

Cambridge University Press  
978-0-521-19545-4 - Control as Movement  
Cedric Boeckx, Norbert Hornstein and Jairo Nunes  
Frontmatter  
[More information](#)

---

## CONTROL AS MOVEMENT

The movement theory of control (MTC) makes one major claim: that control relations in sentences like ‘John wants to leave’ are grammatically mediated by movement. This goes against the traditional view that such sentences involve not movement, but binding, and analogizes control to raising, albeit with one important distinction: whereas the target of movement in control structures is a theta position, in raising it is a non-theta position; however, the grammatical procedures underlying the two constructions are the same. This book presents the main arguments for MTC and shows it to have many theoretical advantages, the biggest being that it reduces the kinds of grammatical operations that the grammar allows, an important advantage in a minimalist setting. It also addresses the main arguments against MTC, using examples from control shift, adjunct control, and the control structure of “promise,” showing MTC to be conceptually, theoretically, and empirically superior to other approaches.

CEDRIC BOECKX is Research Professor at the Catalan Institute for Advanced Studies (ICREA), and a member of the Center for Theoretical Linguistics at the Universitat Autònoma de Barcelona.

NORBERT HORNSTEIN is Professor in the Department of Linguistics at the University of Maryland, College Park.

JAIRO NUNES is Professor in the Department of Linguistics at the Universidade de São Paulo, Brazil.

Cambridge University Press  
 978-0-521-19545-4 - Control as Movement  
 Cedric Boeckx, Norbert Hornstein and Jairo Nunes  
 Frontmatter  
[More information](#)

### *In this series*

- 81 ROGER LASS: *Historical linguistics and language change*
- 82 JOHN M. ANDERSON: *A notional theory of syntactic categories*
- 83 BERND HEINE: *Possession: cognitive sources, forces and grammaticalization*
- 84 NOMI ERTESCHIK-SHIR: *The dynamics of focus structure*
- 85 JOHN COLEMAN: *Phonological representations: their names, forms and powers*
- 86 CHRISTINA Y. BETHIN: *Slavic prosody: language change and phonological theory*
- 87 BARBARA DANCYGIER: *Conditionals and prediction*
- 88 CLAIRE LEFEBVRE: *Creole genesis and the acquisition of grammar: the case of Haitian creole*
- 89 HEINZ GIEGERICH: *Lexical strata in English*
- 90 KEREN RICE: *Morpheme order and semantic scope*
- 91 APRIL McMAHON: *Lexical phonology and the history of English*
- 92 MATTHEW Y. CHEN: *Tone Sandhi: patterns across Chinese dialects*
- 93 GREGORY T. STUMP: *Inflectional morphology: a theory of paradigm structure*
- 94 JOAN BYBEE: *Phonology and language use*
- 95 LAURIE BAUER: *Morphological productivity*
- 96 THOMAS ERNST: *The syntax of adjuncts*
- 97 ELIZABETH CLOSS TRAUGOTT and RICHARD B. DASHER: *Regularity in semantic change*
- 98 MAYA HICKMANN: *Children's discourse: person, space and time across languages*
- 99 DIANE BLAKEMORE: *Relevance and linguistic meaning: the semantics and pragmatics of discourse markers*
- 100 IAN ROBERTS and ANNA ROUSSOU: *Syntactic change: a minimalist approach to grammaticalization*
- 101 DONKA MINKOVA: *Alliteration and sound change in early English*
- 102 MARK C. BAKER: *Lexical categories: verbs, nouns and adjectives*
- 103 CARLOTA S. SMITH: *Modes of discourse: the local structure of texts*
- 104 ROCHELLE LIEBER: *Morphology and lexical semantics*
- 105 HOLGER DIESSEL: *The acquisition of complex sentences*
- 106 SHARON INKELAS and CHERYL ZOLL: *Reduplication: doubling in morphology*
- 107 SUSAN EDWARDS: *Fluent aphasia*
- 108 BARBARA DANCYGIER and EVE SWEETSER: *Mental spaces in grammar: conditional constructions*
- 109 HEW BAERMAN, DUNSTAN BROWN, and GREVILLE G. CORBETT: *The syntax-morphology interface: a study of syncretism*
- 110 MARCUS TOMALIN: *Linguistics and the formal sciences: the origins of generative grammar*
- 111 SAMUEL D. EPSTEIN and T. DANIEL SEELY: *Derivations in minimalism*
- 112 PAUL DE LACY: *Markedness: reduction and preservation in phonology*
- 113 YEHUDA N. FALK: *Subjects and their properties*
- 114 P. H. MATTHEWS: *Syntactic relations: a critical survey*
- 115 MARK C. BAKER: *The syntax of agreement and concord*
- 116 GILLIAN CATRIONA RAMCHAND: *Verb meaning and the lexicon: a first phase syntax*
- 117 PIETER MUYSKEN: *Functional categories*
- 118 JUAN URIAGEREKA: *Syntactic anchors: on semantic structuring*
- 119 D. ROBERT LADD: *Intonational phonology, second edition*
- 120 LEONARD H. BABBY: *The syntax of argument structure*
- 121 B. ELAN DRESHER: *The contrastive hierarchy in phonology*
- 122 DAVID ADGER, DANIEL HARBOUR, and LAUREL J. WATKINS: *Mirrors and microparameters: phrase structure beyond free word order*
- 123 NIINA NING ZHANG: *Coordination in syntax*
- 124 NEIL SMITH: *Acquiring phonology*
- 125 NINA TOPINTZI: *Onsets: suprasegmental and prosodic behaviour*
- 126 CEDRIC BOECKX, NORBERT HORNSTEIN, and JAIRÓ NUNES: *Control as movement*

