In the early part of the twentieth century, China was on the brink of change. Different ideologies – those of radicalism, conservatism, liberalism and social democracy – were much debated in political and intellectual circles. Whereas previous works have analysed these trends in isolation, Edmund S. K. Fung shows how they related to each other and how intellectuals in China engaged according to their different cultural and political persuasions. In fact, the author argues, Republican ideologies are best understood as a triad of liberal, radical and conservative thought, which arose at about the same time and in similar circumstances, each a modern response to the challenges of modernity. It is this interrelatedness and the interplay between different schools of thought that are central to the understanding of Chinese modernity, for many of the debates which began in the Republican era still resonate in China today. The book charts the development of these different ideologies and explores the work and influence of intellectuals who were associated with them. In its challenge to previous scholarship and the breadth of its approach, the book promises to make a major contribution to the study of Chinese political philosophy and intellectual history.

The Intellectual Foundations of Chinese Modernity

Cultural and Political Thought in the Republican Era

EDMUND S. K. FUNG

University of Western Sydney
To my wife, Lucia

my son, Eugene

and

my grandchildren, Harry, Emma, and Daniel
Contents

Acknowledgements ix
Abbreviations xiii
A Note on Romanization xv

Introduction 1
Towards an Understanding of Chinese Modernity 5
Some Methodological Issues 13
A Community of Critical Intellectuals 18
The Main Arguments of the Book 20
The Structure of the Book 24

1 The Push of Westernized Radicalism 27
The Early East–West Debate 31
The Advocacy of Thorough Westernization 37
Total Westernization: The Advocacy of a Fervent Nationalist 46
The Decline of Westernized Radicalism 56
A Critique of Westernized Radicalism 58

2 The Pull of Cultural Conservatism 61
The Rise of Modern Chinese Conservatism 63
Easternization: The Quest for Cultural Equality 72
Central Themes of the Conservative Counter-Discourse 76
Tiaohelun: The Doctrine of Mediation and Harmony 84
New Confucianism 90
Reflections on Cultural Conservatism 93

3 The Politics of Modern Chinese Conservatism 96
Nationalism, Modernity and Politicocultural Nationalism 98
### Contents

**The Politicocultural Thought of Liang Shuming and Zhang Junmai**
- 103

**The Politics of China-Based Cultural Reconstruction**
- 113

**Wartime Politicocultural Nationalism**
- 117

**The Political Thought of the Warring States Group**
- 120

**Conclusion**
- 126

4 **Liberalism in China and Chinese Liberal Thought**
- 128

**The Rise of Chinese Liberalism**
- 130

**The Liberals as a Differentiated Category**
- 134

**How Was Liberalism Understood in Modern China?**
- 138

**The Features and Specific Concerns of Chinese Liberal Thought**
- 146

**Liberal Thought, Cultural Radicalism, Cultural Conservatism**
- 157

5 **The State, Government and the Rule of Law**
- 159

**What Did a Strong Chinese State Mean?**
- 161

**Omnipotent Government and Government with a Plan**
- 167

**Good Government and Government by ‘Good Men’**
- 171

**The Rule of Law**
- 182

**Conclusion**
- 189

6 **The Rise of Reformist Socialist Thought**
- 191

**The Socialist Discourse, 1919**
- 193

**The 1920 Controversy: Capitalism Versus Socialism**
- 199

**Zhang Junmai and the German Influence**
- 205

**The Influence of British Socialism**
- 211

**A Liberal Response to the Soviet Experiment of the 1920s**
- 213

**Protosocialism in Ancient Chinese Thought**
- 219

**Conclusion**
- 222

7 **From State Socialism to Social Democracy**
- 224

**State Socialist Thought to 1945**
- 226

**Postwar Social Democratic Thought**
- 238

**A Comparative Perspective**
- 253

**Conclusion**
- 256

**Glossary**
- 269

**Selected Bibliography**
- 281

**Index**
- 307
Acknowledgements

This book has been six years in the works. In its early days, the project began on a modest scale, supported by a grant from the University of Western Sydney’s Research Committee in 2004. In the following year, it developed into a more ambitious project when I secured funding from the Australian Research Council as an ARC Discovery Project for the next three years. In 2008, I was on a Professional Development Programme (study leave) during the autumn semester, which enabled me to complete the project and produce a full manuscript for review by Cambridge University Press. I am most grateful to the Australian Research Council and to the University of Western Sydney for their financial support over the years.

The bulk of the research for this book was carried out in China and Taiwan. During my numerous visits to the Institute of Modern History, Chinese Academy of Social Sciences, Beijing, I enjoyed the academic hospitality of the former director of the Institute, Professor Zhang Haipeng. Two members of the Institute, Professors Zheng Dahua and Zuo Yuhe, shared their thoughts with me on various questions of interest. I have also benefited from their prolific works on Chinese intellectual history of the Republican era. Through these three men I have been invited to several international conferences on modern Chinese intellectual history held on the mainland. To all of them I here convey my sincere thanks. My research in China also took me to Beijing University. The assistance of the Beida Library staff is gratefully acknowledged.

