The International Protection of Internally Displaced Persons

Despite the fact that there are up to 25 million internally displaced persons around the world, their plight is still little known. Like refugees, internally displaced persons have been forced to leave their homes because of armed conflict and human rights abuses, but they have not left their country. This has major consequences in terms of the protection available to them. This book aims to offer a clear and easily accessible overview of this important humanitarian and human rights challenge. In particular, it seeks to provide an objective evaluation of UN efforts to protect the internally displaced. It will be of interest to all those involved with the internally displaced, as well as anyone seeking to gain an overall understanding of this complex issue.

Catherine Phuong is a Lecturer in Law at the University of Newcastle. She studied law, politics and economics at the Institut d'Etudes Politiques de Paris (Sciences Po), and received her Master of Laws from the University of Durham and her Doctorate from the University of Nottingham. She has been Visiting Professor at the University of Lyon II, and Visiting Research Scholar at the University of Michigan.
CAMBRIDGE STUDIES IN INTERNATIONAL AND COMPARATIVE LAW

Established in 1946, this series produces high quality scholarship in the fields of public and private international law and comparative law. Although these are distinct legal subdisciplines, developments since 1946 confirm their interrelation.

Comparative law is increasingly used as a tool in the making of law at national, regional and international levels. Private international law is now often affected by international conventions, and the issues faced by classical conflicts rules are frequently dealt with by substantive harmonisation of law under international auspices. Mixed international arbitrations, especially those involving state economic activity, raise mixed questions of public and private international law, while in many fields (such as the protection of human rights and democratic standards, investment guarantees and international criminal law) international and national systems interact. National constitutional arrangements relating to ‘foreign affairs’, and to the implementation of international norms, are a focus of attention.

The Board welcomes works of a theoretical or interdisciplinary character, and those focusing on new approaches to international or comparative law or conflicts of law. Studies of particular institutions or problems are equally welcome, as are translations of the best work published in other languages.

General Editors
James Crawford SC FBA
Whewell Professor of International Law, Faculty of Law, and Director, Lauterpacht Research Centre for International Law, University of Cambridge
John S. Bell FBA
Professor of Law, Faculty of Law, University of Cambridge

Editorial Board
Professor Hilary Charlesworth Australian National University
Professor Lori Damrosch Columbia University Law School
Professor John Dugard Universiteit Leiden
Professor Mary-Ann Glendon Harvard Law School
Professor Christopher Greenwood London School of Economics
Professor David Johnston University of Edinburgh
Professor Hein Kötz Max-Planck-Institut, Hamburg
Professor Donald McRae University of Ottawa
Professor Onuma Yasuaki University of Tokyo
Professor Reinhard Zimmermann Universität Regensburg

Advisory Committee
Professor D. W. Bowett QC
Judge Rosalyn Higgins QC
Professor J. A. Jolowicz QC
Professor Sir Elihu Lauterpacht CBE QC
Professor Kurt Lipstein
Judge Stephen Schwebel

A list of books in the series can be found at the end of this volume.
The International Protection of Internally Displaced Persons

Catherine Phuong

University of Newcastle
A mes parents
Pat et Louis
## Contents

Acknowledgments  page  xii  
Table of cases  xiv  
Table of treaties and other international documents  xvi  
List of abbreviations  xviii  

**Introduction**  1  
Internal displacement and containment policies  3  
A problem of international concern  6  
Analysing the problem of internal displacement  
within a human rights framework  9  

1  Internally displaced persons and refugees: conceptual differences and similarities  13  
Refugees and internally displaced persons  16  
Defining internally displaced persons  28  
Conclusion  37  

