

Index

absolute priorities. See also difference principle measuring, 81 granted in Rawls's approach, 5 quantitative measure of, 33 Harsanyi's distaste for, 423 advantaged, demonizing, 403 Aggregation Theorem. See Harsanyi's Harsanyi's skepticism about, 5 to the least advantaged social group, 72 Aggregation Theorem within a liberal utilitarian code, 422-429 Agreement condition of Mongin, 209 principles in Rawls's theory, 73-74 allocation rules, 37, 263 of Rawls, 413 defined, 268, 269 absolute welfare weights, 175, 176 in implementation theory, 37 abstract analysis, 10 rationalizing, 273 act(s) versus social rankings, 268 ex ante alternative as, 19 allocations, computing values of, 277 allocative efficiency, 381-385 preference as a relation between, 206-207 act utilitarianism altruism, evolution of, 348 distinguishing from rule utilitarianism, 413 altruistic preferences, 227 negative implementation effects, 417 ambitions, chances of success of, 292 optimal rule utilitarian moral code American cause, defenders of, 397 compared to, 61 ancients, liberty of, 390 as a super-Machiavellistic morality, 413 Anonymity, 180, 185, 193, 271 theory of right, 222 antidictatorial social evaluation functional, 179 actions, morally good and bad, 78 appreciation for individual excellence and adaptive efficiency, 381-384 superior performance, 76 adaptive preference formation, 281, 297-298 appropriateness, 377 adaptive preferences arbitrary basis, act perpetrated on, 392 nothing wrong with, 298 arbitrary interference capacity for, 407 sour grapes as one aspect of, 297 additive principle others lacking the capacity for, 398 for histories, 224 possible, 58 not deriving from preferencism, 225-226 vulnerability to, 393 additivity, 224-226 Aristotle, 296 admissible profiles, 140 Arneson, Richard admissible social evaluations, 140 evolution of thought, 8 adulthood, allocating resources at the onset index of primary goods, 35 of, 9. See also canonical moment personal responsibility, 7-9 advantage, 239-240 Rawls, responsibility, and distributive justice, 80-107 common currency of, 33-36



436 Index

Arneson, Richard (cont.)	badly off. See also disadvantaged; least
Rawls's account of merit and	advantaged class; poor and oppressed;
deservingness, 8	worst off
Arrovian impossibilities, avoiding, 265	priority to, 104
Arrovian independence axiom. See Arrovian	bargaining, in the original position, 317
Independence of Irrelevant Alternatives	bargaining problem
Condition	characteristics of, 44
Arrovian Independence of Irrelevant	simplest type of, 317
Alternatives condition, 22, 152-153, 199,	solutions to, 319-320, 342
271. See also Binary Independence of	bargaining solution, 44, 45
Irrelevant Alternatives; Independence of	bargaining theory, 367-369
Irrelevant Alternatives	Barry, Brian
Arrovian social choice theory	on want satisfaction, 40-41, 281-299
axioms inspired by, 273	basic liberties, 81
goal of, 264	basic moral rights, 415
social aggregation procedure, 137	basic structural inequalities, 82
Arrovian social welfare function, 20, 22, 36,	basic structure of society, 80
38, 141	basins of attraction, 47
Arrow, Kenneth J.	of equal sharing, 52
on determining the worst off, 35	of evolutionary stable polymorphic states,
modeling the social choice problem, 20	339
reaffirming ordinalism, 201	Nash solution versus utilitarianism, 53
Arrow-Pratt (absolute or relative) measure of	bearers of moral attitudes, 78
risk aversion, 188	bearer's responsibility view of free will, 78
Arrow's framework, as purely ordinal, 199	beliefs
Arrow's General Possibility Theorem.	abandonment of pure democracy of,
See Arrow's impossibility theorem	117
Arrow's impossibility theorem, 38, 198–199	coherent sets incompatible between
aspirations, adjusting to possibilities, 298	themselves, 115
assurance, giving to property owners, 418	converged upon as objective, 124
assurance effects. See expectation effects	convergence in, 123
asymmetric bargaining, 342–347	as empirically grounded, 116
asymmetric case, 346–347	enlarging the set of core, 118
attitudes toward risk, 425	of high reliability, 122
autarkic chooser, 360	intuitions as, 112
authority, granting over others, 378	justifying axioms, 114
autistic approach, as constrained, 363	making coherent, 113
average utilitarian rule, ranking	benefits, equal sharing of, 372
lotteries, 14	Bentham, Jeremy
average welfare, maximizing, 133, 134	advocate of law representing a compromise
avoidance and pursuit, 358	of liberty, 395
axiomatic approach, to constructing social	on ipsedixism, 305
welfare orderings, 39	opposing the American cause in the 1770s,
axiomatic characterizations of welfarism, 150	opposing the American cause in the 1770s,
axiomatic systems, 113	rejecting the notion of freedom as
	nondomination, 398
axiomatizations, 146	utilitarian criterion, 288
axioms, bearing on social orderings, 270	
had luck	Berlin, Isaiah, 56, 391
bad luck	Bernoulli, Daniel, 223
compensating for, 103	Bernoulli expected utility profiles, 146,

174, 181

initial opportunities and, 104



Index 437

Bernoulli hypothesis, 23, 148-149, 223. See standard objection to Harsanyi's theorems, also expectational concept implying risk neutrality about good, 231 version of Harsanyi's social aggregation objection to, 148, 232 theorem, 28-29 brute luck, 7, 87-88, 326 satisfying, 27, 145, 158 Bernoulli utility function, 19, 145 budget sets, social ranking of distributions of, attitudes toward risk captured by, 148 272 as continuous and state-independent, 146 bureaucratic elite, 383 unique up to a positive affine transform, 148 Bert's case, 102-106 calm judgements, 119 best reply, 44 calm passions, 229 betterness relation, 31 canonical moment, 86, 101 Binary Independence of Irrelevant difference principle, 89-90 Alternatives, 152-153, 160. See also distributive principle, 89 Arrovian Independence of Irrelevant version of the Rawlsian difference principle, Alternatives Binmore, Ken capabilities, Sen's theory of, 7 criticizing the use of the Harsanyi doctrine, capacity for choice, restoring, 92 cardinal noncomparable partition, 143 defining a distinctive moral sort of rational cardinal unit-comparable function, 143 choice, 416 cardinal unit-comparable plus partition, 144, on equiprobability model, 422 163, 164 on extended preferences, 235 cardinal utilities for game theory, 201 modeling self-policing social contracts, 323 cardinal utility functions, 307 as a modern Humean, 335 comparing, 307 on natural justice, 47 required restriction, 425 naturalistic account of moral behavior, 337 utility gain or loss meaningful with, 13 naturalizing Harsanyi and Rawls, 303-332 cardinality, 185 Cardinality and Unit Comparability (CU), on social evolution, 425 on symmetric empathy equilibrium, 328 191, 194 theory of justice, 417 Carnap, Rudolf, as a subjectivist, 205 on utility theory among neoclassical cash lotteries preferences over, 131 economists, 416 biological time, long run corresponding to, 328 risk neutral preferences over, 132 birth lottery, 130, 135 Cato's Letters, 389, 396 Blackorby, Charles, 23, 136 causal explanation of preferences, 234 Blackstone, William, 395 causally empty situation, 235 Bolker-Jeffrey expected utility theory, 28, 206, causes of intuitions, 109 207, 208 champagne tastes. See expensive tastes Boolean algebra, 110 character planning, 298 Bowers v. Hardwick, 285 characterizations, 166 Bradley probability agreement theorem, 29 choice(s) Braithwaite, John, 390, 401 explaining in uncertain circumstances, 32 Brandt, R. B., 111 modern economic theory of, 242 Broome, John responsibility for self-affecting, 96 Bernoulli hypothesis, 23 rule-governed, 376 coherence among judgments of value, 241 choice and expectation, convergence of, 355 identifying utilities with individual good or choice-following, deficiencies in, 88 well-being, 181 choice-making, deficiencies in, 88 preference-based utilitarianism, 30, 221-237 choice-theoretic foundation for classical

