## Contents

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Acknowledgments</th>
<th>page xiii</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1  Political and Jurisprudential Worlds in Conflict in the New Republic</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2  Politics in the New Republic</td>
<td>23</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>A. Introduction</td>
<td>23</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>C. Corruption of the Press: Financial Support from Political Leaders and Foreign Powers</td>
<td>27</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1. The Politicized Press of the New Republic</td>
<td>29</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. Support of the Partisan Press by Political Patronage</td>
<td>32</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>a. Government Printing Contracts</td>
<td>32</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>b. The Flow of Foreign Money</td>
<td>35</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>D. Partisan Virulent Speech and the Demonization of Opponents</td>
<td>36</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>E. Partisan Violence in the New Republic: An Inheritance from the Struggles with the British Crown</td>
<td>40</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>F. Three Insurrections Threatening the Stability of the New Nation</td>
<td>42</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1. Shays's Rebellion (1787)</td>
<td>42</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. The Whiskey Tax Rebellion (1794)</td>
<td>44</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. The Fries Insurrection (1799)</td>
<td>49</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>G. Conclusion</td>
<td>50</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3  Criminal Libel in the Colonies, the States, and the Early Republic During the Washington Administration</td>
<td>52</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
A. Introduction 52

B. English Seditious Libel and Criminal Libel Law: The Law of the American Colonies 54
   1. Eighteenth-Century English Law 54
   2. The Colonial Experience 55

C. Criminal Libel in the States After the Revolution: The English Inheritance and the Role of Blackstone 57
   1. The Reception Statutes 57
   2. The Role of Blackstone 59
   3. The Isolated Cases Before the Adams Administration 66

Federalist Partisan Use of Criminal and Seditious Libel – Statutory and Common Law – During the Tumultuous Adams Administration 72
A. Collapse of Relations with the French, the Adams Administration Preparing for the Imminent Outbreak of War, and the Bitter Political Climate in the Spring of 1798 72
   1. United States v. Samuel J. Cabell, Congressman from Virginia 73
   2. United States v. Benjamin Franklin Bache, Editor of the Philadelphia Aurora 77
   4. United States v. Dr. James Smith, Co-Publisher of the New York Time Piece 81

C. The Enactment of the Sedition Act, July 14, 1798 82
   1. Introduction of the Bill 82
   2. The Action of the Congress 84
   3. The Approval of President Adams 90

D. The Federalists Divided over the Act: The Reaction of Such Federalists as George Washington, Alexander Hamilton, Oliver Ellsworth, and John Marshall 92
   1. George Washington 93
   2. Alexander Hamilton 94
   3. Chief Justice Oliver Ellsworth 95
   4. John Marshall 95
Contents

E. The First Cases Under the Act: Protecting National Security by Prosecuting Three Disorderly Drunks for Vulgar Remarks About President Adams 99

F. The Major Federalist Onslaught: Nine Cases Against Editors and Publishers of Jeffersonian Newspapers 101
   1. United States v. Matthew Lyon, Congressman from Vermont and Editor of the Vermont Journal 102
   2. United States v. Anthony Haswell, Editor of the Vermont Gazette 107
   4. United States v. Charles Holt, Editor of the New London Bee 112
   5. United States v. Ann Greenleaf; People v. David Frothingham (N.Y.), Editor and Employee, Respectively, of the New York Argus 114
   6. United States v. William Duane, Editor of the Philadelphia Aurora 116
   7. United States v. Thomas Cooper, Editor of the Sunbury and Northumberland Gazette 122
   8. United States v. James Thomson Callender, Polemicist 125
   9. United States v. William Durrell, Editor of the Mt. Pleasant Register 131

G. Three Cases Involving Republican Activists 134
   3. United States v. Dr. Samuel Shaw 138

H. Unconfirmed Cases 139
   1. United States or New Jersey v. Daniel Dodge; United States or New Jersey v. Aaron Pennington 139
   2. United States v. Judah P. Spooner; United States v. James Lyon 140
   3. United States v. Conrad Fahnstock; United States v. Benjamin Moyer or Mayer 142
   4. United States or Commonwealth v. James Bell 143
   5. Dr. John Tyler; Dr. John Vaughan 143
Table of Contents

I. Judicial Consideration of the Constitutionality of the Sedition Act 144
J. Conclusion 145

5 Criminal Libel During the Jefferson and Madison Administrations, 1800–1816 148
A. Introduction 148
B. Ambivalence of the Jeffersonians: The Federal Government 149
   1. The Accession of Jefferson to the Presidency, 1801 149
   2. The Demise of Criminal Libel and Federal Criminal Common Law in the Jefferson and Madison Administrations 150
   4. The Constitutional Issue: Did the Federal Courts Have Criminal Common-Law Jurisdiction? 166
      a. The Experience in the First 25 Years of the Early American Republic 166
      b. The Constitutional Issue Resolved: Hudson & Goodwin (1812) 181
      c. Jefferson and Criminal Libel 184

