

INDEX

- Abella, Justice Rosalie (Canada),
recusal 311
- absolute neutrality as realistic objective
351–7
- access to justice
Article 6 ECHR 6
as core value 5–6, 13
- accountability
appointment procedures 68–70
chapter summary 4
and freedom of speech 259–60
independence, tension with 9
as requirement for independence 10
role of judges, as to 162–4
- acting judges, appointment 32–5,
89–90, 91, 104–6
- administrative independence,
entitlement 17
- administrative judges, independence 19
- American Bar Association (ABA)
Model Code of Judicial Conduct
266–72, 274–5, 380–1, 386–90,
396
response to political attacks on
judges 275
- American Law Institute (ALI),
principles of justice system
13–15
- Andrews, Neil, principles of justice
system 12, 13–15
- anti-bias rule, characteristics
361–2
- appeal cases, criticism of judges in
politically controversial 262
- appointments *see also specific
jurisdictions, e.g., Canada*
acting judges 32–5, 89–90, 91, 104–6
bodies 30–2, 68, 70–1, 118–19,
120–6 *see also* judicial
commissions/councils
comparison summary 536–7
‘depoliticisation’ 273–4
devolution of regional powers
118–19
diversity 8, 119–20, 121–2, 125–6,
139
effectiveness of system 113–16
efficient process 102–3
election campaigns, high cost of 266
ethnic communities 67–8
ethnic representation 71
fixed-term warrants 90–1
to higher courts 56
ideological issues 139–40
and independence 51–2
Judicial Appointments Commission
70–1
by judicial commissions 30–2,
101–6, 118
Kable principle 33–5
liberal attacks 265
Lord Chancellor’s powers 121
magistrates 120, 134–5
Ombudsman’s role 131
parliamentary scrutiny 122–3
patronage 139
political issues 52, 53–4, 55–6, 119,
135–40
President’s power 135–40
Prime Minister’s power 121–2
procedures 28–30, 51–8, 67–71,
101–6, 135–40, 143–7
public confidence 27–8
reform 30–2, 52–4, 118–20, 121–2

- reform recommendations 55
- secondment 91–2
- short-term political aims 138–9
- Supreme Court *see* Supreme Court *below*
- women judges 32, 71, 104
- apprehension of bias *see* reasonable suspicion of bias test
- arbitrators, bias by 340–1
- Arbour, Justice Louise (Canada), extra-judicial service 435–6
- associational activities, non-judicial functions 523–6
- attacks on judges *see* criticism of judges
- attitudinal bias, disqualification for 313, 371–2
- Attorney-General
 - power to appoint judges 67–8
 - role 456–7
- Australia
 - appointments
 - accountability issues 27–8, 30
 - acting judges 32–5
 - judicial commission for 30–2
 - Kable* principle 32–5
 - process 28–30
 - reform 30–2
 - summary of issues 45
 - women 32
 - automatic disqualification for pecuniary interests 292–5
 - bias, reasonable suspicion test
 - chapter summary 279–80
 - constitutional issues 296–7
 - fair-minded lay observer, role of 286–92
 - judge's financial interest 292–5
 - main issues 279–80
 - necessity exception to anti-bias rule 296–9
 - operation 280–3
 - purposes 283–6
 - summary of issues 299–300
 - underlying purposes 297–9
 - use of 348
 - waiver, doctrine of 295–9
 - Bruce, Justice Vince, resignation 40
 - Cahill, Ron, resignation as Chief Magistrate of ACT 41
 - Callinan, Justice Ian, inquiry into conduct called for 38–9
 - complaints handling 41–4
 - compulsory questioning of suspects, issuing of warrants 418–20
 - conduct, guidance 168–9, 426–7
 - Constitution, separation of powers 404–5
 - detention orders, issuing of 418–20
 - disqualified judge, pecuniary interests
 - failure to disclose interests, effect 281
 - recusal 292–5
 - duty to sit 352–3
 - federal courts, separation of powers 404–5
 - freedom of speech
 - chapter summary 154
 - 'citizen judge' approach 164–9
 - constitutional guarantee 170–3
 - constitutional provision 154–7
 - current debate on 164–9
 - impartiality 165–6
 - Kilmuir rules 157–64
 - main issues 153–4
 - summary of issues 173–4
 - human rights charters 156–7
 - impartiality, appearance of, constitutional provision 296–7
 - independence
 - constitutional provision 159–60
 - remuneration, legislative provision 159
 - interception of telecommunications, issuing of warrants 416–17
 - judicial commissions
 - as to appointments 30–2
 - as to removal 41–4
 - judicial power
 - definition 405–6
 - limits 405–10
 - Kable* principle
 - appointments 33–5
 - non-judicial functions 405, 422–6
 - Kilmuir rules 158

- Australia (cont.)
- Kirby, Justice Michael, freedom of speech controversy 153–4
 - Marks, Justice Kenneth, Royal Commission 414–15
 - Mason, Sir Anthony, approach to openness 162–4
 - Mathews, Justice Jane, compatibility of non-judicial function 412–14
 - McClellan, Justice Peter, apprehension of bias 287–9
 - Murphy, Justice Lionel, attempted removal 36–8
 - non-judicial functions
 - ‘chameleon’ doctrine 406
 - commissions and inquiries, service on 414–15
 - connections with executive 415
 - constitutional issues 404–5
 - examples 403–4
 - guidance for judges 426–7
 - historically regarded as judicial 405–6
 - incompatibility criteria 411
 - incompatibility test 410–14
 - independent tribunals, service on 415
 - judicial functions distinguished 405–10
 - judicial power, limits 405–10
 - Kable* principle and state courts 405, 422–6
 - main issues 403–4
 - persona designata* exception 410–22
 - public confidence 411–12
 - security orders and warrants, issuing of 416–22
 - and separation of powers 404–5
 - summary of issues 426–7
 - validity of statutory functions 407
 - pecuniary interests
 - automatic disqualification for 292–5
 - failure to disclose, effect 292–5
 - preventative detention orders, issuing of 418–20
 - removal
 - inability, for 86–7
 - procedures 35–41
 - role of judges
 - within legal system 154–7
 - openness as to 162–4
 - security orders and warrants, issuing of 416–22
 - separation of powers 404–5
 - state courts, separation of powers 405
 - state judges
 - acting judges, appointment 32–5
 - appointment 30
 - complaints handling 41–4
 - judicial appointments
 - commissions 31
 - removal 35–41, 44–5
 - surveillance devices, issuing of warrants authorising use 417–18
 - suspension of judges 44–5
 - telecommunications, issuing of interception warrants 416–17
 - Vasta, Justice Angelo, removal 39–40
 - women judges, appointment 32
- Austria, provincial judges, power to appoint 49
- automatic disqualification 292–5, 349, 370–1 *see* disqualification
- Barrington, Sir Jonah (UK), removal 84, 127
- Bastarache, Justice Michel (Canada), apprehension of bias 313–14
- behaviour *see* conduct
- Benjamin, Justice Brent (US), apprehension of bias 392–6
- Berger, Justice Thomas (Canada), resignation 178–80
- bias *see also specific jurisdictions, e.g., Canada*
- absolute neutrality as realistic objective 351–2
 - anti-bias rule, characteristics 361–8
 - appearance of, and anti-bias rule 362–8

Cambridge University Press

978-0-521-19060-2 - Judiciaries in Comparative Perspective

Edited by H. P. Lee

Index

[More information](#)

