

# THE SOURCES OF THE DOCTRINES OF THE FALL AND ORIGINAL SIN



#### BY THE SAME AUTHOR.

The Origin and Propagation of Sin.

Being the Hulsean Lectures delivered before the University of Cambridge in 1901-2.



# THE SOURCES OF THE DOCTRINES OF THE FALL AND ORIGINAL SIN

 $\mathbf{BY}$ 

F. R. TENNANT, M.A., B.Sc.

FORMERLY STUDENT OF GONVILLE AND CAIUS COLLEGE, CAMBRIDGE.

CAMBRIDGE:
AT THE UNIVERSITY PRESS.
1903



> CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY PRESS Cambridge, New York, Melbourne, Madrid, Cape Town, Singapore, São Paulo, Delhi, Tokyo, Mexico City

Cambridge University Press
The Edinburgh Building, Cambridge CB2 8RU, UK

Published in the United States of America by Cambridge University Press, New York

www.cambridge.org Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9780521236331

> First published 1903 First paperback edition 2011

A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library

ısвn 978-0-521-23633-і Paperback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this publication, and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.



TO MY WIFE





#### PREFACE.

In the preface to my recently published Hulsean Lectures on *The Origin and Propagation of Sin*, which treated the subject described by their title critically and inductively, it was stated that the results of a historical study, then not completed, of the sources and development of the doctrines of the Fall and Original Sin, were inevitably presupposed throughout that work. These results are now placed before the reader.

The purpose which their publication is hoped to fulfil is twofold. In the first place, such a historical inquiry as is here undertaken furnishes one criterion amongst others as to the validity and finality of the doctrines previously criticised and restated; and thus the present work embodies an argument supplementary to those offered in the Hulsean Lectures. Secondly, it is hoped that some small service may be rendered to the student of doctrine by collecting together, into small compass, the literature, both ancient and modern, dealing with the sources of the Hebrew Fall-story and with the growth, from that narrative, of the Jewish and Christian theories concerning the origin and diffusion of human sinful-This hope is the more confidently entertained, partly on account of the fact that no complete history of the earlier growth of the doctrines of the Fall and Original Sin has previously been supplied, and partly because the inquiry prosecuted in this volume has been allowed to assume more



# viii Preface

minuteness and exhaustiveness than was perhaps necessary for the purpose of merely furnishing an argument supplementary to such as were elaborated in a former work.

The literature which it is here attempted to collect and to review is indeed scattered, and requires to be sought in books dealing with numerous and diverse branches of theological study. Hence the need for the labour of gathering it systematically together. Hence also the need, on the part of him who would endeavour to fulfil such a task, of recourse, throughout the work, to the results of the investigations of specialists in each of the departments of learning that are involved. This need is the greater when one who takes the work in hand cannot claim to be an experienced student of any of these several branches of theology, but must confess himself an amateur in all of them; when he is therefore unable to write with that confidence and independence which are born alone of minute and specialised first-hand study.

I trust that my indebtedness to the authorities from whose works I have gathered information has always been acknowledged in the appropriate place. How much I owe to German scholarship will be very evident to the reader of my book.

There is another kind of help, however, which I have derived, not from published works of writers, but from direct and personal communication; and this calls for more particular acknowledgment, such as can more fittingly find expression here. The generous readiness of both friends and strangers, not only at Cambridge but at other universities, to place at my disposal the best of their knowledge and to give me unstintingly of their time and thought, has placed me under an obligation which it gives me genuine pleasure to acknowledge. Information otherwise quite inaccessible has thus been very kindly afforded me by Profs. Sayce and Cheyne of Oxford, Prof. Otto Pfleiderer of Berlin, Prof. W. Max Müller of Philadelphia, Prof. Swete, Prof. Bendall and the



## Preface

ix

late Prof. Cowell of Cambridge, the Rev. A. H. Moulton and Dr Schechter, both until recently of Cambridge, Dean Armitage Robinson, Dr E. W. West, Mr Morfill of Oxford, and Mr N. McLean, who also kindly allowed me access to the late W. Robertson Smith's collection of books at Christ's College, of which he is the librarian.

My thanks are also especially due to my old friend the Rev. J. H. Srawley for finding time, amidst great pressure of work, to read through my last three chapters while in manuscript, and to offer me many valuable suggestions with regard to them.

I have further to acknowledge the kindness of the editors and the publishers (Messrs Macmillan and Co.) of *The Journal of Theological Studies* in allowing me to reprint extracts from an article contributed to that periodical. Finally, I have been materially helped at home in the correction of the proofsheets, the verification of references and the compilation of the indexes.

F. R. TENNANT.

HOCKWOLD RECTORY, *July*, 1903.