utilitarianism, 26

probability agreement theorem, 27



Cicero, 389	complex moral norms, 120
citizens, not fearing other citizens, 398	concept of degree, expectational, 231
civil liberty, recognized by Paley, 400	concept of degree of preference, 229
civil order, 378	conception(s) of the good, 248
civil war, as a result of Rawls's theory, 72	adjusting, 94
claim-rights	adjusting to circumstances, 95
giving certain absolute priority, 414	opposed, 107
never overridden by liberties, 428	responsibility for, 85
as permissible strategies, 428-429	conclusions, as context dependent, 270
closed conditions on information, 383	confidence in ethics, 119
Cobb-Douglas function of individual utilities,	consequential costs of the autistic approach,
157	363
Cobb-Douglas social welfare function, 162	consequentialist argument, 375
coercion	consequentialist principles, 21-22
in a large modern state, 311	considered judgements, 119
limiting, 56	consistency, as a weak test for beliefs, 114
cognitive dissonance reduction, 291	consistency postulates of Von Neumann and
Cohen G. A., on personal responsibility, 7	Morgenstern, 307
coherence	Constant, Benjamin, 390
defining, 114, 115	consumption, money metric of, 254, 258, 239
on moral views, 125	context, fault depending on, 85
coherence theory for ethics, 117	contingent social contracts, 321
coherence theory of justification, 10, 113-117	continuity axiom for actions, 426
coherence-foundationalist theory, 116	contractarian tradition, 42
coherentism	contractual arrangement, perpetually
empirical input effect on, 116-117	renegotiating, 369
simple, 117	convergence
commitment	alternative account of the process of, 364
to act, 377	in belief, 123
theory of bargaining with, 319	in ethics, 125
common good, Harsanyi axioms	convex set, 25, 166
characterizing, 308	cooperation
common knowledge condition, 358	alternative model of, 371–374
common preference, Harsanyi endorsing,	case for the revised model of, 374–376
248–249	distributing benefits from, 55
common preference principle, 246	cooperative dispositions, 53–56
justifying, 247	cooperative game theory, 43, 44, 419
of Sugden, 34	cooperative interaction
common prior assumption, 246	alternative view of, 371
common sense, 414	modeling, 354–358
commonwealthmen, 389	coordinated choice, 364
communication, absence of, 357	coordination games
communitarians, 285	nature of, 354
community standards, appeal to, 284, 285	pure, 54
compatibilist approach to free will, 6	core values, 118
compatibilists, 77	credibility of beliefs, 114–115
compensation, opportunity approach to, 9	credibility transfers
compensation test, principle of, 253	appropriateness to ethics, 122
competitive capitalism, 56–57	systematic network of, 121
Complete Utility Attainability property, 24, 25	criminal justice, 401
completeness, 110	CU. See Cardinality and Unit Comparability



Index 439

cultural evolution, dynamic modeling of, 335 currency of advantage, 240 current market prices, valuing opportunity sets, 36 Daniels, Norman, 92 Dasgupta, Partha, 384 d'Aspremont, Claude on welfarism and social aggregation, 24-26 welfarist version of Harsanyi's Aggregation Theorem, 184 Davidson, Donald, 113 debate between Harsanyi and Rawls, 4 Debreu coefficient of resource utilization, 277 decentralized decision making, 382 Decision Analysis, 210 deep inequalities, 81 defectors, 366 degrees of good, 228 demand behavior, 266 democratic equality, 74 deregulation of economic activity, 384 Dershowitz, Alan, 2 desert-based principle of responsibility, 8 desert-based theory of justice, 84 desert-catering prioritarian theory, 9 deservingness, 104 deservingness and merit, 84 desirability, 257 defined, 207 of an event, 207 natural money-metric index of, 258 dessert makes strange bedfellows example, 212-215 determinism, 75 deterministic view of human behavior, 77 dictatorial social evaluation functionals, 179 dictators, 209 difference principle. See also absolute priorities mixing deep and shallow inequalities, 83 of Rawls, 5, 89, 378 remaining controversial, 412 yielded by maximin rule, 342 disadvantaged. See also badly off; least advantaged class; poor and oppressed; fueling deep resentment of, 383 disagreement point in a bargaining problem, discretization, granularity of, 340

disembodied preferences, 248 dispositional concept of preference, 226 distribution defining without alluding to wants, 296 of rights, opportunities, and resources, 290 distributive criterion, applying to an index of resource holdings, 39 distributive justice compensating for bad luck, 103 compensating individuals for misfortune, 80 continuously divisible good in problems of, fusion of Rawls and Dworkin on, 88 problem of allocating resources not utility, theory of, 295-296 diversity, 209 assumption of, 208 as part of political reality, 215 division economies constructing social ordering functions in, 269 model of, 270 domination, limiting, 58 Donaldson, David social aggregation and the expected utility hypothesis, 136 on social aggregation under uncertainty, 23 Doolittle, Alfred, 82 double hermeneutic feature of the human sciences, 112 doubts, raised by piecemeal appeal to intuition, 108 dualism of practical reason, 424 Dworkin, Ronald on equal concern, 422 equality of resources proposal espoused by, on personal responsibility, 7 dynamic modeling, of cultural evolution, 335 easier-to-lose-freedom effect, 396-397 economic approaches, to the setting of priorities, 384 economic efficiency, 253 economic opportunities identifying a common currency of, 35 money metric of, 239 economic resources, distribution of, 37 economic time, short run corresponding to,

discriminatory proposals, filtering out, 404



440 Index

economy in division problems, 37 equal rights effective freedom, measuring, 253 determining feasible, 420 effectively equivalent options, 97 optimal system of, 421 efficiency, 104 equal sharing, basin of attraction of, 52 efficiency-egalitarian principle, 377-379 equal splits all bargaining solutions agreeing on, 348 efficient inequalities, 378 effort, not a moral basis for claims over evolution of, 349 in interaction with anonymous opponents, resources, 6 egalitarian arrangements, 378, 379 egalitarianism, nonteleological defense equality of opportunities, as paramount, 3 equality of resources proposal, 87 of, 323 egalitarians, debates with utilitarians, 304 equilibria Elster, Jon, 281 based on trust and distrust, 381 on adaptive preference formation, 41 selecting from among, 357 excluding the fox from the consumption of equilibrium, 429 the grapes, 294 equilibrium analysis, conditions driving, 358-361 individuals limiting wants, 40 equilibrium condition, 356 on preference change, 298 equilibrium of forces interpretation, 367 on preference shaping, 298-299 equilibrium outcomes, feasible set, 420 on "Sour Grapes", 290-298 equilibrium pairs empathetic equilibrium, 422-423 Lewis on, 362 empathetic preferences, 313-314 preoccupation with, 356 as an artifact of upbringing, 326 equilibrium reasoning, implications of, 356 behind the veil, 48 equilibrium requirement, deriving from as being packaged, 327 best-reply reasoning, 359 expressing outside the family, 326 equilibrium theory, 376 imitated and propagated, 50 equipollence, structure of, 121 similar, 325 equiprobability criterion, 416 empathetic utility function equiprobability model of impersonal choice, expressing in terms of personal utility functions, 317 equivalent options, 97-98 of an observer, 314 ethical arguments, against using utility, 266 empathetic utility scale, 314 ethical beliefs empathy equilibrium, symmetric, 328 aim in holding, 121 empirical observations in the natural sciences, causal story of, 120 convergence in, 123 employer, interfering with employees, 407 as independent of metaethics, 124 ends, amending responsibility for, 96 justification of, 10 enforcement, associated costs of, 366 moral intuitions justifying a set of, 10 natural history of, 237 enforcement mechanism, as a sanction system, as susceptible to defects, 120 equal basic rights, 411, 412 ethical language, intelligibility of, 118 equal division ethical neutrality of Binmore, 237 favored in the symmetric case, 347 ethical notions, adding to core beliefs, 118-119 as a unique evolutionarily stable strategy, ethical standards, 112 ethical thought, 121 equal income Walrasian rule, 274-275 ethics coherence theory for, 117-122 equal liberties, as paramount, 3 equal opportunities maximin principle as a poor decision in a radical sense, 7 rule, 72 Rawls's notion of, 7 as a therapeutic effort, 109



Index 441

eu (expected utility), 199 expected utilities for a lottery, 309 events expected utility axioms, 146 expected utility criteria, plural systems of, 426 concept of, 28 expected utility hypothesis preference as a relation between, 207 satisfying, 147, 150, 180 evolutionary dynamics of an asymmetric social preferences satisfying, 138 bargaining game, 343 evolutionary equilibrium, 235 utility functions satisfying, 145 evolutionary forces, leading to shared expected utility profile, 147, 149 expected utility property, 28, 130, 131 empathetic preferences, 50 expected utility theorem, 137 evolutionary game theory, 45, 46 evolutionary process expected utility theory, 145, 230 model of, 341 applications of, 225 Arrow's version of, 146 shaping who we are, 43 evolutionary stability developed by von Neumann and Morgenstern, 12-14 exploring the issue of, 327 standard conditions for, 327 versions of, 19 evolutionary stable strategy, 45-46, 337-338 expected-utility maximization, 71 evolutionary viability of fairness norms, 51 expenditure function of an individual, 254 ex ante aggregation, 200, 206 expensive tastes ex ante alternative, 19. See also state-contingent costly to satisfy, 306 alternatives Rawls's discussion of, 250 ex ante approach resolving, 102 difficulties of, 215 experimentation, learning from, 362 to social aggregation, 26, 27 exploitation, people subject to, 406 to social evaluation, 159 extended alternatives, 233 ex ante impossibility theorems Extended Interval Independence, 271-272, 279 general versions of, 27 extended lottery, faced by an impartial Harsanyi's aggregation theorem and, 204 observer, 14 extended preferences, 233 ex ante Pareto principles, 181 ex ante possibility theorem, 208 of Harsanyi, 243-244 Harsanyi's concept of, 34 ex post aggregation, 200, 210-216 as not coinciding, 234 ex post alternative, 19, 19. See also state-contingent alternatives as universal, 233 ex post approach extended prospects, 129 flipping problem inherent in, 211-212 extended sympathy preferences. See empathetic to social aggregation, 26 preferences; extended preferences to social evaluation, 159 ex post school of welfare economics, 225 facts, testing moral views, 123 excellence, fostering, 75 fair allocation, theory of, 37, 38 exceptions, flexible policy of making, 376 fair distribution of resources, 89 expectation effects, 418-420 fair distribution, of rights, opportunities, and expectational concept, 230-232. See also resources, 290 Bernoulli hypothesis fair division, 340 of degree, 231 fair equality of opportunity, principle of, 411, of good, 231 expectations fair opportunity for well-being, 105-106 defined, 249 fair rule of law, 58, 405 forming about preferences, 259 fair shares interdependence of, 355 personal responsibility as a determinant of, expected Bernoulli utility functions, 20, 138, 145 of primary social goods, 86



