Shadows of War

Silence lies between forgetting and remembering. This book explores the ways in which different societies have constructed silences to enable men and women to survive and make sense of the catastrophic consequences of armed conflict. Using a range of disciplinary approaches, it examines the silences that have followed violence in twentieth-century Europe, the Middle East, and Africa. These essays show that silence is a powerful language of remembrance and commemoration and a cultural practice with its own rules. This broad-ranging book discloses the universality of silence in the ways we think about war through examples ranging from the Spanish Civil War and the Israeli-Palestinian conflict to the Armenian Genocide and South Africa’s Truth and Reconciliation Commission. Bringing together scholarship on varied practices in different cultures, this book breaks new ground in the vast literature on memory, and opens up new avenues of reflection and research on the lingering aftermath of war.

Efrat Ben-Ze’ev is Senior Lecturer in Anthropology at the Department of Behavioral Sciences, Ruppin Academic Center, Israel. She has published on Palestinian-Arab and Jewish-Israeli memories of the war of 1948.

Ruth Ginio is Senior Lecturer in History at Ben Gurion University of the Negev and a research fellow at the Harry S. Truman Research Institute for the Advancement of Peace in Jerusalem. Her recent publications include French Colonialism Unmasked: The Vichy Years in French West Africa (2006) and Violence and Non-Violence in Africa (as co-editor, 2007).

Jay Winter is Charles J. Stille Professor of History at Yale University. He is the author of Sites of Memory, Sites of Mourning: The Great War in European Cultural History (1995), and War and Remembrance in the Twentieth Century (as editor, with Emmanuel Sivan, 1999).
Shadows of War

A Social History of Silence in the Twentieth Century

Edited by
Efrat Ben-Ze’ev,
Ruth Ginio
and
Jay Winter
Contents

Notes on contributors
Preface and acknowledgments

Part I Framing the problem: Multi-disciplinary approaches

1 Thinking about silence
   JAY WINTER

2 The social sound of silence: Toward a sociology of denial
   EVIATAR ZERUBAVEL

Part II Europe

3 Breaking the silence? Memory and oblivion since the
   Spanish Civil War
   MARY VINCENT

4 In the ashes of disgrace: Guilt versus shame revisited
   JEFFREY K. O LiCK

5 On silence, madness, and lassitude: Negotiating the past
   in post-war West Germany
   SVENJA GOLTERMANN

Part III Africa

6 Silences on state violence during the Algerian War of
   RAPHAËLLE BRANCHE AND JIM HOUSE

7 African silences: Negotiating the story of France’s colonial
   soldiers, 1914–2009
   RUTH GINIO
vi Contents

8 Now that all is said and done: Reflections on the Truth and Reconciliation Commission in South Africa
LOUISE BETHLEHEM 153

Part IV The Middle East

9 Facing history: Denial and the Turkish national security concept
TANER AKÇAM 173

10 Imposed silences and self-censorship: Palmach soldiers remember 1948
EFRAT BEN-ZE’EV 181

11 Forgetting the Lebanon War? On silence, denial, and the selective remembrance of the “First” Lebanon war
ASHER KAUFMAN 197

Index 217
Notes on contributors


Efrat Ben-Ze’ev is Senior Lecturer in Anthropology at the Department of Behavioral Sciences, Ruppin Academic Center, Israel. She has published on Palestinian-Arab and Jewish-Israeli memories of the war of 1948.

Louise Bethlehem is Senior Lecturer in the Program in Cultural Studies and in the Department of English at the Hebrew University of Jerusalem. She has published widely on South African literary and cultural history, postcolonialism, and gender studies. Her recent volumes include Skin Tight: Apartheid Literary Culture and its Aftermath, (Pretoria and Leiden, 2006) and Violence and Non-Violence in Africa, co-edited with Pal Ahluwalia and Ruth Ginio (Abingdon and New York, 2007).

Raphaëlle Branche is Lecturer in Modern History at the University of Paris-1. She is currently working on French colonialism in Algeria and the Algerian War of Independence.

