Index

2004 Regulations see clinical trials, 2004 Regulations

acute rejection 17
AIDS see HIV/AIDS
allotransplants
acute rejection management 17
chronic rejection management 17
consent issues, xenotransplantation compared 175
and doctors’ dual role 161
emerging infectious diseases 21
as experimental procedure 66
HAR management 16
microbiological risk of infection 18–19
outline consent to surveillance while on waiting list for 218–219
parallel research with xenotransplantation 119
reasons why xenotransplantation preferable 3, 14
recipient with no other hope 89, 92
risk of infection, xenotransplantation compared 133–134
archiving of samples, surveillance of procedures 193–197
assisted reproductive technologies (ARTs) regulation 105–106
Australia
assisted reproductive technologies (ARTs) regulation 107, 117–118
consent guidance 160–161
counselling guidance 182
definition of xenotransplantation 2
ethical review of experimental procedures 77
gene therapy regulation 112, 113–114, 114–115
health tourism guidance 139–140
information disclosure guidance 171, 175
IVF guidelines 108

NGOs’ guidelines and reports 123, 124
patient advocate, role of 181
public consultation 53–54
surveillance guidance 208
vulnerable patients treatment guidance 96–97
xenotransplant regulation 132–134, 144
Austria, gene therapy regulation 115
Baby Fae case 92, 119
Beck, Ulrich, risk society concept 14
benefit, definition of 69
Better Regulation Task Force guidance on xenotransplant regulation 146
and harm principle 39
Blood, Diane, health tourism case 139–140
blood donations by recipients, surveillance of 200–201
British Medical Association (BMA)
consent guidance 170
consent working party 162
IVF working group 109
BSE crisis
media’s role in 34–35
and precautionary principle 39
risk communication during 29–35
as trans-scientific policy question 32–34
Canada
assisted reproductive technologies (ARTs) regulation 107–108
counselling guidance 182
definition of xenotransplantation 2
ethical review of experimental procedures 77
gene therapy regulation 114–115
human rights guidance 229
information disclosure guidance 175–176
public consultation 52
public health statutes, effectiveness for xenotransplantation regulation 223

© in this web service Cambridge University Press

www.cambridge.org
Canada (cont.)
recipient selection guidance 99
surveillance guidance
  close contacts 195, 201–202
  consent and compliance 212–213
donations of blood, organs, etc. 200–201
  health workers 196, 202–203
human rights 229
  local level generally 192–193
  national level 203
post-mortems 201
recipients 193, 197–198
recipients’ sexual activity 198–200
third parties 214
  xenotransplant regulation 121–122, 134
capacity, statutory test 154–155
chapter summaries 5–12
China, health tourism 139–140
  problems with regulation 141–143
competency for giving consent 150–151, 154–159
  see also recipients, with no other hope
cost–benefit analysis, use of 36–37
  Council for International Organisations of Medical Sciences (CIOMS)
  experimental procedures guidance 76
  guidance on risk evaluation 82
confidence, public see public involvement
consent procedures 211–217
  effect of measures, level of discussion 211–212
  methods 217–228
  specific legislation, need for 217
competency 150–151, 154–159
  see also recipients, with no other hope
government, public see public involvement
health tourism by 140
  problems with regulation 141–143
human rights 229
  chapter summaries 5–12
  Defamation Act 1996 174–175
  effects of measures, level of discussion 211–212
  in the United States 174–175
  'Ulysses Contract' 219
informed decision-making 166–179
  see also information disclosure
  legal framework 150–154
  main issues 150
  patient advocate, role of 181
  public safety 151–154
  summary of issues 185–188
cost–benefit analysis, use of 36–37
  Council for International Organisations of Medical Sciences (CIOMS)
  experimental procedures guidance 76
  guidance on risk evaluation 82
information disclosure guidance
  174–175
information disclosure guidance
  174–175
  as legal process for xenotransplantation 83–84, 131, 173–174
  offers of treatment 94–95
  statutory regime 62
  as legal process for xenotransplantation 83–84, 131, 173–174
  offers of treatment 94–95
  statutory regime 62
  'Ulysses Contract' 219
consent procedures 211–217
  effect of measures, level of discussion 211–212
  methods 217–228
  specific legislation, need for 217
Index

