

Cambridge University Press

978-0-521-19912-4 - The Platonic Alcibiades I: The Dialogue and its Ancient Reception

François Renaud and Harold Tarrant

Frontmatter

[More information](#)THE PLATONIC *ALCIBIADES I*

Although it was influential for several hundred years after it first appeared, doubts about the authenticity of the Platonic *Alcibiades I* have unnecessarily impeded its interpretation ever since. It positions itself firmly within the Platonic and Socratic traditions, and should therefore be approached in the same way as most other Platonic dialogues. It paints a vivid portrait of a Socrates in his late thirties tackling the unrealistic ambitions of the youthful Alcibiades, urging him to come to know himself and to care for himself. François Renaud and Harold Tarrant re-examine the drama and philosophy of *Alcibiades I* with an eye on those interpreters who cherished it most. Modern scholars regularly play down one or more of the religious, erotic, philosophic, or dramatic aspects of the dialogue, so ancient Platonist interpreters are given special consideration. This rich study will interest a wide range of readers in ancient philosophy.

FRANÇOIS RENAUD is a Professor of Philosophy at the Université de Moncton (New Brunswick). He has published mostly on Plato, Platonic interpretation both in Antiquity and in modern times, and Plato's Socratic legacy. His major publications include *Hermeneutic Philosophy and Plato: Gadamer's Response to the Philebus* (2010) co-edited with Christopher Gill.

HAROLD TARRANT is Emeritus Professor at the University of Newcastle, Australia, where he was Professor of Classics for several years. He has authored or co-authored several books relating to ancient Platonism from Plato through to Olympiodorus, and has also co-edited several volumes, the latest being *The Neoplatonic Socrates* (2014) with Danielle A. Layne.

Cambridge University Press

978-0-521-19912-4 - The Platonic Alcibiades I: The Dialogue and its Ancient Reception

François Renaud and Harold Tarrant

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

Cambridge University Press

978-0-521-19912-4 - The Platonic Alcibiades I: The Dialogue and its Ancient Reception

François Renaud and Harold Tarrant

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

THE PLATONIC *ALCIBIADES I*

The Dialogue and its Ancient Reception

FRANÇOIS RENAUD

and

HAROLD TARRANT



Cambridge University Press

978-0-521-19912-4 - The Platonic Alcibiades I: The Dialogue and its Ancient Reception

François Renaud and Harold Tarrant

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

CAMBRIDGE
UNIVERSITY PRESS

University Printing House, Cambridge CB2 8BS, United Kingdom

Cambridge University Press is part of the University of Cambridge.

It furthers the University's mission by disseminating knowledge in the pursuit of education, learning and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

www.cambridge.org

Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9780521199124

© François Renaud and Harold Tarrant 2015

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2015

Printed in the United Kingdom by Clays, St Ives plc

A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library

Library of Congress Cataloging in Publication data

Renaud, François

The Platonic Alcibiades I : the dialogue and its ancient reception / François

Renaud & Harold Tarrant.

pages cm

Includes bibliographical references.

ISBN 978-0-521-19912-4 (hardback)

I. Plato. Alcibiades I. I. Tarrant, Harold. II. Title.

B391.A53R46 2015

184—dc23

2015014693

ISBN 978-0-521-19912-4 Hardback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this publication, and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.

Contents

<i>Acknowledgements</i>	page vii
<i>Selected abbreviations</i>	ix
 PART I THE DIALOGUE	 I
Introduction	3
1 Uncertain status of the <i>Alcibiades</i> today	4
2 Privileged status of the dialogue in Antiquity	6
3 Defence of the general approach	7
4 General arguments in favour of an ancient approach	8
5 Hermeneutic issues: the dialogue and the <i>corpus</i>	11
6 The subject of the <i>Alcibiades</i>	13
7 Drama	22
1 The <i>Alcibiades I</i> and its issues	25
1 Opening (103a–106a): the beauty and the beast	25
2 Exposing double ignorance (106b–119a)	35
3 The protreptic passage (119a–124a)	43
4 Taking care of our self (124b–129b)	53
5 The mirror-motif and self-knowledge (129b–133c)	57
6 Putting self-knowledge to use (133c–135e)	71
7 Summary of the dialogue	79
 PART II RECEPTION IN ANTIQUITY	 83
2 Prereception and early reception	85
1 Lost clues regarding interpretation	85
2 Xenophon and Alcibiades	89
3 Aristotle	94
4 The <i>Magna Moralia</i> and the intertextual mirror	98
5 The <i>Alcibiades II</i>	102
6 The Academy under Polemo	108
7 The problem of Cicero	110

