> Allocation in the European Emissions Trading Scheme

A critical issue in dealing with climate change is deciding who has a right to emit carbon dioxide, particularly when those emissions are limited. *Allocation in the European Emissions Trading Scheme* provides the first in-depth description and analysis of the process by which rights to emit carbon dioxide were created and distributed in the European Emissions Trading Scheme. This is the world's first large-scale experiment with an emission trading system for carbon dioxide and is likely to be copied by others if there is to be a global regime for limiting greenhouse gas emissions. The book consists of contributions by participants in the allocation process in ten representative member states and at the European Commission. The problems encountered by these ten representative countries, the solutions found and the choices they made, will be of interest to all who are concerned with climate policy and the use of emissions trading.

A. DENNY ELLERMAN is Senior Lecturer at the Sloan School of Management, Massachusetts Institute of Technology.

BARBARA K. BUCHNER is Senior Researcher at the Fondazione Eni Enrico Mattei (FEEM).

CARLO CARRARO is Professor of Econometrics and Environmental Economics at the University of Venice and Director of Research at the Fondazione Eni Enrico Mattei (FEEM).

Allocation in the European Emissions Trading Scheme

Rights, Rents and Fairness

Edited by

A. DENNY ELLERMAN Massachusetts Institute of Technology

BARBARA K. BUCHNER Fondazione Eni Enrico Mattei

CARLO CARRARO University of Venice



> CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY PRESS Cambridge, New York, Melbourne, Madrid, Cape Town, Singapore, São Paulo, Delhi, Dubai, Tokyo, Mexico City

Cambridge University Press The Edinburgh Building, Cambridge CB2 8RU, UK

Published in the United States of America by Cambridge University Press, New York

www.cambridge.org Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9780521182621

© Cambridge University Press 2007

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2007 Reprinted 2008 First paperback edition 2010

A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library

ISBN 978-0-521-87568-4 Hardback ISBN 978-0-521-18262-1 Paperback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this publication, and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.

> If factors of production are thought of as rights, it becomes easier to understand that the right to do something which has a harmful effect... is also a factor of production.

> > Ronald Coase, The Problem of Social Cost

Contents

	List of figures	<i>page</i> ix
	List of boxes	xi
	List of tables	xii
	List of contributors	xiv
	Introductory note/Foreword	xvii
	Acknowledgements	xix
	Glossary and abbreviations	XX
Part I	The EU ETS allocation process	
1	The EU ETS allocation process: an overview A. Denny Ellerman, Barbara K. Buchner and Carlo Carraro	3
2	A brief but lively chapter in EU climate policy: the Commission's perspective <i>Peter Zapfel</i>	13
Part II	Experiences from Member States in allocating allowances	
3	United Kingdom David Harrison and Daniel Radov	41
4	Germany Felix Christian Matthes and Franzjosef Schafhausen	72
5	Denmark Sigurd Lauge Pedersen	106

vii

Cambridge University Press 978-0-521-18262-1 - Allocation in the European Emissions Trading Scheme: Rights, Rents and Fairness Edited by A. Denny Ellerman, Barbara K. Buchner and Carlo Carraro Frontmatter More information

viii		Contents
6	Sweden Lars Zetterberg	132
7	Ireland Conor Barry	157
8	Spain Pablo del Río	182
9	Italy Daniele Agostini	213
10	Hungary Istvan Bart	246
11	Czech Republic <i>Tomas Chmelik</i>	269
12	Poland Boleslaw Jankowski	301
Part III	Concluding remarks and background material	
13	Unifying themes A. Denny Ellerman, Barbara K. Buchner and Carlo Carraro	339
	Appendix I Participants	370
	Appendix II The individual country outlines	378
	Appendix III The country tables	381
	1 NAP summary for Czech Republic	381
	2 NAP summary for Denmark	383
	3 NAP summary for Germany	385
	4 NAP summary for Hungary	387
	5 NAP summary for Ireland	389
	6 NAP summary for Italy 7 NAP summary for Poland	391 393
	7 NAP summary for Poland8 NAP summary for Spain	393 396
	9 NAP summary for Sweden	398
	10 NAP summary for United Kingdom	400
	Appendix IV Background material from the	
	European Commission	402
	Index	405

