DAY OF SHINING RED
For a list of the titles in the series, see page 235
Day of Shining Red

An essay on understanding ritual

GILBERT LEWIS

Lecturer in Social Anthropology
University of Cambridge

CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY PRESS

Cambridge
New York New Rochelle
Melbourne Sydney
CONTENTS

Analytical table of contents

Preface
1 A question of interpretation
2 Problems of ritual in general
3 Views from one village
4 The rites of puberty seen
5 Rules of procedure and reflection on them
6 Silent forms but natural symbols?
7 Moon, river and other themes compared
8 For success in life
9 A choice of magic
10 Change and a rite falling into disuse
11 Inventory of themes

References
Index

page vii
xv
1
6
39
73
89
106
121
134
186
200
216
225
229
To Ariane
Chapter 1. A question of interpretation

Interpretation and selection, 1; the Gnaú do not liken penis-bleeding to menstruating as do some other peoples in the Sepik area, 2; the temptation to interpret it similarly, 2; taboos on eating fishes, 2, on chewing betel with lime, 3; the appeal of order, 4; a warning drawn from Gombrich on intuition, convention and the understanding of art, 5.

Chapter 2. Problems of ritual in general

Outline of the argument, 6–8.

The difficulty of defining ritual, 9; analogy with defining art, 9; ritual refers to conduct, 10; both custom and ritual are guided by convention, 11; ritual may express something about social relationships, 12; actions may gain a clear significance by convention, 12.

One view: ritual as a particular kind of action, 13–16. Neither technical skill nor rationality is a satisfactory criterion by which to exclude ritual, 13; logic and rationality, 13; the criterion of achieved purpose, 14; motives or intentions behind action may not be simple or made explicit, 15; attempts to isolate ritual as a specific and exclusive kind of action fail, 15.

An alternative view: ritual as an aspect of action, 16–19. The distinction between instrumental and expressive aspects of behaviour, 16; the expressive aspect may sustain belief in ritual whether or not its several purposes be all accomplished, 17. The hazards to interpretation: we can read mistaken meaning into what we see, 17; the distinction between expression and communication, 18; what is clear in ritual is how to do it rather than its meaning, 19.

The alerting quality of ritual directs attention to the action: it is present in varying degree, 19; it may serve to guide the observer's efforts at interpretation, 20; the variety of ritual: public v. private aspects, 21. The idea of type and token applied to ritual performance, 22; the original setting of a type, 22; recognition of intention, 23; the classification of customs into genres or ideal types, 23; kinds of communication in ritual, 23. Is an analysis that goes beyond what the observer is told by the actor a matter of discovery or persuasion? 24; we cannot give pure descriptions of ritual, 24; the alerting quality in ritual acts on participants, 25.

The grounds on which we understand expression, 26–8: outward signs of inner states, 26; ritual is formalised and not necessarily symptomatic of the
Analytical table of contents

mental state of the performer, 26; the social, not individual, nature of ritual, 26; the attribution of expressive qualities to human behaviour, 27, to objects, 27; the increased significance of choice when exercised within a defined range of possibilities, 28; the game of correspondence, matching mood to object, 28.

The grounds on which we understand representation, 29–32; collateral information and knowledge of the repertoire, 29; substitution and convention, 29; symbolism may aim at clarity or ambiguity and mystery, 30; metaphor as a means to isolate or intimate elusive associations, 31.

Analogies with language, code and communication, 32–8: ritual differs from language in precision of meaning, 32; neither units of the code nor symbols are easily identified, 32; symbols are not discrete objects, 33; we do not decipher a ritual code as we do semaphore, 33; likeness of ritual to performance of a play, 33; not meaning understood but various responses to an event providing complex stimuli, 34; the special kind of communication in a play or a rite, 34; a society as ‘author’, 34; features of a code in ritual, 35; the notion of code as a means to transmit information, 35; the view of ritual coding as an economic device for storing knowledge, 36; defects in the analogy of message and communication applied to ritual, 37; the indeterminacy of ritual meaning is not necessarily a defect, 38.