INDEX

545

- by arbitrators 340–1
- automatic disqualification 370–1
- behaviour as indicator of actual bias 337–8
- case examples 328–36
- comparison summary 538–9
- connection between matter and decision, articulation 281
- criminal appeals 326
- danger of suspicion of, extra-judicial service 443–5
- definition 302–5
- essence of 301
- failure to disclose interests, effect 281, 359
- identification, steps for 280–1
- impartiality, dichotomy with 301–2
- increase in claims 345
- by jurors 340–1
- matter suggesting, categories 280–1
- and natural justice 301
- necessity exception to anti-bias rule 342
- political bias, danger of, non-judicial functions 439
- presumption of impartiality 352
- prior decision-making 341–2
- reasonable suspicion
 - articulation 281
 - recusal in response to *see* recusal
 - test *see* reasonable suspicion of bias test
- relations between opposing lawyers and judges 338–40
- test *see* reasonable suspicion of bias test
- Bienvenue, Justice Jean (Canada), removal of 186–7
- bills of rights *see* human rights charters
- Bingham, Lord (UK), freedom of speech controversy 249–50
- Binnie, Justice Ian (Canada), apprehension of bias 320–1
- Boilard, Justice Jean-Guy (Canada), recusal 319
- Bork, Judge Robert (US), nomination 140
- Brennan, Justice William (US), nomination 138–9
- Bruce, Justice Vince (Australia), resignation 40
- Cahill, Ron, Chief Magistrate of ACT (Australia), resignation 41
- Callinan, Justice Ian (Australia), inquiry into conduct called for 38–9
- Cameron, Justice Edwin (South Africa), freedom of speech controversy 235–6
- Canada
 - Abella, Justice Rosalie, recusal 311
 - appointments
 - acting judges 91
 - election, public support 58
 - to higher courts 56
 - and independence 51–2
 - numbers appointed 49
 - parliamentary scrutiny 122–3
 - political issues 52, 53–4, 55–6
 - procedures 51–8
 - provincial judges 54
 - reform 52–4
 - reform recommendations 55
 - Supreme Court 57–8
 - Arbour, Justice Louise, extra-judicial service 435–6
 - Bastarache, Justice Michel, apprehension of bias 313–14
 - Berger, Justice Thomas, resignation 178–80
 - bias
 - application of law of 305–17
 - attitudinal bias 313
 - chapter summary 302
 - danger of, extra-judicial service 439
 - definition 302–5
 - group memberships of judges 307–10
 - main issues 301–2
 - pecuniary interests 305–7
 - personal relationships of judges 310–13
 - prejudice 313

Cambridge University Press

978-0-521-19060-2 - Judiciaries in Comparative Perspective

Edited by H. P. Lee

Index

[More information](#)

546

INDEX

- Canada (cont.)
 - recusal 317–21
 - summary of issues 321
- Bienvenue, Justice Jean, removal of 186–7
- Binnie, Justice Ian, apprehension of bias 320–1
- Boilard, Justice Jean-Guy, recusal 319
- Charter of Rights and Freedoms 50–1, 175–6
- commissions, government policy/ advisory, extra-judicial service 432–4, 439, 446
- conduct 58–65
- Cosgrove, Justice Paul, resignation 63–4, 188–9
- discipline
 - instances 63–5
 - issue 47
 - Judicial Council *see* Judicial Council *below*
 - provincial judges 62–3
 - reform proposals 59
 - sensitivity training 47
 - United States contrasted 62
- election, public support 58
- electoral boundary commissions, extra-judicial service 436
- executive role of judges 430
- extra-judicial service
 - advocate for, danger of being 442–3
 - appendage of government, danger of being 440–1
 - bias, danger of suspicion of 443–5
 - caution against 428–9
 - chapter summary 429
 - conflict with government, danger of 441–2
 - constitutional limits 429–30
 - continuing service, danger of 445–6
 - ethical reform proposals 448–51
 - executive role 430
 - impact on judiciary 439–46
 - increase 428
 - and independence 439–46
 - Judicial Council Position Paper 448–51
 - judicial review, danger of 443–5
 - main issues 428–9
 - political bias, danger of 439
 - rationale 438
 - reform proposals 446–51
 - statutory limits 430–1
 - statutory reform proposals 447–8
 - summary of issues 451
 - types 431–8
- federal tribunals, extra-judicial service 437–8
- Flynn, Justice Bernard, freedom of speech controversy 182–3
- freedom of speech
 - Berger affair 178–80
 - case-by-case approach to limiting 189–91
 - cases as to 183–5
 - chapter summary 176
 - criticism of judges 176–8
 - guidance for judges 191–3
 - increase of judges' 181–3
 - limits 185–9
 - main issues 175–6
 - summary of issues 193–4
- Gomery, Justice John, apprehension of bias 314, 439, 442–3, 444–5
- Gratton, Justice Fernand, resignation 63
- Hall, Justice Emmett, Royal Commission on Healthcare Services 432–4, 439
- honorary orders advisory councils, extra-judicial service 436–7, 446
- human rights, Charter of Rights and Freedoms 50–1
- Iacobucci, Justice Frank, recusal 319–20
- independence
 - appointment process and 51–2
 - challenges to 51
 - and extra-judicial service 439–46
 - legislative provision 49, 50
 - main issues 46–51
 - perceptions and realities 18

Cambridge University Press

978-0-521-19060-2 - Judiciaries in Comparative Perspective

Edited by H. P. Lee

Index

[More information](#)

INDEX

547

- research into 46, 47, 48–9
- and rule of law, maintenance of 428
- security of tenure 51
- and separation of powers 160–1, 429–30
- Somalia Inquiry 440–2, 443–4
- investigative inquiries, extra-judicial service on 432, 439
- Judicial Council
 - composition 46–7
 - creation 59–60
 - formal inquiries 61
 - inquiries, instances 61–2, 63–5
 - Inquiry Committee 62
 - panels 61
 - Position Paper on extra-judicial service 448–51
 - procedures, assessment of 60
 - recusal, statements of principle 318
- judicial review, danger of, extra-judicial service 443–5
- L'Heureux-Dubé, Justice Claire, freedom of speech controversy 181, 315–17
- Marshall Jr., Donald, inquiry into judges' conduct of trial 65, 185–6
- Matlow, Justice Theodore, inquiry into conduct 64–5, 184–5, 318–19
- McClung, Justice John, freedom of speech controversy 181, 315–17
- McLachlin, Chief Justice Beverley, apprehension of bias 315
- Moreau-Bérubé, Justice Jocelyne, removal of 187–8
- non-judicial functions *see* extra-judicial service *above*
- O'Connor, Justice Dennis, service on inquiries 433–4
- Order of Canada advisory council, extra-judicial service 436–7
- Paperny, Justice Marina, recusal 309–10
- parliamentary scrutiny of appointments 122–3
- provincial judges
 - appointment, power of 49
 - appointment procedures 54
 - discipline 62–3
 - independence, challenges to 51
 - removal 59
- public inquiries
 - executive role of judges 430
 - extra-judicial service 431–4, 447–51
- recusal 317–21
- removal
 - instances 58–9
 - legislative provision 49
 - provincial judges 59
- remuneration, legislative provision 49
- resignation of judges 63–4
- Royal Commission on Healthcare Services 432–4, 439
- Ruffo, Justice Andrée, freedom of speech controversy 183–4, 313
- scandalising the court offence, abolition 176–8
- security of tenure, legislative provision 51
- separation of powers 160–1, 429–30
- Somalia Inquiry and independence 440–2, 443–4
- special prosecutors, extra-judicial service as 434–6
- Supreme Court, appointment to 57–8
- Cayman Islands, removal of judge 82–3
- 'chameleon' doctrine as to non-judicial functions 406
- charitable activities, non-judicial functions 526–8
- charters of rights and freedoms 50–1, 156–7, 175–6 *see also* European Convention on Human Rights (ECHR)
- Chase, Justice Samuel (US), attempted impeachment 141
- 'citizen judge' approach to role of judges 164–9

Cambridge University Press

978-0-521-19060-2 - Judiciaries in Comparative Perspective

Edited by H. P. Lee

Index

[More information](#)

