

Expertise in Transition

This book challenges standard notions of expertise. In today's world, truly effective expertise is built on fluid collaboration between practitioners from multiple backgrounds. Such collaborative expertise must also be transformative, must be able to tackle emerging new problems and changes in its organizational framework. Engeström argues that the transition toward collaborative and transformative expertise is based on three pillars: expertise needs to be understood and cultivated as a collective activity; expertise needs to be built on flexible knot-working among diverse practitioners; and expertise needs to be fostered as the expansive learning of models and patterns of activity that are in progress. In this book, Engeström recasts expertise as fluid collaboration on complex tasks that requires envisioning the future and mastering change.

Yrjö Engeström is Professor Emeritus of Communication at the University of California, San Diego, and Professor Emeritus of Adult Education at the University of Helsinki, Finland, where he is also director of the Center for Research on Activity, Development and Learning (CRADLE). Engeström is also a visiting professor at Rhodes University in South Africa and at University West in Sweden. In his work, Engeström applies and develops cultural-historical activity theory as a framework for the study of transformations in educational settings, work activities, and communities. He has done interventionist research in health care settings for over thirty years. He is known for his theory of expansive learning and for the methodology of formative interventions, including the Change Laboratory method. Engeström's most recent books are From Teams to Knots: Activity-Theoretical Studies of Collaboration and Learning at Work (2008), Learning by Expanding: An Activity-Theoretical Approach to Developmental Research, 2nd Edition (2015), and Studies in Expansive Learning: Learning What Is Not Yet There (2016), all published by Cambridge University Press.





Expertise in Transition

Expansive Learning in Medical Work

YRJÖ ENGESTRÖM

University of Helsinki and University of California, San Diego





CAMBRIDGEUNIVERSITY PRESS

University Printing House, Cambridge CB2 8BS, United Kingdom
One Liberty Plaza, 20th Floor, New York, NY 10006, USA
477 Williamstown Road, Port Melbourne, VIC 3207, Australia
314–321, 3rd Floor, Plot 3, Splendor Forum, Jasola District Centre,
New Delhi – 110025, India

79 Anson Road, #06-04/06, Singapore 079906

Cambridge University Press is part of the University of Cambridge.

It furthers the University's mission by disseminating knowledge in the pursuit of education, learning, and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

www.cambridge.org Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9780521407854 DOI: 10.1017/9781139023009

© Yrjö Engeström 2018

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2018

Printed in the United States of America by Sheridan Books, Inc.

A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library.

ISBN 978-0-521-40448-8 Hardback ISBN 978-0-521-40785-4 Paperback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this publication and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.



Contents

Preface		page vii
	PART I THE THEORETICAL LANDSCAPE	
I	Toward a New Framework for Understanding Expertise	3
	PART II EXPERTISE AS OBJECT-ORIENTED ACTIVITY	
2	Constructing the Object in the Work Activity of Primary Care Physicians	35
3	Objects and Contradictions as Drivers of Expert Work	57
4	Spatial and Temporal Expansion of the Object	71
	PART III EXPERTISE AS KNOTWORKING	
5	The Emergence of Knotworking in Medicine	85
6	Knotworking as Expansive Decision-Making	III
7	Knotworking as History-Making	137
	PART IV EXPERTISE AS EXPANSIVE LEARNING	
8	Expansive Visibilization of Medical Work	167
9	Expansive Learning in a Hospital	200
то	The Horizontal Dimension of Expansive Learning	2.16



vi Contents

PART V TOWARD COLLABORATIVE AND TRANSFORMATIVE EXPERTISE

11 From Stabilization Knowledge to Possibility Knowledge in	
Expert Work	241
12 Expertise in Transition	248
References	257
Index	



Preface

This book condenses the lessons and insights I have gained over a period of 30 years of research and formative interventions in medical work and expertise. My argument is that our predominant notions of expertise are foundationally insufficient in the face of the present challenges of an interconnected and unpredictable world. This book builds a perspective of transition toward collaborative and transformative expertise. Such a possibility is made real when practitioners and their clients take actions informed by this perspective.

Medical expertise has a long history of steadfast individualism on the one hand and intense collaboration on the other hand. The intense collaboration is vividly manifest in surgical operations, such as the one depicted on the cover of this book. Yet this intense collaboration seldom extends beyond the walls of the operating theater into today's fragmented multiorganizational fields of medical care. In these broader arenas, individualism and compartmentalization prevail.

Medical expertise is also deeply dilemmatic in its relation to change. Medicine embraces rapid development of new treatments, medications, and technologies on the one hand. On the other hand, it stubbornly resists major shifts in the organization of work and reallocation of resources. The stubborn resistance is vividly manifest in the poor performance of medicine in handling chronic illnesses and health problems of populations living in poverty.

These two dilemmas are so persistent that our very concept of medical expertise needs to be rebuilt. Cosmetic improvements will not do the job.

The analyses, findings, and ideas presented in this book have emerged in multiple successive research projects, in collaboration with a good number



viii Preface

of colleagues. I am grateful to Paul Adler, Eeva Ahonen, Tuula Arvonen, Frank Blackler, Aaron Cicourel, Michael Cole, Ritva Engeström, Jouni Helenius, Rick Iedema, Anu Kajamaa, Hannele Kerosuo, Kirsi Koistinen, Päivikki Lahtinen, Päivi Laurila, Kirsti Launis, Kimmo Leppo, Philippe Lorino, David Middleton, Anna-Liisa Niemelä, Jaana Nummijoki, Kaija Saarelma, Osmo Saarelma, Tarja Saaren-Seppälä, Annalisa Sannino, Riitta Simoila, Toomas Timpka, and Hanna Toiviainen. The contributions of these colleagues range from critical commentaries to collaborative data collection and joint analyses.

This book reports on the experiences of a number of patients. Collaborative and transformative medical expertise is continuous negotiation and hybridization of the insights of medical professionals and their patients. Without patients' insights, accounts, and actions, medical expertise would at best be merely top-down engineering. I am grateful to the patients who gave their time and efforts to the research and intervention projects that form the basis of this book.

This book is dedicated to Annalisa and Jurij Enzo. Our collaboration and love keep us in transition.