2  The legal protection of internally displaced persons  39  
An overview of the law applicable to situations of internal displacement  40  
Towards the Guiding Principles on Internal Displacement  48  
Legal analysis of the Guiding Principles on Internal Displacement  56  
Beyond the Guiding Principles?  66  
Conclusion  74
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Chapter</th>
<th>Title</th>
<th>Pages</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>The institutional framework of protection for the internally displaced</td>
<td>76</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>The role of UNHCR with regard to internally displaced persons</td>
<td>77</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>An extended role for UNHCR?</td>
<td>84</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Formulating coherent IDP policies in other international agencies</td>
<td>92</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Improving the UN response to crises of internal displacement</td>
<td>102</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Conclusion</td>
<td>115</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>Protection strategies for the internally displaced</td>
<td>117</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Defining protection for internally displaced persons</td>
<td>118</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Means of protection for internally displaced persons</td>
<td>125</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Special protection strategies for vulnerable groups of internally displaced persons</td>
<td>142</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>New initiatives</td>
<td>148</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Conclusion</td>
<td>148</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>Case study: internal displacement in Bosnia and Herzegovina</td>
<td>155</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Background to the crisis</td>
<td>157</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>International responses to internal displacement</td>
<td>165</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>International responsibility towards the internally displaced</td>
<td>174</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Reversing ethnic cleansing: strategies for the return of refugees and internally displaced persons</td>
<td>184</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Conclusion</td>
<td>205</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6</td>
<td>Reconceiving sovereignty and intervention</td>
<td>208</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Internal displacement and sovereignty issues</td>
<td>209</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Situations of internal displacement justifying external intervention</td>
<td>219</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Means of intervention and impact on IDP protection issues</td>
<td>226</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Conclusion</td>
<td>232</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Conclusions
Refugees and internally displaced persons: different frameworks of analysis 235
Internal displacement as a human rights issue 237
Possible improvements to the UN’s response to the problem of internal displacement 239
Internal displacement, human rights and sovereignty 241

Annex 1: The Guiding Principles on Internal Displacement 244

Bibliography 255
Index 279
Acknowledgments

This book would not have been written without the assistance and support of a number of people, of whom there are too many to list here. It started as a doctoral thesis at the University of Nottingham where I had the privilege to be supervised by Patrick Twomey. I have received invaluable guidance from him. He has spent long hours reading through and commenting on my many drafts, and discussing my ideas with me. I am extremely grateful for his help. I would also like to thank Ian Forbes for his advice and support. My examiners, Guy Goodwin-Gill, Dino Kritsiotis and Richard Aldrich, gave me very helpful suggestions with regard to the final version of this work.

I am particularly indebted to the University of Nottingham and the Jean Monnet Fund for their generous financing of this project. The Schools of Law and Politics have both funded my trips to national and international conferences where I was able to present and discuss my ideas, as well as a trip to Geneva. In addition, I would like to thank the J. C. Smith Travelling Fund (Nottingham) and the Gilbert Murray Trust (Oxford) for funding the field trip to the former Yugoslavia. I would especially like to thank the University of Newcastle for awarding me an internal research fellowship and the School of Law for granting me a period of research leave to allow for the completion of this book. I would further like to thank Finola O’Sullivan of Cambridge University Press for her enthusiasm and encouragement.

For this book, I have interviewed or spoken with many individuals, mainly in Geneva and the former Yugoslavia, who have taken time to discuss my ideas and/or given me access to invaluable source materials. It is impossible for me to list all their names. Special thanks go to Jane Alexander, Axel Bisschop, Jeff Crisp, Birgit van Delft, Thierry Domin, Jacoba van den Ende, Walpurga Englbrecht, Madeleine Garlick,
Marguerite Garling, Lutz Gauger, Daniel Helle, Guy Hovey, Ayaki Ito, Michael Kingsley, Hans Lunshof, Erin Mooney, Viktor Nylund and Werner Wendt. In addition, I would like to thank for their assistance the library staff at the Refugee Studies Centre Library in Oxford and the UNHCR Library in Geneva.

An early version of the Introduction and Chapter 1 of this book was published as ‘Internally Displaced Persons and Refugees: Conceptual Differences and Similarities’ (2000) 18 Netherlands Quarterly of Human Rights 215, and is reproduced here in its adapted form with the kind permission of the copyright holder. An early version of Chapter 3 appeared in ‘Improving the United Nations Reponse to Crises of Internal Displacement’ (2002) 13 International Journal of Refugee Law 491. This is reproduced here with the kind permission of Oxford University Press, as is part of Chapter 5, which was first published as “‘Freely to Return”: Reversing Ethnic Cleansing in Bosnia and Herzegovina’ (2000) 13 Journal of Refugee Studies 165.

I would like to thank my family and friends for their constant support throughout the last few years. In particular, friends and colleagues at the Universities of Nottingham and Newcastle have been a source of invaluable help and support. Gemma Hayton, Joanne Pinnock and Ann Sinclair provided invaluable assistance to complete the manuscript. Finally, I would like to thank Alistair for his critical comments and constant encouragement. All errors and omissions remain mine alone.

