

Cambridge University Press  
978-0-521-19392-4 - A Moral Theory of Political Reconciliation  
Colleen Murphy  
Frontmatter  
[More information](#)

---

## A MORAL THEORY OF POLITICAL RECONCILIATION

Following extended periods of conflict or repression, political reconciliation is indispensable to the establishment or restoration of democratic relationships and critical to the pursuit of peacemaking globally. In this important new book, Colleen Murphy offers an innovative analysis of the moral problems plaguing political relationships under the strain of civil conflict and repression. Focusing on the unique moral damage that attends the deterioration of political relationships, Murphy identifies the precise kinds of repair and transformation that processes of political reconciliation ought to promote. Building on this analysis, she proposes a normative model of political relationships. *A Moral Theory of Political Reconciliation* delivers an original account of the failure and restoration of political relationships, which will be of interest to philosophers, social scientists, legal scholars, policy analysts, and all those who are interested in transitional justice, global politics, and democracy.

COLLEEN MURPHY is an associate professor of philosophy at Texas A&M University. She has published widely on topics pertaining to political philosophy, philosophy of law, and risk analysis.

Cambridge University Press  
978-0-521-19392-4 - A Moral Theory of Political Reconciliation  
Colleen Murphy  
Frontmatter  
[More information](#)

---

# A MORAL THEORY OF POLITICAL RECONCILIATION

COLLEEN MURPHY

*Texas A&M University*



**CAMBRIDGE**  
UNIVERSITY PRESS

Cambridge University Press  
 978-0-521-19392-4 - A Moral Theory of Political Reconciliation  
 Colleen Murphy  
 Frontmatter  
[More information](#)

CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY PRESS  
 Cambridge, New York, Melbourne, Madrid, Cape Town, Singapore,  
 São Paulo, Delhi, Dubai, Tokyo

Cambridge University Press  
 The Edinburgh Building, Cambridge CB2 8RU, UK

Published in the United States of America by Cambridge University Press, New York

[www.cambridge.org](http://www.cambridge.org)  
 Information on this title: [www.cambridge.org/9780521193924](http://www.cambridge.org/9780521193924)

© Colleen Murphy 2010

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception  
 and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements,  
 no reproduction of any part may take place without  
 the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2010

Printed in the United Kingdom at the University Press, Cambridge

*A catalog record for this publication is available from the British Library*

*Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data*

Murphy, Colleen, 1974–  
 A moral theory of political reconciliation / Colleen Murphy.

p. cm.

ISBN 978-0-521-19392-4 (hardback)

1. Reconciliation—Political aspects. 2. Reconciliation—Moral and ethical aspects.  
 3. Rule of law. 4. Truth commissions. 5. War crimes trials. I. Title.

JC580.M87 2010

172—dc22

2010028678

ISBN 978-0-521-19392-4 Hardback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or  
 accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to  
 in this publication, and does not guarantee that any content on such  
 websites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.

## *Contents*

<i>Acknowledgements</i>	<i>page vi</i>
Introduction	I
<b>PART I CONCEPTUAL FRAMEWORKS</b>	<b>39</b>
1 The rule of law	41
2 Political trust	71
3 Capabilities	94
<b>PART II PROMOTING POLITICAL RECONCILIATION</b>	<b>121</b>
4 Evaluating processes of political reconciliation	123
5 Truth commissions	144
6 International criminal trials	167
Conclusion	187
<i>Bibliography</i>	200
<i>Index</i>	209

## *Acknowledgements*

Fifteen years ago, while an undergraduate student at the University of Notre Dame, I spent a semester studying abroad in London and took a course on the conflict in Northern Ireland taught by Brendan O'Duffy. This course was of special interest given my Irish-American ethnic background and a childhood spent primarily among the large Irish-American community in Chicago. Going into this course I considered the solution to resolving the conflict in Northern Ireland in a just manner quite simple and straightforward: reunify Ireland. This course showed me how profoundly misguided I was to think that the resolution of the conflict was either simple or straightforward. Ongoing discussions with Alasdair MacIntyre over the years, beginning during my time at Notre Dame, have further deepened and enriched my grasp of different aspects of the situation in Northern Ireland. Because of that class, these discussions, and extensive examination of other conflicts around the world, I developed an enduring interest in understanding how it becomes possible for human beings, who live in the same society and who have suffered and inflicted suffering on one another in a systematic and widespread manner, to live peacefully and justly with each other again. This book represents my attempt to answer this question.

