CAMBRIDGE

Cambridge University Press
978-0-521-43985-5 - Indivisible Territory and the Politics of Legitimacy: Jerusalem and Northern Ireland
Stacie E. Goddard
Frontmatter
More information

Indivisible Territory and the Politics of Legitimacy

In Jerusalem and Northern Ireland, territorial disputes have often seemed indivisible, unable to be solved through negotiation and prone to violence and war. This book challenges the conventional wisdom that these conflicts were the inevitable result of clashing identities, religions, and attachments to the land. On the contrary, it was radical political rhetoric, not ancient hatreds, that rendered these territories indivisible.

Stacie Goddard traces the roots of territorial indivisibility to politicians' strategies for legitimating their claims to territory. When bargaining over territory, politicians utilize rhetoric to appeal to their domestic audiences and undercut the claims of their opponents. However, this strategy has unintended consequences; by resonating with some coalitions and appearing unacceptable to others, politicians' rhetoric can lock them into positions in which they are unable to recognize the legitimacy of their opponent's demands. As a result, politicians come to negotiations with incompatible claims, constructing territory as indivisible.

Stacie E. Goddard is Assistant Professor of Political Science at Wellesley College and a faculty associate in the International Security Program at the Belfer Center for Science and International Affairs at Harvard University. Previously, she was a Fellow at the Belfer Center, a National Security Fellow at the John M. Olin Institute for Strategic Studies at Harvard University, and a Fellow at the Center for International Studies at Princeton University and the Center for International Studies at the University of Southern California. Her articles have appeared in *International Organization, International Security, International Theory*, and the *European Journal of International Relations*.

© in this web service Cambridge University Press www.cambridge.org

CAMBRIDGE

Cambridge University Press
978-0-521-43985-5 - Indivisible Territory and the Politics of Legitimacy: Jerusalem and Northern Ireland
Stacie E. Goddard
Frontmatter
More information

To Paul

© in this web service Cambridge University Press www.cambridge.org

CAMBRIDGE

Cambridge University Press
978-0-521-43985-5 - Indivisible Territory and the Politics of Legitimacy: Jerusalem and Northern Ireland
Stacie E. Goddard
Frontmatter
More information

Indivisible Territory and the Politics of Legitimacy

Jerusalem and Northern Ireland

STACIE E. GODDARD
Wellesley College

CAMBRIDGE
UNIVERSITY PRESS

© in this web service Cambridge University Press www.cambridge.org

CAMBRIDGE

Cambridge University Press
978-0-521-43985-5 - Indivisible Territory and the Politics of Legitimacy: Jerusalem and Northern Ireland
Stacie E. Goddard
Frontmatter
More information

CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY PRESS
Cambridge, New York, Melbourne, Madrid, Cape Town, Singapore,
São Paulo, Delhi, Dubai, Tokyo

Cambridge University Press
32 Avenue of the Americas, New York, NY 10013-2473, USA

www.cambridge.org
Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9780521439855

© Stacie E. Goddard 2010

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception
and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements,
no reproduction of any part may take place without the written
permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2010

Printed in the United States of America

A catalog record for this publication is available from the British Library.

Library of Congress Cataloging in Publication data

Goddard, Stacie E., 1974–
Indivisible territory and the politics of legitimacy : Jerusalem and
Northern Ireland / Stacie E. Goddard.
p. cm.
Includes bibliographical references and index.
ISBN 978-0-521-43985-5 (hardback)
1. Ireland – History – Partition, 1921. 2. Nationalism – Northern Ireland.
3. Political violence – Northern Ireland. 4. Rhetoric – Political aspects –
Northern Ireland. 5. Jerusalem – History – Partition, 1948. 6. Nationalism –
Jerusalem. 7. Political violence – Jerusalem. 8. Rhetoric – Political aspects –
Jerusalem. 9. Partition, Territorial – Case studies. I. Title.
D990.U46G63 2010
941.5082′1 – dc22 2009019253

ISBN 978-0-521-43985-5 Hardback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or
accuracy of URLs for external or third-party Internet Web sites referred to in
this publication and does not guarantee that any content on such Web sites is,
or will remain, accurate or appropriate.

© in this web service Cambridge University Press www.cambridge.org

CAMBRIDGE

Cambridge University Press
978-0-521-43985-5 - Indivisible Territory and the Politics of Legitimacy: Jerusalem and Northern Ireland
Stacie E. Goddard
Frontmatter
More information

Contents

Acknowledgments *page* vii

1 Introduction 1

2 Constructing Indivisibility: A Legitimation Theory of Indivisible Territory 18

PART ONE. CONSTRUCTING AN INDIVISIBLE IRELAND 47

Introduction 47

3 Home Rule: A Divisible Ireland 58

4 "Ulster Will Fight": The Orange Card and an Indivisible Ireland 81

PART TWO. JERUSALEM: THE ETERNAL INDIVISIBLE CITY 115

Introduction 115

5 Dividing the Holy City 124

6 Jerusalem, Indivisible 159

7 How Northern Ireland Became Divisible (and Why Jerusalem Has Not) 208

8 Conclusion 240

Bibliography 257

Index 277

© in this web service Cambridge University Press www.cambridge.org

CAMBRIDGE

Cambridge University Press
978-0-521-43985-5 - Indivisible Territory and the Politics of Legitimacy: Jerusalem and Northern Ireland
Stacie E. Goddard
Frontmatter
More information

