THE AFTERLIFE OF RAPHAEL’S PAINTINGS

Raphael is one of the rare artists who have never gone out of fashion. Acclaimed during his lifetime, he was imitated by contemporaries and served as a model for painters through the nineteenth century. Because of the artist’s renown, his works have continuously been subject to care, conservation, and restoration. In this book, Cathleen Hoeniger focuses on the legacy of Raphael’s art: the historical trajectory – or “afterlife” – of the paintings themselves. The appreciation of Raphael was expressed and the restoration of his works debated in contemporary treatises, which provide a backdrop for probing the fortune of his paintings. What happened to his panel paintings and frescoes in the centuries after his death in 1520? Some were lost altogether; others were severely damaged in natural disasters; and many were affected by uncontrolled climatic conditions, by travel from one place to another, and by the not-always cautious or careful hands of restorers. This book reveals the 500-year story of many of Raphael’s best-known paintings.

Cathleen Hoeniger is Associate Professor of Art History at Queen’s University in Canada. The author of numerous journal articles and book chapters, she has recently contributed to Conservation: Principles, Dilemmas and Uncomfortable Truths and The Cambridge Companion to Raphael. She is also the author of The Renovation of Paintings in Tuscany, 1250–1500 (Cambridge University Press, 1995).
THE AFTERLIFE OF
RAPHAEL’S PAINTINGS

CATHLEEN HOENIGER
Queen's University, Canada
This book is dedicated to
Geoffrey, Julia, Dana, and my father, David.
CONTENTS

List of Illustrations  ix
Acknowledgements  xiii

1 An Introduction to the History of Restoring Raphael's Paintings  1

2 The Reception of Raphael, with a Focus on the Vatican Stanze  36

3 The History of Damage and Restoration to Raphael's Stanze and the Restoration of the Loggia of Psyche in 1693–1695  72

4 The French King's Raphaels, 1750–1792  108

5 The English Reception and Restoration of Raphael's Cartoons, c. 1525–1800  135

6 Changing Ownership at a Time of War: The Movement of Seventeen Paintings by Raphael during the Napoleonic Era  162

7 Raphael's Great Altarpieces in Paris and Dresden, 1801–1828  192

8 "Heritage Preservation," the Establishment of National Galleries, and the Restoration of Raphael in Nineteenth-Century Italy  255
## Contents

9 Attention to Detail in the Study and Preservation of Raphael’s Art during the Nineteenth Century 291

10 Conclusion: Meticulous Research, Revelatory Cleanings, and the Rediscovery of a Lost Raphael 316

Notes 349
Bibliography 399
Index 425
ILLUSTRATIONS

Plates

Color plates follow page xvi

2. View of the Stanza della Segnatura, Vatican.

Figures

2. Raphael and Evangelista da Pian di Meleto, *Coronation of St. Nicholas of Tolentino*, reconstruction based on Fischel, 1912, with location of surviving fragments.  5
6. Lorenzo Lotto, *The Physician Giovanni Agostino della Torre and His Son, Niccolò* (1515; National Gallery, London), with repainting by Giuseppe Molteni, 1936 before cleaning and restoration. 19
7. Lorenzo Lotto, *The Physician Giovanni Agostino della Torre and His Son, Niccolò*, present condition. 20
11. *Ganymede and Zeus*, ancient sculpture of a boy, restored by Benvenuto Cellini, Bargello, Florence. 39
12. Anton Raphael Mengs, copy of the *School of Athens*, Victoria and Albert Museum, London. 69
18. Correggio, *Leda* (with repainted head by Jacob Schlesinger), Gemäldegalerie, Berlin. 88
19. Correggio, *Leda*, X-radiograph, detail of right two-thirds of canvas. 89
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Illustrations</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>25. Raphael, <em>Christ’s Charge to Peter</em>, cartoon, on loan to the Victoria and Albert Museum, London. Detail showing misalignment of domed building in background, and repainting along join of cartoon strips.</td>
<td>151</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>27. Daniele da Volterra, <em>Deposition</em>, detached from wall and remounted on canvas, Trinità dei Monti, Rome.</td>
<td>189</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>30. Christian van Mechel, Tafel 10, “Third room, the side on the right of the second façade,” engraving from Pigage and van Mechel, 1778.</td>
<td>224</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>31. Raphael, <em>Canigiani Holy Family</em>, detail of upper half in present condition.</td>
<td>225</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>32. Raphael, <em>Canigiani Holy Family</em>, UV-fluorescence photo, before cleaning of 1982, showing repainting of sky from late eighteenth century.</td>
<td>228</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>33. Raphael, <em>Canigiani Holy Family</em>, detail from child angels in upper right, after cleaning and before in-painting, 1982.</td>
<td>229</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>34. Raphael, <em>Sistine Madonna</em>, Gemäldegalerie Alte Meister, Dresden.</td>
<td>233</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>35. Raphael, <em>Sistine Madonna</em>, Gemäldegalerie Alte Meister, Dresden, with areas of damage outlined.</td>
<td>249</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>37. Mauro Pellicioli examining Raphael’s <em>Marriage of the Virgin</em>, 1952.</td>
<td>289</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>39. Raphael and Perugino, <em>Trinity and Saints</em>, with repainting by Consoni, before 1906.</td>
<td>313</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Illustrations</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>---------------</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>41. Timoteo Viti/Raphael, <em>Portrait of a Young Man – Angel</em>, before 1912, Pinacoteca, Brescia. 318</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>43. Raphael, compositional study for the <em>Coronation of St. Nicholas of Tolentino</em>, recto, black chalk. Musée des Beaux-Arts, Lille. 327</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>44. Raphael, <em>Angel</em>, from the <em>Coronation of St. Nicholas of Tolentino</em>, after cleaning and restoration of 1912–13, Pinacoteca, Brescia. 331</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

Over the course of about a decade, many individuals assisted with the research for this book, but there is space to acknowledge only those who were especially generous with their time and resources: Christoph Schölzel at the Gemäldegalerie Alte Meister in Dresden; Emanuela Daffra, Brera, Milan; Cornelia Syre and Andreas Schumacher, Alte Pinakothek, Munich; Alan Derbyshire and Nicola Costeras of the Victoria and Albert Museum, London; Fabrizio Cosimo, Vatican Museums; and my colleagues Janice Helland, David McTavish, John Osborne, and Sebastian Schütze. Petra Lamers-Schütze helped enormously with obtaining the illustrations for the book, and Paul Hodgetts provided expert digital imaging services. Several former graduate students worked as research assistants on this project; notably Andrea Bubenik, Allison Fisher, Sally Hickson, Amanda Morhart, Kimberly Muir, and Krystina Stermole. Without generous funding from the Social Sciences and Humanities Research Council of Canada, my travel itineraries would have been much curtailed. I would also like to thank the two anonymous reviewers of the manuscript for their perceptive commentary. Finally, four individuals, who have had a very positive impact on my scholarly path, deserve my heartfelt thanks: Norman Muller; the late John Shearman; Marcia Hall; and my very helpful editor at Cambridge, Beatrice Rehl.
THE AFTERLIFE OF RAPHAEL'S PAINTINGS
1. Raphael, *Transfiguration*, Pinacoteca, Vatican (© Photo SCALA, Florence)
2. View of the Stanza della Segnatura, Vatican (© Photo SCALA, Florence)