*Earlier issues not listed are also available*

Cambridge University Press  
978-0-521-19545-4 - Control as Movement  
Cedric Boeckx, Norbert Hornstein and Jairo Nunes  
Frontmatter  
[More information](#)

---

CAMBRIDGE STUDIES IN LINGUISTICS

*General editors:* P. AUSTIN, J. BRESNAN, B. COMRIE,  
S. CRAIN, W. DRESSLER, C. J. EWEN, R. LASS,  
D. LIGHTFOOT, K. RICE, I. ROBERTS,  
S. ROMAINÉ, N. V. SMITH

---

*Control as Movement*

Cambridge University Press  
978-0-521-19545-4 - Control as Movement  
Cedric Boeckx, Norbert Hornstein and Jairo Nunes  
Frontmatter  
[More information](#)

---

# CONTROL AS MOVEMENT

CEDRIC BOECKX

*ICREA/Universitat Autònoma de Barcelona*

NORBERT HORNSTEIN

*University of Maryland, College Park*

JAIRO NUNES

*Universidade de São Paulo, Brazil*



CAMBRIDGE  
UNIVERSITY PRESS

Cambridge University Press  
 978-0-521-19545-4 - Control as Movement  
 Cedric Boeckx, Norbert Hornstein and Jairo Nunes  
 Frontmatter  
[More information](#)

CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY PRESS

Cambridge, New York, Melbourne, Madrid, Cape Town, Singapore,  
 São Paulo, Delhi, Dubai, Tokyo, Mexico City

Cambridge University Press  
 The Edinburgh Building, Cambridge CB2 8RU, UK

Published in the United States of America by Cambridge University Press, New York

[www.cambridge.org](http://www.cambridge.org)

Information on this title: [www.cambridge.org/9780521195454](http://www.cambridge.org/9780521195454)

© Cedric Boeckx, Norbert Hornstein, and Jairo Nunes 2010

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception  
 and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements,  
 no reproduction of any part may take place without the written  
 permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2010

Printed in the United Kingdom at the University Press, Cambridge

*A catalog record for this publication is available from the British Library*

*Library of Congress Cataloging in Publication data*

Boeckx, Cedric.

Control as movement / Cedric Boeckx, Norbert Hornstein, Jairo Nunes.

p. cm. – (Cambridge studies in linguistics ; 126)

Includes bibliographical references and index.

ISBN 978-0-521-19545-4 (hardback)

1. Control (Linguistics) 2. Generative grammar. 3. Grammar, Comparative and  
 general – Sentences. 4. Grammar, Comparative and general – Word order.

5. Grammar, Comparative and general – Syntax. I. Hornstein, Norbert. II. Nunes,  
 Jairo. III. Title. IV. Series.

P299.C596B63 2010

415 – dc22 2010020575

ISBN 978-0-521-19545-4 Hardback

---

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or  
 accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to  
 in this publication, and does not guarantee that any content on such  
 websites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.

---

Contents

	<i>Acknowledgments</i>	<i>page x</i>
<b>1</b>	<b>Introduction</b>	<b>1</b>
<b>2</b>	<b>Some historical background</b>	<b>5</b>
2.1	Introduction	5
2.2	What any theory of control should account for	5
2.3	Control in the standard-theory framework	6
2.4	Control in GB	9
2.5	Non-movement approaches to control within minimalism	16
	2.5.1 The null-case approach	16
	2.5.2 The Agree approach	20
2.6	Conclusion	35
<b>3</b>	<b>Basic properties of the movement theory of control</b>	<b>36</b>
3.1	Introduction	36
3.2	Departing from the null hypothesis: historical, architectural, and empirical reasons	37
3.3	Back to the future: elimination of DS and the revival of the null hypothesis	43
3.4	Controlled PROs as A-movement traces	46
	3.4.1 Configurational properties	47
	3.4.2 Interpretive properties	49
	3.4.3 Phonetic properties and grammatical status	52
3.5	Conclusion	56
<b>4</b>	<b>Empirical advantages</b>	<b>59</b>
4.1	Introduction	59
4.2	Morphological invisibility	59
4.3	Interclausal agreement	60
4.4	Finite control	63
	4.4.1 Finite control and hyper-raising	70