548

INDEX

- codes and guides on conduct 168–9, 191–3, 196–7, 235, 242–4, 266–72, 275, 318, 372–3, 380–1, 386–90, 396, 426–7, 448–51, 489–92
- colleagues on same bench as grounds for recusal 354
- collective independence, importance 3, 16
- commissions *see also* judicial commissions/councils
 - legal services 6, 81
 - service on 120–1, 414–15, 432–4, 436, 439, 446, 460–8, 469–70, 513–17
- Commonwealth Guidelines on Judicial Independence (Latimer House Guidelines) 22–3
- complaints handling *see also specific jurisdictions, e.g., Canada*
 - bias cases 328–36, 377
 - discipline 73–5
 - procedures 41–4, 73–5, 129–32
 - statistics 75
 - statutory provision 455
- compulsory questioning of suspects, issuing of warrants as non-judicial function 418–20
- conduct
 - codes and guides 168–9, 191–3, 196–7, 235, 242–4, 266–72, 275, 318, 372–3, 380–1, 386–90, 396, 448–51, 489–92
 - freedom of speech controversies 181–9
 - guidance 426–7
 - impropriety, appearance of 389–90
 - inquiries into 35–41, 58–65, 78–9, 80–2, 108–11, 377
 - ‘misbehaviour’ 82–5
 - outside court, and public confidence 8
 - ‘proved misbehaviour’, and public confidence 38
 - public confidence 65, 84, 87–8, 249
 - whether indicating actual bias 337–8
- confidence *see* public confidence
- conservative attacks on judges
 - evangelical conservatives 261
 - ‘liberal activism’, campaign against 263–5
- constitutional courts
 - appointments to 102
 - establishment 96
 - freedom of speech issues 227–31
- constitutional protection/provision
 - against bias 390–6
 - freedom of speech 156–7, 159–60, 170–3, 258
 - impartiality 346–7
 - infrastructure for protection 19–21
 - removal 454
 - security of tenure 76–8, 80, 159–60
- constitutional separation of powers *see* separation of powers
- contempt of court 222–33
- core values of judicial system
 - Article 6 ECHR as statement of 10–15
 - categorisation, approaches to 13
 - chapter summary 4
 - generally 4
 - values 5–10
- Cosgrove, Justice Paul (Canada), resignation 63–4, 188–9
- courts martial judges, independence 19
- court system, structure 134–5, 143, 456
- criticism of judges
 - ability to respond
 - importance 273
 - individual’s attacks 206–8
 - media attacks *see* media
 - principles 215–16
 - abolition of laws restricting 176–8
 - conservative attacks
 - evangelical conservatives 261
 - ‘liberal activism’, campaign against 263–5
 - cyclical nature of 260–2
 - ‘depoliticisation’ response 273–4
 - historical cycles 260
 - judges’ response 273–5
 - and legal realism 261–2
 - ‘liberal activism’, campaign against 263–5

Cambridge University Press

978-0-521-19060-2 - Judiciaries in Comparative Perspective

Edited by H. P. Lee

Index

[More information](#)

INDEX

549

- political reasons for 260–2
- progression generally 260
- and public confidence 163–4, 537–8
- Dadelszen, Judge Paul von (NZ),
 - freedom of speech controversy 205
- defamation, judge's right to sue 258–9
- democracy argument for freedom of speech 211
- 'depoliticisation' of appointments 273–4
- detention orders, issuing as non-judicial function 418–20
- devolution of regional powers, appointments 118–19
- discipline *see also* complaints handling; *specific jurisdictions, e.g., Canada*
 - comparison summary 536–7
 - constitutional issues 71–2
 - effectiveness 113–16, 142
 - immunity 72–3
 - instances 63–5
 - issue 47
 - 'misbehaviour' 82–5
 - Ombudsman's role 131
 - procedures 58–65, 71–5, 106, 126–7, 140–3, 148
 - provincial judges 62–3
 - reform proposals 59
 - sensitivity training 47
 - standards 386–90
- disclosure of interests, effect of failure 281, 359
- disqualified judge
 - attitudinal bias 371–2
 - automatic disqualification 292–5, 349, 370–1
 - criteria 386–90
 - criteria for disqualification 386–90
 - failure to disclose interests, effect 359, 370–1
 - group memberships 373
 - guidance for disqualification 372–3
 - nemo iudex in re sua* principle 361
 - pecuniary interests 292–5, 370–1
 - recusal *see* recusal
 - relations with parties 371–2
 - relations with solicitors 373–4, 376–7
 - relations with witnesses 373
 - self-disqualification *see* recusal
 - waiver of right to object to 374–5
- diversity
 - appointments process 8, 119–20, 121–2, 125–6, 139
 - and public confidence 8
- double reasonableness requirement for bias test 354
- duty to give reasons for decisions, and public confidence 7–8
- duty to sit, recusal and 352–3
- Dworkin, Ronald, views on freedom of speech 212–13
- education and training, sensitivity training 47
- efficiency
 - appointments 102–3
 - argument for non-judicial functions 500
 - as core value 5, 13
 - impairment 503
 - maintenance of 46–7, 65, 70
 - and procedural fairness 5
- election
 - bias 396
 - high cost of campaigns 266
 - and legal realism 397
 - public support 58
- electoral boundary commissions, extra-judicial service 436
- Elias, Rt Hon. Dame Sian, Chief Justice of New Zealand, freedom of speech controversy 200
- Embry, Justice Eric (US), apprehension of bias 392
- ethnic communities
 - appointments 67–8
 - representation in judiciary 71, 104
 - tribunals 453–4
- European Convention on Human Rights (ECHR)
 - Article 6
 - access to justice 6

Cambridge University Press

978-0-521-19060-2 - Judiciaries in Comparative Perspective

Edited by H. P. Lee

Index

[More information](#)

550

INDEX

- European Convention on Human Rights (cont.)
 - duty to give reasons for decisions 8
 - fair trial, right to 22
 - impartiality 366
 - and judges' independence 22–3
 - procedural fairness 11
 - reasonable suspicion of bias test 366
 - as statement of core values of judicial system 10–15
 - judge's criticism of 250–2
- European Court of Human Rights and freedom of speech 211–12
- European Union (EU), standards of judicial independence 22–3
- evangelical conservatives and criticism of judges 261
- executive patronage, knighthood as 93
- executive role of judges 430
- extra-judicial functions *see* non-judicial functions
- failure to disclose interests, effect 281, 359, 370–1
- fair hearing, meaning 11
- fair-minded lay observer *see* lay observer
- fair trial, Article 6 ECHR right to 22
- fairness *see* procedural fairness
- family relationships as grounds for recusal 310–13
- financial interests *see* pecuniary interests
- fixed-term warrants 90–1
- Flynn, Justice Bernard (Canada), freedom of speech controversy 182–3
- freedom of speech *see also specific jurisdictionsm, e.g., Canada*
 - and accountability 259–60
 - Bill of Rights and 197–9
 - 'citizen judge' approach 164–9
 - comparison summary 537–8
 - consequentialist arguments for 210–12
 - constitutional protection 170–3, 258
 - controversies 181–9, 200–9
 - convention as to 196
 - criticism of judges 176–8
 - defamation, judge's right to sue 258–9
 - democracy argument for 211
 - Dworkin, Ronald, views of 212–13
 - general principle, justifications for 210
 - government criticism of judges 253–5
 - guidance for judges 168–9, 191–3, 196–7, 235, 242–4, 266–72, 275
 - importance generally 209–10
 - increase 181–3
 - and independence 253–5, 259–60
 - individualist arguments for 212–13
 - judges' government role and 200
 - justice argument for 211–12
 - Kilmuir rules 157–64
 - limitation 185–9
 - Madison, James, views of 211
 - Mill, John Stuart, views of 210–11
 - oversight 197
 - principles 158–9
 - and public confidence 162–5, 167, 169, 186, 187, 190–1
 - and rule of law 162–4
 - and separation of powers 159–61
 - statutory limits 196
 - truth argument for 210–11
- fundamental values *see* core values of judicial system
- Gibraltar, removal of judge for inability 86
- Gomery, Justice John (Canada), apprehension of bias 314, 439, 442–3, 444–5
- government
 - criticism by judges 244–9
 - criticism of judges 253–5
- Gratton, Justice Fernand (Canada), resignation 63
- group memberships, disqualification for 307–10

- guides and codes on conduct 168–9, 191–3, 196–7, 235, 242–4, 266–72, 275, 318, 372–3, 380–1, 386–90, 396, 426–7, 448–51, 489–92
- Hall, Justice Emmett (Canada), Royal Commission on Healthcare Services 432–4, 439
- hearings and inquiries, public, service on 431–4, 447–51, 460–8, 487–9, 517–19
- Hlophe, Judge John (South Africa), inquiry into conduct 108–11
- Hoar, Judge Ebenezer (US), nomination 139
- honorary orders advisory councils, extra-judicial service 436–7, 446
- Hope, Lord (UK), freedom of speech controversy 247–8
- human rights charters 50–1, 156–7, 175–6, 453 *see also* European Convention on Human Rights (ECHR)
- Hutton, Lord (UK), Dr David Kelly inquiry 507–10
- Iacobucci, Justice Frank (Canada), recusal 319–20
- ideological issues and appointments 139–40
- immunity of judges 72–3
- impartiality *see also* independence
 - absolute, as realistic objective 351–2
 - and Article 6 ECHR 366
 - bias, dichotomy with 301–2
 - as boundary to freedom of speech 250–2
 - challenges to 388–9
 - common law and Roman law principle compared 346–7
 - conflict with independence 239–42
 - constitutional provision 346–7
 - idea of judge 383
 - importance 165–6, 380–2
 - importance as common theme 533–4
 - presumption of 352
 - and public confidence 540–1
 - reputation for, as rationale for non-judicial functions 451
- impeachment 141–2
- impropriety, appearance of 389–90
- inability, removal for 86–8
- incapacity, removal for 85–6
- incompatibility test as to non-judicial functions 480–6
- incompetence as ground for removal 10
- independence *see also* impartiality
 - and abolition/restructuring of courts 92–3
 - accountability as requirement 10
 - accountability, tension with 9
 - administrative independence, entitlement 17
 - aspects, distinction between 15
 - challenges to 51
 - chapter summary 4
 - civil law and common law contrasted 17
 - collective independence, importance 3, 16
 - compromising practices 89–93
 - conflict with impartiality 239–42
 - constitutional provision *see* constitutional protection/provision
 - contact with executive 457
 - as core value 9–10, 13
 - different national approaches 3, 9
 - economic importance 3
 - and extra-judicial service 439–46
 - and freedom of speech 253–5, 259–60
 - importance as common theme 533–4, 535–6
 - and increasing role of judges 10
 - internal independence, importance 3, 16–17
 - international law as to 22–3
 - investigative inquiries, extra-judicial service 440–2, 443–4
 - legal writers' views 12
 - main issues 3–4