Figures

3.1	Fuel input for electricity generation in the UK,	
	1990–2003	page 42
3.2	The UK's path to Kyoto and national target	44
3.3	Revisions to projected CO ₂ emissions and distance	
	from UK target	53
3.4	Emissions from sites covered by the Phase 1 NAP	
	ranked according to share of UK Phase 1 cap	65
4.1	Early action allocation: the German East-West divide	87
4.2	Effective compliance factor considering special	
	provisions and the cap adjustment according to $\S4(4)$	
	ZuG 2007	96
4.3	Installations covered by the EU ETS in Germany and	
	the structure of allowance allocation	101
5.1	Total primary energy demand in Denmark	107
5.2	Historical CO ₂ emissions in Denmark	108
5.3	Danish historical emissions, business-as-usual emission	
	forecast and 2005-2007 allocations in Mt of CO2 from	
	installations covered by the Emissions Trading Directive	e 116
5.4	Long-range marginal costs (LRMC) of gas combined	
	cycle and coal steam turbine with and without CO ₂	
	costs. (Allowance price: €20. Gas/coal price ratio: 2.	
	Annual operating hours: 5500.)	125
6.1	The national greenhouse gas emission budget of Sweden	n 143
8.1	Comparative GDP growth rates (%) in Spain and the	
	EU in the period 1991–2002	183
	Trends and targets set in Spain's NAP	188
9.1	Electricity prices to the residential sector (1 January	
	cEuro/kWh, taxes included, 3500 kWh per year)	214
9.2	Electricity prices to industry (1 January cEuro/kWh,	
	taxes included, 10 GWh per year, 2500 kW)	214

х

Cambridge University Press
978-0-521-18262-1 - Allocation in the European Emissions Trading Scheme: Rights, Rents
and Fairness
Edited by A. Denny Ellerman, Barbara K. Buchner and Carlo Carraro
Frontmatter
More information

List of figures

9.3	Energy intensity of GDP in the EU (TOE/\$1000 1995	
	using purchasing power parities)	215
9.4	CO ₂ emission per unit of GDP (kg CO ₂ per \$US using	
	1995 prices and purchasing power parities)	215
9.5	Power production (%) in Europe in 2001	216
	Abatement costs in Europe	216
	Emission trends in Italy	217
	The impact of new investments on the Italian power	
	sector	219
9.9	The Path to Kyoto in Italy: total national emissions of	
	greenhouse gases	222
10.1	CO ₂ emissions per capita in selected countries	
	(based on OECD data)	248
10.2	Proposed and approved allocations and their	
	relationship with the Kyoto Protocol target (based on	
	NAP data). Countries are ordered by their distance to	
	the Kyoto Protocol target	250
11.1	Diagram of the Czech allocation process	272
	Greenhouse gas (GHG) emissions from 1990 to 2004	
	excluding bunkers in the Czech Republic (Gt CO ₂ e)	274
11.3	Average Temperature in the Czech Republic	276
11.4	An illustration of the methodology used to prepare	
	variant I of the Czech allocation plan	288
12.1	The modelling set used to develop CO_2 emission	
	projections in Poland	309
12.2	Historical GDP growth and current governmental plans	
	in Poland	312
12.3	Growth of sold production in industry in Poland in 2004	312
	CO ₂ emissions in both Polish scenarios versus the	
	Kyoto Protocol limit	315
12.5	Different paths to achieve the Kyoto CO ₂ target in	
	Poland (numbers represent average emissions in	
	2005–2007)	316
12.6	Summary of the top-down and bottom-up integrated	
	approach to the Polish NAP preparation	326
12.7	The structure of the reserve in the Polish NAP proposal	331
	The relation of recent emissions to the ETS allocation	
	and the Kyoto target	354