vulnerable patients treatment guidance 93, 95–96
Council of Europe compliance guidance 232
consent guidance 154
 counselling guidance 182
definition of xenotransplantation 2, 66
gene therapy regulation 115–116
human rights guidance 229
information disclosure guidance 175, 187
and precautionary principle 40–41
recipient selection guidance 93–94
recommendations on xenotransplantation outside research 77, 83–84
surveillance guidance 209, 213, 214, 215
third-party consent guidance 184
vulnerable patients treatment guidance 98
xenotransplant guidance 126–127
Council of Science and Society, IVF report 109
criminal law, compliance via 223
decision-making process see also information disclosure
decision-making categories 23–24, 36
doctors’ role 155–156
importance 148
precautionary principle 48–49, 58
public involvement in 47–57
Declaration of Helsinki
compliance with 80, 148
consent guidance 153, 155, 181
doctors’ role, guidance on 160
enactment into law 82–83, 142
experimental procedures guidance 76
information disclosure guidance 168–169
principles for medical research combined with medical care 81–82
recipient selection guidance 97
requirement for informed consent 93
vulnerable patients treatment guidance 95
Department of Health (DH)
committee on biotechnology 120
consent guidance 148
definition of medicinal product 84, 85
disregard of guidance from 87
information disclosure guidance 169, 172, 179
public consultation 51–52
UKXIRA abolition 129–130

vulnerable patients treatment guidance 98
xenotransplant guidance 79, 83, 86, 131
disclosure of information see information disclosure
doctors see also health workers
aim in using experimental procedure 63–64
discretion to offer procedure 62–63, 75, 77, 79, 92–93, 100–102
see also recipients,
doctor–patient relationship and compliance 217
and contract law 219
in medical research 64–65
obtaining consent 163–166
patients with no other hope 155–157
dual role 97, 101, 160
duty to provide information 187
information disclosure by 167–168
informed decision-making, role in 155–156
option to comply with regulatory scheme 78
and patient advocates 181–182
perception of risk, contrast with recipient 26
surveillance and monitoring role 197–198, 201
donor organs see organ donations

Ebola, as cross-species infection 20
enforcement
issue of 190–191, 199–200, 206–207
level of discussion as to effect 211–212
powers in new legislation 228
of surveillance contract 219–220
ethical guidance
experimental procedures 76–77
medical research 81–83
offers of experimental procedures 93
offers of medical research 95–97
ethical norms
challenges to, main issues 150
as theme of book 9–10
European Centre for Disease Prevention and Control
role of 210
website 210
European Commission, and precautionary principle 39
European Convention on Human Rights (ECHR)
individual’s rights to health 44
public health powers compliance 43–44
and surveillance regimes 229–232