fair social orderings, 36-40	intuitive interpretation of, 77-79
fair-minded mutant, 339	to make choices, 97
fairness	personal experience suggesting, 76–77
considerations of, 370–371	Rawls and, 75
do-as-you-would-be-done-by principles	freedom
of, 48	antonym of, 393
issue of justice as, 384	deflating to noninterference, 400
fairness norm(s), 39	Marx's conception of, 56
evolution of, 47	maximal equal distribution of, 401
evolutionary viability of, 51	as noninterference, 391, 392, 394
operating in practice, 329	notion shared among republican thinkers,
original position as a, 325	390
social welfare orderings incorporating,	republican ideal of, 390–399
38	freedom as nondomination, 392, 394, 397–399
families, relationships within, 326	as excessively demanding on the state, 400
fault, depending on context, 85	increasing, 399
faulty, suffering imposition first, 84–85	as not all-or-nothing, 399
feasibility of moral views, 125	substantial commitment to redistribution,
feasible Bernoulli utility vectors, 149	402
feasible set of equilibrium strategy	freedom of choice, measuring, 253
combinations, 420	free-riding
feasible utilities, 179–180	disposition to, 376, 377
feasible utility vectors, 151, 152	distributive formula resulting from, 373
Federalist Papers, 389	preventing, 312
final ends, as incommensurable, 94	frequency interpretation of probability, 205
finite trade-off between social values, 73	Friedman, Milton, 56
first best problem, 268	full cooperation
fixed numeraire egalitarian equivalent rule, 274	changes in the arrangement, 373
Fleurbaey, Marc	conditions of, 372–373
Bert's case, posed by, 103	rationality of, 376
on fair social orderings, 36	full cooperators
on personal responsibility, 7	not free-riding, 373
utilitarianism versus fairness in welfare	settling on an arrangement and a
economics, 263–278	distributive rule, 374
flexibility, measuring, 253	fully cooperative arrangement, 372
flipping, 27	functionality, 209
flipping phenomenon, 200, 213	fundamental preference, 33
flipping theorem, 28, 29, 211	fundamental similarity postulate, 416
folk theorems on indefinitely repeated games,	
353, 365–367	game(s)
form of life, 112–113	cooperative and noncooperative, 43
formal institutional arrangement sanction	as a strategic situation, 43
system, 366	game form models, 429
foundationalism, starting points, 117	game theory, 43–47
foundationalist presupposition, rejecting,	Game Theory and the Social Contract, 303
115	Gauthier, David, 45
fox and the grapes parable, 41, 295. See also	gene, social equivalent of, 327
sour grapes	Generic Ex Ante Impossibility Theorem, 200.
free will	See also Harsanyi's Aggregation Theorem
concerned with implementation, 8	genetic inheritance, inequalities in, 81
denying the existence of, 6	Giddens, Anthony, 112



good. See also conception(s) of the good;	viewing deontological constraint on
individual good	utilitarian as arbitrary, 422
adding across people, 224	Harrington, James, 389, 395
correct conception of, 93	Harsanyi, John. See also Harsanyi's
deducing from the Right, 312	Aggregation Theorem; Harsanyi's
determined by people's preferences, 221	Impartial Observer Theorem
expectational concept of, 231	aggregation problem considered by, 156
nonutilitarian conceptions of, 289-290	aggregation scheme, 215
not agreeing on a common conception of, 34 preferencism as an account of individual, 226	approach to interpersonal comparison, 306–308
quantitative concept of, 228	cardinalism applying to preferences, 201
good character	compared to Rawls, 303
contributions based on, 74	consequentialist case for rules guiding moral
moral credit for, 75	decisions, 352
good luck, talents and good character owed to,	decision-theoretic foundations for
74	utilitarianism, 1
good-maximization theories	deriving additivity from preferencism, 224-225
drawback inherent in, 297	distaste for absolute priorities, 423
objection to all, 294–295	doctrine, 324
goodness	extended preferences, 34
differences in, 32	game-theoretic version of rule
measurement of, 31	utilitarianism, 60
as rationality, 248	imaginative empathy, 243
of a situation, 33	just distribution, 342
in utilitarianism, 33	liberal rule utilitarianism, 415–422
of want satisfaction, 40	lines of thought of, 303
government	moral duties having absolute priority, 62
enforcing agreements behind the veil, 49	moral type of rational choice, 416
utilitarianism for, 310	on Nash's original two-person bargaining
granularity	theory, 367–368
of the discrete bargaining problem, 345	nonteleological utilitarianism, 315
of discretization, 340	not providing argument for weighted
grapes. See fox and the grapes parable; sour	utilitarianism, 181
grapes	postulates, 202–203
Greedy strategy, 338	on Rawls, 4–6
Griffin, James	referee flipping a coin, 336
improving ethical beliefs, 108–126	relevance of empathetic preferences, 315
on moral intuition, 10–11	Representation Theorem. See Harsanyi's
on reflective equilibrium, 11	Aggregation Theorem
on well-being, 241	resisting absolute priority rules, 413-414
group desirabilities, flipping, 212	on rule utilitarianism, 412–414
group probabilities, inconsistency with	on rule-guided behavior, 352
desirabilities, 214	teleological approach to utilitarianism, 305
	teleological defense of utilitarianism, 311
hard determinism, 6, 75, 84	theorems about utilitarianism, 2
harder-to-lose-freedom effect, 394-396	treating causes of preference, 33
Hardin, Russell, institutional utilitarianism,	two-stage <i>n</i> -person game of, 419
310–311	utilitarianism, 200–206
Hare, R. M.	utility theory as orthodox among
degrees of preference as experiences, 229	neoclassical economists, 416
as a modern purist, 111	view of probability, 205



444 Index

Harsanyi's Aggregation Theorem, 14, 16, ideal principles, 8 184-195, 199, 203, 224, 308-310 ideal society, 418 adopting, 189 ideal theory, 42 deriving an improved version of, 192 identity lottery, 48 for state-contingent model of uncertainty, ideology differential bargaining power and, 380 implications of Sen's objection, 17 problem of, 379-381 in support of utilitarianism, 136, 184 stabilizing expectations, 380 SWF version of, 186, 190-194 imaginative empathy, 243, 244, 253 Harsanyi's Impartial Observer Theorem, imagined veil of ignorance, 236 11-30, 315-321 immunity-rights, 415 proof of, 130 impartial decision making, 4 Hayek, Friedrich, 56 impartial observer. See also ideal observer; hedonistic utilitarianism, 240 impersonal observers Hempel, Carl, 115 of Harsanyi, 129 high reliability, beliefs of, 122 as not a utilitarian, 131-134 Hild, Matthias, 26, 198-216 as ranking social alternatives, 14 transforming vNM utility, 135 Hild-Jeffrey-Risse flipping theorem. See flipping theorem impartial observer theorem. See Harsanyi's Impartial Observer Theorem histories additive principle for, 224 impartial perspective, 4 outcomes as, 223 impersonal desirability, 257 Hobbes, Thomas, 395 impersonal money metric of consumption, 258 holism, 117 impersonal money metric of opportunity, 258 homosexual sex, appeal to community impersonal observers. See also ideal observer; standards curtailing, 285 impartial observer human desire, giving content to values, 112 liberal utilitarian doctrine lacking, 430 human interaction, pressures preventing implementation theory, allocation rules, 37 satisfaction of Pareto conditions, 354 impossibility theorem, 27 human will, dubious conceptions of, 123 incentive effects. See expectation effects Hume, David incentives support of utilitarian justice, 423 for contributions to society, 74 tradition exemplified by, 334-345 providing socially desirable, 418 Humeans, modern, 335 income hybrid proposal measures of, 251 as the opportunity for well-being as primary goods, 251 conception, 101-102 income redistribution, 73 on responsibility, 101, 102-103 incompatibilists, 77 Hylland-Zeckhauser theorem, 28, 209 incompleteness, 110 hypothetical imperatives, 416 independence axiom for actions, 426 of von Neumann and Morgenstern, 26 ideal conditions, 227 ideal observer. See also Harsanyi's Impartial Independence condition of Mongin, 209 Observer Theorem; impartial observer; Independence of Irrelevant Alternatives axiom of, 265, 271 impersonal observers expected utility for a lottery, 309 condition of, 199 interests of society identified with, 308-309 contrasted with Extended Interval Independence, 272 ipsedixist philosophy and, 315 ideal preferences, 228, 234 economic problems and, 39 ideal preferencism, 227-228 satisfying, 22 Ideal Preferencist Biconditional, 227 Independence of the Feasible Set, 273, 280



