Revolution and Constitutionalism in the Ottoman Empire and Iran

As a wave of democratic social movements, under the influence of “velvet” revolutions, is sweeping the Middle East, this book calls attention to an earlier wave that swept the region a century ago. In his book on constitutional revolutions in the Ottoman Empire and Iran, Nader Sohrabi considers global diffusion of institutions and ideas, their regional and local reworking, and the long-term consequences of adaptation to local exigencies. There are lessons to be learned here. The revolutions, despite the differing social structures of the societies in which they happened, shared the same objectives and demands. Furthermore, the suddenness and simultaneity of their appearance point to a commonality that transcended the localities. Arguing that revolutions are time-bound phenomena whose forms follow global models in vogue at particular historical junctures, the book challenges the ahistoric and purely local understanding of them. Furthermore, it provides a strong case that macrostructural preconditions alone cannot explain the occurrence of revolutions; rather, global waves, intervention of agency, and additional contingent events work together to bring them about in competition with other possible outcomes. Beyond concern for how and why revolutions happen, the book offers a comparative account of the process of institutionalizing constitutionalism in two settings. The comparison highlights many similarities in the power struggles, including the paradox inherent in the “constitutional revolutions.” Comparison also affords exploration of a key difference: the reason for greater resilience of democratic institutions in the Ottoman Empire and modern Turkey in contrast to Iran. In making his case, Sohrabi draws on a wide array of archival and primary sources that afford a minute look at the revolutions as they unfold.

Nader Sohrabi is an Associate Research Scholar at the Middle East Institute, Columbia University.
To my mother, Shirin Hakimi,
in memory of my father, Yadollah Sohrabi
Revolution and Constitutionalism in the Ottoman Empire and Iran

NADER SOHRABI

Columbia University
Contents

Acknowledgments vii

Introduction 1

THE OTTOMAN EMPIRE

1 Revolution and the Neopatrimonial State 33
2 The Young Turk Revolution and the Global Wave 72
3 Constitutional and Extra-constitutional Struggles 135
4 The Staff Policies and the Purges 189
5 Counterrevolution and Its Aftermath 224

IRAN

6 Reform and Patrimonialism in Comparative Perspective 287
7 The Less Likely Revolution: The Constitutional Revolution of 1906 in Iran in Light of the Young Turks 335
Concluding Remarks 427

Selected Bibliography 437
Index 443
Acknowledgments

This project’s transformation from its initial vague outlines and undisciplined argumentation to the present form would have been impossible without the enthusiasm, insights, and support of certain individuals, and I thank them deeply for that. These are William Parish, George Steinmetz, David Laitin, Şükrü Hanioğlu, Roberto Franzosi, and John Woods. There are others with whom I have talked about the book incessantly, and benefited immensely from their incisive comments on the manuscript, sometimes several renditions of it, in full or in part. These are William Sewell, Jr., Ivan Ermakoff, Marc Van de Mieroop, Ben Fortna, Karen Barkey, Brinkley Messick, Mark Mazower, Cyrus Amir-Mokri, Kate Bjork, and Bijan Sohrabi. I am also grateful to individuals whose generous comments on various aspects of the present book in one form or another have made it a better work of scholarship. These are Said Amir Arjomand, Roy Mottahedeh, Mansour Bonakdarian, Carter Findley, and the late Donald Quataert. In addition to the already named former colleagues in the department of Middle East, South Asia, and African Studies of Columbia University, I would like to thank George Saliba, Wael Hallaq, Muhsin al-Mousavi, Etem Erol, Hamid Dabashi, Rashid Khalidi, Sheldon Pollock, and Sudipta Kaviraj. From Cenk Palaz and Bedross Der Matossian I have learned more than they are aware, and they have always come to my help when I needed them. During research, I benefited from the generosity of archivists and librarians in Turkey and Iran. I would like to thank the staff at the Prime Ministry Archives and at Atatürk Library, both in Istanbul. Ibrahim Küreli, a friend, deserves special thanks. I would also like to thank the staff at the Library of Parliament and the National Archives of Iran, both in Tehran, and the House of Constitution in Tabriz. Harvard Academy for International and Area Studies, with its true commitment to multidisciplinary research, provided two years of generous support that enabled me to gather and analyze much of the archival material found in this book. The office of University Seminars at Columbia University, by kindly providing a subvention, made publication of a larger book than is now conventional possible. Friends and family have been the backbone of support and there are too many to name here, but I would like to
single out Bijan and Niloofer Sohrabi, Parviz and Shohreh Nabavi, Babak Khoshnood, and Eskandar Sohrabi for always being there. Mojgan, Kayvon, and Sara, the joys of my life, cannot be thanked in words. Finally, I would like to thank Lewis Bateman, senior editor at Cambridge University Press; the reviewers; and the production editor, Mary Cadette.

This book is dedicated to my parents, whose unconditional love, and love of learning, have been constant sources of inspiration. I wish my father had lived long enough to see it.