Chapter 3. Views from one village

An attempt to identify the Gnau concept of ritual, 39; the Gnau do not have a word to isolate the concept, 39; proposal instead to examine the views implicit in their conversation to each other, 39. The source: recorded conversations during the building of a new men’s house, 39; preparations and the opening night of this major rite, 40; the making of hunting ash (nawugap), 41; Gnau naming for these rites, 42; use of metonymy in this naming dependent on the fixity of ritual sequences, 42.

Extract I, 43–5: direct address to patrilinial dead, declaratory speech, statement of obedience to tradition, hope of successful outcome; text, 43; notes, 44.

Extract II, 45–7: the ritual must be done publicly before an audience; there is concern for public registration and opinion of what they do; there is concern with the precise detail or order of procedure; text, 45; notes, 46; what is done is not ordinary but special or peculiar; alertness or attention to performance, 46; the action of tearing the lyimangai-banana leaf, 46; spells, 47.

Extract III, 47–8: request to ancestors to fulfil specific hopes because their descendants perform the rites; text, 48; notes, 48.

Extract IV, 48–9: statement of belief in the efficacy and value of rites; text, 49; notes, 49; magical substances, 49.

Extract V, 50–2: ritual is a source of knowledge about how to do things, learnt from ancestors and held in trust; there is a duty to teach it and pass it on; the Gnau mode of learning from experience, 50; Gnau teaching methods, 50; text, 51; notes, 52.

Extract VI, 52–7: pride in ritual, that ritual action is not ordinary nor discoverable by the exercise of reason; it can be learned but only after the original revelation; it is peculiar to the people who practise it. Elliptical reference to a myth in which the origin is found for the action of tearing the lyimangai leaf, 52; text, 53; notes, 55; trance and the hunting ash, 56; syntax in the
Analytical table of contents

expression of pride, 56; the sense of ritual things as a collective entity, 56; allusive fragmentary reference in explanation, 57; Gnav phrases for identifying the puberty rites, 'making a girl beautiful', 57.

Extract VII, 57–9: to show how the symbolism of a particular action is publicly explained; the women strike the newly completed thatch of the house with their sago-processing equipment, 58; analogy of the house to a sago palm, 58; text, 58.

Extract VIII, 59–67: to show how men discuss the order of the ritual-song performance in terms which assume knowledge of some of its implicit associations. The song of Panu’at, 59; archaic words and their interpretation, 59; the supposed fixed and ideal order of verses — how do they remember it? 61; relation of the song to myth, 61; song as journey, 61; verse linkage, 62; myth and clan links, 62; the alternative routes the song may take, 63; distinction of 'spirit' from 'spell' sections of the song, 63; spells in the song, 64; verse links to phrases in the progress of the night, 64; the mnemonic art and its devices, 64; text, 65; notes, 66.

Extract IX, 67–70: text, 67; notes, 68; ellipsis in how they explain about ritual; an event in the ritual may be given several interpretations; an elliptical statement interpreted by spelling out implicit associations, 68; associations of Panu’at and an analogy behind searing the new house with fire, 69; an alternative interpretation of why the new thatch is struck and shaken, 70.

Recapitulation of themes in the extracts, 70. The Gnav lack a specific word for ritual — how do words reflect non-linguistic experience? 71; the expectation of specific terms for concepts, 72; ideas may be expressed through actions as well as in words, 72; an exclusive concern with words in cognitive anthropology is unsatisfactory, 72.

Chapter 4. The rites of puberty seen

The village, 73; a day on which the rites of puberty are done, 73. Early morning: the cooking of the wa’agap stew in a clay pot; assembly of visitors, 73; the preparation of a mash of yams by men, 74.

The boy’s puberty rites, 75–81. Description of Geryik’s rites, 75; inside the men’s house; the phallicrypt; reluctance to let the author see the penis-bleeding, 75, the command to keep it secret from women, 76; the spitting of Geryik with betel juice, 76; his step-mother’s act with her bush knife, 77. Description of the rites for Wowulden in which the wa’iptat headdress was put on, 77; departure to the pool to bleed him, 77; he is bled, 78; behaviour of men watching, 78; Wowulden is bled over and smeared, 78; decoration of Wowulden and the completion of his headdress, 79; he is given the wa’agap stew with blood, 79; return to his hamlet, 80; further wa’agap given inside the men’s house, 80.