- independence (cont.)
 - Montreal Declaration 19
 - perceptions and realities 18
 - personal independence,
 - characteristics 15–16
 - principles 20–1
 - protection 19–21
 - and public confidence 162–5, 261–2, 410–11, 416, 540–1
 - and public honours awards 93
 - reasonable suspicion test 18–19
 - regulation generally 19–20
 - remuneration, legislative provision 49, 159, 454–5
 - research into 46, 47, 48–9
 - and rule of law 162–4, 428
 - security of tenure 51
 - and separation of powers 9–10, 429–30
 - standards 15–16, 17–18, 22–3
 - substantive independence, meaning 15–16
 - summary of issues 23
- India, state judges, power to appoint 49
- individualist arguments for freedom of speech 212–13
- informed observer *see* lay observer
- inquiries and hearings, public, service on 431–4, 447–51, 460–8, 487–9, 517–19
- inquiries into judges' conduct 35–41, 58–65, 78–9, 80–2, 108–11, 377
- interception of telecommunications, issuing of warrants as non-judicial function 416–17
- internal independence, importance 3, 16–17
- International Bar Association (IBA), standards of judicial independence 22–3
- International Institute for the Unification of Private Law *see* UNIDROIT
- international law as to judges' independence 22–3 *see also* European Convention on Human Rights (ECHR)
- internet and criticism of judges 262
- investigative inquiries, extra-judicial service 432, 439, 440–2, 443–4, 476–7, 494–5
- Israel
 - courts' recognition of importance of public confidence 6–7
 - increased role of judges, political motives for 12–13
- Jackson, Justice Robert (US), appointment as Nuremburg Trials chief prosecutor 434–5
- judges/judiciary
 - accountability *see* accountability
 - acting judges, appointment 32–5, 89–90, 91, 104–6
 - administrative judges, independence 19
 - appointment *see* appointments
 - attacks on *see* criticism of judges
 - bias *see* bias, reasonable suspicion of bias test
 - 'citizen judge' 164–9
 - conduct *see* conduct
 - confidence in *see* public confidence
 - constitutional protection/ provision *see* constitutional protection/provision
 - contemporary role 534–5
 - courts martial judges, independence 19
 - criticism *see* criticism of judges
 - discipline *see* discipline
 - diversity *see* diversity
 - election *see* election
 - ethnic representation 67–8, 71, 104, 453–4
 - financial interests *see* pecuniary interests
 - freedom of speech *see* freedom of speech
 - function *see* judicial function
 - impartiality *see* impartiality
 - inability as grounds for removal 86
 - incompetence as ground for removal 10
 - independence *see* independence

Cambridge University Press

978-0-521-19060-2 - Judiciaries in Comparative Perspective

Edited by H. P. Lee

Index

[More information](#)

INDEX

553

- 'liberal activist' judges, campaign against 263–5
- magistrates *see* magistrates
- misbehaviour, removal for 38, 82–5
- neutrality *see* impartiality
- non-judicial functions *see* non-judicial functions
- opposing lawyers and judges, relations between, as grounds for bias 338–40
- pay and pensions *see* remuneration
- pecuniary interests *see* pecuniary interests
- persona designata* 410–22
- personal independence, characteristics 15–16
- personal relationships and bias 310–13
- policy advice from 432–4, 439, 446, 471–2
- power *see* judicial power
- prejudice by, law of bias applied to 313
- presumption of impartiality 352
- protection *see* constitutional protection/provision
- 'proved misbehaviour' and public confidence 38
- provincial judges *see* provincial/state judges
- public confidence *see* public confidence
- recusal *see* recusal
- removal *see* removal
- remuneration *see* remuneration
- resignation, instances 40, 41, 63–4, 81, 143, 178–80, 188–9
- role *see* role of judges
- secondment 91–2
- security of tenure 76–8, 80
- selection *see* appointments
- sensitivity training 47
- skills as rationale for non-judicial functions 438
- speeches *see* freedom of speech
- state judges *see* provincial/state judges
- substantive independence, meaning 15–16
- suspension 44–5
- teaching and writing 471, 519–23
- temporary judges, appointment 32–5, 89–90, 91
- test for bias *see* reasonable suspicion of bias test
- tribunal judges, independence 18–19, 22
- women judges, appointment 32, 71, 104
- judges' rules on freedom of speech 191–3, 196–7, 235, 242–4
- judicial commissions/councils appointments 30–2, 46–7, 101–6, 118
- complaints handling 130–1
- complaints statistics 75
- discipline 58–65, 73–5, 106, 218–22
- effectiveness 113–16
- establishment 99–101, 118–19
- guidance 168–9, 191–3, 196–7, 235, 242–4, 266–72, 275, 448–51, 489–92
- judicial review 88–9
- membership 123–4
- overview 120–3
- record to date 124–6
- removal 41–4
- scrutiny of 131
- service on 487
- judicial decisions, judges' rules on comments as to 197
- judicial function non-judicial functions distinguished 405–10
- and procedural fairness 424
- judicial independence *see* independence
- judicial power definition 405–6
- limits 405–10
- judicial review danger of, extra-judicial service 443–5
- removal 88–9

- judicial system, core values *see* core values of judicial system
- jurors, suspicion of bias 340–1, 374
- justice argument for freedom of speech 211–12
- justice ministry, role 456–7
- Kable* principle
 - appointments 33–5
 - non-judicial functions 405, 422–6
- Kilmuir rules 157–64, 195, 196
- Kirby, Justice Michael (Australia), freedom of speech controversy 153–4
- knighthood as executive patronage 93
- Latimer House Guidelines on Judicial Independence 22–3
- lay observer
 - balanced approach 367
 - characteristics 336–7
 - description 367–8
 - knowledge attributed to 287–9, 336–7, 368
 - matters considered by 287
 - meticulousness of consideration by 287–9, 336–7
 - public confidence in 287–9, 336–7
 - reasonable suspicion of bias test 286–92
 - reasonableness standard 366–7
- legal realism
 - and criticism of judges 261–2
 - and election 397
 - influence 383–6
- legalism and public confidence 159–60
- L'Heureux-Dubé, Justice Claire (Canada), freedom of speech controversy 181, 315–17
- 'liberal activist' judges, campaign against 263–5
- liberal attacks on appointments 265
- 'litigation explosion' and criticism of judges 260–1
- Lord Chancellor *see* United Kingdom (UK)
- Madison, James, views on freedom of speech 211
- magistrates
 - appointment 120, 134–5
 - non-judicial functions 488–9
- Marks, Justice Kenneth (Australia), Royal Commission 414–15
- Marshall Jr., Justice Donald (Canada), inquiry into conduct 65, 185–6
- Mathews, Justice Jane (Australia), compatibility of non-judicial function 412–14
- Matlow, Justice Theodore (Canada), inquiry into conduct 64–5, 184–5, 318–19
- McClellan, Justice Peter (Australia), apprehension of bias 287–9
- McClung, Justice John (Canada), freedom of speech controversy 181, 315–17
- McLachlin, Chief Justice Beverley (Canada), apprehension of bias 315
- McCluskey, Lord (UK), freedom of speech controversy 250–2
- media criticism of judges
 - ability to respond 208–9
 - and public confidence 9
- Mill, John Stuart, views on freedom of speech 210–11
- Ministry of Justice, role 456–7
- misbehaviour, removal for 38, 82–5
- Montreal Declaration on Independence of Justice 19
- Moreau-Bérubé, Justice Jocelyne (Canada), removal of 187–8
- Mount Scopus Standards, independence 15–16, 17–18
- Murphy, Justice Lionel (Australia), attempted removal 36–8
- natural justice, bias and 301
- necessity exception to anti-bias rule
 - operation 342
 - and reasonable suspicion of bias test 296–9
- nemo judex in re sua* principle 361
- neutrality *see* impartiality

