European Constitutional Law

The European Union has existed for over half a century. Having started as the 'Europe of the Six' in a specific industrial sector, the Union today has twenty-seven Member States and acts within almost all areas of social life. The Union’s constitutional structures have evolved in parallel with this immense growth. Born as an international organisation, the Union has developed into a constitutional Union of States. This new textbook analyses the constitutional law of the European Union after Lisbon in a clear and structured way. Examining the EU in a classic constitutional perspective, it explores the central themes of the subject: the history and structure of the Union, the powers and procedures of its branches of government, and the rights and remedies of European citizens. A clear three-part structure and numerous illustrations will facilitate understanding. Critical and comprehensive, this is required reading for all students of European constitutional law.

Robert Schütze is a Reader in Law at Durham University.
In Memory of Pierre Pescatore (1919–2010)
## Summary Contents

**Introduction: European Constitutional Law**

**Part I: History and Structure**

1. Constitutional History: From Paris to Lisbon  
2. Constitutional Nature: A Federation of States  
3. Governmental Structure: Union Institutions I  
4. Governmental Structure: Union Institutions II

**Part II: Powers and Procedures**

5. Legislative Powers: Competences and Procedures  
6. External Powers: Competences and Procedures  
7. Executive Powers: Competences and Procedures  
8. Judicial Powers: Competences and Procedures

**Part III: Rights and Remedies**

9. European Law: Direct and Indirect Effect  
10. European Law: Supremacy and Preemption  
11. European Law: Remedies and Liabilities  
12. In Particular: European Human Rights
## Contents

*List of Illustrations*  xviii  
*List of Tables*  xix  
*Preface*  xxii  
*Acknowledgements*  xxii  
*Table of Cases*  xxxvi  
*Table of Equivalences*  lii  
*List of Abbreviations*  

### Introduction: European Constitutional Law

1  Introduction: European Constitutional Law  

### Part I: History and Structure

1  Constitutional History: From Paris to Lisbon  

#### 1. From Paris to Rome: the European Coal and Steel Community  

(a) The (supranational) structure of the ECSC  
(b) The (failed) European Defence Community  

#### 2. From Rome to Maastricht: the European (Economic) Community  

(a) Normative supranationalism: the nature of European law  
(b) Decisional supranationalism: the governmental structure  
(c) Intergovernmental developments outside the EEC  
(d) Supranational and intergovernmental reforms through the Single European Act  

#### 3. From Maastricht to Nice: the (old) European Union  

(a) The Temple Structure: the Three Pillars of the (Maastricht) Union  
(i) The First Pillar: the European Communities  
(ii) The Second Pillar: Common Foreign and Security Policy  
(iii) The Third Pillar: Justice and Home Affairs  
(b) A decade of ‘constitutional bricolage’: Amsterdam and Nice  
(i) The Amsterdam Treaty: dividing the Third Pillar  
(ii) The Nice Treaty: limited institutional reform
### Contents

(d) Parliamentary powers 96  
   (i) Legislative powers 96  
   (ii) Budgetary powers 97  
   (iii) Supervisory powers 98  
   (iv) Elective powers 99

3. The European Council 100  
   (a) The President of the European Council 102  
   (b) The European Council: functions and powers 103

4. The Council 104  
   (a) The Council: composition and configuration 105  
   (b) Internal structure and organs 106  
      (i) The Presidency of the Council 106  
      (ii) ‘Coreper’ and specialised committees 107  
      (iii) *Excursus*: the High Representative of Foreign Affairs and Security Policy 110  
   (c) Decision-making and voting 111  
   (d) Functions and powers 114

4 Governmental Structure: Union Institutions II 116

1. The Commission 116  
   (a) Composition and structure 117  
      (i) The President and ‘his’ college 118  
      (ii) The Commission’s administrative organs 119  
   (b) Decision-making within the Commission 122  
   (c) Functions and powers of the Commission 123  
   (d) *Excursus*: European Agencies and the Commission 125

2. The Court of Justice of the European Union 128  
   (a) Judicial architecture: the European court system 129  
      (i) The Court of Justice: composition and structure 130  
      (ii) The General Court: composition and structure 131  
      (iii) *Excursus*: the Advocates General 132  
      (iv) The ‘specialised court(s)’: the Civil Service Tribunal 134  
   (b) The judicial procedure(s) 135  
   (c) Judicial reasoning: methods of interpretation 136  
   (d) Jurisdiction and judicial powers 138