Boxes

5.1	Milestones in the Danish implementation of the	
	EU ETS Directive	page 110
8.1	Detailed steps and formulae involved in the Spanish	
	installation-level allocation	193
13.1	The challenge of data availability during the	
	allocation process	342
13.2	The importance of an interactive process for allocation	345
13.3	Competitiveness concerns as a major force behind	
	allocation decisions	359

Tables

1.1	Participants in the FEEM project	page 6
2.1	Overview of initial notification and assessment dates	
	of National Allocation Plans	24
2.2	Summary information on the first allocation process	26
3.1	Key dates for the UK NAP	46
3.2	Final UK Phase 1 NAP allocations to EU ETS sectors	47
4.1	Greenhouse gas emission trends (Mt CO ₂), the Kyoto	
	target and different projections in the context of German	y 76
4.2	Approaches to ensure Germany's compliance with the	
	emission ceilings of the Kyoto Protocol	80
4.3	Results of the German allocation process compared to	
	planned data	94
6.1	Development of the Swedish cap	141
7.1	Ireland's distance to target, with costs of effective	
	abatement (Mt CO ₂ e)	166
8.1	Changes to the initial draft allocation made by the	
	September version	196
8.2	Changes to the September version made by the final NAF	P 199
8.3	Coverage of sectors' demand for allowances	207
9.1	National Emission Reduction Plan scenarios in Italy	218
9.2	Allocation criteria for existing plants in Italy	228
	Power sector market segmentation based on merit order	232
10.1	Base periods in various Hungarian sectors	258
11.1	Greenhouse gas emissions from 1990 to 2004	
	excluding bunkers in the Czech Republic (Gt CO ₂ e)	273
11.2	The Czech NAP by sector (share of emissions, number	
	of installations)	282
11.3	Allocation of bonuses in the Czech Republic (number	
	of allowances)	285
11.4	Comparison of allocation variants in the Czech	
	Republic (number of allowances)	290

Cambridge University Press
978-0-521-18262-1 - Allocation in the European Emissions Trading Scheme: Rights, Rents
and Fairness
Edited by A. Denny Ellerman, Barbara K. Buchner and Carlo Carraro
Frontmatter
More information

List of tables

Х	1	1	1	
	-	-	-	

12.1	Sectoral emissions based on top-down and bottom-up	
	analyses (kt/year)	311
12.2	Main macroeconomic assumptions in the Polish	
	scenario modelling	313
12.3	CO ₂ emission per unit of GDP in Poland	314
12.4	CO ₂ emissions in the Polish BLN scenario from trading	
	and non-trading sectors (in Mt)	315
12.5	Main indexes that influence CO ₂ emissions in the	
	Polish ETS sectors in 2005–2007	320
12.6	Projected emission needs in the Polish ETS sectors in	
	2005–2007	321
12.7	Results of sectoral allocation: annual average (kt/year)	
	for 2005–2007	322

Contributors

- DANIELE AGOSTINI Department for Global Environment, International and Regional Conventions, Italian Ministry for the Environment
- CONOR BARRY CDM Secretariat, UN Framework Convention on Climate Change, Registration and Issuance Unit
- ISTVAN BART DG Environment, European Commission
- BARBARA K. BUCHNER Fondazione Eni Enrico Mattei (FEEM)
- CARLO CARRARO Department of Economics, University of Venice and Fondazione Eni Enrico Mattei (FEEM)
- TOMAS CHMELIK Climate Change Department, Czech Ministry of Environment
- PABLO DEL RÍO Department of Economics, University of Castilla-La Mancha
- A. DENNY ELLERMAN Center for Energy and Environmental Policy Research, Sloan School of Management, Massachusetts Institute of Technology
- DAVID HARRISON National Economic Research Associates (NERA) Economic Consulting
- BOLESLAW JANKOWSKI Badania Systemowe 'EnergSys' Sp. z o.o.
- FELIX CHRISTIAN MATTHES Öko-Institut (Institute for Applied Ecology)
- SIGURD LAUGE PEDERSEN Danish Energy Authority
- DANIEL RADOV National Economic Research Associates (NERA) Economic Consulting

xiv

List of contributors

xv

FRANZJOSEF SCHAFHAUSEN German Federal Environment Ministry

PETER ZAPFEL DG Environment European Commission

LARS ZETTERBERG Swedish Environmental Research Institute (IVL)

Foreword

Environmental policy-making in Europe has undergone a profound change over the last two decades: new policies have been initiated primarily at the EU rather than Member State level, and the influence of economic thinking has become quite important. There is probably no other policy area where this shift is clearer than on climate change, and the development of the EU ETS is undoubtedly the most remarkable example of both developments.