Cambridge University Press

978-0-521-19060-2 - Judiciaries in Comparative Perspective

Edited by H. P. Lee

Index

[More information](#)

INDEX

555

- New Zealand (NZ)
 - abolition of courts, statutory 92–3
 - appointments
 - accountability 68–70
 - acting judges 89–90
 - Attorney-General's power 67–8
 - chapter summary 66
 - fixed-term warrants 90–1
 - inferior courts 69–70
 - Judicial Appointments
 - Commission 70–1
 - Judicial Appointments Unit 68
 - main issues 66
 - Maori community 67–8, 71
 - procedures 68–70
 - secondment 91–2
 - standardisation 68–70
 - superior courts 68–9
 - women 71
 - Attorney-General, role 456–7
 - bias *see also* recusal *below*
 - by arbitrators 340–1
 - behaviour as indicator of actual
 - bias 337–8
 - criminal appeals 326
 - distinctive New Zealand approach
 - 326–7
 - increase in claims 345
 - by jurors 340–1
 - necessity exception to anti-bias
 - rule 342
 - prior decision-making as basis
 - 341–2
 - relations between opposing
 - lawyers and judges 338–40
 - Saxmere* cases 328–36
 - Bill of Rights 453
 - commissions of inquiry, service on
 - 460–8
 - complaints handling
 - procedures 73–5
 - Saxmere* cases 328–36
 - statistics 75
 - statutory provision 455
 - constitutional system
 - democratic tradition 454
 - features 452–3
 - judges' position within 452–7
 - court system, structure 456
 - Courts Executive Council, service on
 - 458
 - criticism of judges, ability to respond
 - individual's attacks 208–9
 - media attacks 206–8
 - principles 215–16
 - Dadelszen, Judge Paul von, freedom
 - of speech controversy 205
 - democratic tradition 454
 - discipline
 - chapter summary 66
 - complaints handling 73–5
 - complaints statistics 75
 - constitutional issues 71–2
 - immunity 72–3
 - main issues 66
 - Elias, Rt Hon. Dame Sian, Chief
 - Justice, freedom of speech
 - controversy 200
 - ethnic communities *see* Maori
 - community *below*
 - freedom of speech *see also* criticism
 - of judges; ability to respond
 - above*
 - Bill of Rights and 197–9
 - chapter summary 195, 196
 - controversies 200–9
 - convention as to 196
 - general principle 209–13
 - Judges' Bench Book rules 196–7
 - judges' freedom, general principle
 - 213–15
 - judges' government role and 200
 - as to lecture by judge 200
 - limits 196–7
 - main issues 195
 - oversight 197
 - principles 209–16
 - statutory limits 196
 - summary of issues 216
 - trial judge's 205–6
 - government system, judges' position
 - within 452–7
 - Governor-General, service as 468–9
 - Heads of Bench, service on 457
 - higher courts management
 - committees, service on 459–60

Cambridge University Press

978-0-521-19060-2 - Judiciaries in Comparative Perspective

Edited by H. P. Lee

Index

[More information](#)

556

INDEX

- New Zealand (NZ) (cont.)
 - human rights Bill 453
 - immunity of judges 72–3
 - independence
 - and abolition/restructuring of courts 92–3
 - compromising practices 89–93
 - contact with Executive 457
 - knighthood as executive patronage 93
 - remuneration, legislative provision 454–5
 - summary of issues 94–5
 - Independent Police Conduct Authority, service on 470
 - inferior court judges, appointment 68–9
 - inferior court judges, removal
 - attempts 80–2
 - protection 80
 - informed observer, characteristics 336–7
 - inquiry commissions, service on 460–8
 - inter-bench committees, service on 459
 - Judges' Bench Book, freedom of speech rules 196–7
 - judicial committees, service on 457–60
 - Judicial Conduct Commissioner
 - complaint to 334–6
 - judicial review 88–9
 - procedures 73–5
 - statistics 75
 - judicial decisions, judges' rules on
 - comments 197
 - judicial support committees, service on 459–60
 - Justice Ministry, role 456–7
 - Kilmuir rules 195, 196
 - knighthood as executive patronage 93
 - lecture by judge, free speech
 - controversy 200
 - legal committees, service on 458–9
 - legal system, size 452
 - Maori community
 - appointments 67–8
 - representation in judiciary 71
 - Waitangi Tribunal 453–4
 - Ministry of Justice, role 456–7
 - non-judicial functions
 - advisory commissions 465–6
 - flexibility 470
 - inquiries, service on 460–8
 - investigative inquiries 463–4
 - judicial committees 457
 - judicial review, for avoidance of 467–8
 - reasons for use of judges 466
 - parliamentary select committees, judges' rules on submissions 197
 - parliamentary select committees, service on 470–1
 - Parole Board, service on 470
 - pecuniary interests, former
 - approach 322–3
 - policy advice from judges 471–2
 - President of Law Commission, service as 469–70
 - public debate, judges' rules on
 - participation 196–7
 - public roles of judges
 - examples 468–73
 - summary of issues 473
 - recusal
 - current situation 345
 - domestic bodies 342–3
 - former approach 322–3
 - informed observer, characteristics 336–7
 - and integrity of justice system 324
 - local government 343–5
 - premature 327–8
 - prior decision-making as basis 341–2
 - self-examination 323
 - test 324–6
 - removal
 - attempts 78–9, 80–2
 - chapter summary 66
 - constitutional protection 454
 - inability 86–8

Cambridge University Press

978-0-521-19060-2 - Judiciaries in Comparative Perspective

Edited by H. P. Lee

Index

[More information](#)

INDEX

557

- incapacity 85–6
- judicial review 88–9
- main issues 66
- misbehaviour 82–5
- protection 76–8, 80
- remuneration, legislative provision 454–5
- restructuring of courts, statutory 92–3
- Saxmere* cases 328–36
- secondment of judges 91–2
- security of tenure 76–8, 80
- sentencing policy, free speech controversy 200
- Siemer, Vincent, attacks on judges 208–9
- statutory abolition/restructuring of courts 92–3
- superior court judges, appointment 69–70
- superior court judges, removal attempts 78–9
- protection 76–8
- Supreme Court, establishment 455–6
- system of government, judges' position within 452–7
- teaching and writing by judges 471
- trial judge, free speech controversy 205–6
- tribunals
 - characteristics 472
 - service on 472–3
 - system 456
- Waitangi Tribunal 453–4
- Wilson, Justice Bill, *Saxmere* cases 328–36
- women judges, appointment 71
- newspapers *see* media
- Niekerk, Barend van (South Africa), freedom of speech controversy 222–7
- non-judicial functions *see also specific jurisdictions, e.g., Canada*
 - acceptable activities 487
 - administrative tasks 487
 - advisory commissions 465–6
 - advocate for, danger of being 442–3
 - appendage of government, danger of being 440–1
 - bias, danger of suspicion of 443–5
 - caution against 428–9, 477–8
 - 'chameleon' doctrine 406
 - commissions and inquiries, service on 414–15, 432–4, 439, 513–17
 - comparison summary 539–40
 - conflict with government, danger of 441–2
 - connections with executive 415
 - constitutional issues 404–5
 - constitutional limits 429–30
 - continuing service, danger of 445–6
 - efficiency argument for 500
 - ethical reform proposals 448–51
 - examples 403–4, 468–73
 - executive role 430
 - flexibility 470
 - guidance for judges 426–7, 448–51, 497–8
 - historically regarded as judicial 405–6
 - impact on judiciary 439–46
 - incompatibility criteria 411, 482
 - incompatibility test 410–14, 480–6
 - increase 428
 - and independence 439–46
 - independent tribunals, service on 415
 - inquiries, service on 460–8
 - investigative inquiries 463–4
 - judges' skills as rationale 438, 466
 - judicial functions distinguished 405–10
 - judicial power, limits 405–10
 - judicial review, danger of 443–5
 - Kable* principle 405, 422–6
 - limits 429–31
 - magistrates 488–9
 - persona designata* exception 410–22
 - prohibition of payment for 112–13
 - political bias, danger of 439
 - and public confidence 411–12, 420, 423, 428–9, 446, 447, 448, 451, 485–6, 499, 500–1, 509, 513, 520, 521–2, 524

