Bound to Sin

This book tests the explanatory and descriptive power of the doctrine of sin in relation to two concrete situations: sexual abuse of children and the holocaust. Taking seriously the explanatory power of secular discourses for analysing and regulating therapeutic action in relation to such situations, the book asks whether the theological language of sin can offer further illumination by speaking of God and the world together. Through its discussion of abuse and the holocaust, an engagement with Augustine, original sin and feminism, a fresh and sometimes surprising perspective is offered, both on the theology of sin and on the pathologies under consideration. The understanding of sin that emerges is centred on joyful worship of the trinitarian God. This essay is more systematic and more theological than most practical, pastoral or applied theology and more practical and concrete than most systematic or constructive theology. It is a genuinely concrete, systematic theology.

ALISTAIR MCFADYEN is Senior Lecturer in Theology at the University of Leeds. Author of *The Call to Personhood* (Cambridge, 1990) and a number of journal articles, he is a former Samaritan counsellor and member of the Leeds Ritual Abuse Study Group. He is currently a member of the Church of England's Doctrine Commission, and Secretary to the Society for the Study of Theology.

Cambridge University Press
0521432863 - Bound to Sin: Abuse, Holocaust and the Christian Doctrine of Sin -
Alistair McFadyen
Frontmatter
More information

Cambridge Studies in Christian Doctrine

Edited by Professor Colin Gunton, King's College London Professor Daniel W. Hardy, University of Cambridge

Cambridge Studies in Christian Doctrine is an important series which aims to engage critically with the traditional doctrines of Christianity, and at the same time to locate and make sense of them within a secular context. Without losing sight of the authority of scripture and the traditions of the Church, the books in this series will subject pertinent dogmas and credal statements to careful scrutiny, analysing them in light of the insights of both church and society, and will thereby practise theology in the fullest sense of the word.

Titles published in the series

- 1. Self and Salvation: Being Transformed DAVID F. FORD
- 2. Realist Christian Theology in a Postmodern Age SUE PATTERSON
- 3. Trinity and Truth Bruce D. Marshall
- 4. Theology, Music and Time JEREMY S. BEGBIE
- 5. The Bible, Theology, and Faith: A Study of Abraham and Jesus R. W. L. MOBERLY
- 6. Bound to Sin: Abuse, Holocaust and the Christian Doctrine of Sin ALISTAIR MCFADYEN

Forthcoming titles in the series

Church, World and the Christian Life: Practical–Prophetic Ecclesiology NICHOLAS M. HEALY Church, Narrativity and Transcendence

ROBERT JENSON

A Political Theology of Nature PETER SCOTT

Remythologizing Theology: Divine Action and Authorship KEVIN J. VANHOOZER

Bound to Sin

Abuse, Holocaust and the Christian Doctrine of Sin

.....

ALISTAIR MCFADYEN University of Leeds



CAMBRIDGE

Cambridge University Press 0521432863 - Bound to Sin: Abuse, Holocaust and the Christian Doctrine of Sin -Alistair McFadyen Frontmatter <u>More information</u>

PUBLISHED BY THE PRESS SYNDICATE OF THE UNIVERSITY OF CAMBRIDGE The Pitt Building, Trumpington Street, Cambridge, United Kingdom

CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY PRESS The Edinburgh Building, Cambridge CB2 2RU, UK www.cup.cam.ac.uk 40 West 20th Street, New York, NY 10011–4211, USA www.cup.org 10 Stamford Road, Oakleigh, Melbourne 3166, Australia Ruiz de Alarcón 13, 28014 Madrid, Spain

© Cambridge University Press 2000

This book is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2000

Printed in the United Kingdom at the University Press, Cambridge

Typeface TEFFLexicon 9/13 pt System QuarkXPress[®] [SE]

A catalogue record for this book is available from the British Library

Library of Congress Cataloguing in Publication data McFadyen, Alistair I. Bound to sin: abuse, Holocaust, and the Christian doctrine of sin / Alistair McFadyen. p. cm. – (Cambridge studies in Christian doctrine; 6) Includes bibliographical references and index. ISBN 0-521-43286-3 – ISBN 0-521-43868-3 (pbk.) 1. Sin. 2. Child sexual abuse – Religious aspects – Church of England. 3. Holocaust (Christian theology) I. Title. II. Series. BT715.M376 2000 241'.3-dc21 99-058733 ISBN 052143286-3 hardback

ISBN 0521432683 paperback

In joy:

To Catherine, with whom I have found so much;

And to George and Tom, Helen and Catriona, who deserve and give us so much;

And to Mike, a different Helen, Kim and Steve, who offered so much;

And to Peter, David and Dan, who helped me weave together so much;

And to Haddon, who has taught me so much about sin (who first suggested I write this book, and who might enjoy the ambiguities of having a book on sin dedicated to him).