3. The European Central Bank 139  
   (a) The special status of the ECB 140  
   (b) Organs and administrative structure 142  
   (c) Internal divisions and decision-making 143  
   (d) Functions and powers 144

4. The Court of Auditors 145  
   Conclusion 147
## Part II: Powers and Procedures

### 5 Legislative Powers: Competences and Procedures

#### Introduction

1. **The scope of Union competences**
   - (a) Teleological interpretation
   - (b) The general competences of the Union
     - (i) The harmonisation competence: Article 114 TFEU
     - (ii) The residual competence: Article 352 TFEU

2. **The categories of Union competences**
   - (a) Exclusive competences: Article 3 TFEU
   - (b) Shared competences: Article 4 TFEU
   - (c) Coordinating competences: Article 5 TFEU
   - (d) Complementary competences: Article 6 TFEU

3. **Legislative procedures: ordinary and special**
   - (a) The ‘ordinary’ legislative procedure
     - (i) Constitutional theory: formal text
     - (ii) Constitutional practice: informal trilogues
   - (b) The ‘special’ legislative procedures

4. **The principle of subsidiarity**
   - (a) Procedural standard: subsidiarity as a political safeguard of federalism
   - (b) Substantive standard: subsidiarity as a judicial safeguard of federalism

#### Conclusion

### 6 External Powers: Competences and Procedures

#### Introduction

1. **The external competences of the Union**
   - (a) The Common Foreign and Security Policy
   - (b) The Union’s special external powers
   - (c) The residual treaty power: Article 216 TFEU
   - (d) The relationship between the CFSP and the special external competences

2. **The nature of external competences**
   - (a) The *sui generis* nature of the CFSP competence
   - (b) Article 3 (2) TFEU: subsequent exclusive treaty powers
     - (i) Three lines of exclusivity: codifying constitutional practice?
     - (ii) Subsequent exclusivity: criticising constitutional theory
8 Judicial Powers: Competences and Procedures

Introduction 258

1. Annulment powers: judicial review 262
   (a) The existence of a ‘reviewable’ act 263
   (b) Legitimate grounds for review 264
      (i) ‘Formal’ and ‘substantive’ grounds 265
      (ii) In particular: the proportionality principle 267
   (c) Legal standing before the European Court 268
      (i) The Rome formulation and its judicial interpretation 270
      (ii) The Lisbon formulation and its interpretative problems 273
   (d) The indirect review of European law 275
      (i) Collateral review: the plea of illegality 275
      (ii) Indirect review through preliminary rulings 276

2. Remedial powers: liability actions 278
   (a) Procedural conditions: from dependent to independent action 279
   (b) Substantive conditions: from Schöppenstedt to Bergaderm 280

3. Adjudicatory powers I: enforcement actions 283
   (a) Enforcement actions against Member States 283
      (i) The procedural conditions under Article 258 TFEU 283
      (ii) Judicial enforcement through financial sanctions 286
   (b) Enforcement actions against the Union: failure to act 287

4. Adjudicatory powers II: preliminary rulings 289
   (a) Paragraph 1: the jurisdiction of the European Court 291
   (b) Paragraph 2: the conditions for a preliminary ruling 292
      (i) ‘Who’: national courts and tribunals 293
      (ii) ‘What’: necessary questions 295
   (c) Paragraph 3: the obligation to refer and ‘acte clair’ 296
   (d) The legal nature of preliminary rulings 299

Conclusion 301

Part III: Rights and Remedies

9 European Law: Direct and Indirect Effect 305

Introduction 306

1. Constitutional law: the effect of European primary law 310
   (a) Direct effect: from strict to lenient test 312
   (b) The dimensions of direct effect: vertical and horizontal direct effect 315
2. Direct Union law: regulations and decisions 317
   (a) Regulations: the 'legislative' instrument 317
      (i) General application in all Member States 317
      (ii) Direct application and direct effect 318
   (b) Decisions: the executive instrument 320
      (i) Specifically addressed decisions 321
      (ii) Non-addressed decisions 322
3. Indirect Union law: directives 323
   (a) Direct effect and directives: conditions and limits 323
      (i) The no-horizontal-direct-effect rule 326
      (ii) The limitation to the rule: the wide definition of State (actions) 327
      (iii) The exception to the rule: incidental horizontal direct effect 329
   (b) Indirect effects through national and (primary) European law 331
      (i) The doctrine of consistent interpretation of national law 331
      (ii) Indirect effects through the medium of European law 334
4. External Union law: international agreements 337
   (a) Direct effects of Union agreements 338
      (i) The conditions for direct effect 339
      (ii) The dimensions of direct effect 341
   (b) Indirect effects: the interpretation and implementation principles 342
Conclusion 344