It was indispensable for all those involved in the development of climate change policy to be able to rely on solid academic work in both Europe and the world at large. It is very welcome for me as a policy-maker that this work is not limited only to conceptual thinking, but also takes in the evaluation of practical choices made in mundane matters such as allocation. This book is therefore a timely contribution for all those involved in the design of further trading schemes around the world for the first Kyoto Protocol period 2008–2012 and beyond.

All observers realised that the learning-by-doing phase of the EU ETS in 2005 would be challenging from several perspectives. Perhaps the most important was the absence of a comprehensive database concerning the emissions of the 11,500 installations covered by the EU ETS. Many pragmatic solutions had to be invented on the spot by the national officials in the capitals and in the Commission's offices. In the meantime, the first compliance cycle came to an end on 15 May 2006, and this has generated a wealth of verified real-life emissions data for the year 2005 at the level of each installation. The process of designing allocation plans for the trading period 2008–2012 will benefit a lot from this empirical base, as all those involved have moved up the NAP learning curve in a significant manner. And this applies not only to policy-makers, but also to companies and academics.

The new piece of analysis in front of us brings also a number of insights which will influence the policy process much beyond the NAP process. The legislators may have underestimated the significant

xvii

Cambridge University Press 978-0-521-18262-1 - Allocation in the European Emissions Trading Scheme: Rights, Rents and Fairness Edited by A. Denny Ellerman, Barbara K. Buchner and Carlo Carraro Frontmatter More information

xviii

Foreword

distributional battle that every allocation process entails, between Member States, between sectors, and within sectors. Sorting these out in a satisfactory manner was a precondition for the solid implementation of the EU ETS. Moreover the small print of the allocation plans may also have a considerable impact on the effectiveness of the system. It is of utmost importance to acquire a thorough insight into all aspects of this allocation experience, not least in the light of the review of the EU ETS Directive. It would be surprising if the decentralised nature of the allocation process, the structure of twelve general criteria and the limited role of auctioning would not become major issues in the preparation of the EU ETS for the post-2012 period.

> Jos Delbeke DG Environment European Commission July 2006

Acknowledgements

This book originated from a EU project on 'Lessons Learnt from the National Allocation of Allowances', sponsored by the European Commission's Directorate General for Environment. We would therefore like to thank the European Commission for financial support, and Jos Delbeke and Peter Zapfel for their intellectual engagement and guidance.

In order to prepare this book, two workshops were organised in which the contents of the different chapters were discussed. We are therefore grateful to the staff of the Fondazione Eni Enrico Mattei, and in particular to Rita Murelli and Barbara Racah, who helped to organise the workshops and who provided useful assistance throughout the preparation of this book.

Several discussions and comments from friends and colleagues have improved our understanding of the EU ETS allocation process. We thank our colleagues at the Fondazione Eni Enrico Mattei, at the Massachusetts Institute of Technology Center for Energy and Environmental Policy Research and at the Joint Program on the Science and Policy of Global Change for helpful remarks and suggestions. Comments from participants at seminars in Cambridge, MA and in Venice and from those colleagues who attended the special session on the design of climate policy at the 3rd World Congress of Environmental Economists in Kyoto are gratefully acknowledged.