Cambridge University Press

978-0-521-19060-2 - Judiciaries in Comparative Perspective

Edited by H. P. Lee

Index

[More information](#)

558

INDEX

- non-judicial functions (cont.)
 - rationale 438
 - reasons for use of judges 466, 476
 - reform of rules as to 446–51, 486–7
 - reputation for impartiality as
 - rationale 451
 - security orders and warrants, issuing
 - of 416–22
 - and separation of powers 404–5, 410, 429–30, 479–80
 - statutory reform proposals 447–8
 - tribunals 472–3
 - types 431–8, 487–9
 - validity of statutory functions 407
- Northern Ireland, Judicial
 - Appointments Commission 118
- Nuremburg trials, service as special prosecutors 434–5
- observer *see* lay observer
- O'Connor, Justice Dennis (Canada),
 - service on inquiries 433–4
- offence of scandalising the court,
 - abolition 176–8
- Ombudsman, complaints handling
 - role 131
- opposing lawyers and judges, relations
 - between, as grounds for bias 338–40
- orders and warrants, issuing as non-judicial function 416–22, 487
- Paperny, Justice Marina, recusal
 - 309–10
- Parker, Judge John J. (US), nomination
 - 140
- parliamentary scrutiny of
 - appointments 122–3
- parliamentary select committees,
 - judges' rules on submissions 197
- parties to cases, disqualification for
 - relations with 371–2
- patronage and appointments 139
- pay and pensions *see* remuneration
- pecuniary interests
 - automatic disqualification 292–5, 349, 370–1
 - earlier approaches to 322–3
 - law of bias applied to 305–7
 - reasonable suspicion of bias test 292–5
- persona designata* exception as to non-judicial functions 410–22
- personal independence, characteristics 15–16
- personal relationships of judges, law of
 - bias applied to 310–13
- Pickles, Judge James (UK), threatened dismissal 128
- policy advice from judges 432–4, 439, 446, 471–2
- political associations as grounds for
 - recusal 355
- political attacks on judges *see* criticism
 - of judges
- political bias, danger of, non-judicial
 - functions 439
- prejudice by judges, law of bias applied
 - to 313
- press *see* media criticism of judges
- presumption of impartiality 352
- preventative detention orders, issuing
 - as non-judicial function 418–20
- prior decision-making as grounds for
 - bias 341–2
- procedural fairness
 - and Article 6 ECHR 11
 - as core value 5, 13
 - danger of undermining 443–5, 448
 - and efficiency 5
 - and judicial function 424
- 'proved misbehaviour' of judge, and
 - public confidence 38
- provincial/state judges *see also specific jurisdictions, e.g., Canada*
 - acting judges, appointment 32–5
 - appointment
 - power of 49
 - procedures 30, 54
 - attacks on appointments 265–6
 - complaints handling 41–4
 - discipline 62–3

- election campaigns, high cost of 266
- independence, challenges to 51
- judicial appointments commissions 31
- removal 35–41, 44–5, 59
- public confidence
 - in appointments 27–8
 - and behaviour outside court 8
 - conduct 65, 84, 87–8, 249
 - as core value 6–9, 13
 - courts' recognition of importance of 6–7
 - and criticism of judges 163–4, 395, 537–8
 - diversity 8
 - and duty to give reasons for decisions 7–8
 - and freedom of speech 164–5, 167, 169, 186, 187, 190–1
 - importance as common theme 540–1
 - and independence 162–4, 261–2, 410–11, 416
 - in lay observer 287–9
 - and legalism 159–60
 - and media criticism 9
 - and non-judicial functions 411–12, 420, 423, 428–9, 446, 447, 448, 451, 485–6, 499, 500–1, 509, 513, 520, 521–2, 524
 - as normative standard 411–12
 - and procedural fairness 5
 - and 'proved misbehaviour' of judge 38
 - and reasonable suspicion of bias test 285–6, 292, 295, 297–300, 303–4, 326, 339, 361–2, 365, 367, 373–4, 444
 - and recusal 8 *see also* recusal
 - and rule of law 162
- public debate, judges' rules on participation 196–7
- public hearings/inquiries, service on 430, 431–4, 447–51, 460–8, 487–9, 504–10, 517–19
- public roles of judges *see* non-judicial functions
- race issues as to recusal 354–5
- reasonable suspicion of bias test
 - and Article 6 ECHR 366
 - articulation of suspicion 281
 - choice of test 350–1, 369–70
 - considerations 351
 - constitutional issues 296–7
 - decision to use 350
 - definition of bias 302–5
 - double reasonableness requirement 354
 - establishment 349–50
 - jurors 374
 - lay observer, role of 286–92
 - nature of 362
 - and necessity exception to anti-bias rule 296–9
 - operation 280–3
 - pecuniary interests 292–5
 - public confidence in 285–6, 292, 295, 297–300, 303–4, 326, 339, 361–2, 365, 367, 373–4, 444
 - purposes 283–6
 - underlying purposes 297–9
 - use of 18–19, 353, 369–70, 371–4
 - waiver of right to object 295–9
- recusal *see also specific jurisdictions, e.g., Canada*
 - appeals against refusal of application 359–60
 - application 358–9
 - attitudinal bias 313
 - automatic, undesirability of 282
 - circumstances
 - general 347–8
 - special situations 354–7
 - colleagues on same bench 354
 - comparison summary 538–9
 - conduct 355–7
 - criteria for decision 282
 - current debasement 345
 - domestic bodies 342–3
 - and duty to sit 352–3
 - earlier approaches to 322–3
 - failure to recuse, effect of unlawful 359
 - family relationships 310–13
 - group memberships 307–10

Cambridge University Press

978-0-521-19060-2 - Judiciaries in Comparative Perspective

Edited by H. P. Lee

Index

[More information](#)

560

INDEX

- recusal (cont.)
 - informed observer, characteristics 336–7
 - and integrity of justice system 324
 - no call for 357–8
 - pecuniary interests 305–7
 - personal relationships 310–13
 - prejudice 313
 - premature 327–8
 - prior decision-making as basis 341–2
 - prior political associations 355
 - procedures 357–60, 375–7
 - proceedings, conduct of 355–7 and public confidence 8
 - race issues 354–5
 - rules 317–21
 - self-examination 323
 - statements of principle 318
 - successful application for, retrial upon 282–3
 - test 324–6
- regional devolution of powers, appointments 118–19
- removal *see also specific jurisdictions, e.g., Canada*
 - comparison summary 536–7
 - constitutional protection 454
 - effectiveness of system 113–16
 - impeachment 141–2
 - inability, for 86–8
 - incapacity, for 85–6
 - incompetence, for 10
 - instances 58–9, 80–2, 186–8
 - by judicial commissions 41–4
 - judicial review 88–9
 - misbehaviour, for 82–5
 - procedures 35–41, 58–65, 76–89, 106, 126–7, 140–3, 147–8
 - provincial/state judges 35–41, 44–5, 59
- remuneration, legislative provision 49, 159, 454–5
- resignation of judges, instances 40, 41, 63–4, 81, 143, 178–80, 188–9
- Roberts, Chief Justice John (US), views on impartiality 383
- role of judges
 - ‘citizen judge’ approach 164–9
 - increase
 - general trend 3
 - and independence 10
 - political motives for 12–13
 - within legal system 154–7
 - openness as to 162–4
- Roman law principle of impartiality, common law compared 346–7
- Ruffo, Justice Andrée (Canada), freedom of speech controversy 183–4, 313
- rule of law
 - and independence 162–4, 428
 - and public confidence 162
- salaries and pensions *see* remuneration
- Saxmere* cases 328–36
- scandalising the court, abolition of offence 176–8
- Scotland
 - Judicial Appointment Board, establishment 118
 - removal of judge for inability 87–8
- secondment of judges 91–2
- security of tenure 76–8, 80
- security orders and warrants, issuing as non-judicial function 416–22, 487
- Sedley, Sir Stephen (UK), freedom of speech controversy 248–9
- selection *see* appointments
- self-disqualification *see* recusal
- sensitivity training, use of 47
- separation of powers
 - constitutional issues 404–5
 - and independence 9–10, 159–61
 - and non-judicial functions 404–5, 429–30, 479–80
- short-term political aims and appointments 138–9
- Siemer, Vincent (NZ), attacks on judges 208–9
- skills of judges as rationale for non-judicial functions 438
- solicitors, disqualification for relations with 373–4, 376–7