10 European Law: Supremacy and Preemption 347
   Introduction 347
   1. The European perspective: absolute supremacy 349
      (a) The absolute scope of the supremacy principle 350
         (i) Supremacy over internal laws of the Member States 350
         (ii) Supremacy over international treaties of the Member States 352
      (b) The ‘executive’ nature of supremacy: disapplication, not invalidation 355
   2. The national perspective: relative supremacy 358
      (a) Fundamental rights limits: the ‘so-long’ jurisprudence 359
      (b) Competences limits: from ‘Maastricht’ to ‘Mangold’ 361
   3. Legislative preemption: nature and effect 363
      (a) Preemption categories: the relative effects of preemption 364
         (i) Field preemption 365
         (ii) Obstacle preemption 366
         (iii) Rule preemption 366
      (b) Modes of preemption: express and implied preemption 367
### 4. Constitutional limits to legislative preemption

- **(a) Union instruments and their preemptive capacity**
  - (i) The preemptive capacity of regulations
  - (ii) The preemptive capacity of directives
  - (iii) The preemptive capacity of international agreements
- **(b) Competence limits to preemption**
  - (i) Competences for minimum harmonisation
  - (ii) Complementary competences excluding harmonisation

### Conclusion

#### 11 European Law: Remedies and Liabilities

**Introduction**

1. The (consistent) interpretation principle
2. The equivalence principle
   - (a) Non-discrimination: extending national remedies to European actions
   - (b) ‘Similar’ actions: the equivalence test
3. The effectiveness principle
   - (a) The historical evolution of the effectiveness standard
   - (b) Procedural limits to the invocability of European law
4. The liability principle
   - (a) State liability: the Francovich doctrine
     - (i) The three conditions for State liability
     - (ii) State liability for judicial breaches of European law
   - (b) Private liability: the Courage doctrine

### Conclusion

#### 12 In Particular: European Human Rights

**Introduction**

1. The ‘unwritten’ bill of rights: human rights as ‘general principles’
   - (a) The birth of European fundamental rights
     - (i) The European standard – an ‘autonomous’ standard
     - (ii) Limitations, and ‘limitations on limitations’
   - (b) United Nations law: external limits to European human rights?
2. The ‘written’ bill of rights: the Charter of Fundamental Rights
   - (a) The Charter: structure and content
     - (i) (Hard) rights and (soft) principles
     - (ii) Limitations, and ‘limitations on limitations’
   - (b) Relations with the European Treaties (and the European Convention)
3. The ‘external’ bill of rights: the European Convention of Human Rights
   (a) The Convention standard for Union acts
      (i) Before accession: (limited) indirect review of Union acts
      (ii) After accession: (full) direct review of Union acts
   (b) Union accession to the European Convention: constitutional preconditions
4. The ‘incorporation doctrine’: European rights and national law
   (a) Incorporation and general principles: implementation and derogation
   (b) Incorporation and the Charter of Fundamental Rights
      (i) General rules for all Member States
      (ii) Special rules for Poland and the United Kingdom
   (c) Incorporation and the European Convention of Human Rights?
   (d) Excursus: incorporation and individuals – human rights and private actions

Conclusion

Appendices
1. European Treaties (Chronology)
2. Territorial Evolution of the European Union
3. Extracts from the ‘Luxembourg Compromise’
4. Extracts from James Madison’s ‘Federalist No. 39’
5. Extracts from the 1976 ‘European Parliament Direct Election Act’
6. Extracts from Decision 2009/908 on the Council Presidency
7. Directorate-General Home Affairs (Organigramme)
8. Extracts from the ‘Comitology’ Regulation