Index 445

independent agents, 77 maximin principle failing to distinguish, 8 Independent Prospects assumption morally justified, 87 sanctioned by egalitarian-efficiency, 380 adopting, 16-17 from the lottery model of uncertainty, 27 treating in different ways, 83 Independent Prospects, 185, 189, 203 inferential relations, network of, 115 independently and identically distributed informal arrangement sanction system, 366 (i.i.d.) distributions, 210 informal institutional arrangement sanction index of primary goods, 34, 249. See also system, 366 information primary goods constructing, 34-35 factional control of, 383 Rawls on, 305 reliable (accurate) and open exchange of, indices, measuring freedom of choice, 35-36 indifference curves information invariance condition, 142 alternatives on the same, 12 Information Invariance with Respect to money value to, 254 Cardinal Noncomparable Utilities, 143 indifference relationship, 202 Cardinal Unit-Comparable Utilities, 143, indirect argument 144, 166. See also Interpersonal Difference assuming parametrization is possible, 360 Comparability (IRRC) Ordinal Noncomparable Utilities, 142, 153, version most frequently cited, 359 indirect proof, method of, 358 individual(s) Partition \mathcal{A} property, 141–142 average payoff to, 337 information partitions bearing responsibility for ends, 85 assuming, 141 comparing utilities across, 308 examples of, 144 responsibility according to Rawls, 6 information sets, 141 rewarding for inherited traits, 83-84 inherited traits, rewarding individuals for, 83 satisfying the wants of, 40 institutional arrangements, manipulation by individual and social preferences, relating, 16 special interests, 353 individual choice, 19, 134-135 institutional utilitarianism, 310-311 individual ends, responsibility of society for, intensities of preference, 307-308 95-96 intensity individual good freedom as nondomination varying in, 399 as expected value of Bernoulli utilities, 181 risk-based definition of, 307-308 nonpreferencist view of, 33 intentional acts, intrusions as, 391-392 preferencism as an account of, 226 interacting persons, study of, 360 individual goodness interactive choice, 358 measuring, 32 interference, 56 von Neumann-Morgenstern measure intrusions counting as, 391 practizing, 406 individual responsibility. See also personal interpersonal common currency of advantage, responsibility responsiveness to, 90 interpersonal comparability, 232-235 individual utility functions. See utility interpersonal comparisons difficulties of making, 93 functions individual well-being, 241 for distributive justice, 106 individualism with a vengence result, 91 Harsanyi's approach to, 306 inequalities Kantian foundations for, 324-325 in the medium run, 328-330 in the basic structure of society, 80-81 distinction between deep and shallow, 85 Rawlsian approach to, 107 required by weighted utilitarianism, 137 in genetic inheritance, 81 of risk attitudes, 188 keeping within definite limits, 379



interpersonal comparisons (cont.)	Jeffrey, Richard. See also Bolker-Jeffrey
in units of welfare, 133	framework
of utility, versus ordinalism, 266-268	ex ante versus ex post social aggregation,
of utility differences, 21	26
of utility gains and losses, 12, 15, 141	preference aggregation after Harsanyi, 198
of utility in allocation decisions, 267	judgements about well-being, 246
Interpersonal Difference Comparability	just arrangement, 334
(IRDC), 194. See also Information	just distribution for Harsanyi and Rawls, 342
Invariance with Respect to Cardinal Unit	just political regime, Rawls version of, 89
Comparable Utilities	justice. See also social justice
interpersonal utility comparisons, 23	as impartiality, 42
making, 49	lacking a blindfold, 348
shaped by biological and cultural	as not indifferent to outcomes, 105
evolutionary forces, 50	principles of, 10
interpersonally, pleasure as common currency, 240	as a rational choice behind a veil of
	ignorance, 336
interstate comparability, getting, 135	Rawls's general conception of, 83
interstate comparisons of utility gains and	Rawls's special conception of, 83
losses, 20	Rawlsian idea of, 85–86
interval commensuration, 204	rewarding superior performance as a
intrapersonal comparison	requirement of, 75
of preference intensities, 202	securing a fair share of resources to
of utility, 314–315	individuals, 85
Intrapersonal Preferencist Principle, 230	as some function of opportunity provision,
intrapersonal standards	105
aggregating, 315	justice and right, priority over the good, 412
for comparing utils, 315	Justice as Fairness: A Restatement, 3
intrapersonal utility comparisons, 15	justification
intrapersonally, pleasure as common currency,	coming from a whole set of beliefs, 117
240	as not linear or circular, 115
intrusions, constituting interference, 392	of a perceptual belief, 116
intuition pump, 110	
intuitions	Kalai-Smorodinsky solution, 53, 342-343
as beliefs, 109	Kant, Immanuel
case against piecemeal appeal to, 120	individuals as ends in and of themselves, 1
causes of, 109	as a purist, 111
as commonsense beliefs, 112	Kantian consensus on the equiprobability
piecemeal appeal to, 108–111	model, 422
role in moral philosophy, 110	Kantian foundations for interpersonal
sifting, 119	comparison, 324
intuitive repugnance, 110	Kantian impersonal observers, 430
invisible hand metaphor of Smith, 353	rantian impersonal coort (ets) to c
IO. See impartial observer	law, subjection to, 394
ipsedixism, 305	law of excluded middle, 114
ipsedixist, 305	
	least advantaged class, 82. See also badly off;
ipsedixist philosophy, ideal observer approach and, 315	disadvantaged; poor and oppressed; wors off
IRDC (Interpersonal Difference	legal interference, extreme case of, 394
Comparability), 194	legal regime, 394
irrational decision rule, 71-72	leisure, 83
irrational preference formation, 299	Leviathan, 395



Lewis, David	Machiavelli, Niccolò, 389
on equilibrium pairs, 362	majoritarian principles, 379
on games of pure coordination, 355	manifest preferences, 245
marginalizing the Pareto conditions, 355	manipulation, people subject to, 406
leximin principle, 5, 160, 358	Maniquet, François
liabilities, assigning for an adverse outcome, 9	on fair social orderings, 36
liberal egalitarianism	utilitarianism versus fairness, 263
approaches to personal responsibility, 6-7	market mechanism, 267
debate with utilitarians, 2	Marschak, Jacob axiomatic treatment of
of Rawls, 42	preference, 201, 202, 205
liberal equality, 74	Marx, Karl, 56
liberal priorities, 63	masking, true consequences of, 382
liberal rule utilitarianism	maximal equal distribution of freedom as
of Harsanyi, 415–422	noninterference, 402
providing basis for equal freedom, 429	maximal utility, versus opportunity provision,
liberal society, features of, 4	104
liberal utilitarian code, 422–429	maximin principle. See also difference principle
liberal utilitarian rules, 419	a criterion for making decisions applied to
liberal utilitarianism	utilities, 312
complex Millian sort of, 428	embraced by Rawls, 4-5
Harsanyi's brand of, 428	failing to distinguish between inequalities,
objections to, 422	8
used to identify an ideal personal character,	of Rawls, 57
430	Rawls's use of, 50, 71–73
liberals, 411	in terms of lifetime holdings of primary
libertarians	goods, 8
against big government, 405	maximization
protecting negative freedom, 56	of (expected) utility, 356
liberties	conceptually anchoring, 361
assigning absolute priority to basic, 73	maximization condition, 358
modern discussions of, 56	Maynard Smith, John and Price, George,
optimal system of, 421	defining an evolutionary stable strategy,
protection of basic, 57	337–338
secure foundation for basic, 60	McClennen, Edward F.
liberty	alternative model of rational cooperation,
of the moderns, 390	351–384
price of, 389	on cooperative distributions, 53
liberty-rights, 415	meaningfulness of judgements, 248
life, 233	mediocrity, acceptance of, 76
limited information for utility comparisons, 21	medium run
Lind, John, 398	corresponding to social time, 328
Lindhal rule, 277	interpersonal comparison in, 328, 330
linear transformation of units, 133	interpersonal comparisons evolving in, 304
Locke, John, 389, 395	memes, 327
long run, corresponding to biological time, 328	mental states, interpersonal comparability of,
lord, living in the power of a, 408	254
Lorenz, Konrad, 331	merit
lotteries	distribution according to, 83–84
convex set of, 155	Rawls's complex treatment of, 6
modeling uncertainty, 12–14	metaethical concerns, raised by Griffin's
Luce, Duncan, and Raiffa, Howard, 359	analysis, 11