© in this web service Cambridge University Press
www.cambridge.org
Index

European Convention on Human Rights and Biomedicine, information disclosure guidance 168
European Union assisted reproductive technologies (ARTs) regulation 110
definition of medicinal product 84
gene therapy regulation 115–116
experimental procedures allotransplants classified as 66 clinical trials distinguished 62
doctors' decision to offer 75, 77, 79, 92–93, 100–102 see also recipients, selection procedures
ethical guidance 76–77
focus on individual patient 62–64
information disclosure requirements 174
interests involved 61
law as to 70–75
legal definitions as to 62–64
as legal process for xenotransplantation 79, 83–84, 131, 174
and medical research, distinction 64–65, 70–73
offers of see offers of experimental procedures
‘one-off’ procedures, legality 70–73
outside clinical trials framework, legality 73–74
regulatory schemes 70–79
review 73–74, 77
and xenotransplantation 78–79
Expert Scientific Group, review of TGN1412 drug trial 186
Feinberg, Joel, notions of harm 40
first-party consent see consent
France assisted reproductive technologies (ARTs) regulation 107
definition of xenotransplantation 2
gene therapy regulation 113–114, 115
information disclosure guidance 175
xenotransplant regulation 121, 135
gene therapy public involvement in decisions as to 51
regulation emerging themes 117–119
government committee recommendations 113–114
international regulation 115–116
NGOs’ guidelines and reports 114–115
pre-clinical 111–113
statutory regulation 115
Gene Therapy Advisory Committee (GTAC)
consent guidance, compliance with 173–174
counselling guidance 182
establishment 113–114
ethical review by 83–84, 86
information disclosure guidance 173, 187
rejection of proposed procedure 174
General Medical Council (GMC)
consent guidance 153, 165–166, 169–170
definition of medicinal product 85
experimental procedures guidance 77
information disclosure guidance 179
vulnerable patients treatment guidance 96
genetically engineered solid organ xenotransplants, legal definitions 65–70
Germany
gene therapy regulation 112, 115
xenotransplant regulation 121, 136
global issues
global regulation 143
global risks as theme of book 10–11
problems with regulation 138–140
Glover Report on new reproductive technologies 112
GM crops public involvement in decisions as to 49–50
public suspicion of 29
harm principle application of 39–40, 45, 235, 238
Feinberg’s notions of harm 40
and precautionary principle 15, 39, 57–58, 185, 231
prevention of harm, issue of 4–5
public health measures and 43–44
and risk 23
and xenotransplantation 40–42
health tourism discussions on 209
problems with regulation 138–140
health workers see also doctors

occupational health service (OHS), access to 196–197
surveillance of 196–197, 202–203

HIV/AIDS
as cross-species infection 20
deliberate infection with, criminal law sanctions 223
latent effect 18
retroviral action 20

Hong Kong, SARS epidemic 34

Human Fertilisation and Embryology Authority, establishment 107

human rights see also individual, rights of compliance of new legislation with 226 consideration of 191 limitation of 240–241 Siracusa Principles, applicability of 232 and surveillance 228 as theme of book 11–12

Human T cell Lymphotropic Virus, as cross-species infection 20

hyperacute rejection (HAR) 16

ICH guidelines
experimental procedures guidance 82
information disclosure guidance 169
vulnerable patients treatment guidance 96

immunological barriers 16–17
India, health tourism 139–140
individual patient see also recipients
consent see consent
focus of experimental procedures on 62–64
and harm principle 39–40, 41–42
imposition of risks on other persons, permissibility 90
perception of risk changes in 26
contrast with health professionals 26
rights of
infringement of, prohibition of xenotransplantation as 46–47
interaction with public health 4–5, 6, 9, 15, 44, 151–154, 238 see also surveillance and monitoring
prioritisation of 238–239
respect for 11–12
relationship with doctor see doctors
infections
control methods 189
from pig organs see PERVs; pig organs risk, allotransplants and xenotransplants compared 133–134

transmission of across species, examples 20
potential for 21–23
risk evaluation 19–21
influenza
as cross-species infection 20
speed of response to epidemics 210–211

information disclosure
content of disclosure 168–172
decision to disclose 167–168
information overload, problem of 178–179
plain English, use of 166
to recipients 172–177
standards for 166–179
informed consent see consent; decision-making process
innovative practice, legal definitions of 62–64

International Conference on
Harmonisation of Technical Requirements for Registration of Pharmaceuticals for Human Use (ICH) see ICH guidelines
International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights, departure from 232
International Society for Heart and Lung Transplantation, xenotransplantation recommendations 123–124
International Xenotransplantation Association (IXA)
on importance of public involvement 54
surveillance guidance 213
on withdrawal of consent 217
on xenotransplantation monitoring 23
investigator, doctors’ dual role 97, 101, 160
Ireland, ‘significant risk’ defined in case law 167

Italy, IVF code of practice 109

IVF, regulation of
consent schemes, statutory regulation 187
emerging themes 117–119
government committee recommendations 107–108
international regulation 110
NGOs’ guidelines and reports 108–109
pre-clinical 104–106 recommendations by World Congress 110
statutory regulation 109
286 Index