#### ERRATA

PAGE 94

Line 21. For 'no such' read 'such a'

PAGE 169

Note, line 4. After yezer hara read 'or yezer hatob'

PAGE 170

Line 10. For tob read hatob





### CONTENTS.

#### CHAPTER I.

THE FALL-STORY AND ITS EXEGESIS.
Introductory—The Jahvist Document, its date, theological stand-point, style, composition—Exegesis of the narrative of Gen. iii. —Literary criticism of the Fall-story—Oral tradition
CHAPTER II.
THE ETHNOLOGICAL ORIGIN AND RELATIONS OF THE FALL-STORY.
Present state of comparative study of sacred legend—Elements of Fall-story derived from early religion of nomadic Hebrews—Phoenician parallels—Egyptian parallels—Babylonian parallels—Greek parallels—Iranian parallels—Indian parallels—Conclusion
CHAPTER III.
THE PSYCHOLOGICAL ORIGIN OF THE FALL-STORY: ITS RELATION
TO HISTORY, ALLEGORY AND MYTH.
Traces of legends about the first man and Paradise in O.T.— Psychological origin of conceptions of the Garden of Eden, a golden age, the trees of Paradise—Fossil conceptions im- bedded in Fall-story—Hypothetical reconstruction of early history of Fall-story—The story neither history, nor allegory, nor, in the strict sense, myth



xii

#### Contents

#### CHAPTER IV

THE PREPARATION IN THE OLD TESTAMENT FOR A DOCTRINE OF THE FALL AND OF ORIGINAL SIN. PAGE
The use of elements of the Fall-story in the O.T.—Absence in O.T. of any doctrine derived from it—An alternative O.T. source of speculation on the origin of human sinfulness—Growth, in the O.T., of ideas involved in the doctrine of Original Sin—Universality and inherence of sinfulness—The yezer 89
CHAPTER V.
THE TEACHING OF ECCLESIASTICUS ON SIN AND THE FALL.
Introductory—Place of Ecclus. in Jewish literature—Its teaching as to Sin, the Fall and its consequences, Death 106
CHAPTER VI.
THE PREPARATION FOR THE DOCTRINE OF THE FALL IN ALEXANDRIAN JUDAISM.
The Sibylline Oracles—Wisdom—Philo—The Book of the Secrets of Enoch (Slavonic Enoch)—Note on 3 and 4 Maccabees . 122
CHAPTER VII.
THE FALL AND ORIGINAL SIN IN RABBINICAL LITERATURE.
Date and nature of the Rabbinic literature—Its teaching on man's first estate and fall—The tempter—The Fall-story regarded as symbolically descriptive of a sin of unchastity—Crude notion of inherited corruption derived from Eve—Rabbinic speculation on the introduction of Death—Adam and the race—The doctrine of the yezer hara not a doctrine of Original Sin 145

#### CHAPTER VIII.

THE FALL AND ORIGINAL SIN IN JEWISH PSEUDEPIGRAPHIC LITERATURE.

Origin and characteristics of apocalyptic literature—I. The (Aethiopic) Book of Enoch, (a) The groundwork—Its Theodicy grounded on the legend of the Watchers: (b) The Similitudes:



Contents xii	i
(c) Interpolations — II. The Testaments of the Twelve Patriarchs—III. The Book of Jubilees—IV. The Apocalypse of Abraham—V. Pseudo-Philo—Note on The Assumption of Moses, The Psalms of Solomon, The Testament of Abraham—VI. The Books of Adam, (a) The Apocalypse of Moses:  (b) The Vita Adae: (c) The Book of Adam and Eve (Malan) or The Conflict of Adam and Eve (Dillmann): (d) The Treasure Cave: (e) The Apocalypse of Adam or The Testament of Adam and Eve: (f) The History of the Creation and of the Transgression of Adam: (g) Fragments of late Adam-literature—VII. The Greek Apocalypse of Baruch	
CHAPTER IX.	
The fall and original sin in Jewish pseudepigraphic literature—( $continued$ ).	
III. The Book of the Secrets of Enoch (Slavonic Enoch)—Its unique doctrine of Original Sin—IX. The (Syriac) Apocalypse of Baruch—X. 4 Ezra (2 Esdras)—Its relation to the last work and to S. Paul	
CHAPTER X.	
THE GROWTH OF THE DOCTRINE OF THE FALL, AND OF ITS ELEMENTS, IN JEWISH LITERATURE AS A WHOLE.	
Jsage in Jewish Literature of the Fall-stories of Gen. vi. 1-4 and Gen. iii.—Development of Doctrine from Gen. iii.—Summary of Jewish teaching on Adam in the unfallen state, The Fall and Death, The Tempter, etc	35
CHAPTER XI.	
S. PAUL'S DOCTRINE OF THE FALL.	
The endeavour to interpret S. Paul in the light of contemporary  Jewish thought—Discussion of Rom. v. 12 ff. and its exegesis—  Rom. vii. 7 ff. on the psychological source of sin—1 Cor. xv.  45–50 irrelevant to our subject—Effects of the Fall on Nature—  Dicta of S. Paul embody results of previous Jewish speculation	<b>1</b> 8



xiv

#### Contents

#### CHAPTER XII.

THE DOCTRINES OF THE FALL AND ORIGINAL SIN IN THE FATHERS BEFORE AUGUSTINE.

#### CHAPTER XIII.

THE DOCTRINES OF THE FALL AND ORIGINAL SIN IN THE FATHERS BEFORE AUGUSTINE—(continued).

v. Methodius, Athanasius and Cyril of Jerusalem—vi. The Cappadocians: Basil, Gregory of Nazianzus, Gregory of Nyssa—vii. The Antiochene School: Chrysostom, Theodore of Mopsuestia—viii. Tertullian—ix. From Tertullian to Augustine: Cyprian, Hilary, Ambrose—Conclusion . . . 307

Additions and Corr	ECTIC	NS	•	•		•	•	346
INDEX OF PASSAGES			•					349
INDEX OF AUTHORS								355
INDEX OF SUBJECTS								360