THE CAMBRIDGE APPLIED LINGUISTICS SERIES

Series editors: Michael H. Long and Jack C. Richards

This series presents the findings of recent work in applied linguistics which are of direct relevance to language teaching and learning and of particular interest to applied linguists, researchers, language teachers, and teacher trainers.

In this series:

Interactive Approaches to Second Language Reading edited by Patricia L. Carrell, Joanne Devine, and David E. Eskey

Second Language Classrooms – Research on teaching and learning by Craig Chaudron

Language Learning and Deafness edited by Michael Strong

The Learner-Centred Curriculum by David Nunan

Language Transfer – Cross-linguistic influence in language learning by Terence Odlin

Linguistic Perspectives on Second Language Acquisition edited by Susan M. Gass and Jaquelyn Schachter

Learning Strategies in Second Language Acquisition by J. Michael O’Malley and Anna Uhl Chamot

The Development of Second Language Proficiency edited by Birgit Harley, Patrick Allen, Jim Cummins, and Merrill Swain

Second Language Writing – Research insights for the classroom edited by Barbara Kroll

Genre Analysis – English in academic and research settings by John M. Swales

Evaluating Second Language Education edited by J. Charles Alderson and Alan Beretta

Perspectives on Pedagogical Grammar edited by Terence Odlin

Academic Listening edited by John Flowerdew

Power and Inequality in Language Education edited by James W. Tollefson

Language Program Evaluation – Theory and practice by Brian K. Lynch

Sociolinguistics and Language Teaching edited by Sandra Lee McKay and Nancy H. Hornberger

 Contrastive Rhetoric – Cross-cultural aspects of second language writing by Ulla Connor

Teacher Cognition in Language Teaching by Devon Woods

Second Language Vocabulary Acquisition edited by James Coady and Thomas Huckin

Text, Role, and Context – Developing Academic Literacies by Ann M. Johns

Immersion Education: International Perspectives edited by Robert Keith Johnson and Merrill Swain

Focus on Form in Classroom Second Language Acquisition edited by Catherine Doughty and Jessica Williams

Interfaces Between Second Language Acquisition and Language Testing Research edited by Lyle F. Bachman and Andrew D. Cohen
Contrastive Rhetoric

Cross-cultural aspects of second-language writing

Ulla Connor
Indiana University at Indianapolis
This book is dedicated to my mother, Esteri Niemelä, and to the memory of my father, Antti Niemelä.
Contents

Series editors’ preface ix
Preface xi

I PRELIMINARIES; EARLY PHASES OF THE FIELD 1

1 Toward an extended definition of contrastive rhetoric 3
Writing in a second language: anecdotal evidence about problems and solutions 3
Study of second language writing: the emergence of contrastive rhetoric 5
Aims, purposes, and outline of this book 6
Building a comprehensive theory of contrastive rhetoric 8

2 Contrastive rhetoric studies in applied linguistics 12
Contrastive analysis, error analysis, and analysis of interlanguage 12
Development of contrastive rhetoric: parallel with contrastive analysis 14
International Englishes 16
New directions in contrastive rhetorical research in applied linguistics contexts 18
Summary 26

3 Historical evolution of contrastive rhetoric: from Kaplan’s 1966 study to diversification in languages, genres, and authors 28
Origins of contrastive rhetoric 28
Arabic 34
Chinese 37
Japanese 41
Korean, German, Finnish, Spanish, and Czech 45
Summary 54
viii Contents

II INTERFACES WITH OTHER DISCIPLINES 57

4 Contrastive rhetoric and the field of rhetoric and composition 59
   The role of rhetoric and composition in college education in the United States 59
   Classical rhetoric 62
   The expressionist approach 71
   Contrastive rhetoric and the expressionist approach 72
   Writing as a cognitive approach 74
   The social constructivist approach 76
   Summary 79

5 Contrastive rhetoric and text linguistics 80
   Brief overview of the history of text linguistics; definitions 80
   Major schools of thought in text linguistics 81
   Concepts and methods of text linguistics and their application to the study of writing 83
   NORDTEXT and NORDWRITE text linguistic projects of student writing 89
   Survey of contrastive rhetorical studies with a text linguistic emphasis 90
   Summary 97