Japan, gene therapy regulation 114–115
known infections, transmission of, risk evaluation 19–21
legal definitions as to medical research 62–70
legal norms
challenges to, main issues 150
as theme of book 9–10
legislation see regulation
Louise Brown, birth of, regulatory response 106, 107–108
media
and BSE crisis 34–35
risk communication 26–28
and SARS epidemic 34
medical research see also clinical trials; experimental procedures
doctor–patient relationship 64–65
ethical guidance 81–83
and experimental procedures, distinction 64–65, 70–73
form of statutory regime 62
interests involved 61
law as to 80
legal definitions as to 62–70
offers of see offers of medical research regulatory schemes 80–87
and xenotransplantation 83–87
Medical Research Council (MRC)
ethical review of experimental procedures 105
IVF working group 105, 108
medicinal product, legal definitions 84–86
Medicines and Healthcare Products Regulation Agency (MHRA)
authorisation of clinical trials 80, 83–84
definition of medicinal product 85
Mexico, health tourism 139–140
microbiological barriers 18–19
Mill, John Stuart see harm principle
monitoring see surveillance and monitoring
National Expert Panel on New and Emerging Infections (NEPNEI), and xeno-tourism issue 209
National Institute for Health and Clinical Excellence (NICE)
effectiveness of guidance 102
experimental procedures guidance 93
information disclosure guidance 170, 174
notification to 174
review of experimental procedures 73–74
National Research Ethics Service (NRES)
consent guidance, compliance with 173–174
information disclosure guidance 169, 187
rejection of proposed procedure 174
review by 83–84
Netherlands
assisted reproductive technologies (ARTs) regulation 107
gene therapy regulation 112, 113–114, 115
information disclosure guidance 175
IVF regulation 109
surveillance guidance 198, 215
third-party consent guidance 184–185
xenotransplant regulation 121, 135–136
new variant CJD see CJD
New Zealand
consent, independent person's role in procedure 181
definition of xenotransplantation 2
ethical review of experimental procedures 77
information disclosure guidance 171, 175, 187
innovative practice, definition 63–64
NGOs' guidelines and reports 123
review of experimental procedures 74
surveillance guidance 208–209
vulnerable patients treatment guidance 97
xenotransplant regulation 122, 125, 134–135
Nipah virus, potential for infection 21
Norway
IVF regulation 109
surveillance guidance 208
xenotransplant regulation 120–121
Nuffield Council on Bioethics
consultation on xenotransplantation 123
definition of xenotransplantation 65–66
disregard of guidance from 87
guidance on treatment of patients with no other hope 91
human rights guidance 235
information disclosure report 177, 178
and precautionary principle 41
public consultation 51
risk management guidance 36
occupational health service (OHS), access to 196–197
Index

offers of experimental procedures 93
and harm principle 15, 39, 57–58, 185, 231
ethical guidance 93
SARS epidemic 232
law as to regulation of xenotransplantation 40–42, 154, 231, 232
prohibition of developing technology as infringement of recipients’ autonomy 46–47
precedent for 45–46
public health issues aspects relevant to xenotransplantation 15
organs
characteristics of public health measures 43–44
devotions in approach to 43–45
interaction with individual patient’s rights 4–5, 6, 9, 15, 44, 151–154
prioritisation of needs 238–239
as theme of book 10–11
and xenotransplantation 45–47
public health law, compliance via 220–223
public health measures and harm principle 43–44
justificatory conditions 190
public involvement
BSE crisis 29–35
in consultation on xenotransplantation 51–54
in decision-making process 47–57
gap between expert and public perceptions of risk 26
GM crops 29
increase in consultation 7
and individual’s right to give consent 151–154
need for consultation 6–7, 239–240
and risk communication 25–26
as theme of book 6–7
trust and confidence issues as to risk 28–29
understanding of science issues, need for 14
‘Xeno Nation’ debate 55–56
in xenotransplant decisions 54–57

