Paradise and Hell in Islamic Traditions

The Muslim afterworld, with its imagery rich in sensual promises, has shaped Western perceptions of Islam for centuries. However, to date, no single study has done justice to the full spectrum of traditions of thinking about the topic in Islamic history. The Muslim hell, in particular, remains a little-studied subject. This book, which is based on a wide array of carefully selected Arabic and Persian texts, covers not only the theological and exegetical but also the philosophical, mystical, topographical, architectural, and ritual aspects of the Muslim belief in paradise and hell, in both the Sunni and the Shi'i world. By examining a broad range of sources related to the afterlife, Christian Lange shows that Muslim religious literature, against transcendentalist assumptions to the contrary, often pictures the boundary between this world and the otherworld as being remarkably thin, or even permeable.

Christian Lange is Professor of Arabic and Islamic Studies at Utrecht University. He is the author of *Justice, Punishment and the Medieval Muslim Imagination* (2008) and the editor of several scholarly volumes, including *Locating Hell in Islamic Traditions* (2015). From 2011 to 2015, he was Principal Investigator of the European Research Council project, “The Here and the Hereafter in Islamic Traditions.” He is a member of the Young Academy of the Dutch Royal Academy of Sciences.
Paradise and Hell in Islamic Traditions

CHRISTIAN LANGE
Utrecht University
Für A. und M.,

قرة عيني
Contents

List of Figures  page x
List of Table and Charts  xii
Acknowledgements  xiii
List of Abbreviations  xv
Note on Dates, Citation, Translations, and Transliteration  xvii

Introduction  1
Reconceptualising the Dunyâ/Ākhira Divide  4
The Muslim Eschatological Imagination  13
Premodern Views of the Islamic Otherworld among Non-Muslims  17
Modern and Contemporary Scholarship on Paradise and Hell in Islam  24
Overview of Chapters and Note on Illustrations  31

PART I  TEXTUAL FOUNDATIONS: NARRATING THE OTHERWORLD

1  The Otherworld Revealed: Paradise and Hell in the Qur’ān  37
   Time and Space in the Qur’ānic Otherworld  39
   The Joys and Torments of the Qur’ānic Paradise and Hell  43
   The Development of Qur’ānic Eschatology  48
   Qur’ānic Eschatology in Its Late Antique Context  56
   The Originality of the Qur’ānic Vision of Paradise and Hell  67

2  The Growth of the Islamic Otherworld: A History of Muslim Traditionist Eschatology  71
   The Formative Period (ca. First–Third/Seventh–Ninth Century)  71
   The Second Period of Expansion (ca. Fourth–Sixth/Tenth–Twelfth Century)  81
Contents

The Third Period of Expansion (ca. Seventh–Ninth/Thirteenth–Fifteenth Century) 85
Late-Medieval Developments (ca. Tenth–Thirteenth/Sixteenth–Nineteenth Century) 89

3 Hope, Fear, and Entertainment: Parenetic and Popular Muslim Literature on the Otherworld 93
   Parenetic Works up to al-Ghazālī 94
   Cultivating Hope and Fear after al-Ghazālī 99
   Popular Manuals 104
   The Prophet’s Ascension and Other Prophetic Tours of the Otherworld 112

4 The Imagination Unbound: Two Late Medieval Muslim Scholars on Paradise and Hell 120
   A Prelude to the Otherworld 122
   Time, Space, and Vision in the Muslim Paradise and Hell 128
   Plants, Animals, and Spiritual Beings 135
   Otherworldly Bodies 146
   The Blessed and the Damned 154

PART II DISCOURSES AND PRACTICES: DEBATING THE OTHERWORLD

5 The Otherworld Contested: Cosmology, Soteriology, and Ontology in Sunni Theology and Philosophy 165
   The Location, Creation, and Duration of Paradise and Hell 165
   Salvation in Sunni Theology 171
   The Reality of the Afterlife 179
   Imagining the Otherworld 186

6 Otherworlds Apart: Shīʿi Visions of Paradise and Hell 192
   The World of Image in Shīʿi Thought 192
   Traditionalism and Rationalism in Shīʿi Eschatology 196
   The Akhbaʾī Revival of Eschatology 204
   Ismāʿīli Eschatology 209

7 The Otherworld Within: Paradise and Hell in Islamic Mysticism 219
   Fear and Longing in Early Sufism 219
   Contemptus Ultramundī 225
   The Immanentist View 231
   Compulsory Return 236
   Voluntary Return 239