Index
Illustrations

1. Structure of the Book 5
2. Historical Evolution of the Union 11
3. Pillar Structure of the ‘old’ (Maastricht) Union 30
4. Dual Treaty basis before and after Lisbon 42
5. Distribution of Seats in the European Parliament (Political Parties) 92
6. Preparatory Committees to the Council 109
7. Internal Commission Structure 121
8. Structure of the Court of Justice of the European Union 130
9. Structure of the European Central Bank 142
9a. General and Special Competences 158
9b. Competence Types 164
10. Structure of the Union Legislator 170
11. Ordinary Legislative Procedure under Article 294 TFEU 172
12. Declining Democratic Representation 175
13. Structure of the Social Policy Competence 185
14. Relationship among Union External Competences 199
15. Dual Executive of the Union 226
16. ‘Comitology’ as defined by Regulation 182/2011 243
17. Judicial Federalism in Comparative Perspective 290
18. Preliminary Rulings under Article 267 TFEU 295
19. Monism and Dualism 307
20. Direct Applicability, Direct Effect and Private Party Actions 316
21. Preemption Types: Field, Obstacle, Rule Preemption 365
22. Limits on National Procedural Autonomy 383
23. Standards of Effectiveness 388
24. Inspiration Theory versus Incorporation Theory 417
25. Principles and Rights within the Charter 426
26. Relationship between the Union’s three ‘Bills of Rights’ 445
27. Territory of the European Union 452
28. Directorate-General Home Affairs (Organigramme) 466
Tables

1. Structure of the TEU and TFEU
2. Treaty provisions on the institutions
3. Union institutions correlating to governmental functions
4. Distribution of seats in the European Parliament (Member States)
5. Standing Committees of the European Parliament
6. Council Configurations
7. Weighted Votes System within the Council
8. Commission College: President and Portfolios
9. (Selected) European Agencies and Decentralised Bodies
10. Union Policies and Internal Actions
11. Union External Policies
12. Judicial Competences and Procedures
13. Structure of the Charter of Fundamental Rights
14. European Treaties (Chronology)
15. Member States of the European Union (Evolution)
The European Union has existed for over half a century. Having started in 1952 as ‘the Europe of the Six’ in a specific industrial sector, the Union today has twenty-seven Member States and acts within almost all areas of social life. The Union’s constitutional structures have evolved in parallel with its vivid growth. Born as an international organisation, the Union has developed into a mature federation of States. The European Union thereby underwent its greatest ‘transformation’ in the first decade of the twenty-first century. This fundamental reform started in 2001 with the Laeken Declaration on the Future of the European Union and would – despite the failure of the 2004 'Treaty establishing a Constitution for Europe' – find its way into the 2007 Reform (Lisbon) Treaty. And the Union after Lisbon is not the Union that it was before. This book presents the structures and powers of this ‘renewed’ Union in ‘renewed’ constitutional terms. It is the fruit of my lectures and writings during the – tumultuous – last decade. Thanks go to many a colleague and friend, and especially to Antonis Antoniadis, Amandine Garde, Konrad Lachmayer, as well as Dieter and Isolde Schütze. On the editorial side, I profoundly thank Sinéad Moloney of Cambridge University Press for her boundless patience and professionalism. The book is dedicated to Pierre Pescatore – the greatest twentieth century ‘painter’ of the European Union.
Acknowledgements

Grateful acknowledgements are made to Hart Publishing, Kluwer Law International, Oxford University Press, Sweet & Maxwell, as well as Wiley for their kind permission to incorporate sections from previously published material. In particular, Chapter 2 represents a shortened and amended version of a chapter published in *From Dual to Cooperative Federalism: The Changing Structure of European Law* (Oxford University Press, 2009). Thanks also go to Cambridge University Press for allowing me to reproduce parts of the *Federalist No. 39* from the series on 'Texts in the History of Political Thought'. For illustrations 2 and 5, 27 and 28 acknowledgements go – respectively – to Wikipedia and the European Union’s website(s).
Table of Cases

Contents

1. Court of Justice of the European Union
   (a) European Court of Justice: Cases (numerical) xxiii
   (b) European Court of Justice: Opinions (numerical) xxxiv
   (c) General Court: Cases (numerical) xxxiv

2. Other jurisdictions xxxv
   (a) European Court of Human Rights: Cases (chronological) xxxv
   (b) German Constitutional Court: Cases (chronological) xxxv
   (c) United States Supreme Court: Cases (chronological) xxxv

