AFTER-SCHOOL CENTERS AND YOUTH DEVELOPMENT

This book examines after-school programs in light of their explosive growth in recent years. In the rush to mount programs, there is a danger of promoting weak ones of little value and failing to implement strong ones adequately. But what is quality and how can it be achieved?

This book presents findings from an intensive study of three after-school centers that differed dramatically in quality. Drawing from 233 site visits, the authors examine how – and why – young people thrive in good programs and suffer in weak ones.

The book features engaging in-depth case studies of each of the three centers and of six youths, two from each center. Written in a highly accessible style for academics, youth workers, after-school program leaders, and policy makers, the study breaks new ground in highlighting the importance of factors such as collective mentoring, synergies among different programs and activities, and organizational culture and practices. Guidelines are included for program improvement.


Nancy L. Deutsch is Associate Professor of Educational Leadership and Foundations at the University of Virginia’s Curry School of Education and Associate Director for Methodology at Youth-NEX, University of Virginia’s Center for Effective Youth Development. A scholar of the social ecological contexts of development, she is the author of *Pride in the Projects: Teens Building Identities in Urban Contexts*.

David L. DuBois is Professor in the Division of Community Health Sciences within the School of Public Health at the University of Illinois at Chicago. His research focuses on youth mentoring relationships and programs for positive youth development. He is the co-editor of the *Handbook of Youth Mentoring*, which received the Social Policy Award for Best Edited Book from the Society for Research on Adolescence.
After-School Centers and Youth Development

CASE STUDIES OF SUCCESS AND FAILURE

Barton J. Hirsch
Northwestern University

Nancy L. Deutsch
University of Virginia

David L. DuBois
University of Illinois at Chicago
# CONTENTS

**Figure and Tables**  page vii

**Preface**  ix

**INTRODUCTION**

1. The Quality of After-School Centers  3

**MIDWEST CENTER**

2. Pockets of Excellence  33
3. Pocahontas Joins the Tribe  63
4. Bill: The Pros and Cons of Being One of the Guys  92
5. Putting It All Together: Midwest Center  121

**NORTH RIVER CENTER**

6. A Study of Organizational Dysfunction  129
7. Undercutting Tweetie: The Trials and Tribulations of a Youth Leader  155
8. Beyonce: A Good Friend Is Hard to Find (and Keep)  183
9. Putting It All Together: North River and Midwest Centers  208

**WEST RIVER CENTER**

10. The Jewel in the Crown  217
11. Midnight: A Teen Father Stays the Course  234
Contents

12. Tommiana: A Contest between Closeness and Competition 259
13. Putting It All Together: What Have We Learned? 282

CONCLUSION
14. Recommendations for Improving Practice 297

Appendix: Data Sources 307
References 331
Index 351
FIGURE AND TABLES

FIGURE

1.1 Conceptual framework for understanding the role of comprehensive after-school centers in youth development  

TABLES

1.1 Overview of case study participants  
3.1 Pocahontas’ PARC profile  
4.1 Bill’s PARC profile  
7.1 Tweetie’s PARC profile  
8.1 Beyonce’s PARC profile  
11.1 Midnight’s PARC profile  
12.1 Tommiana’s PARC profile  
14.1 Recommendations for improving practice  

page 10  
25  
67  
97  
159  
188  
238  
264  
298
This research project has gone through some interesting transformations. Our original grant application to the William T. Grant Foundation proposed a year of qualitative research followed by a year of quantitative research. We were very grateful when the foundation’s then senior vice president, Robert Granger, encouraged us to focus on the qualitative portion only.

We hadn’t expected to be taken by surprise by the nature of the three after-school centers that we were going to study, but we were. A few years earlier, we had studied six Boys and Girls Clubs and had written two books based on that experience: Hirsch’s *A Place to Call Home: After–School Programs for Urban Youth*, and Deutsch’s *Pride in the Projects: Teens Building Identities in Urban Contexts*. We had thought that the clubs in the current research would be reasonably similar to the six we had studied earlier, but that was not the case. With one of the clubs (referred to as North River), it was clear from the very beginning that it was a lot worse than any of the clubs we had come to know previously. Nothing during the rest of our year of data collection served to change our mind about this.

Indeed, as time went on, we became more sharply aware of differences across all three of the clubs. We became convinced that to do justice to this situation, we needed to expand our research focus. Our initial objective was to conduct an intensive study of youth-staff relationships, as such relationships had emerged as an important factor in our prior studies. We have done that. But we also added an organizational level of analysis to capture the different cultures and operations at the three sites. The varying perspectives are reported via case studies of each club and of two youth at each club. The book
that grew out of this more comprehensive effort is richer, and it is both more theoretical and more applied as a result.

As with our earlier publications, we made an agreement with the clubs to keep their identities confidential. Accordingly, the locations of the clubs are not specified and their names have been changed, as have the names and potentially identifying characteristics of both the clubs and individuals. Each youth chose his or her own pseudonym, and we assigned pseudonyms to the various staff members and administrators.

We owe a debt of great appreciation to the youth, staff, and administrators at the clubs for their cooperation and support. We are pleased to acknowledge the contributions of Leah Doane, Carrie Luo, and Kim Star who served as research assistants. Thanks also go to James G. Kelly, Dan Lewis, Megan Mekinda, and James Spillane, who generously commented on earlier drafts of some of our chapters. We are very grateful to the William T. Grant Foundation, and especially Robert Granger (now president of the Foundation), for its support over the years. Thanks go as well to our editor at Cambridge, Simina Calin.

We cannot end without acknowledging our wonderful families, including Margherita Andreotti, Rachel Hirsch, and David Hirsch; Jon Rice; and Natalie and Lily, Gwyneth, and Rebecca DuBois.