patient see individual patient

consent, obtaining see consent

recipients see also individual patient

close contacts, surveillance of 195–196,
201–202
consent, obtaining see consent
existing protection, whether sufficient 4–5
information disclosure to 172–177
infringement of autonomy of 46–47
perception of risk, contrast with health professionals 26

organ donation
pig organs see pig organs
by recipients, surveillance of 200–201
shortage of, xenotransplantation as viable solution 5, 14
organ rejection, types of 16
Organization for Economic Co-operation and Development (OECD)
surveillance guidance 205, 210, 213
‘Ulysses contract’ 219
xenotransplant guidance 125–126

PERVs
action of 19–20
effects of 20
infection from 19–21
listing as notifiable disease 210
potential for infection 21–23
physiological barriers 17–18
pig organs
infection from see also PERVs
microbiological risks 18–19
unknown viruses 21
physiological differences to human organs 17–18
rejection 16–19
as source of xeno-organs 16
Plain English Campaign, role in drafting patient information 166
Pontifical Academy for Life, recommendations on xenotransplantation 123
porcine endogenous retroviruses see PERVs
post-mortems of recipients, surveillance regimes 200–201
precautionary principle
application of 37–39, 238
clinical trials 57
and decision-making 48–49, 58

SARS epidemic
and xenotransplantation 40–42, 154

and harm principle

and time principle

and justification principle

and precautionary principle

as infringement of recipients’ autonomy

as theme of book

as theme of book
recipients (cont.)
with no other hope
allotransplants 89, 92
benefit to, definition of 69
competency for giving consent
153–157, 166, 177–178
competency status 157–159
ethical guidance as to 93, 96–97
health status 75, 77
obtaining consent from, approach to
180–181, 241
selection of 61–62, 88–92, 97, 98–99
vulnerable patients, definition of 93
selection procedures
regulation generally 87–92
xenotransplantation 90–92
surveillance of
donations of blood, organs, etc. 200–201
post-mortems 200–201
sample storage 200–201
sampling 193–195
sexual activity 198–200
vulnerable patients, definition of 93
regulation see also compliance;
 enforcement; legal norms;
surveillance and monitoring
approaches to devising 117–119, 243–246
of consent see consent
doctors’ option to follow 78
existing protection, whether sufficient
4–5
forms of 61
gene therapy see gene therapy
global issues see global issues
and human rights see human rights
IVF see IVF, regulation of
legal definitions as to medical research
62–70
main issues 61–62, 103–104
new legislation, introduction 226–228
of offers of experimental procedures
92–94
of offers of medical research 94–99
problems with regulation 103–104,
138–143
regulatory schemes 70–87
review and recommendations for reform
80
of selection procedures 87–92
strengthening of 242–243
summary of issues 99–102, 144–147
as theme of book 7–8
xenotransplantation
development of regulation 119–127
government committee
recommendations 120–122
implementation legislation 135–137
implementation of recommendations
127–138
international implementing legislation
137–138
international regulation 125–127
national committees 128–135
NGOs’ guidelines and reports 123–124
pre-clinical 119–125
statutory regulation 124–125
rejection of organs see organ rejection
reproductive cloning, prohibition of 45–46
research ethics committees (RECs)
approval from 76, 79, 80, 81, 82, 94, 97
consent guidance 164
problems with 87
review by 73, 77, 81, 83–84, 86, 96,
98–99, 100
role of 130–131
research not under 2004 Regulations
consent 179
information disclosure requirements 174
as legal process for xenotransplantation
83–84, 131, 174
retroviruses see PERVs
risk see also global issues
assessment 19–42
balance with benefits 14, 45, 66–69
communication
complexity of issues 24–25
gap between expert and public
perceptions 26
by media 26–28
public understanding of 25–26
perceptions 26
decision-making categories 23–24, 36
evaluation 19–23
and harm 23
main issues 14–16
management 35–42, 238–240
see also cost–benefit analysis;
harm principle; precautionary
principle
management principles 35–36
manufactured risk, xenotransplantation
as 24
need to address 237–238, 245
perception of see individual patient
and public health issues 43–47
and public involvement 47–57
regulation of, xenotransplantation as
example of 4
Index