The girl’s puberty rites, 81–5. The menarche should decide when to do the girl’s rites — the example of Malu’s rites precipitated by her first menstrual period, 81; but a girl does not have to wait for her menarche, 82; food taboos which the girl must observe; smoking and chewing betel also forbidden, 82; she washes in scented water from a decorated container, 82; she eats a mixture of leaves and ash salt (teltag–nawugap) and is freed from the restrictions mentioned, 82; lyimangal-banana leaf torn, 83; uncertainty about whether the leaf had been torn or not, 83; spitting the girl with betel juice, 83; horseplay, 84; decoration of the girls with beads and a special pubic covering (timalyi’ep
Analytical table of contents

bifan; the girl is given the wa'agap stew to eat, 84; food is brought, displayed and distributed, 85; a money payment may be made, 85. Synopsis of the rites of puberty, 85–8.

Chapter 5. Rules of procedure and reflection on them

Aspects of the rites dependent on the device of the marked stage, 89–97: participation may demonstrate or confirm social relationships publicly, 89; puberty as one marked stage in a series of shifts of responsibility and dependence in relations between a couple, their children, and the people most closely connected to them — the main developmental stages stemming from a marriage, 90; payments and the special position of the first-born, 91; the individualised relationships of boys after puberty, 91; reasons for departing from the stated rules governing the usual form of the rites, 92; the mother's position, 92; parents' choice of the day for the rites, 93; the gabdag gift brought by the mother's brothers, 93; the father organises preparations but does not act directly in the rites done for his child, 94; interpretation of the mother's act of striking firewood with her bush knife before her son, 94; the mother's continuing tie to her daughter, 95; rights and duties changed solely by performance of the rites of puberty, 95; food restrictions, 95; the establishment of ritual friendship — wusai status, 96; gifts from the father's sister or elder married 'sisters', 96. Rules of custom may be linked to belief and morality as practice is to theory, 97; the epitomising function of such rules, 97; performance in rites linked to the public acknowledgement or registration of claims and duties in non-literate society, 97; alerting devices may be used in ritual to focus attention on them, 97.

Individual speculation on reasons why particular objects or actions are used in the rites, 98; variability of response, 98; apt association in the choice of custom, idiom, or metaphor — examples from the relationship of mother's brother and sister's son, 99; the lyumaygai banana, 99; bats, 100; wild aroid herbs, 100. Right and duty in this relationship, 101; asymmetry in the relationship, 101; gifts of the mother's brother and the growth of his sister's child, 102; complexity of the moral sentiments involved, 102; the composition of the gabdag gift and why it is thought appropriate, 103; benefit from the mother's brother, 103; steadfastness and shelter, 104. Fixed duties or customs, apt because of their content to a particular relationship, may serve to direct people's attention to the values and attitudes that should belong to it, 104.

Chapter 6. Silent forms but natural symbols?

On what grounds may an observer attribute a particular symbolism to the actor when the actor disagrees with him? The parallel between the girl's menarche and the boy's penis-bleeding, 106; equivalence of the puberty rites for boys and girls, 106; naming of the rites, 106; shared rites, discharge of obligations for either sex, wusai status, 106; puberty as a point or phase of growth common to both sexes — its signs, 107; individual focus, 108; identity in the detail of actions done in the ritual, 109; the food, smoking and betel-chewing restrictions, the giving of the leaves and salt mixture, 109; penile blood given to the girls but concealed, 109; problems of deciding the issue of identity or difference, 110. Over bleeding, how exact must imitation be when the anthropologist infers an interpretation and the actors disagree? 110; we must be speaking of some-
Analytical table of contents

thing other than conscious understanding of a symbolism, 111; the Wogo apply their word for ‘menstruating’ to men and women, 111; the question of symbolic menstruation may turn on the distinctions of particular classifications, 112; the notion of metaphor must involve an intellectual perception of the boundaries of categories, 112; emotion may make the recognition of symbol or metaphor unstable, 112; dissonance between an intellectual awareness of the symbolic character of something done and the appeal possibly made to the emotions, 113; the emphasis on intellect in anthropological writing on symbolism and disregard of emotion, 114; conscious knowledge v. ‘unconscious knowledge’ of symbolism, does the herring gull sit on a substitute egg or a symbolic egg? 114; defence of the interpretation by recourse to a hypothesis of natural symbols, 115; the release of animal or natural responses does not necessarily depend on closeness of imitation of an object’s external form, 115; the anthropologist may project his own ideas onto the actors, 116.