6 Writing as an activity embedded in a culture 100
   Definition of “culture” 101
   Psychological investigations of culture and literacy 101
   Anthropological study of culture and literacy 105
   Educational study of culture and literacy 107
   Studies of culture and literacy conducted by applied linguists 113
   Summary 115

7 Contrastive rhetoric and translation studies 117
   Development of theories of translation studies 117
   Transfer in contrastive rhetoric and translation theory 120
   Issues in common: theories of “acceptability” and “adequacy” in translation 121
   Summary 123

8 Genre-specific studies in contrastive rhetoric 126
   The concept of genre 126
   School writing 129
Contents ix

Academic writing 132
Professional writing 135
Learning academic writing in sociocognitive perspective as a
dynamic activity 145
Summary 149

III IMPLICATIONS OF CONTRASTIVE RHETORIC 151

9 Methods of research in contrastive rhetoric 153
Guidance from studies of composition pedagogy 153
Methods of contrastive rhetorical research 155
Summary and implications 162

10 Conclusion: Implications and research directions 166
Implications from contrastive text studies 167
Implications from contrastive process-based writing 167
Implications from contrastive genre-specific research in EFL
settings 169
Testing ESL/EFL writing in a cross-cultural setting 170
Research directions 172

References 175
Author index 195
Subject index 199
Series editors’ preface

The influence of the learner’s first language on the acquisition and use of a second has long been a focus of interest within applied linguistics. Much of this work has been confined to the sentence or utterance level and has explored both the linguistic and psycholinguistic aspects of the processes involved. The field of contrastive rhetoric, by comparison, extends and broadens this area of inquiry to the levels of discourse and text. Its areas of focus are the role of first language conventions of discourse and rhetorical structure on second language usage, as well as cognitive and cultural dimensions of transfer, particularly in relation to writing. The expanding discipline of contrastive rhetoric studies is hence of considerable interest to the field of second language learning and teaching, particularly to those involved in teaching composition and English for Specific Purposes.

It is this approach to the study of second language literacy which is presented in Ulla Connor’s comprehensive introduction to the field of contrastive rhetoric, as she defines the outer boundaries of the field. Drawing on a wide and interdisciplinary body of theory and research, Connor traces the history of contrastive approaches to the study of second language writing and explores the interfaces between contrastive rhetoric and other disciplines, including composition studies, translation, text linguistics, genre analysis, and cultural anthropology. She demonstrates, with examples from a wide variety of languages, how second language writers draw on a range of cross-linguistic and cross-cultural influences at both the sentence, paragraph, and textual level. Connor examines the effects of these influences on different aspects of textual organization, including cohesion, coherence, and schematic structure, and shows how both linguistically and culturally bound assumptions about the nature and purposes of written texts can transfer from one language to another. She reviews and assesses research methods and assumptions underlying research in contrastive rhetoric, examining both quantitative and qualitative approaches to research in contrastive rhetoric, and also demonstrates the practical applications of contrastive rhetoric research in applied linguistics and second language composition teaching.
xii Series editors’ preface

This book therefore makes a valuable contribution to our understanding of second language learning and teaching. It will be an invaluable source of information and theory for scholars, composition specialists, and students of applied linguistics and will form a welcome addition to the Cambridge Applied Linguistics Series.

Michael H. Long
Jack C. Richards
Preface

During this book’s gestation, I was influenced by several competing viewpoints of writing research. Along with many others in the profession, Robert B. Kaplan’s 1966 seminal “doodles” article had a great impact on my teaching and L2 writing research. For five consecutive years, Bob Kaplan and I organized a session on contrastive rhetoric at the International TESOL Conference. During this period the late John Hinds transformed contrastive rhetorical research because of his rigorous text analysis combined with an acute understanding of the L1 languages and cultures. John Hinds was a forceful presence at our contrastive rhetoric colloquia at TESOL. The proceedings eventually resulted in a collection of essays that redirected contrastive rhetoric towards a more text analytic approach (Connor and Kaplan, 1987).

