Noam Chomsky is one of the leading intellectual figures of modern times. He has had a major influence on linguistics, psychology, and philosophy, and a significant effect on a range of other disciplines from anthropology to mathematics, education to literary criticism.

In this rigorous yet accessible account of Chomsky’s work and influence, Neil Smith analyzes Chomsky’s key contributions to the study of language and the study of mind. He gives a detailed and partly historical exposition of Chomsky’s linguistic theorizing, and examines the ideas (from deep and surface structure to the economy considerations of the Minimalist Program) for which he is best known. Smith discusses the psychological and philosophical implications of Chomsky’s work, and argues that he has fundamentally changed the way we think of ourselves, gaining a position in the history of ideas on a par with that of Darwin or Descartes. Finally, he examines Chomsky’s political ideas and how these fit intellectually with his scholarly work. Throughout, Smith explores the controversy surrounding Chomsky’s work, and explains why he has been both adulated and vilified.

This much needed book will be welcomed by a wide range of readers: students and researchers in linguistics, philosophy, psychology, cognitive science, and politics, and anyone with an interest in the impact of Chomsky’s work.

Neil Smith is Professor and Head of Linguistics at University College London. He is the author of An Outline Grammar of Nupe (1967); The Acquisition of Phonology (1973); Modern Linguistics: the Results of Chomsky’s Revolution (with Deirdre Wilson, 1979); The Twitter Machine: Reflections on Language (1989); The Mind of a Savant (with Ianthi Tsimpili, 1995), and he has edited a volume on Mutual Knowledge (1982).

In addition, Neil Smith has published around one hundred essays, articles and reviews in a wide variety of publications, including Journal of Linguistics, Lingua, Journal of Neurolinguistics, and Glot International.
PUBLISHED BY THE PRESS SYNDICATE OF THE UNIVERSITY OF CAMBRIDGE
The Pitt Building, Trumpington Street, Cambridge, United Kingdom
CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY PRESS
The Edinburgh Building, Cambridge, CB2 2RU, UK
40 West 20th Street, New York, NY 10011-4211, USA
477 Williamstown Road, Port Melbourne, VIC 3207, Australia
Ruiz de Alarcon, 13, 28014 Madrid, Spain
Dock House, The Waterfront, Cape Town 8001, South Africa
http://www.cambridge.org

© Cambridge University Press 1999
This book is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 1999
Reprinted 2000, 2003

Printed in the United Kingdom at the University Press, Cambridge

Typeset in Plantin 10/12pt [vn]

A catalogue record for this book is available from the British Library

Library of Congress Cataloguing in Publication data
Smith, N. V. (Neilson Voyne)
Chomsky: ideas and ideals/Neil Smith
p. cm.
Includes bibliographical references and index.
ISBN 0 521 47517 1 — ISBN 0 521 47570 8 (pbk.)
1. Chomsky, Noam. 2. Linguistics. I. Title
P85.C47564 1999
410’.92—dc21 98-48326 CIP

ISBN 0 521 47517 1 hardback
ISBN 0 521 47570 8 paperback
Dedication to my friends

Dear friends, I say friends here
In the larger sense of the word:
Wife, sister, associates, relatives,
Schoolmates, men and women,
Persons seen only once
Or frequented all my life:
Provided that between us, for at least a moment,
Was drawn a segment,
A well-defined chord.
.. . remember the time
Before the wax hardened.

“To my friends” by Primo Levi (Levi, 1990:5)
Contents

Acknowledgments ix

Introduction 1

Chapter 1 The mirror of the mind
Linguistics as a science 7
Modularity 17
Competence and performance 28
Performance, parsing, and pragmatics 35
Evolution and innateness 38
Natural language and the language of thought 45

Chapter 2 The linguistic foundation
Introduction 49
Knowledge of language 50
The lexicon 50
Knowledge of language: structure 53
Knowledge of language: structural relations 54
Levels of representation 56
 Constituents and rules 57
Deep structure 59
Description versus explanation 62
Government and Binding theory 69
Empty categories 76
The status of transformations 80
Principles and parameters 81
Lexical and functional categories 83
Minimalism 86
A historical progression 90
Evolution 91

Chapter 3 Psychological reality
Causality and observability 95
Psychological reality and the nature of evidence 97
Language processing 106
Language acquisition (Plato’s problem) 116
Language pathology 126
Connectionism: the behaviorists strike back 131
## Contents

**Chapter 4  Philosophical realism: commitments and controversies 136**

- Commitments 136
- Controversies 145
- Language and the world 146
- Language and the community 149
- Language and the individual 155
- Problems of semantics 162
- Innateness 167
- Unification and reduction 174
- Conclusions 176

**Chapter 5  Language and freedom 177**

- Explanation and dissent: the common threads 177
- Rationality, modularity, and creativity 180
- The anarchist background 186
- The critique of (American) foreign policy 190
- The critique of domestic policy 195
- The critique of media control 199
- The technique of dissection 203
- Moral absolutes and options for the future 208
- The positive program 211

Conclusion 213

Envoi 214

**Notes and references 215**

**Bibliography 241**

**Index 263**
Acknowledgments

My greatest debt, both intellectual and personal, is to Noam Chomsky. Without his work, and inspiration, my career would have been radically different, and this book would obviously not have existed. In addition, he has made time over the years to talk and correspond with me, despite the overwhelming pressures of his innumerable other commitments. Most recently, when I sent him the pre-final version of the manuscript, he replied with some sixty pages of comments and suggestions. If I have still misrepresented him in any way, he is not to blame. It has been a privilege to work in his shadow.

A number of colleagues and friends have discussed all or parts of the contents of this book over the five years or so that I have been preoccupied with it: Stefanie Anyadi, Misi Brody, Robyn Carston, Ray Cattell, Teun Hoekstra, Rita Manzini, Milena Nuti, Ianthi Tsimpli, Hans van de Koot, Nigel Vincent, and especially Annabel Cormack and Deirdre Wilson. Needless to say, they are not to be taken to agree with what I have written, nor to be blamed because I have sometimes failed to take their advice. Closer to home my family – Amahl, Ivan, and Saras – have inspired and supported me with sage advice, heartfelt encouragement, and good food.

Part of the work for this book was carried out while I was in receipt of a British Academy research grant, which was matched by a comparable period of sabbatical leave from University College London. I was also granted travel expenses by the Dean of the Faculty of Arts at UCL to visit Chomsky at MIT. I am grateful to the Academy and to the College for their support, and to my colleagues for shouldering my duties while I was away.