Is our search to understand ritual in terms of symbols and communication directed right? 116; Gombrich’s argument applied to ritual: making comes before matching, substitutes before representations, function before form, 116; to presume that ritual is essentially a form of communication prejudices what is to be found out, 117; misuse of linguistic models, 117; ritual as a complex form of stimulus, 118; over-intellectualisation in anthropological interpretation, 118; the instability of decision about whether something is used metaphorically or symbolically, 119.

Chapter 7. Moon, river and other themes compared

Is penis-bleeding thought to be a functional substitute for the menarche or menstruation? 121; cultural differences in the variety of knowledge may partly reflect the numbers of people available to contribute and transmit what they have learned, 121; as the Gnau are not decided on the function of menstruation, the question posed cannot be settled, 121.

Gnau views on the moon’s relation to menstruation, 122; a myth about catching the moon, 122; periodicity and menstruation, 123; opposition between men and women, 124; menstrual blood dangerous to men, 124; sex v. gender distinctions, 124; vulnerability when menstruating, 125; notions of cold and hot applied to people and activities, 125; comparisons with other Sepik peoples, 126; Arapesh views on menstruation, 126; ideas of the dangers of sexual intercourse, 127; views on bleeding as purificatory, 129; scarifying, 131.

Common features of puberty rites in the Sepik, 131; variety in interpretation, 132; the imputation of a uniform single meaning obscures and evades questions of cultural variation 132; the relative stress among the Gnau on some aspects of relationships between the sexes compared with that found elsewhere in the Sepik, 132.

Chapter 8. For success in life

Outline of the chief themes to be discussed, 134; two senses of life, 136; animal and vegetable life, 137.

Growth, 138–58: overall aim of the puberty rites — successful growth, 138; plant imagery, 138; states of human maturity — wholeness, 138, drying out, 139, dried-out things (nsm beirkatidom), 140; differing responses of boys and girls to the same taboos in the puberty rites, 140.
Analytical table of contents

Familiar ideas receive less attention or comment than strange ones, 141; thematic mood of the puberty rites, 141; individual variation in ability to comment on the rites, 142; implicit meaning, 142; inward and outward association, 142; Frye’s views on hypothetical and intrinsic meaning, 142; the special nature of ritual action, 143; pattern, motif, and context-dependent meaning and the heresy of paraphrase, 144; emotional and aesthetic responses, 145; food as a ritual medium, 146; food taboos and awareness of social identity, 146; food provides a spectrum of associations, 147; sequence in a range of food rules, 147.

Nama-beirkatidam taboos as a motif, 148; imposition of the taboos on a girl — her great toe sandwiched in a breadfruit, 148; umbilical cord tied round the mother’s great toe, 149; recurrence of the nama beirkatidam taboos at childbirth, 149; interpretation of the differing attention given by boys and girls to the same restrictions, 150; other motifs similarly recur, 150; the girl’s wa’ati and washing, 150; men forbidden nama beirkatidam in the Tambi initiation rites, 151; good growth depends on the condition of the blood, 151; water, washing and sweating, 152; the contrast of wet and dry, 152; composition of the wa’ati and the waa’agap, 153, known to men, 153, made of the growing points of certain plants, 154, the banana plants used, 154, flowers used, 155, the terms wa’ati and waa’agap also mean ‘flowers’ generically — an apparent paradox, 155; the peculiar gesture by which waa’agap is given to the boy or girl — interpretation, 157; general comment on the symbolism of growth based on links to plant growth, 158.

Achievement, 158–66; three ways of explaining the meaning of the phrases for stages of maturity, 158; system of food rules related to development, 159; clear system? 159; order among animals, 160; uncertain timing in the middle range of rules, 160; timing for men v. women, 161; main features and associations of system, 162; rules for the use of animal foods and plants related to the two senses of life, 165; stress on nama beirkatidam changes for men and women at different stages of their lives, 165.