6 Partisan Prosecutions for Criminal Libel in the State Courts: Federalists Against Republicans, Republicans Against Federalists, and Republicans Against Dissident Republicans in Struggles for Party Control 187
A. Introduction 187
B. Republican Use of Repressive Doctrines Against Federalists and Dissident Republicans Alike 188
   1. Pennsylvania 188
      a. Republicans Against Federalists 188
      b. Republicans Against Republicans 194
   2. New York 203
      a. The Federalist Interlude 203
      b. The Republican Era 204
   3. Other Jurisdictions 214
C. Federalist Use of Repressive Doctrines Against Republicans 215
   1. Connecticut 215
   2. Massachusetts 222
   3. New Jersey 233
D. Liberalization of Massachusetts Criminal Libel Law 234
1. The Role of Truth 234
2. The Scope of the Jury’s Role 236
3. The Requirement of Proof of “Intent” 237
4. Reform in the States 238
E. Conclusion 241

7 Established Jurisprudential Doctrines (Other than Criminal Libel) Available in the New Republic for Suppression of Anti-Establishment Speech 243
A. Introduction 243
B. Criminal Contempt of Court for Out-of-Court Speech 244
1. Contempt in the Early Republic During the Late 18th Century and Early 19th Century 248
   a. The Early Pennsylvania Experience 248
   b. The Early New York Experience 254
   c. Other Early Developments 255
2. Federal Statutory and Constitutional Limitations of the Judicial Contempt Power 257
   a. The “Duane” Prelude (1800) and the Congressional Contempt Power 257
   b. The Act of March 2, 1831 262
   c. The Century-Long Struggle in the Federal Courts over the Meaning of the Act of 1831 264
3. The Judicial Contempt Power in the States 272
   a. Statutory and Other Issues 272
   b. State Constitutional Limitations 275
   c. Separation of Powers 275
   d. Free Speech and Press 277
   e. Trial by Jury 279
   f. Due Process 279
   g. State Law in Conflict: Was Contempt Available After the Case Had Come to an End? 280
4. Federal Constitutional Limits of the Contempt Power of State Judges 284
C. Criminal Contempt of the Legislature 289
1. The English and Colonial Inheritance 289
2. The Federal Experience 293
   a. The First Quarter Century of the Early Republic 294
   b. The Evolution of the Doctrine in the Federal Courts 296
x

3. The State Experience 301
D. Binding Over of Defendants to Assure Good Pretrial Behavior 303
E. Breach of the Peace 312
F. Conclusion 317

8 Still Other 19th-Century Doctrines for Suppression of Anti-Establishment Speech: The Law of Blasphemy and the Slave State Anti-Abolition Statutes 318
A. Introduction 318
B. Criminalization of Blasphemy Under State Common and Statutory Law 319
1. Introduction 319
2. The English Criminal Common Law of Blasphemy 320
3. Blasphemy Law in the Colonies and the New Republic 321
4. The Blasphemy Statutes 326
5. The Blasphemy Litigation 328
6. The Contrasting Experience with the “Blue Laws” 335
7. Conclusion 336
C. Suppression of Anti-Slavery Speech 337
1. Introduction 337
2. The Experience in the Slave States 338
   a. Anti-Abolition Statutes 338
   b. The Slave State Decisions 341
   c. State Utilization of Federal Postmasters to Impound Anti-Slavery Newspapers 349
   d. Slave State Statutes Jailing Free Black Seamen on Ships Entering State Ports: An Ugly Episode from America’s Unhappy Past 349
   e. State Common-Law Prosecutions to Stifle Abolitionist Activists: Criminal Libel and Public Order 356
   f. Limits on Slave State Jurisdiction to Respond Fully to the Circulation of Abolitionist Pamphlets and Newspapers 362
   g. Northern State Common-Law Prosecution of Abolitionist Agitation 365
3. The Federal Experience 368
   a. Anti-Slavery Petitions in the Congress 368
   b. Jacksonian Approval of State Interception of Anti-Slavery Newspapers in the U.S. Mails 368
Contents

4. Ineffectiveness of Constitutional Guaranties of Freedom of Press to Invalidate the Southern Statutes Suppressing Anti-Slavery Publications

D. Conclusion

9 Conclusion

A. Introduction

B. Let Us Call the Roll

Table of Cases

Index