1. Court of Justice of the European Union
   (a) European Court of Justice: Cases (numerical)

Case 8/55, Fédération Charbonnière de Belgique v. High Authority of the European Coal and Steel Community, [1955] ECR 245 155, 267
Case 1/58, Stork & Cie v. High Authority of the European Coal and Steel Community, [1958] ECR 17 412
Case 20/59, Italy v. High Authority, [1960] ECR 325 283
Case 30/59, De Gazamenlijke Steenkolenmijnen in Limburg v. High Authority of the European Coal and Steel Community, [1961] ECR 1 163
Case 10/61, Commission v. Italy, [1962] ECR 1 353
Table of Cases

Case 75/63, Hoekstra (née Unger), [1964] ECR 177 291
Joined Cases 90–91/63, Commission v. Luxembourg and Belgium, [1964] ECR 625 60, 287
Case 6/64, Costa v. ENEL, [1964] ECR 585 20, 60, 59, 162, 291, 295, 297, 350
Joined Cases 18 and 35/65, Gutmann v. Commission, [1965] ECR 103 266
Case 13/68, Salgoil v. Italian Ministry of Foreign Trade, [1968] ECR 453 314
Case 9/69, Sayag et al. v. Leduc et al., [1969] ECR 329 280
Case 29/69, Stauder v. City of Ulm, [1969] ECR 419 413, 415
Case 64/69, Compagnie Française commerciale et financière v. Commission, [1970] ECR 221 318
Case 15/70, Chevallery v. Commission, [1970] ECR 975 288
Case 22/70, Commission v. Council (ERTA), [1971] ECR 263 195, 202, 264, 266
Case 18/72, Granaria v. Produktschap voor Veevoeder, [1972] ECR 1163 370
Case 30/72, Commission v. Italy, [1973] ECR 161 285
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Case</th>
<th>Parties</th>
<th>Decision Year</th>
<th>Reference</th>
<th>Relevant Pages</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Case 34/73, Fratelli Variola Spa v. Amministrazione delle finanze dello Stato</td>
<td>[1974]</td>
<td>ECR 33</td>
<td>294</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Case 167/73, Commission v. France</td>
<td>[1974]</td>
<td>ECR 359</td>
<td>357</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Case 36/74, Walrave et al. v. Association Union cycliste internationale et al.</td>
<td>[1975]</td>
<td>ECR 1405</td>
<td>316</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Case 9/74, Casagrande v. Landeshauptstadt München</td>
<td>[1975]</td>
<td>ECR 117</td>
<td>280</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Joined Cases 38/77, Enka BV v. Inspecteur der invoerrechten en accijnzen</td>
<td>[1977]</td>
<td>ECR 2043</td>
<td>382, 389</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Table of Cases**

Case 34/73, Fratelli Variola Spa v. Amministrazione delle finanze dello Stato, [1973] ECR 981 318
Case 167/73, Commission v. France, [1974] ECR 33 294
Case 36/74, Walrave et al. v. Association Union cycliste internationale et al., [1974] ECR 1405 316
Case 100/74, CAM v. Commission, [1975] ECR 1393 272
Case 43/75, Defrenne v. Sabena, [1976] ECR 455 301, 313, 316, 444
Case 60/75, Russo v. Azienda di Stato per gli interventi sul mercato agricolo, [1976] ECR 45 397
Case 74/76, Iannelli & Volpi SpA v. Ditta Paolo Meroni, [1977] ECR 557 312, 315
Case 38/77, Enka BV v. Inspecteur der invoerrechten en accijnzen, [1977] ECR 2203 371
Case 31/78, Bussone v. Italian Ministry of Agriculture, [1978] ECR 2429 368, 370
Case 120/78, Rewe-Zentral v. Bundesmonopolverwaltung für Branntwein (Cassis de Dijon), [1979] ECR 649 23
Case 230/78, SpA Eridania-Zuckerificio nazionali and SpA Societa Italiana per l'Industria degli Zuccheri v. Minister of Agriculture and Forestry, Minister for
Table of Cases