8 Eschatology Now: Paradise and Hell in Muslim Topography, Architecture, and Ritual 245
   Eutopia/Dystopia 246
   Architectural Visions of Paradise 257
Contents

Otherworldly Rituals 267
Interfused Worlds 277
Epilogue 279
  Modern Continuities and Discontinuities 279
  The Disappearing Boundary 286

Primary Sources 291
Secondary Sources 313
Index of Names 347
Index of Terms 357
Figures

1. The devil tempts Adam and Eve to eat the fruit of the forbidden tree. Tabriz/Persia, 707/1307–8
2. The prophet Muhammad approaching the gate of heaven during his ascension. Tabriz/Persia, ca. 705/[1306] or 714/[1314–15]
3. An angel in the form of a heavenly horse. Baghdad/Iraq, eighth/fourteenth century
5. Two prophetic figures in paradise. Qazwin/Persia, 984/1577
6. The angels of the grave, Munkar and Nakir, torturing an inhabitant of the grave. India, prob. late twelfth/eighteenth century
7. The eight gates and gardens of paradise. Turkey, before 1147/[1735]
8. Hell’s angels. Herat/Afghanistan, ninth/fifteenth century
9. Malik, the guardian of hell. India, thirteenth/nineteenth century (?)
10. Muhammad, during his heavenly journey, prostrates before God. Herat/Afghanistan, ninth/fifteenth century
14. The prophet Muhammad, during his heavenly journey, visits paradise. Persian lithograph dated 1271/1854
15. ‘Ali offers Muhammad an apple in paradise. Persian lithograph dated 1271/1854
Figures

17 A dream vision of Najm al-Dīn Kubrā’s ascension. Agra/India, 1012/1603 229
18 An eschatological map of the Temple Mount in Jerusalem. Mecca, ca. 967/1559 249
19 The entry to heaven on top of mount Qāf. Turkey, 675/1276 or 714/1314-5 258
20 The city of Iram. Tabriz/Persia, ca. 705/1306 or 714/1314-5 265
21 The angel of death grabbing the soul of the king Shaddād. India (?), probably eleventh/seventeenth century 266
22 The mountain of ʿAyr. India, probably late twelfth/eighteenth century 270
23 The Bridge, the valleys and mountains of hell, the eight gates of paradise, and the residences therein of the Prophet and the eponyms of the four Sunni schools of law. Turkey, twelfth/eighteenth century 273
Table and Charts

Table

1 Occurrence of the terms al-janna (“the Garden”) and al-nār (“the Fire”) in some traditionist works of the third/ninth and later centuries  page 80

Charts

1 The dunyā/akhira relationship: The diachronic view  5
2 The dunyā/akhira relationship: The synchronic view  12
3 Al-dunyā and al-ākhira as merismos  43
4 Three types of unitive conceptualisations of the dunyā/akhira relationship  231
5 Ibn al-ʿArabi’s ethical hell  242
Acknowledgements

The research for, and writing of, this book was carried out in the framework of the research project “The here and the hereafter in Islamic traditions” (HHIT), which I had the good fortune to oversee, as Principal Investigator, at the University of Utrecht from March 2011 to April 2015 (http://hhit.wp.hum.uu.nl/). I want to acknowledge the European Research Council for funding this project (ERC Starting Grant, project no. 263308) as well as thank my co-investigators Pieter Coppens, Eric van Lit, Simon O’Meara, and Yunus Yaldiz for going the distance with me. Our joint journey through the vast horizons of Islamic eschatology, whether in our weekly Arabic and Persian reading workshops or in three memorable heidesessies in Eckwarden (2012), Frankfurt (2013), and Doetinchem Castle (2014), has shaped, in profound ways, the structure and argument of this study. I owe a particularly great deal to Simon O’Meara, who, at the eleventh hour, selflessly read the entire manuscript and saved me from many blunders and infelicities.

