental, and emotional sustenance than can ever be returned or acknowledged.

My thanks are also due to Dr. Katharina Brett and all the staff at Cambridge University Press who have so kindly helped me organize, revise, and finish this manuscript.
ABBREVIATIONS


AB       Anchor Bible
ABRL     Anchor Bible Reference Library
AJP      *The American Journal of Philology*
BASPSup  Bulletin of the American Society of Papyrologists: Supplement
BENT     Beiträge zur Einleitung in das Neue Testament
BETL     Bibliotheca Ephemeredum Theologicarum Lovaniensium
BZ       *Biblische Zeitschrift*
CBR      *Currents in Biblical Research*
CP       *Classical Philology*
CQ       *Classical Quarterly*
ET       English translation
ETL      *Ephemerides Theologicae Lovanienses*
EusSup   Eus Supplementa
EvQ      *Evangelical Quarterly*
FN       *Filologia Neotestamentaria*
HSCP     *Harvard Studies in Classical Philology*
HTR      *Harvard Theological Review*
HTS      Harvard Theological Studies
ITQ      *Irish Theological Quarterly*
JBL      *Journal of Biblical Literature*
JCACSup  Journal of the Classical Association of Canada Supplementary
JSNT     *Journal for the Study of the New Testament*
JSNTSup  Journal for the Study of the New Testament Supplement Series
### Abbreviations

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Abbreviation</th>
<th>Description</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>JTS</td>
<td>Journal of Theological Studies</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>LCL</td>
<td>Loeb Classical Library</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>LEC</td>
<td>Library of Early Christianity</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>LXX</td>
<td>Septuagint</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NT</td>
<td>Novum Testamentum</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NTOA</td>
<td>Novum Testamentum et Orbis Antiquus</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NTS</td>
<td>New Testament Studies</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>RB</td>
<td>Revue Biblique</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SBLDS</td>
<td>Society of Biblical Literature Dissertation Series</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SBLMS</td>
<td>Society of Biblical Literature Monograph Series</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SBEC</td>
<td>Studies in the Bible and Early Christianity</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SBS</td>
<td>Sources for Biblical Study</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SNTA</td>
<td>Studiorum Novi Testamenti Auxilia</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SNTSMS</td>
<td>Society for New Testament Studies Monograph Series</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SPIB</td>
<td>Scripta Pontificii Instituti Biblici</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SSD</td>
<td>Seam and summary data</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TAPA</td>
<td>Transactions of the American Philological Association</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TCR</td>
<td>The Classical Review</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TL</td>
<td>Theologische Literaturzeitung</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TLG</td>
<td>Thesaurus Linguae Graecae</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TPAPA</td>
<td>Transactions and Proceedings of the American Philological Association</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TZ</td>
<td>Theologische Zeitschrift</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ZTK</td>
<td>Zeitschrift für Theologie und Kirche</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>