My efforts to develop a theory of political reconciliation began while a graduate student at the University of North Carolina – Chapel Hill. My dissertation, and subsequently this book, would not have been possible without the support of my advisor and mentor Gerald J. Postema. When I began my dissertation, political reconciliation was not a subject of philosophical reflection. Philosophers had begun to consider the moral justifiability of truth commissions, but were not concerned with the meaning of political reconciliation itself. I am deeply indebted to Jerry for his confidence in my ability to tackle new intellectual terrain, for maintaining that confidence as my dissertation progressed, and for continually pushing me to further refine and better articulate my ideas.

*Acknowledgements*

vii

Although this book bears little resemblance in content to my dissertation, it bears the mark of the intellectual guidance that Jerry provided.

During my graduate study at the University of North Carolina – Chapel Hill, I developed a wonderful cohort of dear friends that I would like to thank for their intellectual engagement with and moral support of my project. Yaacov Ben-Shemesh, Katya Hosking, and Susanne Sreedhar spent countless hours discussing my project with me and reading drafts of my dissertation. Susanne deserves special recognition in this regard. Not only did she engage with my project during graduate school, she has remained intimately involved with the progression of my work on this book during my time at Texas A&M University. Susanne has read and extensively commented on almost every chapter that follows; my book is significantly improved because of her feedback.

The Department of Philosophy at Texas A&M University provided the ideal environment for transforming the ideas that I explored in my dissertation into a book. I thank all of my colleagues for their ongoing support for and interest in my project. Within the department I want to recognize in particular Theodore George, Ben McMyler, and Linda Radzik. Conversations with Ted forced me to rethink my analysis of the impact of truth commissions, and those with Ben have been particularly valuable in writing the introductory chapter. Linda has read every page of this manuscript, often multiple times. She has been the ideal interlocutor and sounding board. The mark of her invaluable feedback and constructive criticism permeates the final manuscript.

There is a long list of individuals who have influenced particular arguments I advance and a number of venues where I presented different chapters of my book and received valuable feedback. Each chapter begins by acknowledging the specific places where I presented the ideas from the chapter as well as the particular individuals whose criticisms and suggestions informed the argument I make and to whom I remain grateful. A much earlier version of Chapter 1 first appeared in “Lon Fuller and the Moral Value of the Rule of Law,” *Law and Philosophy*, 24(3) (2005), 239–262. Chapter 6 is a revised version of “Political Reconciliation and International Criminal Trials,” which appeared in Larry May and Zach Hoskins (eds.), *International Criminal Law and Philosophy* (Cambridge University Press, 2010), pp. 224–44.

I would like to thank the National Endowment for the Humanities, as well as the Office of the Vice-President for Research, the College of Liberal Arts, and the Melbern G. Glasscock Center for Humanities Research at Texas A&M University for funding this project. The Department of

Cambridge University Press  
978-0-521-19392-4 - A Moral Theory of Political Reconciliation  
Colleen Murphy  
Frontmatter  
[More information](#)

---

viii

*Acknowledgements*

Philosophy and the Melburn G. Glasscock Center for Humanities Research at Texas A&M University each supported a sabbatical period that allowed me to complete substantial portions of this book during the fall 2007 and spring 2008 semesters, respectively.

Hilary Gaskin at Cambridge University Press has been a superb editor. I would like to express my gratitude to her for guiding me throughout the publication process and ensuring that reviews from readers were completed in a very timely fashion. Two anonymous readers provided insightful, detailed, and constructive comments and criticism in their reports. I thank them for their thorough evaluation of my manuscript, which is substantially improved as a result of their comments. Finally, I thank Cyndy Brown for her editorial and indexing services.

I come from an extremely close family that is an enduring source of love and support. I want to recognize and thank my parents, Robert and Kathleen Murphy; my brothers and sister, Jack, Kevin, and Mary Beth Murphy; my sister-in-law, Amanda Murphy; and my grandmother, Marion Morris, for their ongoing enthusiasm for my project and willingness to engage in countless conversations about political reconciliation during family gatherings for many years. My parents deserve special recognition. My mother read and edited multiple versions of every page of this manuscript, while my father continuously reminded me (and others) of how proud he was that I was working on this project. I also thank the new family I gained during the course of writing this book. My father-in-law and mother-in-law, Giulio and Anna Gardoni, and brother-in-law and sister-in-law, Alberto Gardoni and Silvia Pasolini, warmly welcomed me into the family and became keen supporters of my project. My nieces and nephew, Abigail and Connor Murphy, and Giulia Gardoni, are too young to talk with me about political reconciliation, but they serve as continual reminders of the kind of bright future I hope all children might have and motivate me to continue to work to understand how such a future might become possible.

My greatest debt of gratitude is to my husband, Paolo Gardoni, to whom this book is dedicated. I could not imagine a more perfect partner to have in life. I thank Paolo for his unconditional love; for his deep and steadfast support, both intellectual and emotional, as I wrote this book; and for being a continual source of joy, laughter, and inspiration in my life.