- South Africa
 - apartheid regime 476–7
 - appointments 97–8
 - contempt of court 222–7
 - discipline 98–9
 - freedom of speech 218–27
 - independence, tensions during 99
 - non-judicial functions 475–8
 - removal 99
 - appointments
 - acting judges 104–6
 - apartheid regime 97–8
 - chapter summary 97
 - colonial regime 97–8
 - Constitutional Court 102
 - current regime 101–6
 - effectiveness of system 113–16
 - ethnic communities 104
 - main issues 96–7
 - social representativeness 104
 - women 104
 - bias *see also* recusal *below*
 - absolute neutrality as realistic objective 351–2
 - chapter summary 347
 - main issues 346–7
 - presumption of impartiality 352
 - reasonable apprehension test *see* reasonable apprehension test *below*
 - Cameron, Justice Edwin, freedom of speech controversy 235–6
 - conduct, Code of Judicial Conduct 235, 489–92
 - Constitutional Court
 - appointment to 102
 - duty to sit 352–3
 - establishment 96
 - freedom of speech issues 227–31
 - contempt of court
 - apartheid regime 222–7
 - current regime 227–33
 - discipline
 - apartheid regime 98–9
 - chapter summary 97
 - current regime 106
 - effectiveness of system 113–16
 - main issues 96–7
 - disqualified judge, automatic disqualification 349
 - diversity 104
 - duty to sit 352–3
 - ethnic representation 104
 - freedom of speech
 - apartheid regime 218–27
 - Code of Judicial Conduct 235
 - current regime 227–36
 - judges' speeches 233–6
 - main issues 217–18
 - Hlophe, Judge John, inquiry into conduct 108–11
 - impartiality, constitutional provision 346–7
 - independence
 - Boer republics 97
 - tensions during apartheid regime 99
 - transition to current regime 99–101
 - investigative inquiries, non-judicial functions 476–7
 - Judicial Service Commission
 - appointments 101–6
 - Code of Judicial Conduct 489–92
 - discipline 106
 - effectiveness 113–16
 - establishment 99–101
 - service on 487
 - magistrates, non-judicial functions 488–9
 - Niekerk, Barend van, freedom of speech controversy 222–7
 - non-judicial functions
 - acceptable activities 487
 - administrative tasks 487
 - apartheid regime 475–8
 - caution against 477–8
 - chapter summary 475
 - current activities 487–9
 - current regime 478–86
 - Heath* case 479–80
 - incompatibility criteria 482
 - incompatibility test 480–6
 - Judicial Services Commission Amendment Act provisions 489–92

- South Africa (cont.)
 - magistrates 488–9
 - main issues 474–5
 - prohibition of payment for 112–13
 - reasons for use of judges 476
 - reform of rules as to 486–7, 489–92
 - separation of powers 479–80
 - reasonable apprehension test
 - choice of test 350–1
 - considerations 351
 - decision to use 350
 - determination on facts 353
 - double reasonableness requirement 354
 - establishment 349–50
 - legal consensus as to 349
 - recusal 348
 - appeals against refusal of application 359–60
 - application 358–9
 - chapter summary 347
 - colleagues on same bench 354
 - conduct 355–7
 - and duty to sit 352–3
 - failure to recuse, effect of unlawful 359
 - general approach 347–54
 - no call for 357–8
 - prior political associations 355
 - procedures 357–60
 - race issues 354–5
 - special circumstances 354–5
 - summary of issues 360
 - removal
 - apartheid regime 99
 - chapter summary 97
 - current regime 106
 - effectiveness of system 113–16
 - main issues 96–7
 - separation of powers 479–80
- Truth and Reconciliation Commission, legal institutional hearing 218–22
- warrants for search and seizure, issuing of as non-judicial function 487
- women judges, appointment 104
- special prosecutors, extra-judicial service as 434–6
- speeches by judges *see* freedom of speech
- state judges *see* provincial/state judges
- statutory abolition/restructuring of courts 92–3
- substantive independence, meaning 15–16
- Supreme Court
 - appointment to 57–8
 - Commission 120–1
 - diversity 125–6
 - establishment 117–18, 455–6
- surveillance devices, issuing of warrants authorising use as non-judicial function 417–18
- suspension of judges 44–5
- teaching and writing by judges 471, 519–23
- telecommunications, issuing of interception warrants as non-judicial function 416–17
- temporary judges, appointment 32–5, 89–90, 91
- Thomson, Sheriff Peter (UK), removal 237–9
- training, sensitivity 47
- transparency *see* accountability
- tribunal judges, independence 18–19, 22
- tribunals
 - characteristics 472
 - service on 437–8, 472–3
 - system 456
- Truth and Reconciliation Commission (South Africa), legal institutional hearing 218–22
- truth argument for freedom of speech 210–11
- UNIDROIT
 - principles of justice system 13–15
 - standards of judicial independence 22–3
- United Kingdom (UK) *see also* Scotland *see* Northern Ireland

- appointments
 - Appointments Ombudsman 131
 - background to reform 118–20
 - devolution 118–19
 - diversity 8, 119–20, 121–2, 125–6
 - Lord Chancellor's powers 121
 - Lord Chief Justice's powers 117–18
 - magistrates 120
 - parliamentary scrutiny 122–3
 - political issues 119
 - Prime Minister's power 121–2
 - to public inquiries 503
 - reform 117–18, 121–2
 - summary of issues 132–3
 - Supreme Court *see* Supreme Court *below*
- appointments commissions
 - establishment 118–19
 - membership of England and Wales Commission 123–4
 - overview 120–3
 - record to date 124–6
- arbitrators, removal for bias 340–1
- and Article 6 ECHR 6, 8, 10–11, 366
- automatic disqualification for
 - pecuniary interests 294
- availability of judges, effect of service
 - on public inquiries 504
- Barrington, Sir Jonah, removal 84, 127
- bias *see also* disqualified judge *below*
 - anti-bias rule, characteristics 361–8
 - appearance of, and anti-bias rule 362–8
 - arbitrators, removal for 340–1
 - automatic disqualification 370–1
 - chapter summary 361–2
 - criminal appeals 326
 - jurors, removal for 340–1
 - necessity exception to anti-bias rule 342
 - summary of issues 377–8
 - test *see* bias test *below*
- bias test
 - and Article 6 ECHR 366
 - choice of test 324–6, 350–1, 369–70
 - jurors 374
 - lay observer *see* lay observer *below*
 - nature of 362
 - use of 348, 369–70, 371–4
- Bingham, Lord, freedom of speech
 - controversy 249–50
- complaints handling 129–32, 377
- conduct
 - Guide to Judicial Conduct 242–4
 - rules 82–5
- constitutional reform, reform of
 - judges' role 117–18, 493
- criticism of judges, summary of
 - issues 255–6
- devolution and appointments 118–19
- discipline
 - 'misbehaviour' 82–5
 - Ombudsman 131
 - procedures 126–7
- disqualified judge
 - apprehension of bias 348
 - attitudinal bias 371–2
 - automatic disqualification 370–1
 - chapter summary 361–2
 - Court of Appeal guidance 372–3
 - failure to disclose interests, effect 359, 370–1
 - group memberships 373
 - nemo iudex in re sua* principle 361
 - pecuniary interests 294, 370–1
 - prior decision-making as basis 341–2
 - recusal 375–7
 - relations with parties 371–2
 - relations with solicitors 373–4, 376–7
 - relations with witnesses 373
 - waiver of right to object to 374–5
- diversity 8, 119–20, 121–2, 125–6
- duty to give reasons for decisions 8
- freedom of speech
 - challenging government 244–7
 - conflict between impartiality and independence 239–42
 - controversy over 237–9, 247–50
 - government criticism of judges 253–5

Cambridge University Press

978-0-521-19060-2 - Judiciaries in Comparative Perspective

Edited by H. P. Lee

Index

[More information](#)