Next to the members of HHIT, I should also like to thank Ghassan El Masri, Bill Graham, Ahmet Karamustafa, Christopher Melchert, Harald Motzki, Mohammed Rustom, Tommaso Tesei, Jamel Velji, and my much admired teacher, Josef van Ess, for reading parts of this book and providing helpful suggestions for improvement. Scholars with whom I had the pleasure of discussing specific points include Frederick Colby, Michael Ebstein, Maribel Fierro, Christiane Gruber, Sebastian Günther, Carole Hillenbrand, Robert Hillenbrand, Jon Hoover, Remke Kruk, Herman Landolt, Pierre Lory, Kevin Reinhart, Nicolai Sinai, Daniel de Smet, Wheeler Thackston, Roberto Tottoli, and Wim Raven. The two anonymous reviewers of the original proposal steered my thinking in important directions, and I’m deeply grateful to both. Colleagues in Utrecht and other Dutch universities have likewise enriched the process of researching and writing this book in significant ways, among them Bob Becking, Nico Landman, Birgit Meyer,
Acknowledgements

Eric Ottenheijm, Marcel Poorthuis, Arjan Post, Bernd Radtke, Amr Ryad, and Joost Vanderlijn. It goes without saying that I don’t mention these learned friends and teachers in order to claim their credentials; I merely wish to express my gratitude for their support and readiness to provide advice. I alone remain responsible for any shortcomings there may be in this book.

I also want to salute a number of people who provided logistical and editorial support. Kobi Gal, in unfailing friendship, regaled me with PDFs that I could only get through him. My department’s librarian, Joost van Gemert, tirelessly tried to cater to my research needs. At Cambridge University Press, Marigold Acland and Patricia Crone launched me on this book, which would never have come about without their initial support and inspiration. Because it grew out of size, the book could not be published in Patricia’s series Themes in Islamic History, for which it had been originally commissioned. I am grateful to the Cambridge University Press for allowing me to publish it as a stand-alone title. Kate Gavino, Will Hammell, and Maria Marsh saw the manuscript through press, while Nishanthini Vetrivel and Christine Dunn guided me patiently through the painstaking process of copy editing the final version.
Abbreviations


**BSOAS**  *Bulletin of the School of Oriental and African Studies*


**CMR**  *Christian-Muslim relations: A bibliographical history*. Edited by David Thomas and Barbara Roggema. Leiden and Boston: Brill, 2009–. Online publication


**EI1**  *The encyclopaedia of Islam*. Edited by T. Houtsma et al. 5 vols. Leiden: Brill, 1913–34


**EI3**  *The encyclopaedia of Islam: THREE*. Edited by Kate Fleet, Gudrun Krämer, Denis Matringe, and Everett Rowson. Leiden: Brill, 2007–. Online publication

**EIr**  *Encyclopaedia Iranica*. Edited by Ehsan Yarshater et al. Bibliotheca Persica Press, 1985–. Online publication

**EQ**  *The encyclopedia of the Qur’an*. Edited by Jane Dammen McAuliffe et al. Leiden: Brill, 2001–6
Note on Dates, Citation, Translations, and Transliteration

In the text, Islamic dates for the premodern era are given both according to the Islamic hijri calendar and the Julian/Gregorian calendar. For convenience, in this book I have used the term *Late Medieval* to refer to the post-Mongol period of Islamic history up to the nineteenth century CE. In the bibliography, books issuing from Iran are occasionally listed according to their year of publication in the Iranian solar calendar, and accordingly marked with “sh.” Throughout this book, footnotes only show the short title of books and articles; full information is given in the bibliography at the end. Abbreviations that appear in the footnotes, including the less frequently used ones, are explained in the List of Abbreviations. Entries from the *Encyclopaedia of Islam*, the *Encyclopaedia of the Qurʾān*, and the *Encyclopaedia Iranica* do not feature in the bibliography; they only appear in the footnotes. Hadiths from the Six Books are quoted following the convention established in Arent Jan Wensinck’s *Concordance et indices de la tradition musulmane*, that is, by the name of the kitaḥ and number of the bāb. To facilitate use of my references, I have also provided the title of the bāb (if applicable) and page numbers referring to the printed editions that I have consulted.

All translations into English from the Arabic, Persian, and European languages are mine unless otherwise indicated. As for translations from the Qurʾān, I have mostly relied on Alan Jones’s rendering, although I have in places diverted from it if the argument seemed to call for it. The transliteration of foreign words in this book follows the rules applied in the third edition of *The Encyclopaedia of Islam*. However, I have chosen to use a simplified transliteration of Persian words in which vowels are reduced to the three long and short vowels (ā/a, ī/i, ŭ/u) of the Arabic alphabet and labiodental v becomes w (as in *Mathnawi*, instead of *Mathnavī*). No transliteration has been used for place names and for anglicized words such as hadith, houri, and Kaaba.