Separate male ritual life, 166–73: secrecy as a social device used by men, 166; secrecy and social bonding, 167; values associated with fighting, 167; vice-versa quality in the virtue of ritual work, 168; the male headdress (weipat), 168; first stage of making it, 169; tearing the lyimangai leaf, 170, various explanations for it, 170, on supposing there is a correct meaning for it, 171; hunting gaplagap (special materials), 171; the series of rules for hunting success, 172; completion of the headdress, 172; the materials used in the hunting gaplagap, 173; scent, identification and hunting, 173.

Blood, 174–82: blood identity and kinship, 174; rules about ingesting blood and shot game, 174, on smearing blood, 174, in the rites for the first-born, 175; the Gnau theory of consanguinity, 175; the parents’ stock of blood, 176; seniority by birth order, 176; an anomaly of kin-term application, 176; transfer of blood, 177; rules about such transfers, 177; transfer in the puberty rites as gift from the mother’s brother, 178; behavioural rules associated with blood and relative seniority, 179; the chief ideas associated with bleeding, blood and consanguinity, 179; blood transfer and the rites of Tambi, 180; duty and responsibility in the transfer of blood, 181.

Revelation that male ritual life does not absolutely exclude female participation, 181; comment on the hypothesis of sex antagonism, 182; the spitting with betel juice — commentary, 182; the spells used, 183; the associations with spirits and address to them, 184; the puberty rites must be done for each individual, 185.
Analytical table of contents

Chapter 9. A choice of magic

The approach to rites as though they were puzzles or provided clues for answering questions, 186; emotions and the either/or choice implied by the intellectualist as opposed to the symbolist position on interpreting ritual, 186; do people really believe what they say? an example introduced: the magic to kill a sister's son, 187; payments to the mother's brother after Tambin initiation and after plantation labour, 188; two letters about this, 189; the tragedy of Dalukil's marriage, 190; the resolution of uncertainties in relationships through performance of fixed duties, 190; uncertainty about the cash payment, 191; inconsistency between statement of belief and action, 192; the choice of magic or violence in revenge, 192; literal belief and half-belief, 193; assertion, affirmation and promise, 194; reason and feeling in belief, 194; emotion and taboo words or names, 195; the significance of symbols in real life, 196; in metaphor the illusion of identity is voluntary, 197; values and relationships are in-substantial but that is not the same as saying they are not real, 198; the observer with second-hand understanding may miss the true seriousness of exotic symbolic thinking, 198; symbolic thinking, substitutes and superstition, 198.

Chapter 10. Change and a rite falling into disuse

The Gnau have experienced much change in the last two generations, 200; ritual as uninformative stereotyped action and Bloch's argument on the drift away from propositional meaning, 201; social change and the choice of preserving or adjusting ritual institutions, 201; Gnau reasons for changing elements in the puberty rites, 201; ambivalent attitudes to the past and the present, 202; changed significance of the headdress, 203; type and token: pointing-up aspects of tradition and identity, 203; awareness of change granted by ritual, 204; contrast between the puberty rites preserved and the Tambin initiation rites falling into disuse, 205.

Summary of the Gnau experience of social change, 205–12: pre-war, 205; war, 206; post-war contact, 206; arrival of missionaries, 206; mission settlements as central places in the area, 207; administrative developments, 208; experience of contract labour at plantations, 209; the little drama of departure for plantation labour, 209.

Correspondences between plantation labour and initiation in Tambin, 212; absence, 212; return, 212; care of juniors at plantation, 212; bleeding, 212; wanwok, 213; recasting new experience in a familiar mould, 213; reasons for not doing Tambin, 213; plantation labour v. Tambin initiation as means to fit a young man for the future, 214; the Gnau do not consider them as alternatives, 214; what they lose by abandoning the Tambin rites, 214; the difference between the puberty rites preserved and the Tambin rites falling into disuse decided by function and the ability to provoke or release a response, 215.