metaethics	moral credit
broaching some major issues in, 123-124	assigning, 78
concerns of, 124	for developing talents, 74
ethical beliefs independent of, 124	Rawls's attempt to deny, 74–75
making progress in, 125	moral discredit, assigning, 78
not independent from normative ethics,	moral disvalue, 79
126	moral duties, 74
Mgn ₁ theorem, 209	moral intuition, 10
Mgn ₂ theorem, 209	moral obligation to pursue the common
Mill, John Stuart	good, 47
on absolute priorities, 414	moral observer, 186
denouncing want-satisfaction, 288	moral qualities, indeterminable as irrelevant,
liberty principle, 96	106
on social or legal punishment, 310	moral responsibility, dilemma raised by,
Millian liberal utilitarianism	76–77
accommodating absolute liberal priorities,	moral rights, 414
429–430	moral rules
grounding a form of representative	applying utilitarian criterion to, 60
democracy, 430	basic liberty secured by, 412
•	moral terms
minimal rationality, 92	
minimax relative concession solution, 45	deriving ethical principles from, 111
minimax solution, 357	of ordinary language, 111
misfortune	moral value, 79
morally inappropriate response to, 81	moral value judgements, 243
types of, 80	moral views
misrepresentation, of social, economic, and	comparing, 125
political facts, 362	weeding out unrealistic, 123
mixed games, coordination in, 365	moral worth, as inherently secondary, 84
mixed strategy, 43–44	morality
moderns, liberty of, 390	based on rational individual decision
modest strategy, 338	making, 15
money metric	as a short-run phenomenon, 329–331
approach, 253	smooth working of, 331
described, 253–254	motivation, building into the concept of
of impersonal desirability, 258	utility, 431
reference levels for a, 256	multiprofile aggregation, 137, 160-166
representation of preferences, 35	multiprofile approach
utility function, 35	of d'Aspremont and Mongin, 26
Mongin, Philippe	of Sen, 185
impossibility theorems, 27	multiprofile version of Harsanyi's theorem,
postulates, 208–209	166
on welfarism and social aggregation, 24	multiprofile weighted utilitarian theorem, 167
Montesquieu, 389	mutant meme, appearance of, 327
moral attitudes, actions springing from, 78	mutant strategies
moral behavior, intrinsic and social value of, 6	invasion of other, 338–339
moral beliefs	withstanding, 45
forswearing dependence of substantive, 111	mutations, selection process with respect to, 47
origins of, 109	mutual advantage, 352
moral code	mutual gain, 372
impersonal observers bound to, 416	mutual insurance pacts, bargaining over, 326
optimal, 60	mutual rationality condition, 358



Index 449

naked liberties, 429 noninterference Nash, John hostile to redistribution, 404 bargaining game of, 335 redistribution and freedom as, 401-413 theory of bargaining with commitment, nonpreferencist elements in Harsanyi's theory, 235 two-person bargaining theory, 44, 48, 367 nonteleological moral theories, 311-325 Nash bargaining model, 368 nonteleological utilitarianism of Harsanyi, 315-322 Nash bargaining solution, 44-45, 342-343, 345 basin of attraction for, 53 nonutilitarian conceptions of the good, 290 robust in simulations, 345 normative ethics supported in the asymmetric case, 347 concerns of, 124 Nash equilibrium, 1.339, 17.063 independence from metaethics, 124 feasible in terms of, 423 not independent from metaethics, 126 selecting among in a coordination game, 54 normative principles, 10 Nash solution. See Nash bargaining solution normative theories Natural Iustice, 303 as fundamentally flawed, 43 natural justice, Binmore on, 47-51 versus naturalistic, 42 natural science, standards of success for, normative views, ranking competing, 124-125 120-121 norms of distributive justice, 348 naturalistic foundations, 304 North, Douglass on adaptive efficiency, 381 naturalistic theories, versus normative, 42-43 Nozick, Robert, 73 null social evaluation functional, 179 naturalists, 348 negative freedom, 56, 57 numerically comparable partition, 144 negative outcomes, responsibility for, 99-100 Nydegger Rudy and Owen Guillermo, neoclassical economists, attraction to Pareto's experiment dividing a dollar, 335 strategy, 241 neutrality, denying, 248 objections, to only meeting a minimum no veto power requirement, 265 threshold of rationality, 91-95 no-fault insurance scheme, results of, 101 objective criteria for determining well-being, nonarbitrariness 305 account of, 393 objective probabilities, 139, 225 guaranteeing, 404 observations, as theory-laden, 113 of redistribution, 404 On Liberty, 96 nonarbitrary act of interference, 392 ongoing interaction, dynamic models of, 354 nonbelief input, allowing, 117 opportunities noncooperative game theory, 42 impersonal money metric of, 239, 257-260 personal money metric of, 254 alternatives to, 371 for two-person negotiation, 368 pointless provision of, 105 Harsanvi's, 419 set of, 250 opportunity luck, 326 model of bargaining as the triumph of, 368 noncooperative interaction, 370 opportunity provision nondomination versus maximal utility, 82 fact of, 398 possibility of pointless, 105 freedom as, 57, 58, 391, 392, 396 opportunity sets redistribution and freedom as, 403-408 range of opportunity offered by, 252 nonegalitarian arrangements, defending, 378 ranking distributions of, 272 nonegalitarian systems, as remarkably stable, optimal code absolute priority given to, 423 nonemptiness and contraction consistency deviations from, 421-422 requirements, 269 identifying, 421 nonexchangeable goods, allocating, 293 optimal insurance policy, 134



optimal moral code	lack of, 360
absolute priority over nonmoral	as a restriction on rational interactive
considerations, 421	choice, 361-363
layers or subcodes, 428	parametrization condition, 361
optimal outcomes	Pareto condition, 54. See also Pareto
different in mixed games, 365	Indifference; Pareto Preference condition;
not in equilibrium in mixed games, 365	Strict Pareto (S-P*) condition; Strong
option luck of Dworkin, 7, 87, 88	Pareto principle; Weak Pareto property
ordering, 140	focusing on outcomes satisfying, 364
ordinal noncomparable partition, 142, 142	marginalizing, 355
ordinal preferences, demand behavior	serving as a secondary requirement, 357
revealing, 266–268	Pareto efficient allocation, 270
ordinal social orderings	Pareto Indifference, 27, 136, 140, 271
arguments in favor of, 265	replacing Harsanyi's, 188
constructing, 270	RN implying, 189
definition of, 264	satisfying, 22
ordinal transform, 12	strengthening into Strong Pareto, 17,
ordinal utility function, 12, 307	184–185
ordinalism	Pareto optimal 54, 211, 357
arguments in form of, 38	Pareto Preference condition, 198–199
versus interpersonal comparisons of utility,	Pareto principle, 363
266	abandoning Harsanyi's, 223
ordinalist revolution in utility theory, 12	for histories, 225
original position, 4, 15, 71	minimal requirement about preferences, 267
in achieving compromises, 326	for prospects, 224
analyzing the device of, 325	for want-satisfaction, 286
attraction to, 325	want-satisfaction version of, 40
bargaining in, 317–319	weaker versions of, 27
choosing a social contract using, 329	Pareto requirements, 356
device of, 312	Pareto-based coordination principle of
expanding its circle of application, 332	McClennen, 55
as a natural norm, 325–331	Pareto-efficient changes in institutional
naturalistic account of, 331–332	structures, 353
of Rawls, 16	pathologies about what people want, 297
other-oriented preferences, 416, 422	payoffs
outcomes	measured ex ante, 44
of bargaining behind the veil, 50–51	strategies with better than average, 46–47
defining to exclude uncertainty, 223	Pazner-Schmeidler egalitarian equivalent rule,
holding individuals responsible for bad, 90	39, 274
portfolio of possible, 223	perceptual beliefs
relationship to wants, 293	analogue in ethics to, 118
responsible for the quality of, 99–100	convergence in, 123
overall dictator, 209	high credibility of, 116
Owen, Guillermo experiment dividing a dollar,	perfectionist weighting on primary goods, 35
348	permissibility, 429
3.10	permissible strategies, layers of, 428
Paine, Tom, 393	permissions, as permissible strategies, 429
painful difficulty scale, 97	personal achievement of developing good
Paley, William, 399–400	character, 75
parametrization	personal interests, choices made in ignorance
as a condition on rational choice, 374	of, 71–79