Ruth Ginio is Senior Lecturer in History at Ben Gurion University of the Negev and a research fellow at the Harry S. Truman Research Institute for the Advancement of Peace in Jerusalem. Her recent publications include French Colonialism Unmasked: The Vichy Years in French West Africa (Lincoln, Neb. 2006) and Violence and Non-Violence in Africa, co-edited with Pal Ahluwalia and Louise Bethlehem (Abingdon and New York, 2007).
viii Notes on contributors

SVENJA GOLTTERMANN teaches history at the University of Freiburg. She is author of Die Gesellschaft der Überlebenden: Kriegsheimkehrer und ihre Gewalter fahrungen im Zweiten Weltkrieg (Munich, 2009) and a number of articles, including “The Imagination of Disaster: Death and Survival in Post-War West Germany,” in Paul Betts, Alon Confino, and Dirk Schumann (eds.), Between Mass Death and Individual Loss: The Place of the Dead in Twentieth-Century Germany (Oxford, 2008).

JIM HOUSE is Senior Lecturer in French at the University of Leeds. His recent publications include (with Neil MacMaster) Paris 1961: Algerians, State Terror, and Memory (Oxford, 2006).

ASHER KAUFMAN is Assistant Professor of History at the University of Notre Dame. He is currently working on border dynamics between Syria, Lebanon, and Israel. His recent publications include “From the Litani to Beirut: Israel’s Invasions of Lebanon, 1978–1985: Causes and Consequences,” in Clive Jones and Sergio Catignani (eds.), Israel and Lebanon 1976–2006: An Interstate and Asymmetric Conflict in Perspective (2009).

JEFFREY K. OICK is Professor of Sociology and History at the University of Virginia. His books include, among others, In the House of the Hangman: The Agonies of German Defeat, 1943–1949 (Chicago, 2005), and (with Andrew J. Perrin) Guilt and Defense: Theodor Adorno on Postwar German Society (Cambridge, Mass., 2009).

MARY VINCENT is Professor of Modern European History at the University of Sheffield. Her recent publications include Spain 1833–2002: People and State (Oxford, 2007) and she is currently working on a study of Franco’s “Crusade.”

JAY WINTER is Charles J. Stille Professor of History at Yale University. He is the author of Sites of Memory, Sites of Mourning: The Great War in European Cultural History (Cambridge, 1995), and (with Emmanuel Sivan) the editor of War and Remembrance in the Twentieth Century (Cambridge, 1999).

EVIATAR ZERUBAVEL is Board of Governors Professor of Sociology at Rutgers University. He is the author of nine books, including The Fine Line: Making Distinctions in Everyday Life (Chicago, 1991), Social Mindscapes: An Invitation to Cognitive Sociology (Cambridge, Mass., 1997), Time Maps: Collective Memory and the Social Shape of the Past (Chicago, 2003), and The Elephant in the Room: Silence and Denial in Everyday Life (New York, 2006).
Preface and acknowledgments

We are grateful for the aid and support of the Harry S. Truman Research Institute for the Advancement of Peace of the Hebrew University of Jerusalem, and of the Konrad Adenauer Foundation, without which the development of this book would not have been possible. We thank colleagues who contributed to early meetings and discussions of this theme, and Mishkenot Sha’ananim, which offered a congenial venue for completing this project.

The structure of the book is straightforward. We have aimed at a shift of emphasis in discussions of the general themes of memory and forgetting, by privileging a third element, that surrounding silence and silencing in the way individuals and groups reconfigure the past. In the first part of the book, we offer two multi-disciplinary approaches to silence. We then divide the chapters geographically, into those discussing European, African, and Middle Eastern wars and their aftermath. We have included a chapter on the South African Truth and Reconciliation Commission, on the grounds that the Apartheid regime waged war brutally against its own people. To deny this fact is tantamount to denying the war the Nazis waged against the Jews. To be sure, the institutions of war changed over the twentieth century, but that very mutation is one of the themes of this book.

Recognizing that no one volume can do justice to a subject of manifest importance, we believe these studies, taken as a whole, offer a point of scholarly departure for further research in a field which has become central to our understanding of the ways wars’ survivors make sense of the violent times in which they lived and live.

EFRAT BEN-ZE’EV,
RUTH GINIO,
JAY WINTER
Jerusalem
January 2009