vi	<i>Contents</i>	
	8 The Platonic revival and the Middle Platonists	125
	9 Plutarch of Chaeroneia	127
	10 Albinus, Alcinous and others	140
3	Neoplatonist reception to Proclus	153
	1 'Neoplatonism'	153
	2 Plotinus	154
	3 Porphyry	161
	4 Iamblichus	164
	5 Syrianus and Hermias	173
	6 Proclus	177
	7 Damascius	186
	8 The Christian <i>Alcibiades</i>	187
4	Olympiodorus	190
	1 Introduction: general hermeneutic principles	190
	2 The character of Olympiodorus' teaching	195
	3 Socrates as model	201
	4 Socrates' divine sign and his approach to Alcibiades	203
	5 The Socratic art of love	206
	6 Socratic dialectic	213
	7 The ignorance of Alcibiades	219
	8 The political dimension	221
	9 Self-care	229
	10 The self and the soul	230
	11 The language of the self	234
	12 Olympiodorus on the inner self	236
	13 Olympiodorus' text	241
	14 Conclusion	243
	PART III THE DIALOGUE REVISITED	245
5	Reflections on our ancient journey	247
	1 Ancient lessons for the modern interpreter	247
	2 Ancient texts and modern	257
	3 Authorship and possible ancient contexts	260
	4 Coda: towards a philosophy of self	269
	<i>Bibliography</i>	273
	<i>Index locorum</i>	286
	<i>General index</i>	290

Cambridge University Press

978-0-521-19912-4 - The Platonic Alcibiades I: The Dialogue and its Ancient Reception

François Renaud and Harold Tarrant

Frontmatter

[More information](#)*Acknowledgements*

The authors would like to acknowledge substantial funding for this project from the Australian Research Council under its Discovery Project Scheme (DP0986334: ‘Academies under Stress’) for the years 2009–2012.

Harold Tarrant would also like to thank the University of Newcastle’s Research Management Committee and the Faculty of Education and Arts for funding under various schemes that enabled related work to proceed smoothly. Thanks are also due to the University of Cambridge’s Faculty of Classics for generous access to its facilities since 2012, and to numerous colleagues across the world with whom he has discussed aspects of this project, including above all Michael Griffin, Jim Ambury and Danielle Layne on reception, Rick Benitez, Doug Hutchinson, Marguerite Johnson and Reuben Ramsey on the *Alcibiades* itself, and Cambridge colleagues including of course Nick Denyer – my copy of his excellent little edition of the *Alcibiades* is now almost worn out – particularly for sharing their thoughts on the *Alcibiades II* when that dialogue was read at B-caucus meetings in 2014. Also to those who have patiently listened to his views and contributed to the discussions at various related papers, including those at the conference relating to the *Alcibiades* in Newcastle, Australia, in 2008, the *Lire les dialogues* Symposium in Aix-en-Provence in 2010, the ISNS Conference in Atlanta in 2011, the Academy Conference at the Athens Academy in 2012, and the Prometheus Trust conference on ‘Know Thyself’ in London in 2014. The Australian Research Council has encouraged collaborative research, and though this research began between colleagues based almost half of the earth’s circumference apart, this collaboration with François, with his different background and perspectives, has hopefully justified their policy in terms of the additional breadth that could be achieved. For in the words of the *Alcibiades II*: σὺν τε δύο σκεπτομένω τυχὸν εὐρήσομεν.

François Renaud thankfully acknowledges two three-year research grants from the Social Sciences and Humanities Research Council of

Cambridge University Press

978-0-521-19912-4 - The Platonic Alcibiades I: The Dialogue and its Ancient Reception

François Renaud and Harold Tarrant

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

viii

Acknowledgements

Canada for projects on Olympiodorus and Cicero, both as interpreters of Plato. The Université de Moncton has also generously supported his research through various grants and course-load reduction. Conferences have provided valuable opportunities for exchange, including those of the International Plato Society and the International Society for Neoplatonic Studies as well as the more focused *Argumenta in dialogos Platonis* II (Rome, 2008) and *Plato latinus* (Gargnano, 2011). There and elsewhere discussions with colleagues and friends were vital in developing his ideas, especially those with Michel Narcy and Christopher Gill, and on the ancient commentators, Martin Achard, Andrea Falcon and, in his case too, Danielle Layne and Michael Griffin. Last but definitely not least, Harold's warm hospitality at the 2008 conference in Newcastle ('Socrates, Alcibiades and the Paradigm of the Divine Lover/Educator') proved the beginning of a common and most rewarding endeavour the outcome of which is this book.

βέλτιον δ' ἴσως συνεργοὺς ἔχων . . .