Catherine Phuong
October 2003

The law is stated as at 1 October 2003, although later developments have been incorporated where possible.
Table of cases

International Court of Justice

Military and Paramilitary Activities in and against Nicaragua (Merits)  
(Nicaragua v. United States) (1986) ICJ Reports 14 page 45, 213

Permanent Court of Arbitration

Island of Palmas case (Netherlands v. United States) (1928) 2 Reports of International Arbitral Awards 829 217

European Court of Human Rights

Akdivar and others v. Turkey (Merits) (1997) 23 EHRR 143 63
Akdivar and others v. Turkey (Article 50), 1 April 1998, Reports, 1998-II, 711 63
Bilgin v. Turkey (2003) 36 EHRR 879 63
Cyprus v. Turkey (2002) 35 EHRR 30 63
Loizidou v. Turkey (Article 50), 28 July 1998, Reports, 1998-IV, 1807 63
Mentes and others v. Turkey (Article 50), 24 July 1998, Reports, 1998-IV, 1686 63
Selcuk and Asker v. Turkey (1998) 26 EHRR 477 63
Soering v. United Kingdom et al. (1989) 11 EHRR 439 61
Yöyler v. Turkey, Application No. 26973/9524, Decision of 24 July 2003 63

International Criminal Tribunal for the former Yugoslavia

Prosecutor v. Kunarac, Kovac and Vukovic, Case No. IT-96-23 and IT-96-23/1, Judgment of 22 February 2001 144
Prosecutor v. Simic et al., Case No. IT-95-9, Decision on the Prosecution Motion under Rule 73 for a Ruling Concerning the Testimony of a Witness, 27 July 1999, and Decision Denying Request for Assistance
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Table of Cases</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>in Securing Documents and Witnesses from the International Committee of the Red Cross, 7 June 2000</td>
<td>176</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>United Kingdom</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Horvath v. Secretary of State for the Home Department [2000]</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3 WLR 379</td>
<td>214</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>R. v. Immigration Appeal Tribunal, ex parte Shah [1999] 2 AC 629</td>
<td>214</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>International Criminal Tribunal in Rwanda</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Prosecutor v. Akayesu, Case No. ICTR-96-4-T, Judgment of 22 February 2001</td>
<td>144</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Table of treaties and other international documents

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Year</th>
<th>Title</th>
<th>References</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1933</td>
<td>Montevideo Convention on the Rights and Duties of States</td>
<td>217</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1946</td>
<td>Constitution of the International Refugee Organization</td>
<td>16, 77</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Universal Declaration of Human Rights</td>
<td>42, 51, 62, 64, 213</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Geneva Convention for the Amelioration of the Condition of the Wounded and Sick in Armed Forces in the Field</td>
<td>44, 67, 136, 137</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Geneva Convention relative to the Protection of Civilian Persons in Time of War</td>
<td>44, 45, 46, 47, 49, 59, 61, 67, 136, 137</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1950</td>
<td>European Convention on Human Rights</td>
<td>41, 63, 213</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Statute of the Office of the United Nations High Commissioner for Refugees</td>
<td>78, 84, 90, 119, 178</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Convention relating to the Status of Refugees</td>
<td>1, 4, 9, 13, 14, 16, 17, 20, 21, 23, 28, 36, 43, 47, 55, 61, 66, 77, 78, 80, 95, 118, 164, 236</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>First Protocol to the European Convention on Human Rights</td>
<td>62, 63, 193</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1954</td>
<td>Convention relating to the Status of Stateless Persons</td>
<td>80</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1965</td>
<td>Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Racial Discrimination</td>
<td>42, 213</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1966</td>
<td>International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights</td>
<td>42, 43, 50, 51, 62, 64, 213</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Year</td>
<td>Treaty Description</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>------</td>
<td>------------------------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1966</td>
<td>International Covenant on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1967</td>
<td>Protocol relating to the Status of Refugees</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1967</td>
<td>UN Declaration on Territorial Asylum</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1967</td>
<td>American Convention on Human Rights</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1969</td>
<td>OAU Convention relating to the Specific Aspects of Refugee Problems in Africa</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1969</td>
<td>Vienna Convention on the Law of Treaties</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1979</td>
<td>Declaration on Principles of International Law concerning友好 Relations and Co-operation among States in Accordance with the Charter of the United Nations</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1979</td>
<td>Protocol I, Additional to the 1949 Geneva Convention, and relating to the Victims of International Armed Conflicts</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1979</td>
<td>Protocol II, Additional to the 1949 Geneva Convention, and relating to the Victims of Non-International Armed Conflicts</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1979</td>
<td>Convention on the Elimination of Discrimination Against Women</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1981</td>
<td>African Charter on Human and Peoples’ Rights</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1981</td>
<td>Cartagena Declaration on Refugees</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1981</td>
<td>Convention against Torture and Cruel, Inhuman or Degrading Treatment or Punishment</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1989</td>
<td>Convention concerning Indigenous and Tribal Peoples in Independent Countries, ILO Convention No. 169</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1989</td>
<td>UN Convention on the Rights of the Child</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1989</td>
<td>Declaration on the Elimination of Violence against Women</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1995</td>
<td>Framework Convention for the Protection of National Minorities</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1995</td>
<td>Guiding Principles on Internal Displacement</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1998</td>
<td>Statute of the International Criminal Court</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2000</td>
<td>Optional Protocol to the Convention on the Rights of the Child on the Involvement of Children in Armed Conflicts</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Abbreviations

