ACCOUNTABILITY FOR COLLECTIVE WRONGDOING

Ideas of collective responsibility challenge the doctrine of individual responsibility that is the dominant paradigm in law and liberal political theory. However, little attention is given to the consequences of holding groups accountable for wrongdoing. Groups are not amenable to punishment in the way that individuals are. Can they be punished – and if so, how – or are other remedies available? The topic crosses the borders of law, philosophy, and political science, and in this book, specialists in all three areas contribute their perspectives. They examine the limits of individual criminal liability in addressing atrocity, the meanings of punishment and responsibility, the distribution of group punishment to a group’s members, and the means through which collective accountability can be expressed. In doing so, they reflect on the legacy of the Nuremberg Trials, the philosophical understanding of collective responsibility, and the place of collective accountability in international political relations.

Tracy Isaacs is Associate Professor in the Department of Philosophy and the Department of Women’s Studies and Feminist Research (which she also chairs) at The University of Western Ontario. She is coeditor, with Samantha Brennan and Michael Milde, of New Canadian Perspectives in Ethics and Value Theory (2011) and has published articles in a number of philosophical journals, including Ethics, Criminal Justice Ethics, and The American Philosophical Quarterly. She has a forthcoming monograph titled Moral Responsibility in Collective Contexts.

Richard Vernon is Distinguished University Professor in the Department of Political Science at The University of Western Ontario. His publications include The Career of Toleration (winner of the C. B. Macpherson Prize in 1998); Political Morality: A Theory of Liberal Democracy (2001); Friends, Citizens, Strangers: Essays on Where We Belong (2005); and Cosmopolitan Regard: Political Membership and Global Justice (2010). His current work in progress includes a monograph on historical redress.
Accountability for Collective Wrongdoing

Edited by

Tracy Isaacs
The University of Western Ontario

Richard Vernon
The University of Western Ontario
Contents

List of Contributors vii
Acknowledgments ix

Introduction 1
Tracy Isaacs

PART I: COLLECTIVE ACCOUNTABILITY IN INTERNATIONAL LAW

1 Collective Responsibility and Postconflict Justice 23
Mark A. Drumbl

2 State Criminality and the Ambition of International Criminal Law 61
David Luban

3 Punishing Genocide: A Critical Reading of the International Court of Justice 92
Anthony F. Lang, Jr.

4 Joint Criminal Enterprise, the Nuremberg Precedent, and the Concept of “Grotian Moment” 119
Michael P. Scharf

5 Collective Responsibility and Transnational Corporate Conduct 140
Sara L. Seck

6 Collective Punishment and Mass Confinement 169
Larry May
PART II: DISTRIBUTING ACCOUNTABILITY

7 Reparative Justice
   Erin I. Kelly 193

8 The Distributive Effect of Collective Punishment
   Avia Pasternak 210

9 Citizen Responsibility and the Reactive Attitudes:
   Blaming Americans for War Crimes in Iraq
   Amy Sepinwall 231

10 Kicking Bodies and Damning Souls: The Danger of Harming
    “Innocent” Individuals While Punishing “Delinquent” States
    Toni Erskine 261

11 Punishing Collectives: States or Nations?
   Richard Vernon 287

Index 307
Contributors

Mark A. Drumbl is the Class of 1975 Alumni Professor at the School of Law, Washington and Lee University.

Toni Erskine is a Professor in the Department of International Relations at the University of Aberystwyth.

Tracy Isaacs is Associate Professor of Philosophy and Women’s Studies and Feminist Research and Chair of the Department of Women’s Studies and Feminist Research at The University of Western Ontario.

Erin I. Kelly is Associate Professor of Philosophy at Tufts University.

Anthony F. Lang, Jr., is Senior Lecturer in International Relations at the University of St. Andrews.

David Luban is University Professor and Frederick J. Haas Professor of Law and Philosophy at Georgetown University.

Larry May is W. Alton Jones Chair of Philosophy at Vanderbilt University and Professorial Fellow, Centre for Applied Philosophy and Public Ethics, Charles Sturt and Australian National Universities.

Avia Pasternak is Lecturer in political theory at the University of Essex.

Michael P. Scharf is Professor of Law and Director of the Frederick K. Cox International Law Center at Case Western Reserve University School of Law.

Sara L. Seck is Assistant Professor in the Faculty of Law at The University of Western Ontario.
Contributors

Amy Sepinwall is Assistant Professor in the Department of Legal Studies and Business Ethics at The Wharton School, University of Pennsylvania.

Richard Vernon is Distinguished University Professor in the Department of Political Science at The University of Western Ontario.
Acknowledgments

This book has its origin in a workshop organized by (the former) Nationalism and Ethnic Conflict Research Group at The University of Western Ontario in April 2009. The organizers, Richard Vernon and Tracy Isaacs, are grateful to the Faculty of Social Science (The University of Western Ontario) for the funding that made the group’s program of workshops and conferences possible.

An earlier version of Toni Erskine’s contribution to this book appeared in *Ethics & International Affairs* 24, no. 3 (2010) and is reprinted with permission of the publisher.