personal money metric	Political Liberalism, 3
of consumption, 254	political liberalism, 4
of opportunity, 254	political rights, special place of, 411
personal preferences, 250	political system, stable, 249
claims of justice not grounded on, 251	politics makes strange bedfellows example, 210
index-number problem and, 251-252	polymorphic traps, 339
measure of economic opportunity	polymorphism, as inefficient, 339
independent of, 252	poor and oppressed. See also badly off;
money metric independent of, 257	disadvantaged; least advantaged class;
personal probabilities	worst off
in the aggregation process, 200	as having limited aspirations, 292
no part in Harsanyi's aggregation process,	as liable to be discriminated against, 292
199	population, average payoff to, 337
personal responsibility	population viscosity, 341
liberal egalitarian approaches to, 6	positive freedom, 56, 391
Rawls's complex treatment of, 6	positive outcomes, responsibility for, 100
personal utilities in the aggregation process,	positivity, 209
200	postwelfarists
personal utility function of Harsanyi's players,	no answer to interpersonal comparison, 308
420	views of, 305-306
Pettit, Philip	potential preferences, 253
on redistributive policy, 59	power, shaping interpersonal comparisons, 332
republican political theory, 389-408	powerful people, preference to, 236
on republicanism, 57–59	power-rights, 415
Pexider equation, 171, 175, 175	predictor function, observer defining, 420
philosopher-king	preference(s). See also adaptive preferences;
abandoning, 323	extended preferences; ideal preferences;
impartial, 312	ordinal preferences; personal preferences;
not postulated by Harsanyi or Rawls, 313	rational preferences; social preferences
representing an external enforcement	aggregating into group preference rankings,
agency, 314	198
phronesis, 430, 430	altruistic, 227
piecemeal appeal to intuition, 108	in a betterness relation, 31
plan of life, choosing, 94–95	comparing differences in utility, 30
planner's ethical preferences revelation	confusion surrounding the term, 430
principle, 267–268	as defective, 227
players, 43	delimiting a range of possible, 249
rationality and computing ability assumed	described, 244–245
for, 45	disembodied, 248
rationally pursuing their own ends, 44	extended, 233
pleasure, as a common currency of advantage,	forming or discovering, 206
240	good depending on, 224
plural expected utility theory, 425-428	ideal, 228
pluralism, 107	independence with respect to changes, 267
pluralism of belief, 107	money as a measuring rod for, 253
pluralistic society, political conception of	money metric representation of, 35
justice for, 4	nonpreferencist elements determining
pluralistic utility theory, 430	extended, 33
Pocock, John, 390	as not completely malleable, 40
political legitimacy in western democracies,	outside the veil, 48–49
312–313	over lotteries, 13



preference(s) (cont.) personal, 250	continuing to endorse, 134 empathetic preferences satisfying Harsanyi's
of a rational individual, 13	49
reference distribution of, 259	The Principles of Moral and Political Philosophy
representing an expected utility function,	400
424	prisoner's dilemma, 55
representing in general, 258	privileged factions, likely to break apart, 383
responsibility for, 250, 259	probabilistic model, making equal division
satisfying axioms of utility theory, 136, 198	more compelling, 346
from a standpoint, 248	probabilities
preference aggregation, conceptual map	agreed on by all individuals, 139
of, 198	agreement on, 225
preference autonomy, 245	cardinal, 205
preference diversity assumption, 149	frequency interpretation of, 205
preference intensities, 201, 202	as objective, 225
preference profiles, 142, 167	probability agreement theorem, 32, 33, 209
preference rankings, 205–206	probability assessments, differing, 26
preference relation, 148, 201	probability clones, 209
preference satisfaction, 242	probability heterogeneity, 27
preference utilitarianism, 30–33, 245, 294	procedural utility, assigning to free moral
preferencism, 221	choice, 417
as an account of individual good, 226	procedures, fundamental in nonteleological
deriving additivity from, 224–226	theories, 311
as false, 221–222	profile(s)
ideal, 227	informationally equivalent, 141
preferencist assumptions, 222	of utility functions, 140
Preferencist Biconditional, 226	Profile-Dependent Strong Neutrality
Preferencist Principle, 230	defined, 151
preferencist utilitarianism, 221	equivalent to Strong Neutrality, 158
failure of, 237	implying Pareto Indifference, 151
internal investigation of, 222	strengthening, 152
Price, Richard, 397, 398	Profile-Dependent Welfarism, 150
price weights, used to measure income, 251	defined, 151
Priestly, Joseph, 397	equivalent to Welfarism, 158
primary goods. See also index of primary goods	property rights, benefits from protecting, 60
absolute priorities granted to, 5	prospects, 139, 223
as a simplifying device, 249	prudence, life goals contrary to, 90
common currency of, 247	prudent choice and action, painful difficulty
distributing independently of preferences,	scale, 97
267	prudent decisions, arriving at, 97
index of, 34, 81, 91	prudent life plan, forming, 86
index of the worst-off group, 5	prudential value judgements, 120
maximizing holdings, 85	prudential values
providing at the onset of adulthood, 86	basic, 118
Rawls's concept of, 3, 249	of Griffin, 241
Rawls separating, 81	pseudostates, 215
unequal holdings of, 94	public, tracking the welfare and worldview of,
primary social goods. See primary goods	393
Principle of Acceptance, 1.113, 131	public goods, 277, 252
combining with vNM preferences over	purchasing power, Rawls's concept of income
lotteries, 135	as, 251



Index 453

pure strategies, 41, 43, 44 Rawls, John pure-coordination games, 354 approach to interpersonal comparison, 107 Pygmalion, 82 canonical moment version of justice, 86-88 on character planning, 299 compared to Harsanyi, 303-304 qualitative hedonism contractarian defense of liberal case against, 430 discussion of, 430 egalitarianism, 2 critique of imaginative empathy, 247 quantitative concept of good, 228-230 quantitative hedonism, 424 critique of utilitarianism, 1 Quine, W. V., 110 on deservingness and responsibility, 83-86 difference principle equivalent to RA (Relative Attainability), 189 egalitarian-efficiency principle, 378 Raiffa, Howard, 210, 359 difference principle, reformulation of, 89 range property, rationality as, 91 on distribution justice, 296 ranking, allocation rule as a kind of, 263 egalitarian principle, 377 ratio-comparable concept of degree of equating utilitarianism with preference, 230 want-satisfaction, 287 rational agents ethical beliefs independent of metaethics, engaging in a coordination of choices, 351 109 members of society as, 97-98 hedonistic utilitarianism and, 248 rational beings, cooperation between, 364 index of primary goods, 34, 305 rational choices just distribution, 342 less than fully triggering justice maximin decision rule, 336-337 requirements, 106 maximin principle, reasons for favoring, 323 models, 13 maximin principle, use of, 322 moral species of, 416 on negative and positive freedom, 57 rational choice-theoretic defense of primary social goods, 91 utilitarianism, 14 priority of equal basic liberties, 411 rational cooperation process of constructing a common good nature and conditions of, 352 function, 312 rethinking, 361-365 rejection of utility theory, 422 rational decision, 334 on rule-guided behavior, 352 second principle of justice, 403 rational ends, plurality of, 56 rational faculties, attempting to rehabilitate, 92 "Social Unity and Primary Goods", 281 statement of liberal egalitarian principles, 1 rational plan of life, 248 rational player strains of commitment, 323 defined, 358 themes from, 3-11 making risky decisions, 307 theory of justice limited to feasible rational preferences, 242 administration, 106 theory of justice pioneered by, 80 contingent on conceptions of the good, 248 on utilitarianism, 282 utility representing, 417 Rawlsian social welfare function. See social rational social interactions, 53 rational standpoint, as autistic, 361 welfare function rationality reason, role in giving content to values, 112 concept of, 334 reasonable agreement, principles of justice of full cooperation, 376 based on, 42 objections to meeting a minimum threshold reasonableness of moral views, 125 reciprocity, explicit norm of, 381 of, 90 redistribution as a range property, 91 basis for claiming, 93 relevant criteria, 417 rationalization of allocation rules, 273-277 dangers of, 405