1951 Convention Convention Relating to the Status of Refugees
ASIL American Society of International Law
CFSP Common Foreign and Security Policy (of the EU)
CHR Commission on Human Rights
CIS Commonwealth of Independent States
COHRE Centre on Housing Rights and Evictions
CRPC Commission on Real Property Claims of Displaced Persons and Refugees (in Bosnia and Herzegovina)
ECHR European Convention for the Protection of Human Rights and Fundamental Freedoms
ECOSOC Economic and Social Council
ECRE European Council on Refugees and Exiles
EHRR European Human Rights Reports
ERC Emergency Relief Coordinator
ETS European Treaty Series
EXCOM Executive Committee (of UNHCR)
FRY Federal Republic of Yugoslavia
GA General Assembly
GAOR General Assembly Official Records
HC Humanitarian Coordinator
HIWG Humanitarian Issues Working Group
IASC Inter-Agency Standing Committee
ICC International Criminal Court
ICCPR International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights
ICESCR International Covenant on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Abbreviation</th>
<th>Description</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>ICISS</td>
<td>International Commission on Intervention and State Sovereignty</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ICJ</td>
<td>International Court of Justice</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ICRC</td>
<td>International Committee of the Red Cross</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ICTR</td>
<td>International Criminal Tribunal for Rwanda</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ICTY</td>
<td>International Criminal Tribunal for the former Yugoslavia</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ICVA</td>
<td>International Council of Voluntary Agencies</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>IDP</td>
<td>internally displaced person</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ILM</td>
<td><em>International Legal Materials</em></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>IOM</td>
<td>International Organization for Migration</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>IRO</td>
<td>International Refugee Organization</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>KLA</td>
<td>Kosovo Liberation Army</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NGO</td>
<td>non-governmental organisation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>OAU</td>
<td>Organization of African Unity</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>OCHA</td>
<td>Office for the Coordination of Humanitarian Affairs</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>OHCHR</td>
<td>Office of the High Commissioner for Human Rights</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>OHR</td>
<td>Office of the High Representative</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>OJ</td>
<td><em>Official Journal of the European Communities</em></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>OSCE</td>
<td>Organization for Security and Cooperation in Europe</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PLIP</td>
<td>Property Law Implementation Plan</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SC</td>
<td>Security Council</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SCOR</td>
<td><em>Security Council Official Records</em></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SFOR</td>
<td>Stabilization Force (in Bosnia and Herzegovina)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>UNAMIR</td>
<td>United Nations Assistance Mission in Rwanda</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>UNDP</td>
<td>United Nations Development Programme</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>UNHCR</td>
<td>United Nations High Commissioner for Refugees</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>UNICEF</td>
<td>United Nations Children’s Fund</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>UNMIBH</td>
<td>United Nations Mission in Bosnia and Herzegovina</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>UNPA</td>
<td>United Nations Protected Area</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>UNPROFOR</td>
<td>United Nations Protection Force in the Former Yugoslavia</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>UNTS</td>
<td><em>United Nations Treaty Series</em></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>USCR</td>
<td>United States Committee for Refugees</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>WFP</td>
<td>World Food Programme</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>WHO</td>
<td>World Health Organization</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>WLR</td>
<td><em>Weekly Law Reports</em></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>