Acknowledgments

This book is about networks. Networks are at the core of political action. An actor's networks provide the resources necessary to make certain claims, to mobilize support, and ultimately to prevent or provoke conflict. Likewise, the arguments I have developed here result from generous input from individuals in my personal and professional networks. At Columbia University, I met models of academic scholarship. Jack Snyder and Bob Jervis were, and continue to be, exemplary advisors. Their intellectual curiosity and their dedication to asking interesting, significant questions inspired me in my research. I am extremely grateful to them both. Consuelo Cruz spent numerous hours discussing the earliest manifestations of my ideas and was crucial in getting this project off the ground. I was fortunate enough to have Chuck Tilly's guidance early on in this project. He was an intellectual giant in sociology, history, and political science, and yet his office door was always open. Tilly advised massive numbers of graduate students during his time in Columbia, and all of our work bears his mark.

Numerous individuals read portions of this book, either as a dissertation, in draft articles, or portions of this manuscript. For their insight, I am grateful to Fiona Adamson, Mlada Bukovansky, Lars-Erik Cederman, Tim Crawford, Christina Davis, Amitabh Dubey, David Edelstein, Lynn Eden, Tanisha Fazal, James Fearon, Aaron Friedberg, Ron Hassner, Jeff Herbst, Victoria Hui, Bob Jervis, Peter Katzenstein, Bob Keohane, Kate McNamara, John Mearsheimer, John Padgett, Joe Parent, Dan Reiter, Stephen Rosen, Peter Rosendorff, Jack Snyder, Chuck Tilly, and Monica Toft. Throughout this project, Patrick Jackson and Sherrill Stroschein

© in this web service Cambridge University Press www.cambridge.org

CAMBRIDGE

Cambridge University Press
978-0-521-43985-5 - Indivisible Territory and the Politics of Legitimacy: Jerusalem and Northern Ireland
Stacie E. Goddard
Frontmatter
More information

have been theoretical sounding boards. My thoughts on network theory and rhetoric were shaped in countless conversations with Dan Nexon. I owe a particular debt of gratitude to those who read the manuscript in its entirety: Stuart Kaufman, Ron Krebs, Paul MacDonald, Malina Swiatek, and the anonymous reviewers at Cambridge University Press. Their comments pushed me through the final stages of this book project. Any errors, of course, remain my own.

Since leaving Columbia, I have enjoyed the collegiality of the Department of Political Science at Wellesley College. I am grateful to all of my colleagues for their generous support – they are models of scholar-teachers in the field. I owe particular thanks to Kathy Moon, who read the proposal, and Hahrie Han, for her generous advice. Two of my students, Natasha Villacorta and Malina Swiatek, provided excellent research assistance, and the department's Barnette Miller Committee gave me research support at critical moments during the project. Numerous fellowships have also helped me pursue this research. I received support from the John M. Olin Institute for Strategic Studies, the Belfer Center for Science and International Affairs, Princeton's Center for International Studies, and the Center for International Studies at the University of Southern California. Grants from Columbia's Salzmann Institute of War and Peace Studies and Wellesley College also funded research.

The final stages of this project have been greatly facilitated by the staff at Cambridge University Press. I am particularly grateful to Eric Crahan and Emily Spangler for their input and advice. Chapters 1, 2, 4, and 5 of this book contain portions of my article "Uncommon Ground: Indivisible Territory and the Politics of Legitimacy," published in *International Organization* 60 (1): 35–68; I thank the publisher for granting permission to use the material here.

There is not enough space to thank those to whom I owe a personal debt. My graduate school peers, Amitabh Dubey, Ron Krebs, and Dan Nexon, kept me somewhat sane during graduate school, and they continue to be exemplary colleagues and dear friends. Alex Montgomery and Mike Glosny lent an ear at the most difficult moments of the project. I owe particular thanks to my colleagues in the 1020 Club and to Fiona Adamson, Bill Cameron, Lars-Erik Cederman, Greg Mitrovich, and Marie Runyon. Warner Schilling has been my constant mentor and friend and a model for my own work. My parents, David Goddard and Joyce DiMauro, my sister Jennifer, and my nephew Holden continue to inspire and ground me at the most necessary of times.

© in this web service Cambridge University Press www.cambridge.org

CAMBRIDGE

Cambridge University Press
978-0-521-43985-5 - Indivisible Territory and the Politics of Legitimacy: Jerusalem and Northern Ireland
Stacie E. Goddard
Frontmatter
More information

This book is dedicated to my husband, Paul MacDonald. When I say that I could not have done this project without him, this is not an exaggeration. He has read every single draft, from dissertation to book. He has supported me through moments of frustration and has kept me in good humor throughout (well, mostly throughout). Thank you.

© in this web service Cambridge University Press www.cambridge.org