We would also like to thank the various contributors to this book for their efforts, their commitment and their patience during the completion of the project. And, finally, we wish to thank Chris Harrison of Cambridge University Press for his encouragement throughout the process that led to this book.

xix

Glossary and abbreviations

AAU	Assigned Amount Unit
Accession countries	This term is usually used to refer to the ten new EU Member States from Central and Eastern Europe, which joined the European Union on 1 May 2005 (Cyprus, Czech Republic, Estonia, Hungary, Latvia, Lithuania, Malta, Poland, Slovakia and Slovenia)
Allowance	According to the EU ETS Directive Article 3(a), 'allowance' means an allowance to emit one tonne of carbon dioxide equivalent during a specified period, which shall be valid only for the purposes of meeting the requirements of this Directive and shall be transferable in accordance with the provisions of this Directive
Annex B	The list of countries taking on legally binding commitments along with a listing of their actual commitments as defined in the Kyoto Protocol
Annex I	Industrialised countries that, as parties to the UNFCCC, have pledged to reduce their greenhouse gas emissions by the year 2000 to 1990 levels as per Article 4.2 of the Kyoto Protocol are listed in Annex I. Annex I Parties consist of countries belonging to the OECD, the Economies-in-Transition and Turkey
Banking	Saving emission permits for future use in anticipation that these will accrue value over time

XX

Glossary and abbreviations

xxi

Baseline	Reference scenario which is used for comparisons with other scenarios
Base year	Year that serves as base for calculation of emission targets. In the UNFCCC and the Kyoto Protocol it is 1990 for Annex I countries (except Bulgaria 1988, Hungary average 1985-87, Poland 1988, Romania 1989). A base year may also be used as a reference for establishing an emissions baseline, or standard by which to measure verifiable changes in carbon stocks for the purpose of determining net changes of GHG emissions from anthropogenic land-use change and forestry activities
Basket	The six gases CO ₂ , CH ₄ , N ₂ O, HFC, PCF and SF ₆ form a basket in which the Kyoto commitments are denominated
BAT	Best available technology
BAU	Business as usual
Benchmark	A measurable variable used as a baseline or reference in evaluating the performance of projects or actions
Bubble	The idea that emissions reductions anywhere within a specific area count toward compliance. The possibility of forming a 'bubble' represents one of the flexible mechanisms included in the Kyoto Protocol
BSA	The Burden Sharing Agreement or so-called European Bubble allows the EU to reallocate its overall Kyoto target of -8% among the different EU Member States. In June 1998, a political agreement has been reached on the allocation of emission reduction efforts within the EU. The reduction commitments of each EU Member State can be found in the Communication from the Commission to

Cambridge University Press 978-0-521-18262-1 - Allocation in the European Emissions Trading Scheme: Rights, Rents and Fairness Edited by A. Denny Ellerman, Barbara K. Buchner and Carlo Carraro Frontmatter More information

xxii

Glossary and abbreviations

	the Council and the European Parliament (COM(99) 230 final, 19 May 1999)
Сар	Absolute emissions limit
Carbon dioxide	The concentration of CO_2 that would cause
equivalent	the same amount of radiative forcing as the given mixture of CO ₂ and other greenhouse gases
Carbon sequestration	The uptake and storage of carbon; trees and plants, for example, absorb carbon dioxide, release the oxygen and store the carbon
Carbon sink	Any reservoir that takes up carbon released from some other part of the carbon cycle; for example, the atmosphere, oceans and forests are major carbon sinks because much of the CO ₂ produced elsewhere on the Earth ends up in these bodies
CCGT	Combined cycle gas turbine
CDM	Clean Development Mechanism: in
	Article 12 of the Kyoto Protocol, the parties established the CDM for the purposes of assisting developing countries in achieving sustainable development and helping Annex I parties meet their emissions targets; carbon currency: certified emission reduction units (CERs)
CER	Certified emission reduction unit
CHP	Combined heat and power
CO ₂	Carbon dioxide: the main greenhouse gas affected directly by human activities
СОР	Conference of the Parties: the supreme body of the UNFCCC
Directive	In our context, the reference to the Directive usually denotes the Directive 2003/87/EC of the European Parliament and of the Council of 13 October 2003 establishing a scheme for greenhouse gas emission allowance trading within the Community