Industry, Trade and Craft Trades and SpA Zuccherifici Meridionali, [1979] ECR 2749 319
Case 244/80, Folgia v. Novello (No. 2), [1981] ECR 3045 296
Case 8/81, Becker v. Finanzamt Münster-Innenstadt, [1982] ECR 53 344
Case 60/81, International Business Machines (IBM) v. Commission, [1981] ECR 2639 264
Case 249/81, Commission v. Ireland (Buy Irish), [1982] ECR 4005 285
Case 283/81, CILFIT and others v. Ministry of Health, [1982] ECR 3415 298
Case 11/82, Piraiki-Patraiki and others v. Commission, [1985] ECR 207 272
Table of Cases

| Case C-331/88, The Queen v. Minister of Agriculture, Fisheries and Food and Secretary of State for Health, ex parte Fedesa and others, [1990] ECR I-4023 267–8 |
| Case C-106/89, Marleasing v. La Comercial Internacional de Alimentacion, [1990] ECR I-4135 331–2, 384 |
| Case C-188/89, Foster and others v. British Gas, [1990] ECR I-3313 328 |
| Case C-213/89, The Queen v. Secretary of State for Transport, ex parte Factortame Ltd and others, [1990] ECR I-2433 388, 390 |
| Joined Cases C-6/90 and C-9/90, Francovich and Bonifaci et al. v. Italy, [1991] ECR I-5357 396, 408 |
| Case C-31/90, Johnson v. Chief Adjudication Officer, [1991] ECR I-3723 392 |
| Case C-158/91, Criminal Proceedings against Jean-Claude Levy, [1993] ECR I-4287 353 |
| Joined Cases C-267/91 and C-268/91, Criminal proceedings against Keck and Mithouard, [1993] ECR I-6097 272 |
Table of Cases

Case C-91/92, Faccini Dori v. Recreb, [1994] ECR I-3325 326, 369, 408
Case C-137/92P, Commission v. BASF et al., [1994] ECR I-2555 123
Case C-188/92, TWD v. Germany, [1994] ECR I-833 277
Case C-359/92, Germany v. Council, [1994] ECR I-3681 245
Case C-410/92, Johnson v. Chief Adjudication Officer, [1994] ECR I-5483 391
Case C-431/92, Commission v. Germany, [1995] ECR I-2189 284
Case C-32/93, Webb v. EMO Air Cargo, [1994] ECR I-3567 332
Case C-316/93, Vaneevelt v. Le Foyer, [1994] ECR I-763 330
Case C-324/93, The Queen v. Secretary of State for Home Department, ex parte Evans Medical Ltd and Macfarlan Smith Ltd, [1995] ECR I-563 353
Case C-392/93, The Queen v. HM Treasury, ex parte British Telecommunications, [1996] ECR I-10631 401
Case C-466/93, Atlanta Fruchthandelsgesellschaft mbH and others v. Bundesamt für Ernährung und Forstwirtschaft [1995] ECR I-3799 277
Case C-84/94, United Kingdom of Great Britain and Northern Ireland v. Council, [1996] ECR I-5755 155
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Case</th>
<th>Party 1</th>
<th>Party 2</th>
<th>Year</th>
<th>Document</th>
<th>Pages</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>C-233/94</td>
<td>Germany v. Parliament and Council (Deposit Guarantee Scheme)</td>
<td>[1997] ECR I-2405</td>
<td>182</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>C-84/95</td>
<td>Bosphorus Hava Yollari Turizm ve Ticaret AS v. Minister for Transport, Energy and Communications and others</td>
<td>[1996] ECR I-3953</td>
<td>420</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>C-122/95</td>
<td>Germany v. Council (Bananas)</td>
<td>[1998] ECR I-973</td>
<td>268</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>C-177/95</td>
<td>Ebony Maritime et al. v. Prefetto della Provincia di Brindisi et al.</td>
<td>[1997] ECR I-1111</td>
<td>320</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>C-129/96</td>
<td>Inter-Environnement Wallonie ASBL v. Region Wallonne</td>
<td>[1997] ECR I-7411</td>
<td>331</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>C-170/96</td>
<td>Commission v. Council (Airport Transit Visa)</td>
<td>[1998] ECR I-2763</td>
<td>197</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>C-231/96</td>
<td>Edilizia Industriale Siderurgica Srl (Edis) v. Ministero delle Finanze</td>
<td>[1998] ECR I-4951</td>
<td>386</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>C-264/96</td>
<td>Imperial Chemical Industries (ICI) v. Kenneth Hall Colmer (Her Majesty’s Inspector of Taxes)</td>
<td>[1998] ECR I-4695</td>
<td>296</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>