risk society concept (Beck) 14
significant risk, definition 167
summary of issues 57–60
technological risks, characteristics of 24
as theme of book 5–6
trust and confidence issues 28–29
Royal College of Obstetricians and
Gynaecologists (RCOG), IVF guidelines 109
Royal College of Physicians (RCP)
ethical review of experimental procedures 77
information disclosure guidance 169, 170
innovative practice guidance 64
vulnerable patients treatment guidance 96
samples
storage, surveillance of procedures 193–197
taking of, surveillance of procedures 200–201
SARS epidemic
ability to monitor 189–190
media–government relationship 34
and precautionary principle 232
responses to 228
speed of response 210–211
selection of recipients see recipients
Sense About Science
establishment of 26
report on presentation of treatment claims 157
sexual activity of recipients, surveillance of 198–200
significant risk, definition 167
Siracusa Principles, applicability 232
Spain
assisted reproductive technologies (ARTs) regulation 107
IVF regulation 109
xenotransplant regulation 121, 128
Strategy Unit, risk management principles 35–36
surveillance and monitoring see also enforcement
of archiving procedures 193–197
of close contacts 195–196, 201–202
compliance methods 217–228
consent to 206–207, 211–217, 218–220
doctors’ role 197–198, 201, 217

and ECHR 229–232
effectiveness 205–208
of health workers 196–197, 202–203
and human rights 228
international collaboration, need for 190–191
international level 204–205
local level 192–203
main issues 189–191
national level 203–204
need for 189
post-2000 regimes 208–211
pre-2000 proposed regimes 191–205
publication of guidance 41, 191–192
of recipients 193–195, 197–201
see also recipients
of sampling procedures 193–197
strengthening of 241–242
summary of issues 233–236
surveillance contract, enforcement 219–220
Sweden
consent, independent person’s role in procedure 181
definition of xenotransplantation 2
gene therapy regulation 113–114
information disclosure guidance 175
IVF regulation 109
public consultation 53
vulnerable patients treatment guidance 99
xenotransplant regulation 120–121
swine flu
as cross-species infection 20
as pandemic 154
swine hepatitis E virus, potential for infection 21
Switzerland
definition of xenotransplantation 2
direct democracy 47
IVF regulation 109
xenotransplant regulation 121, 136–137

technological imperative 4, 12–13, 44–45
TGN1412 drug trial, suspension of 186
therapeutic research, definition of 65–66
third-party consent
compliance 214–216
need for 150
procedure 183–185
Index

World Health Assembly (WHA), xenotransplant guidance 125–126
World Health Organization (WHO)
counselling guidance 182
definition of xenotransplantation 2
experimental procedures guidance 66, 76, 100
guidance on risk evaluation 82
human rights guidance 229
information disclosure guidance 169
International Health Regulations 211
principles on xenotransplants, UK compliance with 83–84
surveillance guidance 205, 206, 210, 242
‘Ulysses contract’ 219
vulnerable patients treatment guidance 93, 95–96, 98
xenotransplant guidance 125–126, 137–138
xenotransplantation inventory website 209

‘Xeno Nation’ debate 55–56
xeno-recipients see recipients
xeno-tourism
discussions on 209
problems with regulation 138–140

xenotransplantation
barriers to successful transplant 3–4, 16–19
consent see consent
definitions 1–2
and ethical norms see ethical norms
focus on 4–5
and human rights see human rights
and individual rights see individual, rights of
legal methods for performing 83–84, 173–175
and legal norms see legal norms
potential benefits 3
process of 1–4
public health issues see public health issues
public involvement see public involvement
purpose of book 1, 12–13
recipients see recipients
regulation of see regulation
results to date 15
risks from see global issues; risk science of 16–19
summary of issues 237–246
technological imperative 4, 12–13
themes of book 5–12
as viable solution to donor shortage 5