Since the mid-1980s, four notable experiences – outside the mainstream ESL/EFL teaching – have shaped my views about the teaching and research of writing. First, collaborating with the rhetorician Janice Lauer in research on persuasive writing cross-culturally proved a valuable link in connecting classical theories of rhetoric and composition for L1 writers in the United States with the study of second-language writing. Second, my association with the International Education Achievement Project, directed by Alan C. Purves, on the writing achievement of school students in 14 countries was an eye-opener about the need for carefully designed writing tasks, scoring scales, and systems of analyses in cross-cultural analyses of writing. Third, my involvement in the NORDTEXT writing group in the Nordic countries – initiated by Nils Erik Enkvist and later led by Lars Evensen – instructed me about the special needs of teachers and researchers of writing in EFL situations. Finally, as a member of the Antwerp-Indianapolis-Turku project (with Ken Davis, Teun De Rycker, Piet Verckens, and Meg Phillips), in which international business writing is taught to students in the three countries simultaneously, I have become more keenly tuned to the subtle interactions among language, culture, and writing for specific purposes in the international writing arena.

In the process of writing this book through discussions and correspondence, I am particularly indebted to the following individuals: Bob
xiv  

Preface

Kaplan for his continued encouraging discussions clarifying my views about the role of contrastive rhetoric in applied linguistics; Nils Erik Enkvist for invaluable guidance in the interconnections among related fields having an impact on contrastive rhetoric such as translations studies; Sauli Takala for many insightful discussions and sharing his own writings about the reinterpretations of the Sapir-Whorf hypothesis and other crucial matters of this book; Ann Johns and John Swales for introducing me to genre analysis; Patricia Carrell, Joan Carson, Andrew Chesterman, Nils Erik Enkvist, Lars Evensen, Bill Grabe, Paula Kalaja, Janice Lauer, Ilona Leki, Alan Purves, and Ann Raimes for their helpful critiques of early drafts of certain chapters; Diane Belcher, Guanjun Cai, Sonja Tirkkonen Condit, Shoshana Folman, Tom Huckin, Anncha Lindeberg, Anna Mauranen, Paul Prior, Eija Ventola, and Hilkka Yli-Jokipii for generously sharing their work on writing across cultures.

I am grateful to my students throughout the years at Georgetown University, at Indiana University in Indianapolis, and at several Summer TESOL Institutes for their comments and observations concerning early pieces of this book, and in many cases for collaboration on related writing projects. Among the most memorable contributors are Dwight Atkinson, Linda Jacobsen, Susan Mayberry, Peter McCagg, Ildikó Melis, Miyuki Sasaki, and Robert Springer.

I wish to thank the Department of English and the School of Liberal Arts at Indiana University in Indianapolis for granting me a reduced teaching load one semester as well as providing clerical assistance. Paula Pace, Stuart Schleus, Bill Stuckey, and Susan Springer provided assistance in word processing and editing. Maggie Robillard worked faithfully and patiently during the last few months of manuscript revision even while she was finishing her own undergraduate studies. Ken Davis and Helen Schwartz, faculty colleagues, provided moral support and encouragement. I also owe thanks to the ESL faculty, Karen Asenavage, Mary Boyd, and Barbara Zimmer, for their continued support as well as to the ESL students for sharing their writing with me.

During final stages of preparation of the book, I have experienced the generous hospitality of two universities in Finland: Åbo Akademi University, where Roger Sell hosted my Donner Visiting Research professorship in the Fall of 1994 and where I collaborated with Håkan Ringbom on cross-cultural research; and the University of Jyväskylä where Kari Säävaara provided me research facilities on two occasions during the completion of this book.

I would like to acknowledge the extremely helpful and stimulating reviews by the two anonymous readers recruited by Cambridge University Press. I wish to recognize the series co-editor Jack Richards for helping to focus the book at the initial stages as well as his continual counsel. Mary Vaughn, the Executive Editor, deserves thanks for her patience in
communications related to the book, and Mary Carson for careful editing.

However large the constellation of supporters and friends connected with this book, there is one person who outshines them all. Ray Keller, professor emeritus, took tremendous trouble to read the many drafts of each chapter carefully, quickly, and with minute attention to the smallest detail. His comments not only improved the manuscript, but, more important, gave me an enthusiastic reader, making the writing process almost a joy. Ray is a linguist's linguist. I feel fortunate to have such a devoted former mentor – a role model of a linguist, scholar, teacher, and friend.

Finally, I thank John and Timo Connor, my husband and son, for their continued support and encouragement, for cheering me up by producing pleasant distractions of various kinds including gourmet meals and family trips. John, a competent writer of English himself and erstwhile collaborator, has been a tireless commentator on my research and writing throughout the years. Without his belief in me and my career, this book would have never been written.

Ulla Connor