Cambridge University Press 978-0-521-18262-1 - Allocation in the European Emissions Trading Scheme: Rights, Rents and Fairness Edited by A. Denny Ellerman, Barbara K. Buchner and Carlo Carraro Frontmatter More information

Glossary and abbreviations

xxiii

	and amending Council Directive 96/61/EC, OJ L 275 , 32–45, 25 October 2003
EC	European Commission
ECJ	European Court of Justice
Economies in	The countries listed in Annex I or Annex B
transition	that are undergoing the process of transition
	to a market economy but that are also classified along with the EU, Japan and the
	US as Annex I parties to the UNFCCC
Emissions leakage	A concept often used by policy-makers in
	reference to the problem that emissions abatement achieved in one location may be
	offset by increased emissions in
	unregulated locations
Emission permit	In general a tradable entitlement to emit a specified amount of a substance. In the
	context of the EU ETS, the operators of
	included installations need to hold a
	'greenhouse gas emissions permit' issued
	by a competent authority in accordance
	with Articles 5 and 6 of the EU ETS
	Directive
ERU	Emissions reduction unit
ETS	Short for EU ETS
EU	European Union
EUA	European Union Allowances
EU ETS	The European Union Emissions Trading
	Scheme, specified by the Directive
	2003/87/EC, and launched in January
0110	2005
GHG	Greenhouse gas: any trace gas that does not
	absorb incoming solar radiation but does
	absorb longwave radiation emitted or reflected from the Earth's surface. The
	most important greenhouse gases are water
	vapour, carbon dioxide, nitrous oxide,
	methane and chlorofluorocarbons (CFCs).
Hot air	The amount by which an Eastern European
	country's Kyoto Protocol target exceeds its

Cambridge University Press 978-0-521-18262-1 - Allocation in the European Emissions Trading Scheme: Rights, Rents and Fairness Edited by A. Denny Ellerman, Barbara K. Buchner and Carlo Carraro Frontmatter More information

xxiv	Glossary and abbreviations
	probable emissions in 2012 even without any abatement actions. The reason for this excess emission reductions is the economic collapse which these countries suffered after the base year 1990
Installation	According to the EU ETS Directive Article 3(e), 'installation' means a stationary technical unit where one or more activities listed in Annex I are carried out and any other directly associated activities which have a technical connection with the activities carried out on that site and which could have an effect on emissions and pollution
International	Emission trading as defined in Article 17 of
Emissions Trading	the Kyoto Protocol; carbon currency:
	Assigned Amount Units (AAUs)
IPPC	Integrated Pollution Prevention and Control
JI	Joint Implementation: GHG mitigation projects between developed countries as defined in Article 6 of the Kyoto Protocol; carbon currency: emission reduction units (ERUs)
Kyoto Mechanisms	Generic term for the flexible mechanisms of the Kyoto Protocol: bubbles, JI, CDM and international emissions trading
KPD	Known planned development
MS	Member State of the European Union
MW_{th}	Megawatt thermal
NAP	National Allocation Plan. For each period of the EU ETS, each Member State is supposed to develop a national plan stating the total quantity of allowances that it intends to allocate for that period and how it proposes to allocate them
Non-Annex I country	Any country that does not belong to Annex I of the UNFCCC, i.e. the developing countries and some countries in transition

Glossary and abbreviations

XXV

NER	New Entrant Reserve set aside for any
	installation carrying out one or more of the
	activities indicated in the Directive, which
	has obtained a GHG permit or an update
	of its GHG emissions permit because of a
	change in the nature or functioning or an
	extension of the installation
NO_x	Nitrogen oxides
Operator	According to the EU ETS Directive
	Article 3(f), 'operator' means any person
	who operates or controls an installation or,
	where this is provided for in national
	legislation, to whom decisive economic
	power over the technical functioning of the
	installation has been delegated
SO ₂	Sulphur dioxide: a gas representing a form of
	air pollution It results from the
	combustion of fuels that contain sulphur,
	most prevalently from coal
UNFCCC	United Nations Framework Convention on
	Climate Change: a multilateral agreement
	that lays the basis for international climate
	negotiations
VOC	Volatile organic compounds