CONTENTS

Acknowledgements page xi
Table of cases xii

Introduction 1
The contemporary separation of powers 1

PART I Separation of powers, the Human Rights Act and the European Convention on Human Rights 7

1 A doctrine of uncertain scope and application 9
The meaning(s) and aim(s) of separation of powers 9
Separation of powers in the United Kingdom constitution 16
The supremacy of Parliament 20
'Theory, as usual, followed upon fact …' 21
A relationship of equal branches? 22
A descriptive, or normative, device? 24
The centrality of judicial independence 26
The contemporary separation of powers 31

2 The Human Rights Act 1998 and the separation of powers 33
Introduction 33
Rights as questions of law and/or politics 34
The parliamentary bill of rights model 42
The Human Rights Act in the United Kingdom constitution 44
Intergrating rights concerns into the legislative process 46
Interpretations and declarations of incompatibility 48
Separation of powers at the macro-level: an inter-institutional dialogue on rights? 50
Strong form review by stealth? 52
Operating in the shadow of Strasbourg 54
The separation of powers implications of the dialogic model 56
## Contents

### Part I: The Strasbourg influence

3. The Strasbourg influence 60
   - Introduction 60
   - The standard of review and requirement of proportionate interference 63
     - The inadequacy of *Wednesbury* review 65
   - Proportionate interference 66
   - The Strasbourg jurisprudence on separated governmental functions 70
     - Executive involvement in ‘judicial’ decisions – sentencing 74
     - Judicial review of ‘administrative’ decisions 76
   - The Strasbourg jurisprudence on separated institutions 78
     - An independent and impartial tribunal 79
       - The circumstantial approach to impartiality 80
       - The strict separation approach to impartiality 82
   - Conclusion 84

### Part II: Judicial engagement with the ‘political’ branches

4. Justiciability 89
   - The extended range of review 89
   - The justiciability of the Convention rights 90
   - Public resources 93
   - National security 96
     - ‘High policy’ and prerogative powers 99
     - Deployment of the armed forces 100
     - Foreign relations and the power to enter into treaties 101
     - The withering of non-justiciability doctrines 103
   - Towards legislative review? 105
   - Conclusion 113

5. Deference and proportionality 115
   - Introduction 115
   - Deference 116
     - Deference or a margin of appreciation? 117
     - Constraining judicial power under a statutory bill of rights 119
     - Deference under the Human Rights Act 121
     - ‘…servility, or perhaps gracious concession’? 123
       - A fig leaf for non-justiciability? 125
     - An autonomous or an integrated concept? 128
   - Proportionality and the intensity of review 129
     - The structure of proportionality review 132
     - The integration of proportionality and deference 135
   - Proportionality, legitimacy and merits review 139
   - Conclusion 141
## PART III  The creative powers of courts  143

### 6 Statutory interpretation and declarations of incompatibility  145

- Introduction  145
- The judge as law-maker  146
- Interpretative latitude under the Human Rights Act  151
- Interpretative law-making on the Human Rights Act model  154
  - A power of invalidation through interpretation?  156
  - Implied terms and additional words  160
- Deference to the legislature and the limitations of judicial interpretation  163
- Democratic dialogue in practice: parliamentary and executive responses to incompatibility  168
- Conclusion  176

### 7 Developing the common law and the meaning of ‘the Convention rights’  181

- Introduction  181
- The incremental nature of common law development  181
- The Human Rights Act and law-making at common law  183
  - The transformative potential of models of horizontality  183
  - The modification of breach of confidence  186
  - Towards directly effective rights to privacy and expression at common law?  189
- The meaning and application of ‘the Convention rights’  191
  - ‘The Convention rights’ in domestic law  192
  - The scope for creative judicial interpretation of ‘the Convention rights’  199
- Conclusion  202

## PART IV  The separation of the judicial branch  205

### 8 The independence of the judiciary  207

- Introduction  207
- The institutional independence of the judiciary  208
  - The distinction between institutional and individual independence  208
- The pressure for increased institutional autonomy  212
  - The office of Lord Chancellor  214
  - The Lords of Appeal in Ordinary  216
- Structural independence secured? The Constitutional Reform Act 2005  219
- Independence of the executive  221
- Independence of the legislature  225
| CONTENTS |
|------------------|------|
| Independence, legitimacy and the separation of functions | 227 |
| The emergence of a separation of powers jurisprudence? | 229 |
| Asserting the division between legislator and judge: procedural fairness at common law | 232 |
| Endorsing the Convention’s circumstantial approach | 232 |
| Towards a ‘strict’ separation of functions at common law? | 236 |
| The reach of separation by fair process | 239 |
| Towards a constitutionally separate judicial branch? | 242 |
| Towards constitutional separation | 245 |
| Descriptive or substantive principles of separation? | 245 |
| Select bibliography | 254 |
| Index | 267 |