redistribution (cont.)	resource allocation, 9
entailing interference by the state, 402 under fair rule of law, 405	resource holdings, measured by index of primary social goods, 91
of income and wealth required by Rawls's	resource utilization, Debreu coefficient of, 27
theory, 72	resources
lowering probability of interference, 402	fair distribution of, 7
noninterference introducing a presumption	justifying transfer to the rich, 404
against, 404	sacrificing to reward fair behavior, 370
redistributive measures, reducing, 384	respect, 98
redistributive policies, viewed as intrusive,	respect for persons, slogan of, 98
58–59	responsibility
redistributive taxation, 5	assignment as political, not metaphysical,
reductive naturalism, 123	100
reference distribution of preferences, 258, 259	Rawls's theory of a concept of, 6
reference prices	for what lies within one's power to control,
in the money metric, 254	99
valuing opportunity sets, 36	responsibility for ends
reference profile, permitting to be	defending Rawls's doctrine of, 92
non-Bernoulli, 173	doctrine of, 90–1 9
reflective equilibrium	reconsidered, 90-95
concept of a, 10	responsibility principle, 9
interpretations of, 122	retaliation, 368
refusal, no right of, 293-294	right, utilitarian theory of, 222
regime of law, coercive, 394	rightness, derived from goodness, 222
regress objection, 114, 115	rights
regular expected utility profile, 149, 149	absolute priority to certain kinds of, 63
Reification condition, 211	as morally protected, 412
Relative Attainability (RA), 189	rights and liberties
relative bargaining advantage, 368	game form formulations versus social
Relative Neutrality (RN), 189	choice, 429
relative threat advantage, 368	incentives and assurances provided by, 62
rent-seeking, literature on, 353	Riley, Jonathan, 60-63, 411
repeated interaction, over time, 365-367	risk aversion, 148, 188
replicator dynamics, 46	risk to good, neutrality on, 223
applied to the divide the cake model, 347	Risse, Mathias, 26, 198
discrete time version of, 46-47	RN (Relative Neutrality), 189
of evolutionary game theory, 337	Roemer, John, 18–20
reporting system, centralization of, 366	rule of share and share alike, evolution of, 341
representation theorem(s)	rule utilitarian society as a two-stage game,
as analytical, 206	60–61
of Bolker, 207	rule utilitarianism, 60
of Savage, 207	assuring individual freedom to make
republic, 401	choices, 414
republican conception of liberty, 400-401	code, 417–418
republican ideal, significance of, 399-408	compared to act utilitarianism, 61-62
republican political theory, 389	embedding absolute liberal priorities, 424
republican tradition, 389, 393	full compliance under complete
republicanism	information, 419
more open to egalitarian policies, 59	Harsanyi's arguments for, 412-414
Pettit on, 57	Harsanyi's version of, 60
republicans, against big government, 405	rule-governed choice, 376-377



rules	social contract neutralized, 334-349
Rawls's account of, 352	slavery, association of law with, 396
understood as maxims, 376	Smith, Adam
rules and rankings, deriving axiomatically, 269	ideal observer, 308
	invisible hand, 353
saliency, 357, 364	social aggregation
Samuelson, Paul, 168, 242	ex ante versus ex post, 26–30
sanction systems, different types of, 366	for state-contingent alternatives, 20
satisfaction of wants, 281	under uncertainty, 23
Savage, Leonard	social aggregation problem, reformulating
framework of, 28, 206-208	Harsanyi's, 23
on preferences, 242	social aggregation theorem. See Harsanyi's
Scanlon on champagne tastes, 306	Aggregation Theorem
Schelling, Thomas	social alternatives
drawing expectations to a focus, 363	ranking, 11
on games of pure coordination, 355	sets of, 129, 136, 139
marginalizing the Pareto conditions, 355	social choice function. See allocation rules
theory of saliency, 357	social choice impossibility theorems, 139
second best problems, 268-269	social choice under uncertainty, 136
self-mastery, 58	social consequences of maximin criterion, 5
self-regarding liberty, 430	social contract(s)
semantics of ethical terms, 111	as an application of rational decision theory
Sen, Amartya. See also Sen-Weymark critique	334
defining welfarism, 305	of Binmore, 48
questioning of Harsanyi's utilitarian	as a complex web of conventions and
interpretation, 137	norms,348
SWFLs defined on some universal domain,	contingent on roles, 316
185	evaluating in the original position, 313
theory of capabilities, 7	evolution of, 51
Sen-Weymark critique, 17–18	negotiated by Adam and Eve, 312-313
shallow inequalities, 81	self-policing, 323–324
shared highest-order preference, 33	as a tissue of conventions, 334
shared practices, rules as part of, 112	social contract theory
short run	central features of Binmore's, 47
compared to long run, 328	liberal versions of, 41
morality in, 329	social conventions, origins of, 47
short-run social contract, 51	social cooperation, sharing gains from, 41-56
Sidgwick, Henry	social decision maker, 26
analysis of hedonism, 288	social endowment, 37
on dualism of practical reason, 424	social evaluation, 140
similarity postulate of Harsanyi, 32, 244	as a binary relation, 150
simple bargaining model for two players, 368	ex ante approach to, 159
simplest bargaining game, 337	for a utilitarian social evaluation functional
single-information-set aggregation, 167-175	141
single-preference-profile aggregation, 137,	as a weighted utilitarian rule, 158
175–178	social evaluation functional. See also social
single-profile aggregation, 20, 156-160	welfare functional
Skinner, Quentin, 390	assigning a social evaluation, 149
Skyrms, Brian	assigning social ordering, 138
on evolutionary viability of fairness norms,	as informationally invariant, 144
51-53	limitations on, 141



social evaluation functional (cont.)	of events, 29
modeling the social aggregation procedure,	social time, medium run corresponding to, 328
137, 140	social utility
requiring an unrestricted expected utility	in the flipping theorem, 29
range, 162	individuals maximizing, 421
satisfying Pareto Indifference, 151, 153	maximizing privileges, 418-419
satisfying Strong Neutrality, 155, 156	social utility function, 136
satisfying Strong Pareto, 157, 158	social values, choosing, 73
satisfying welfarism, 152	social welfare, 2
social evolution	social welfare function, 22, 36, 150, 263
determining extended preferences, 235	maximizing, 324
favoring behavior patterns of successful	ranking social alternatives, 37
persons, 422	social welfare functionals (SWFLs), 21, 187.
forces of, 304	See also social evaluation functional
preferences formed by, 236	constructing, 36
selecting consistent behavior, 425	defined on a restricted domain, 185
social goods. See primary goods	different domains for, 24
social institutions	framework, 23
responsibility according to Rawls, 6	restricted to VNM representations, 186
selecting unaffected by personal interests, 71	satisfying Information Invariance, 176
social interaction, study of, 360	satisfying Pareto Indifference, 22
social justice	Sen's framework of, 185
difficulties of formulating a coherent	weighting utilitarian, 25
account of, 2	social welfare ordering, 15, 22, 150
Rawls's theory of, 3-4	directly constructing, 38–39
in terms of equal opportunities, 7	interpreting as social preference, 22
social minimum, responsibility for, 384	as isomorphic, 151, 152
social ordering	socially best alternatives, 37
mapping, 20	society
maximizing on the feasible set, 36	basic structure of, 80
social ordering function(s)	sharing costs and benefits of good and bad
concept of, 38	luck, 100
defined, 268	soft determinism, 75
defining, 275–277	sour grapes, 281, 290
direct inquiry of, 270	case of irreversible, 296–297
social ordering functionals, 276–277	S-P condition. See Strict Pareto (S-P*)
social orderings	condition
constructing, 269–277	stable equilibrium, polymorphism as, 338
justifying, 266–269	stand-alone principle, 265
social organization, nonegalitarian forms of,	standard objection, 18, 231
380–381	standard opportunity sets
social positions	defining, 256
in applying principles of justice, 81	selecting, 255
defining objectively, 248	standpoint of a person, 248
of individuals, 243	state, under severe scrutiny by republicans, 405
social preferences	state of nature
additivity of, 31	as the blindfold, 334
satisfying utility axioms, 16	concept of, 334
social probabilities in the flipping theorem, 29	identifying, 317
social rankings	reverting to, 319
versus allocation rules, 268–269	ultimate, 215