Contents

Acknowledgments xi

Part I Drawing into Conversation

- 1 The loss of God: pragmatic atheism and the language of sin 3
- 2 Speaking morally? The case of original sin 14
- 3 Testing, testing: theology in concrete conversation 43

Part II Concrete Pathologies

- 4 Bound by silence: sexual abuse of children 57
- 5 What was the problem? 'The Final Solution' and the binding of reason 80

Part III Testing the Inheritence

- 6 Willing 107
- 7 Power and participation: feminist theologies of sin 131
- 8 Augustine's will 167
- 9 A question of standards: trinity, joy, worship and idolatry 200
- 10 Concrete idolatries 227

Index of names 250 Index of subjects 253

[ix]

Acknowledgments

This book has been almost seven years in preparation, the course of which has run far from smooth and has brought me into closer proximity to some of its general themes than I could ever have anticipated or would ever have wished. I have therefore accumulated, in this time, a deep vein of gratitude to many for much that goes far beyond the normal range of professional or personal courtesies. It is a measure of the spirit in which so much was given me, that I have accumulated gratitude, not debts. Appropriate to the way in which the argument of this book develops, the theme of these acknowledgments is very much, therefore, joyous acknowledgment of gracious generosity in overwhelming abundance.

I am grateful to the Department of Theology and Religious Studies at the University of Leeds for granting me two short periods of leave to allow me to complete a good deal of the research and writing of this book. But more than that, I am grateful to members of the Department for their unfailing support and understanding of an at times less than fully functional colleague. The friendship and community of the Department has sustained me, stimulating, disciplining and otherwise shaping my thinking, probably more than colleagues realise and often in surprising – if not downright off-the-wall - ways. It has never ceased to amaze me how widespread and constant are the sources of illumination from others' thinking in a Department that spans the spectrum of religious traditions and approaches to religious phenomena. I should like especially to record my thanks to Kim Knott, and also to Linda Hogan, Jim Ginther, Adrian Hastings, Alistair Mason, Phil Mellor, Hugh Pyper, Jacqui Stewart and Kevin Ward for all that they have given me in working towards completion of this text, either directly or indirectly. I am especially fortunate in having Haddon Willmer as a (now allegedly retired) colleague, whose wisdom in

[xi]

xii Acknowledgments

relation to the topic of this book (hard-won through many years of thinking about forgiveness in its personal and political dimensions) I have eagerly and constantly tapped. I am not least grateful for the time and care he took in reading and commenting on early drafts of virtually the whole of the book as they were being written.

The two sabbaticals granted by the Department, I spent at the Center of Theological Inquiry in Princeton. I should like to record my thanks to them for their generous, practical support for two immensely productive and fruitful periods. But mostly, I wish to thank them for the vibrant academic community which their hospitality institutionalised. I was especially fortunate in that the then director, Dan Hardy, was editor of this series and that David Ford, already a good friend writing the companion book on salvation, was resident throughout my first stay. That afforded the opportunity of many two- and three-way conversations through which the early thinking and writing developed - indeed, flourished. Dan has read and commented on the whole text; David, virtually the whole of it. The result is a book, not only greatly enriched by their contributions, but bearing very close affinities with the line developed in David's book on salvation.¹ In it, he constructs an understanding of salvation related to joy in God which, in many respects, has prefigured and shaped my account of sin.

Colin Gunton, co-editor of this Series, also read an initial draft. Whilst nobody else has been subjected to the whole, the final text has benefited from comments made on various parts by Adrian Hastings, Peter Scott, Tony Thiselton, Chris Hobbs, Helga Hanks and Jane Wynne; from comments made on presentations given in various seminars at the Center of Theological Inquiry, in the Department, at the Society for the Study of Theology, at Nottingham Theological Society, and for Worcester Diocese; and in discussions at meetings of the Archbishop's Urban Theology Group and the Church of England's Doctrine Commission. In relation to these latter, discursive contexts, and in addition to those I have already thanked above, I am particularly grateful for the comments and support of Peter Selby, Michael Northcott, Peter Sedgwick, Jeremy Begbie, Steven Sykes and Alan Torrance.

An especially sensitive word of gratitude is reserved for those who, over the last sixteen years, in various contexts and for quite other purposes, have shared with me their stories of childhood sexual abuse. I

^{1.} Self and Salvation: Being Transformed (Cambridge University Press, 1999).

Acknowledgments xiii

hope, more than anything, that they might feel that this work has not done them a disservice and that they may recognise the profound ways in which their stories have affected me theologically, as well as personally.

Given the length of time I have taken to deliver this text, a special word in thanks for the patience of publishers is due, and duly given to Alex Wright (now with SCM), who commissioned the book, and Kevin Taylor, who has seen it through at the end.

Finally, I want to convey a very inadequate word of thanks to the many friends who have offered support in practical and other ways through the period of writing this book: in particular, Steve Jarratt, Mike and Helen Sutcliffe; Phil Spence and Dave Miles; and to members of my family: Patsy, Angus, Jane, Jim and Jenny McFadyen and Catherine Falconer.