Aristotle, *EN* 10.7 1177a34

Cambridge University Press

978-0-521-19912-4 - The Platonic Alcibiades I: The Dialogue and its Ancient Reception

François Renaud and Harold Tarrant

Frontmatter

[More information](#)*Selected abbreviations*

Citations of the Platonic commentaries of Damascius, Proclus and Olympiodorus are abbreviated as follows (for individual editions see the Bibliography):

<i>in Alc.</i>	<i>Commentary on the Alcibiades</i>
<i>in Crat.</i>	<i>Commentary on the Cratylus</i>
<i>in Gorg.</i>	<i>Commentary on the Gorgias</i>
<i>in Parm.</i>	<i>Commentary on the Parmenides</i>
<i>in Phaed.</i>	<i>Commentary on the Phaedo</i>
<i>in Phdr.</i>	<i>Commentary on the Phaedrus</i>
<i>in Remp.</i>	<i>Commentary on the Republic</i>
<i>in Tim.</i>	<i>Commentary on the Timaeus</i>

Dictionary and collections

LSJ	Liddell & Scott, <i>A Greek–English Lexicon</i>
SVF	<i>Stoicorum Veterum Fragmenta</i>
SSR	<i>Socratis et Socraticorum Reliquiae</i>

Anonymous

anon. <i>Proleg.</i>	anonymous <i>Prolegomena to Platonic Philosophy</i>
anon. <i>Thet.</i>	anonymous <i>in Theaetetus</i>

Aristotle

<i>de An.</i>	<i>De Anima</i>
<i>EE</i>	<i>Eudemian Ethics</i>
<i>EN</i>	<i>Nicomachean Ethics</i>

Cambridge University Press

978-0-521-19912-4 - The Platonic Alcibiades I: The Dialogue and its Ancient Reception

François Renaud and Harold Tarrant

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

x

*Selected abbreviations**Met.* *Metaphysics**Poet.* *Poetics**Pol.* *Politics**Rhet.* *Rhetoric***Pseudo-Aristotle***MM* *Magna Moralia***Cicero***Acad.* *Academica**De rep.* *De re publica**Fin.* *De finibus bonorum et malorum**Leg.* *De legibus**Nat.* *De natura deorum**Tusc.* *Tusculanae disputationes***Diogenes Laertius***D.L.* *Lives of Eminent Philosophers***Epictetus***Diss.* *Discourses***Iamblichus***Protr.* *Protrepticus**De Mysteriis* *De Mysteriis Aegyptiorum***Olympiodorus***in Cat.* *Commentary on the Categories***Plato***Alc. I* *Alcibiades I**Alc. II* *Alcibiades II**Apol.* *Apology*

Cambridge University Press

978-0-521-19912-4 - The Platonic Alcibiades I: The Dialogue and its Ancient Reception

François Renaud and Harold Tarrant

Frontmatter

[More information](#)*Selected abbreviations*

xi

<i>Charm.</i>	<i>Charmides</i>
<i>Crat.</i>	<i>Cratylus</i>
<i>Crit.</i>	<i>Crito</i>
<i>Ep.</i>	<i>Epistles/Letters</i>
<i>Euthphr.</i>	<i>Euthyphro</i>
<i>Euthyd.</i>	<i>Euthydemus</i>
<i>Gorgias</i>	<i>Gorg.</i>
<i>La.</i>	<i>Laches</i>
<i>Phd.</i>	<i>Phaedo</i>
<i>Phdr.</i>	<i>Phaedrus</i>
<i>Phil.</i>	<i>Philebus</i>
<i>Prot.</i>	<i>Protagoras</i>
<i>Prm.</i>	<i>Parmenides</i>
<i>Rep.</i>	<i>Republic</i>
<i>Soph.</i>	<i>Sophist</i>
<i>Symp.</i>	<i>Symposium</i>
<i>Tht.</i>	<i>Theaetetus</i>
<i>Theag.</i>	<i>Theages</i>
<i>Tim.</i>	<i>Timaeus</i>

Plotinus

<i>Enn.</i>	<i>Enneades</i>
-------------	-----------------

Plutarch

<i>Alc.</i>	<i>The Life of Alcibiades</i>
<i>De gen. Soc.</i>	<i>De Genio Socratis</i> (= <i>On the Daimonion of Socrates</i>)

Porphyry

<i>VPlot</i>	<i>Vita Plotini</i> (= <i>The Life of Plotinus</i>) (in <i>Enn.</i> ed. Henry-Schwyzler)
--------------	-------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------

Proclus

<i>de Prov.</i>	<i>De Providentia</i>
<i>in Eucl.</i>	<i>A Commentary on the First Book of Euclid's Elements</i>
<i>Theol.</i>	<i>The Elements of Theology</i>

Cambridge University Press
978-0-521-19912-4 - The Platonic Alcibiades I: The Dialogue and its Ancient Reception
François Renaud and Harold Tarrant
Frontmatter
[More information](#)

xii

Selected abbreviations

Seneca

Ep. *Epistulae ad Lucilium*

Stobaeus

Anth. *Anthologia*

Xenophon

Mem. *Memorabilia*
Apol. *Apology of Socrates*