Cambridge University Press  
 978-0-521-19545-4 - Control as Movement  
 Cedric Boeckx, Norbert Hornstein and Jairo Nunes  
 Frontmatter  
[More information](#)

viii *Contents*

4.4.2	Finite control, islands, and intervention effects	75
4.4.3	Summary	79
4.5	The movement theory of control under the copy theory of movement	79
4.5.1	Adjunct control and sideward movement	83
4.5.2	The movement theory of control and morphological restrictions on copies	98
4.5.3	Backward control	102
4.5.4	Phonetic realization of multiple copies and copy control	115
4.6	Conclusion	123
<b>5</b>	<b>Empirical challenges and solutions</b>	<b>125</b>
5.1	Introduction	125
5.2	Passives, obligatory control, and Visser's generalization	125
5.2.1	Relativizing A-movement	127
5.2.2	Impersonal passives	132
5.2.3	Finite control vs. hyper-raising	136
5.3	Nominals and control	141
5.3.1	Finite control into noun-complement clauses in Brazilian Portuguese	142
5.3.2	Raising into nominals in Hebrew	147
5.3.3	The contrast between raising nominals and control nominals in English	149
5.4	Obligatory control and morphological case	152
5.4.1	Quirky case and the contrast between raising and control in Icelandic	152
5.4.2	Apparent case-marked PROs	160
5.5	The minimal-distance principle, control shift, and the logic of minimality	169
5.5.1	Control with promise-type verbs	171
5.5.2	Control shift	176
5.5.3	Summary	181
5.6	Partial and split control	182
5.6.1	Partial control	183
5.6.2	Split control	190
5.7	Conclusion	194
<b>6</b>	<b>On non-obligatory control</b>	<b>195</b>
6.1	Introduction	195
6.2	Obligatory vs. non-obligatory control and economy computations	196
6.3	Some problems	202
6.4	A proposal	204
6.5	Conclusion	209

Cambridge University Press  
978-0-521-19545-4 - Control as Movement  
Cedric Boeckx, Norbert Hornstein and Jairo Nunes  
Frontmatter  
[More information](#)

*Contents* ix

<b>7</b>	<b>Some notes on semantic approaches to control</b>	<b>210</b>
7.1	Introduction	210
7.2	General problems with selectional approaches to obligatory control	210
7.3	“Simpler syntax”	216
	7.3.1 Some putative problems for the movement theory of control	217
	7.3.2 Challenges for “simpler syntax”	226
7.4	Conclusion	237
<b>8</b>	<b>The movement theory of control and the minimalist program</b>	<b>238</b>
8.1	Introduction	238
8.2	Movement within minimalism and the movement theory of control	239
8.3	The movement theory of control and the minimalist architecture of UG	241
8.4	Inclusiveness, bare phrase structure, and the movement theory of control	245
8.5	Conclusion	248
	<i>References</i>	250
	<i>Index</i>	261



Cambridge University Press  
978-0-521-19545-4 - Control as Movement  
Cedric Boeckx, Norbert Hornstein and Jairo Nunes  
Frontmatter  
[More information](#)

---

## *Acknowledgments*

---

Previous versions of (part of) the material discussed here have been presented at the following universities: Connecticut, Harvard, Leiden, Lisbon, Maryland, New York, Rutgers, São Paulo, Stony Brook, Tilburg, and Utrecht; and at the following meetings: ANPOLL 2003, XVIII Colloquium on Generative Grammar, Edges in Syntax, EVELIN 2004, GLOW XXX, Going Romance 2007, LSA 2005, Romania Nova II, Ways of Structure Building, and V Workshop on Formal Linguistics at USP. We would like to thank these audiences for comments and suggestions. Special thanks to Željko Bošković, Hans Broekhuis, Lisa Cheng, Marcelo Ferreira, Michaël Gagnon, Terje Lohndal, Carme Picallo, and Johan Rooryck.

We would also like to acknowledge the support received from the Generalitat de Catalunya (grant 2009SGR1079; first author), NSF (grant NSD.BCS.0722648; second author), and CNPq and FAPESP (grants 302262/2008–3 and 2006/00965–2; third author).