564

INDEX

- United Kingdom (UK) (cont.)
 - impartiality as boundary 250–2
 - and independence 253–5
 - individualist arguments for 212
 - justice argument for 211–12
 - rules 242–4
- government
 - criticism by judges 244–9
 - criticism of judges 253–5
- Hope, Lord, freedom of speech
 - controversy 247–8
- Human Rights Act 1998, judge's
 - criticism of 250–2
- Hutton, Lord, Dr David Kelly
 - inquiry 507–10
- immunity of judges, service on
 - public inquiries 504
- impartiality of judges
 - as boundary to freedom of speech 250–2
 - conflict with judges' independence 239–42
- independence
 - conflict with impartiality 239–42
 - and freedom of speech 253–5
 - legislative provision 11–12, 21
 - tribunal judges 19, 22
- Judges' Council, Guide to Judicial Conduct 242–4
- Judicial Appointments and Conduct Ombudsman 131
- jurors, removal for bias 340–1
- Kelly, Dr David, inquiry into death 507–10
- Kilmuir rules 157–8
- lay observer
 - balanced approach 367
 - description 367–8
 - knowledge attributed to 368
 - reasonableness standard 366–7
- Lord Chancellor
 - appointments powers 121
 - automatic disqualification for pecuniary interests 294
 - complaints handling 129–32
 - Concordat with Lord Chief Justice 126–7
 - discipline and removal 126–9
 - magistrates, appointment of 120
 - reform of role 117–18
- Lord Chief Justice
 - appointment powers 117–18
 - Concordat with Lord Chancellor 126–7
 - discipline 129–30
 - removal 128–9
- magistrates, appointment 120
- McCluskey, Lord, freedom of speech
 - controversy 250–2
- Mill, John Stuart, views on freedom of speech 210–11
- non-judicial functions *see* public inquiries, service on *below*
- Office of Judicial Complaints
 - scrutiny of 131
 - work 130–1, 377
- parliamentary scrutiny of
 - appointments 122–3
- pecuniary interests, automatic
 - disqualification for 294, 370–1
- Pickles, Judge James, threatened dismissal 128
- Prime Minister's power to appoint 121–2
- protection from political
 - interference
 - effect of service on public inquiries 504–10
- public inquiries, service on
 - appointments, impact on 503
 - appropriateness 499–502
 - availability of judges, impact on 504
 - case study 507–10
 - chapter summary 493–4
 - immunity of judges, impact on 504
 - impact on judges' independence 502
 - increased use of inquiries 494–5
 - main issues 493–5
 - nature of inquiries 496
 - protection from political
 - interference, impact on 504–10
 - Salmon principles 497–8
 - statutory inquiries 496–9

Cambridge University Press

978-0-521-19060-2 - Judiciaries in Comparative Perspective

Edited by H. P. Lee

Index

[More information](#)

INDEX

565

- recusal *see* disqualified judge *above*
- removal 128–9
 - freedom of speech issues 237–9
 - inability, for 85–6, 87–8, 249
 - instances 80–2
 - by Royal Commission 81
 - rules 127–9
- resignation of judges, instances 81
- Royal Commissions 6, 81
- Salmon principles 497–8
- Sedley, Sir Stephen, freedom of speech controversy 248–9
- Supreme Court
 - Commission 120–1
 - diversity 125–6
 - establishment 117–18
- Thomson, Sheriff Peter, removal 237–9
- tribunal judges, independence 19, 22
- Wolf, Lord, freedom of speech controversy 244–7
- United Nations (UN) and independence 105, 166
- United States (US)
 - accountability and freedom of speech 259–60
 - administrative judges, independence 19
 - American Bar Association (ABA)
 - Model Code of Judicial Conduct 266–72, 275, 380–1, 386–90, 396
 - response to political attacks on judges 275
- appeal cases, criticism of judges in politically controversial 262
- appointments
 - ‘depoliticisation’ 273–4
 - election campaigns, high cost of 266
 - federal courts 135–40
 - ideological issues 139–40
 - liberal attacks 265
 - magistrate judges 134–5
 - patronage 139
 - political factors 135–40
 - short-term political aims 138–9
 - social representativeness 139
 - state courts 143–7
 - trends emerging 149–50
- Benjamin, Justice Brent, apprehension of bias 392–6
- bias
 - approach to 382–6
 - chapter summary 380, 381–2
 - disqualification and discipline, criteria 386–90
 - and election 396
 - impartiality, importance 380–2
 - main issues 379–80
 - in state courts, federal
 - constitutional protection 390–6
- Bork, Judge Robert, nomination 140
- Brennan, Justice William, nomination 138–9
- Chase, Justice Samuel, attempted impeachment 141
- circuit courts
 - appointments 136–8
 - system 135
- conduct
 - American Bar Association
 - Model Code 266–72, 275, 380–1, 386–90, 396
 - Code of Conduct for United States Judges 386–90
 - impartiality *see* impartiality *below*
 - impropriety, appearance of 389–90
- conservative attacks on judges
 - evangelical conservatives 261
 - ‘liberal activism’, campaign against 263–5
- court system
 - common characteristics of federal and state systems 134
 - federal courts *see* federal courts *below*
 - state courts *see* state courts *below*
- criticism of judges
 - ability to respond, importance 273
 - cyclical nature of 260–2
 - ‘depoliticisation’ response 273–4
 - future developments 273–5
 - historical cycles 260
 - judges’ response 266–72, 273–5

Cambridge University Press

978-0-521-19060-2 - Judiciaries in Comparative Perspective

Edited by H. P. Lee

Index

[More information](#)

566

INDEX

- United States (US) (cont.)
 - 'liberal activism', campaign against 263–5
 - main issues 257–8
 - overview 258–66
 - political reasons for 260–2
 - progression generally 260
 - summary of issues 275
 - 'depoliticisation' of appointments 273–4
 - discipline
 - Canada contrasted 62
 - effectiveness 142
 - federal courts 140–3
 - standards 386–90
 - state courts 148
 - disqualification of judges
 - chapter summary 380, 381–2
 - criteria 386–90
 - district courts
 - appointments 136–8
 - system 135
 - Dworkin, Ronald, views on freedom of speech 212–13
 - election, bias and 396
 - Embry, Justice Eric, apprehension of bias 392
 - evangelical conservatives
 - and criticism of judges 261
 - federal courts
 - appointments 135–40
 - attacks on appointments 265
 - circuit courts *see* circuit courts *above*
 - court system 134–5
 - discipline 140–3
 - district courts *see* district courts *above*
 - removal 140–3
 - Supreme Court *see* Supreme Court *below*
 - freedom of speech *see also* criticism of judges *above*
 - chapter summary 258
 - constitutional provision 258
 - defamation, judge's right to sue 258–9
 - and independence 259–60
 - Madison, James, views of 211
 - Hoar, Judge Ebenezer, nomination 139
 - impartiality
 - challenges to 388–9
 - idea of judge 383
 - importance 380–2
 - Model Code as to 380–1
 - impeachment 141–2
 - impropriety, appearance of 389–90
 - independence
 - administrative independence 17–18
 - administrative judges 19
 - and freedom of speech 259–60
 - public confidence 261–2
 - remuneration 135–6
 - internet and criticism of judges 262
 - Jackson, Justice Robert,
 - appointment as Nuremburg Trials chief prosecutor 434–5
 - legal realism
 - and criticism of judges 261–2
 - and election 397
 - influence 383–6
 - 'liberal activist' judges, campaign against 263–5
 - liberal attacks on appointments 265
 - 'litigation explosion' and criticism of judges 260–1
 - Madison, James, views on freedom of speech 211
 - magistrate judges, appointment and role 134–5
 - national courts *see* federal courts *above*
 - non-judicial functions
 - associational activities 523–6
 - charitable activities 526–8
 - Code of Judicial Conduct 512–13
 - government commissions 513–17
 - public hearings 517–19
 - separation of powers 410
 - summary of issues 528–9
 - teaching and writing 519–23
 - Parker, Judge John J., nomination 140
 - President's power to appoint 135–40

removal	composition 20, 135
federal courts 140–3	jurisdiction 135
impeachment 141–2	
inability, for 85	values <i>see</i> core values of judicial system
state courts 147–8	Vasta, Justice Angelo (Australia),
resignation of judges 143	removal 39–40
Roberts, Chief Justice John, views on	Venezuela, provincial judges, power to
impartiality 383	appoint 49
separation of powers 9–10, 410	
state courts	waiver doctrine, reasonable suspicion
appointments 143–7	of bias test 295–9
attacks on appointments 265–6	warrants and orders , issuing as
bias in, federal constitutional	non-judicial function 416–22,
protection 390–6	487
court system 143	Wilson, Justice Bill (NZ), apprehension
discipline 148	of bias, <i>Saxmere</i> cases 328–36
election campaigns, high cost of	witnesses, disqualification for relations
266	with 373
removal 147–8	women judges, appointment 32, 71,
Supreme Court	104
appointments, political factors	Woolf, Lord (UK), freedom of speech
138–40	controversy 244–7