The Legal Foundations of Inequality

The long revolutionary movements that gave birth to constitutional democracies in the Americas were founded on egalitarian constitutional ideals. They claimed that all men were created equal and with similar capacities and that the community should become self-governing. Following the first constitutional debates that took place in the region, these promising egalitarian claims, which gave legitimacy to the revolutions, soon fell out of favor. Advocates of a conservative order challenged both ideals and wrote constitutions that established a national religion and created an exclusionary political structure. Liberals proposed constitutions that protected individual autonomy and rights but established severe restrictions on the principle of majority rule. Radicals favored an openly majoritarian constitutional organization that, according to many, directly threatened the protection of individual rights. This book examines the influence of these opposing views during the founding period of constitutionalism in countries including the United States, Argentina, Bolivia, Colombia, Chile, Ecuador, Mexico, Peru, Uruguay, and Venezuela and explores their legacy to our time.

Roberto Gargarella is Professor of Constitutional Theory and Political Philosophy at the Law School of the Universidad de Buenos Aires and the Universidad Torcuato Di Tella and a researcher for CONICET in Buenos Aires and the Christian Michelsen Institute in Norway. He has been a Visiting Fellow at Columbia, New York University, and Harvard and a Visiting Professor at universities in Europe, Latin America, and the United States. He received a John Simon Guggenheim grant in 2000 and a Harry Frank Guggenheim grant in 2002–2003 and has published on issues of legal and political philosophy, as well as on U.S. and Latin American constitutionalism.
Cambridge Studies in the Theory of Democracy

General Editor
ADAM PRZEWORSKI  New York University

OTHER BOOKS IN THE SERIES

Robert Barros, Constitutionalism and Dictatorship: Pinochet, the Junta, and the 1980 Constitution

Jon Elster, ed., Deliberative Democracy

José María Maravall and Adam Przeworski, eds., Democracy and the Rule of Law

José María Maravall and Ignacio Sánchez-Cuenca, Controlling Governments: Voters, Institutions, and Accountability

Adam Przeworski, Susan Stokes, and Bernard Manin, eds., Democracy, Accountability, and Representation


Melissa Schwartzberg, Democracy and Legal Change
# Contents

**Acknowledgments**

__Introduction__

1. **Radicalism: Honoring the General Will**
   - The Engine of American History
   - The History of Radical Constitutionalism in America
   - "A Government by Its Citizens in Mass"
   - The People against "The Few and the Great"
   - Moral Populism: On the Tensions between Radicalism and Individual Rights
   - The Economy: The Agrarian Republic
   - The Need for New Political Institutions
   - Constitutionalism
   - The Organization of Power: A Strict Separation of Powers
   - Rights and the Cultivation of Virtue
   - From Political Rights to the Right to the Land: The Constitution as La Ley de la Tierra
   - Radicalism and Constitutionalism in the Americas: A Balance

2. **Conservatism: The Moral Cement of Society**
   - The Endless Influence of Conservatism
   - Moral Perfectionism: Preventing the Loosening of Moral Bonds
   - Political Elitism: The Impossibility of Democracy in a Society "Full of Vices"
   - The Constitution
## Contents

**Conservative Constitutions and the Structure of Power:** “A Single Well-Directed Man” 117  
**Rights:** “To Form Customs and National Character” 130  
**The Regeneration of American Citizens** 136  
**Private Property and Political Rights: The Realm of the Wealthy** 141  
**Conservatism and Constitutionalism in the Americas: A Balance** 146  
**The Conservative Legacy** 150  

### 3 Liberalism: Between Tyranny and Anarchy 153  
**The Sovereignty of the Individual** 153  
**Moral Neutrality: A Wall of Separation** 157  
**Political Neutrality: The Procedural View** 163  
**From the Sovereignty of the People to the Sovereignty of Reason** 167  
**The Economy: The Politics of Laissez Faire** 172  
**Constitutionalism** 178  
**Rights: The Fight against All Privileges** 180  
**The Organization of Power: A System of Checks and Balances** 194  
**Liberalism and Constitutionalism in the Americas: A Balance** 208  

### 4 The Quest for Equality 215  
**Ulysses’ Disloyalty** 215  
**The Unfulfilled Promise of Radicalism** 217  
**Liberalism: Stabilizing Its Own Program** 220  
**Liberals, Conservatives, and Political Inequality** 223  
**Political Inequalities: Were They Unavoidable?** 227  
**Egalitarianism and Politics: Recognizing the Value of Public Discussion** 230  
**Egalitarianism and Rights: The Equal Value of Each Person’s Opinions** 235  
**The Egalitarian Constitution** 241  

**Bibliography** 249  
**Index** 267
I want to give special thanks to Adam Przeworski, who read the first version of this book, made useful and stimulating comments, and encouraged me to publish my manuscript in English. My project benefited greatly from many discussions with friends, colleagues, and students that took place at the Universidad de Buenos Aires and the Universidad Torcuato Di Tella in Buenos Aires; the Universidad de los Andes and the Universidad Nacional in Colombia; the Universidad Católica in Uruguay; the ITAM in Mexico; the Universidad de Chile; the Universitat Pompeu Fabra in Spain; Columbia, Cornell, and Yale universities in the United States; and the Club de Cultura Socialista in Buenos Aires. I thank all those who participated in these debates, particularly Juan Carlos Torre, who helped me with the publication of parts of this manuscript in Spanish. I am thankful to Julia Maskivker and Marisol Yakimiuk, who collaborated with me as research assistants at an early stage of my research. I also took advantage of numerous dialogues at the annual Seminario Latinoamericano (SELA), coordinated by my friend Owen Fiss. My research was made possible, in part, by the financial help I received from the Simon Guggenheim Foundation and the Christian Michelsen Institute in Norway. During these years, I had the enormous privilege of having access to the wonderful library of the Universidad Di Torcuato Tella, the New York Public Library, and the libraries of Columbia, Cornell, New York, and Yale universities.
The Legal Foundations of Inequality