I made frequent visits to Academia Sinica in Taiwan during the past six years. I was attached to its Institute of Modern History, whose former director, Professor Chen Yung-fa, has been of great help to me. He treated me as more than a visiting scholar and made me feel most welcome. Indeed, I felt like I was coming home, or binzhi rugui, as the Chinese
Acknowledgements

put it. I am most grateful to him and to his wife, perfect hosts. Also at the Institute of Modern History is my old friend, Professor Chang Peng-yuan, many years my senior, whom I still call laoshi. Now retired, but still doing research in a relaxed manner, Professor Chang, more than anyone, has given me a great deal of encouragement and moral support. There is another old friend, Professor Chu Hung-yuan, who invited me to several conferences held in Taipei and to dinners with his friends and family members, which I enjoyed very much. I would also like to mention Dr Pan Kuang-che, who has arranged for me to present semesters at the Institute and assisted me in locating some materials on Hu Shi.

I should thank two other members of Academia Sinica: First, Professor Wang Fan-sen, the former director of the Institute of History and Philosophy and now a vice president of Academia Sinica, has been extremely kind to me. His calligraphy provides the frontispiece of this book. Second is Dr Caroline Hui-yu Ts’ai of the Institute of Taiwan Historical Studies, a friend dating back to the early 1990s. She arranged for my accommodation at the Academic Activities Centre and went to great lengths to ensure that my stay in Taipei was comfortable. She has also helped me in many other ways.

This book has left out Marxism for reasons given in the introduction. Nonetheless, I am grateful to my former colleague, Professor Nick Knight, now retired, for sharing his thoughts with me on the ultimate triumph of Marxism over liberal, conservative and non-Marxist socialist thought in the Republican era. I sought his advice while he was on holiday in Tasmania in February 2009. He promptly provided it to me.

The manuscript has gone through many drafts. Dr Peter Zarrow of the Institute of Modern History, Academia Sinica, read an early draft of the introduction. Professor Edward Krebs, now retired, read a later draft of the introduction and also shared his thoughts with me on several papers that were published and eventually became parts of the book. Professor Chang Peng-yuan read nearly the entire manuscript. I thank all of them for their comments and suggestions. Special thanks go to the two anonymous Cambridge University Press readers, who were rigorous in reviewing the manuscript and made the most constructive criticisms. They will find that all their comments and suggestions have been considered and many have been incorporated into the book, although I maintain my own position on some points and issues. It goes without saying that none of the individuals mentioned here is in any way responsible for the opinions I have expressed or for any errors of fact or judgement that I may have committed.
Some of the ideas canvassed in this book were first raised at various international conferences held in Beijing, Yantai, Sydney, Christchurch and Dunedun, and at seminars given at the Institute of Modern History, Academia Sinica, and at the National Central University (Taiwan). Thanks are due to many people who have generously given me their comments.

Earlier versions of chapters or parts of chapters in this book appeared in the following publications.


Permissions from the publishers listed above to make use of these materials are gratefully acknowledged.

At Cambridge University Press, Marigold Acland, the Senior Commissioning Editor for the Middle East, Asia and Islamic Studies, deserves special thanks. It has been a privilege and a pleasure working with her on the book. I should also thank the production editor, Sarah Green, for her advice, and the copy editor, Laura Tendler, for removing some of the stylistic infelicities and making the book more readable. To Peggy Rote, project manager at Aptara, I also say many thanks for her help in numerous ways. Not least of all, this book has benefited from the expertise of Joan Curtis, who carefully proofread it at the final stages.

Finally, I owe more than I can express to my wife, Lucia, for her patience, understanding and support over the years. I dedicate the book to her as well as to my son and grandchildren.
Abbreviations

CCP     The Chinese Communist Party (Zhongguo Gongchandang 中共党中央)
DXWC    Du Xiu wencon (The collected works of Chen Du Xiu) 德秀文存
DYQWC   Du Yaquan wencon (The collected works of Du Yaquan) 杜亚泉文存
GMD     The Chinese Nationalist Party (Zhongguo Guomindang 中国国民党)
HSWJ    Hu Shi wenji (The collected works of Hu Shi) 惠施文集
LQCQJ   Liang Qichao quanji (The complete works of Liang Qichao) 梁启超全集
LSMQJ   Liang Shuming quanji (The complete works of Liang Shuming) 梁漱溟全集
PRC     The People’s Republic of China
ZSZQJ   Zhang Shizhao quanji (The complete works of Zhang Shizhao) 张士钊全集
A Note on Romanization

The *pinyin* system is used throughout for transliterating Chinese names and terms, with some exceptions for personal names that are long familiar in the West, notably Chiang Kai-shek, Sun Yat-sen, H. H. Kung (Kong Xiangxi) and T. V. Soong (Song Ziwen), and that are used by the authors themselves in their English writings, such as Hao Chang and Yü Ying-shih. In the footnotes and in the Bibliography, however, the *pinyin* system is used throughout with the only exception of Hong Kong.