Chapter 11. Inventory of themes

Explanation and meaning, 216; familiarity and understanding, 216; 'pure description', 216; hierarchy in explanation, 217; reasons v. causes, 217; unconscious bias and the study of others, 218; the logic of question and answer, 219; classifications of social actions, 219; ideal types, 219; operative acts and obligatory actions, 220; 'meaning' is a word of easy virtue, 221; intrinsic v.
Analytical table of contents

intended meaning, 221; Boas’s study of the meaning given motifs in art, 222; interpretative understanding depends first on finding out the responses of people to their actions, 222; variation in response, 223; the distortions of reductionism and fashion – William James on this, 223.
PREFACE

Prospero speaks to Caliban: ‘When thou didst not, savage, know thine own meaning, but wouldst gabble like a thing most brutish, I endow’d thy purposes with words that made them known.’ An anthropologist has not the magic art of Prospero that he may dare to speak like that; yet some would almost seem to. It is easy to think about other people’s rites and symbols in terms of our own preoccupations. We have received ideas. Questions put by other anthropologists influence what we ask about in fieldwork, how we listen to answers and observe. Strange customs tempt an anthropologist more strongly to interpret them when he feels the people have not given him a good enough reason for following them. The question of what should count as a good reason runs through this book.

The anthropologist cannot escape from the complexity of his subject matter. Rather than suppose that one idea or theory should singly guide my comments, I have tried to find which ones help in understanding a rather short rite performed by the Gnau of New Guinea. In chapter 2 I present a general view of the problems and then in subsequent chapters take up various aspects of them for further exploration, in the light of what the Gnau had to say. I take extracts of Gnau conversation in chapter 3 to show what sense they have of ritual, and how they come to learn about it and how to do it. Next I describe the rites and mention some aspects of my impressions of them. These have no doubt influenced how I later evaluated the rites. It seems to me false science to disguise the selective personal component that enters willy-nilly into some field observations by an anthropologist, in the hope that the reader will be duped by impersonal phrasing. Some kinds of ethnographic data and observation may be collected, with appropriate effort, both systematically and objectively, but others, by their nature, cannot achieve a like status as ‘hard’ fact. The subjective impact of the different things I saw is partly what directed and motivated my efforts in inquiry and analysis.

Chapter 5 is about the rules of participation in the rites, and some further inferences that may be drawn from them about the intentions and motives of the actors. I relate it to questions of genre, address and style in ritual. Chapter
Preface

6 argues that we may mislead ourselves when we think we naturally understand a representation or a symbolism. I also discuss here some anthropological uses of the term 'metaphor'. The aim of chapter 7 is to see whether comparison within a limited ethnographic area helps to adjust the balance of commentary, partly in regard to the question of how relations between the sexes bear on interpretation of the rite. The long chapter 8 tackles the detail of what is done in the rites, going into issues of response, expression and meaning, especially with regard to differences in what the actors perceive according to sex, age and experience. I have tried to present a full account of a Gnauu understanding of human development through life. Chapter 9 looks at how emotion may affect people's perception of symbols and chapter 10 takes up the idea of token, type and variation to examine some further aspects of the functions of the rites and how they have been affected by social change. The final chapter is an inventory of themes in the book.

My apology for the detail of this study would be that it tries to work right through a particular case and be accurate to my understanding of Gnauu views, rather than to offer another new theory or to show how well one theory works for some of the data. I have been influenced by the books of Gombrich (1960, 1963), Wollheim (1970), Frye (1971), Cherry (1966), and Huizinga (1965). None of them was intended as a work for anthropologists and perhaps for that reason it is easier to single them out. Within anthropology there are too many different sources for my ideas, coming from friends, books and articles, to acknowledge all of them justly, and so, uncertain as to how I should do it, I do thank them, and single out only Bateson's Naven (1958), A. I. Richards's Chisungu (Faber and Faber, London, 1956) and Leenhardt's Do Kamo (1947) for their closeness in subject matter and the influences of the ways they handled it.

For all their kindness and tolerance, and for the help they gave me, I owe the people of Rauitt village a deep debt. I hope they might find this book true to them.

I thank the Social Science Research Council for funds enabling me to visit the Gnauu from December 1967 to November 1969 and again from July to December 1975. Some of the text used in chapters 5 and 9 previously appeared in 'A mother's brother to a sister's son' in Symbols and Sentiments, edited by Ioan Lewis, Academic Press, London, 1977.

Naumas
August 1977

G. L.