Political Philosophy versus History?
Contextualism and Real Politics in Contemporary Political Thought

Is the way in which political philosophy is conducted today too ahistorical? Does such ahistoricism render political philosophy too abstract? Is political philosophy thus incapable of dealing with the realities of political life? This volume brings together some of the world’s leading political philosophers to address these crucial questions. The contributors focus especially on political philosophy’s pretensions to universality, and on its strained relationship with the world of real politics. Some chapters argue that political philosophers should not be cowed by the accusations levied against them from outside of their own field. Others insist that these accusations require a dramatic reshaping of normative political thought. The volume will spark controversy across political philosophy and beyond.

Jonathan Floyd is British Academy Post-Doctoral Fellow in the Department of Politics and International Relations, University of Oxford, and Research Fellow in Political Theory at St Hilda’s College, Oxford. He is currently working on a book on methodology in political philosophy, as well as a book on the same topic as the present volume.

Marc Stears is Fellow in Politics at University College, Oxford, and University Lecturer in Political Theory in the Department of Politics and International Relations, University of Oxford. His most recent book is Demanding Democracy: American Radicals in Search of a New Politics (2010).
Political Philosophy versus History?

Contextualism and Real Politics in Contemporary Political Thought

Edited by Jonathan Floyd and Marc Stears
Contents

Note on the contributors

Acknowledgements

Introduction

Jonathan Floyd and Marc Stears

Part I The challenge of contextualism

1 Rescuing political theory from the tyranny of history

Paul Kelly

2 From historical contextualism, to mentalism, to behaviourism

Jonathan Floyd

3 Contingency and judgement in history of political philosophy: a phenomenological approach

Bruce Haddock

4 Political philosophy and the dead hand of its history

Gordon Graham

Part II The challenge of realism

5 Politics, political theory and its history

Iain Hampsher-Monk

6 Constraint, freedom, and exemplar: history and theory without teleology

Melissa Lane

7 History and reality: idealist pathologies and ‘Harvard School’ remedies

Andrew Sabl
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>vi</th>
<th>Contents</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>8 The new realism: from modus vivendi to justice</td>
<td>177</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>BONNIE HONIG AND MARC STEARS</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Relative value and assorted historical lessons: an afterword</td>
<td>206</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>JONATHAN FLOYD</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Index</td>
<td>226</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Note on the contributors

Jonathan Floyd is British Academy Post-Doctoral Fellow in the Department of Politics and International Relations, University of Oxford, and Research Fellow in Political Theory at St Hilda’s College, Oxford. He is currently working on a book on methodology in political philosophy, as well as a book on the same topic as the present volume.

Gordon Graham is Henry Luce III Professor of Philosophy and the Arts at Princeton Theological Seminary. His recent publications include The Re-enchantment of the World: Art versus Religion (2007) and Ethics and International Relations (2008).

Bruce Haddock is Professor of Modern European Social and Political Thought at Cardiff University. His recent publications include A History of Political Thought: From Antiquity to the Present (2008) and A History of Political Thought: 1789 to the Present (2005).

Iain Hampsher-Monk is Professor of Political Theory at the University of Exeter. His recent publications include ‘Democracy and federation in the federalist papers’, in M. Burgess and M. Gagnon (eds.), Federal Democracies (2009) and (with Andrew Hindmoor) ‘Rational choice and interpretive evidence: caught between a rock and a hard place?’, Political Studies, 58: 1 (2010).

Bonnie Honig is the Sarah Rebecca Roland Professor of Political Science at Northwestern University and a senior research professor at the American Bar Foundation. Her books include Political Theory and the Displacement of Politics (1993), Democracy and the Foreigner (2001) and Emergency Politics: Paradox, Law, Democracy (2009).

Paul Kelly is Professor of Political Theory and Head of the Government Department at LSE. His recent publications include Locke’s Second Treatise of Government (2007) and British Political Theory in the Twentieth Century (2010).

Andrew Sabl is Associate Professor of Public Policy and Political Science at the University of California, Los Angeles. He is the author of *Ruling Passions: Political Offices and Democratic Ethics* (2002) and is currently completing a book for Princeton University Press on the political theory of David Hume’s *History of England*.

Marc Stears is Fellow in Politics at University College, Oxford, and University Lecturer in Political Theory in the Department of Politics and International Relations, University of Oxford. His most recent book is *Demanding Democracy: American Radicals in Search of a New Politics* (2010).
Acknowledgements

This book first emerged from a one-day workshop organised by Jonathan Floyd and hosted at University College, Oxford in the summer of 2007. We are extremely grateful to everyone who participated in that initial event, including Michael Freeden, Benjamin Jackson, Mark Philp, Alan Ryan, Quentin Skinner and Adam Swift. We are also grateful to the participants at two further events, one held at the American Political Science Association annual convention in Boston in 2008, and the other, in 2009, again at University College, Oxford. These participants included Annabel Brett, Christopher Brooke, Jeremy Farris, Jeremy Jennings, David Leopold, Lois McNay and Reidar Maliks. Generous financial support for these events came from Oxford’s Centre for Political Ideologies, where we warmly thank the Centre’s Director, Michael Freeden, for his invaluable assistance, and from University College, Oxford, where we equally warmly thank the Senior Tutor, Anne Knowland. We also greatly appreciated the work of the excellent team at Cambridge University Press who helped us transform the conversations at these events into a book. John Haslam was the ideal editor, generous and demanding in exactly the right measure, and Josephine Lane offered superb support throughout the final process.

We have both learnt an enormous amount from colleagues and friends as we have considered how best to develop this book. Jonathan Floyd would like to thank, in particular, Rita Floyd. She was the first to hear of the idea for this endeavour, and has encouraged him along every step of the way. Marc Stears would also like to thank Elizabeth Frazer, Bonnie Honig, Desmond King, David Leopold, Lois McNay, Lizzy Pellicano, Stuart White and Lea Ypi for extremely stimulating and insightful conversations on questions at the heart of our project. The support of all of these people has been invaluable. Finally, we would also like to thank each other. Marc Stears has nothing but admiration for the energy, determination and thoughtfulness with which Jonathan has shaped this
project throughout. Jonathan Floyd also has a great deal of admiration for Marc – in this case not just for being an excellent co-editor, but also for supporting the project back when it was just an idea and he was just one pesky graduate student amongst many. We hope very much that our readers enjoy the results.