state-contingent alternatives, 19. See also	Sunstein, Cass, 390
ex ante alternative	superego, associated with moral intuitions, 109
expected utility theory for, 145-150	surveillance, associated costs of, 366
model of uncertainty, 19, 20, 23	SWFL version of the Aggregation Theorem,
modeling uncertainty, 138, 139, 180	186
utilities defined for, 146	SWFLs. See social welfare functionals
state-imposed constraints, republicanism	Sydney, Algernon, 389, 396, 397
compatible with, 58	symmetric bargaining situations, 341
states, describing in the flipping theorem, 29	symmetric case
status quo, determining, 319	evolution of equal division more likely, 346
strains of commitment to logical extreme, 323	using the symmetric Nash bargaining
strange bedfellows phenomenon, 210	solution, 320–322
strategic interaction	symmetric Nash bargaining solution, 322–323
as assured to be suboptimal, 375	symmetric Nash equilibrium, 327
not yielding an optimal outcome, 371	system of democratic equality, 74
strategies	system of liberal equality, 74
choosing in pure conflict, 357	systematic connections, raising credibility
for games, 43–44	level, 115
identifying successful, 45	systematic unification, provided by a natural
selecting over time, 46	science, 115
strategy profile, 44	. 1
Strict Pareto (S-P*) condition, 192. See also	talents
Pareto criterion	contributions based on, 74
strong monism, 63	development and employment of, 6
going beyond, 425	moral credit for developing, 74
in Harsanyi's theory, 423–424	tamed housewife example, 289, 292
Strong Neutrality defined, 152	taste heterogeneity, 27
	tastes champagne, 306, 306
implying both Pareto Indifference and Binary Independence, 153	compensating for, 91
implying welfarism, 155	expensive, 102, 250
property, 25	teleologic theory, utilitarianism as, 30
welfarism equivalent to, 23	teleological defense of utilitarianism,
Strong Pareto principle, 24, 136, 140. See also	Harsanyi's, 47
Pareto criterion	teleological utilitarianism of Harsanyi, 305
strong preference relationship, 202	teleological utilitarians, enforcement not a
strongly regular expected utility profile. See	painful issue for, 311
regular expected utility profile	theory, beliefs laden with, 109
subgame perfect	A Theory of Justice, 3
Nash equilibrium as, 44	egalitarian principle, 377
Nash equilibrium outcome, 45	misfortune described in, 80–81
strategy punishing greedy offers, 348	theory of justice, pioneered by John Rawls, 80
subjective probabilities, 139, 205	theory of types, 110
subjectivist, Carnap as, 205	thick concepts, 118, 119
subordination, structure of, 121	time, repeated interaction over, 365
Sugden, Robert	total circumstances of Rawls, 254–255
on common currency of advantage, 33	transformed utilitarian social evaluation, 157
on equal division, 338	transformed utilitarian social welfare function,
as a modern Humean, 335	159, 178
search for a common currency of advantage,	transforms, affine and difference-preserving,
239–260	143



> Index 458

transitivity, choices violating, 416 opposed to theories of fairness, 263 true preferences, 245-246 trust, as Pareto superior, 381 trustworthiness, 374 two-person, zero-sum games, 358 welfare, 129 two-person bargaining theory of Nash, 367. See also Nash, John versions of, 429 ultimate causal responsibility view of free will, ultimate causes, 77 utility ultimate states of nature, 215 uncertainty lottery formulation of, 30 modeling using lotteries, 12 practical way of dealing with, 223 social aggregation under, 23-24 social choice under, 136 within the theory of good, 223 within the theory of right, 223 Unchanged Contour Independence axiom, 272-273 unchosen bad luck, compensating for, 103 unchosen basic structural inequalities, 82 utility clones, 209 undominated, facts making, 398 unforgiving approach to responsibility, 103 utility functions, 416 unfreedom, 396 aggregating, 20 Unit Comparability, 185 universal indifference to a common consumption bundle, 39 unproduced commodities, division of, 266 21, 143 unrestricted Bernoulli expected utility domain, unrestricted expected utility domain, 153 unrestricted expected utility range, 150, 161 Unrestricted Individual Utility Profile, 189 utilitarian moral judgements, 415 utilitarian principles, validating, 352 utilitarian rule, deriving, 186 utilitarian social welfare function approach, 37 utilitarian solution, 342 utilitarianism axiomatization of, 26, 185 138-139, 147 classical formulation of, 11 types of, 53 coherence of preference-based, 30 decision-theoretic defenses of, 11 of Harsanyi, 200-206 utility profiles, 141 Harsanyi's analysis not supporting, 24 utility theory individuals versus government, 310 leading opponents of, 73 versions of, 198

rational choice-theoretic defense of, 14 requiring good to be quantitative, 222 requiring interpersonal comparability of roots of modern welfare economics in, 240 two distinctive features of, 289 weighted form of, 16 utilitarians, debates with egalitarians, 2, 304 added by ex post aggregation, 214 adding individual, 308-310 confusion surrounding the term, 431 defined by Broome, 30 maximizing the sum of, 310 a measure of an individual's well-being, 11 measuring in units of welfare, 135 ordinal and cardinal, 11-14 preference satisfaction as, 242 welfarism based on modern theories of, 306 what constitutes, 305 utility aggregation, 204 utility consequences, 22 cardinally measurable and interpersonally noncomparable, 142-143 cardinally measurable and unit comparable, defining preferences, 147 distinguishing profiles of, 21 of individuals in society, 140 for an ordinalist, 12 ordinally measurable and interpersonally noncomparable, 21, 142 permitting interpersonal utility comparisons, 137 restricting to nontrivial VNM representations, 195 satisfying the expected utility hypothesis, 23, utility gains and losses, comparing, 13 utility maximization, social and moral, 420 rejected by Rawls, 422 utility values, assigning to histories, 230

obtaining, 158



Index 459

utility vectors, social ordering of. See social von Neumann-Morgenstern utility scales. See welfare ordering von Neumann-Morgenstern utility utility-maximizing response, 356 functions von Neumann-Morgenstern utility theory, 12, values, adjudicating conflicts in, 63 14-15, 17 variables, guided by rational principles, 360 veil of ignorance wants argument of Harsanyi, 129 creating easily satisfied, 281 bargaining behind, 320 impoverished, 289 Binmore's bargaining approach to, 49 more easily satisfying, 40 current and future roles in society concealed relationship to outcomes, 293 behind, 312 want-satisfaction, comparing amounts of, Harsanyi's version of, 48 286-287 imagined, 235-237 want-satisfaction thesis impartial observer operating from behind, communitarianism rejecting, 285 15 compatible with rejection of utilitarianism, institutionalization of the use of, 337 289 principles identified from behind, 42 connection with liberalism, 284 worst off appealing to, 49 corollaries of, 293 veil of uncertainty, compared to veil of in its acceptable form, 287 ignorance, 326 limited form of, 40 VNM. See von Neumann-Morgenstern ruling out homosexual relations as VNM-Range (VNM-R), 187 intrinsically bad, 285 VNM-Social Welfare Ordering (VNM-R*), 190 situations in which wants are different, VNM-Utility Domain (VNM-D), 187 194 voluntary choices, responsibility for, 88-90 Weak Anonymity property, 194. See also von Neumann-Morgenstern Anonymity axioms, satisfying, 26 Weak Pareto property, 270. See also Pareto consistency postulates, 307 criterion framework, 24-25, 199, 206 weak preference relationship, 202 Marschak's formulation of, 201 weak utilitarianism, theorem characterizing, maximizing utility, 358 preference axioms, 187 weak-equilibrium pair, 363 preference ordering, 186-187 wealth, as primary goods, 251 preferences risk attitudes and, 188 weighted utilitarian social evaluation functional, 140-141 on probability, 205 providing Harsanyi with a random variable, characterization of, 166 satisfying Information Invariance with rationality conditions, 309 Respect to Cardinal Unit-Comparable treatments of preference, 205 Utilities, 145 turning tables on ordinalists, 201 as welfarist, 150 weighted utilitarian social welfare function, von Neumann-Morgenstern utility function(s), 13, 25, 130, 136, 187, 314 159, 321 deducing, 132 weighted utilitarianism, 136 defining, 307 multiprofile characterization of, 180 hierarchy of plural distinct kinds of, 427 requiring interpersonal comparisons of measuring relative intensities of preference, utility gains and losses, 178 single-information-set characterization of, modeling empathetic preferences, 313 173 weights independent, 137 representing a betterness relation, 31 summarizing preferences over lotteries, 309 weights, determining independently, 185



460 Index

welfare economics measuring effective, 9 aim of, 239 as a placeholder, 101 branches of, 263 Weymark, John A. fundamental theorem of, 352-353 Sen's arguments formalized and extended welfare judgments, as impersonal preferences, by, 18 social aggregation and the expected utility welfare weights, as profile independent, 165 hypothesis, 136-181 welfarism, 150-156 on social aggregation under uncertainty, 23 defined, 152 what lies within our control, responsibility deriving, 190 for, 98-101 wide equilibrium, Rawls's notion of, 122 as an inadequate foundation for moral willingness to take risks, 31 theory, 305 windfall amount of money, sharing, 51-53 movement away from as retrograde, 305 obtaining a VNM version, 185 Wittgenstein, Ludwig, 112, 113 satisfying, 22 worst off. See also badly off; disadvantaged; violation of, 163 least advantaged class; poor and welfarism property, 22 oppressed welfarist principle, utilitarianism as, 21-22 defining, 82 welfarist version of the Aggregation Theorem, giving priority to, 5 184, 190-194 worst possible outcome, 72 well-being, 240 assessing, 305 Yaari, Menahem, 329 concepts of, 30 Griffin's idea of, 287 Zeckhauser, Richard, 211 interpersonal comparisons of, 93 zero-sum, two-person game, 359 measurable by a utility function, 12 Zeuthen, Frederik, 368