

RELIGION IN MIND

Religion in Mind summarizes and extends the last decade's advances in the cognitive study of religion using empirical research from psychology and anthropology to illuminate various components of religious belief, ritual, and experience. The book examines cognitive dimensions of religion within a naturalistic view of culture, while respecting the phenomenology of religion and drawing together teachers of religion, psychologists of religion, and cognitive scientists. Expert contributors focus on phenomena such as belief-fixation and transmission; attributions of agency; anthropomorphizing; counterintuitive religious representations; the well-formedness of religious rituals; links between religious representations and emotions; and the development of god concepts. The work encourages greater interdisciplinary linkages between scholars from different fields and will be of interest to researchers in anthropology, psychology, sociology, history, philosophy, and cognitive science. It also will interest more general readers in religion and science.

JENSINE ANDRESEN is Assistant Professor of Theology at Boston University where she teaches in the graduate program in Science, Philosophy, and Religion. She has published in *Isis:* An International Review Devoted to the History of Science and its Cultural Influences; Zygon: Journal of Religion and Science; Religion and Education; and The Journal of Religion. With Robert K. C. Forman, she has edited Cognitive Models and Spiritual Maps: Interdisciplinary Explorations of Religious Experience (2000).



RELIGION IN MIND

Cognitive Perspectives On Religious Belief, Ritual, and Experience

EDITED BY
JENSINE ANDRESEN





CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY PRESS
Cambridge, New York, Melbourne, Madrid, Cape Town,
Singapore, São Paulo, Delhi, Tokyo, Mexico City

Cambridge University Press
The Edinburgh Building, Cambridge CB2 8RU, UK

Published in the United States of America by Cambridge University Press, New York

www.cambridge.org Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9780521173186

© Cambridge University Press 2001

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2001 First paperback edition 2011

A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library

Library of Congress Cataloguing in Publication data

Religion in mind: cognitive perspectives on religious belief, ritual, and experience / edited by Jensine Andresen.

p. cm

Includes bibliographical references and index.

ISBN 0 521 80152 4

1. Religion. 2. Cognitive psychology.

3. Cognitive science. 1. Andresen, Jensine. BL48.R424 2001

153-dc21 00-045522

ISBN 978-0-521-80152-2 Hardback ISBN 978-0-521-17318-6 Paperback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this publication, and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.



Contents

Notes on contributors		page vii			
Ι	Introduction: towards a cognitive science of religion <i>Jensine Andresen</i>	I			
PA	PART I: BELIEF ACQUISITION AND THE SPREAD OF RELIGIOUS				
REPRESENTATIONS 45					
2	On what we may believe about beliefs Benson Saler	47			
3	Cognition, emotion, and religious experience Ilkka Pyysiäinen	70			
4	Why gods? A cognitive theory Stewart Guthrie	94			
PART II: QUESTIONING THE "REPRESENTATION" OF RELIGIOUS					
RITUAL ACTION		113			
5	Ritual, memory, and emotion: comparing two cognitive hypotheses *Robert N. McCauley*	115			
6	Psychological perspectives on agency E. Thomas Lawson	141			
7	Do children experience God as adults do?	173			



vi	LIST OF CONTENTS	
PART III: EMBODIED MODELS OF RELIGION		191
8	Cognitive study of religion and Husserlian phenomenology: making better tools for the analysis of cultural systems Matti Kamppinen	193
9	Why a proper science of mind implies the transcendence of nature Francisco J. Varela	207
10	Religion and the frontal lobes Patrick McNamara	237
ΙΙ	Conclusion: religion in the flesh: forging new methodologies for the study of religion <i>Jensine Andresen</i>	257
Index		288



Notes on contributors

JENSINE ANDRESEN (Ph.D., Harvard University, 1997) is Assistant Professor of Theology at Boston University where she teaches in the interdisciplinary graduate program in Science, Philosophy, and Religion. She previously served on the faculty of the Department of Religion at the Universty of Vermont. Her research interests include cognitive science and religious experience; bioethics; public policy and ethics; and social justice. With Robert K. C. Forman, she has edited Cognitive Models and Spiritual Maps: Interdisciplinary Explorations of Religious Experience (Thorverton, UK: Imprint Academic, 2000). She has published articles and book reviews in Isis: An International Review Devoted to the History of Science and its Cultural Influences; Zygon: Journal of Religion and Science; and Religion and Education, and The Journal of Religion. Currently, she is editing a volume on entitled Cloning and Genetic Technologies: Religious, Philosophical, and Legal Perspectives, and she recently has completed editing a six-part videotape series on this same topic.

JUSTIN L. BARRETT (Ph.D., Cornell University, 1997) is Assistant Professor of Psychology at Calvin College, Grand Rapids, Michigan. His research concerns cross-cultural cognition and cognitive development, especially as they relate to religion. In his brief career, Professor Barrett has delivered some thirty national and international addresses regarding the intersection of cognition and religion. His articles have appeared in such journals as Child Development; Cognitive Psychology; Current Trends in Cognitive Sciences; Method & Theory in the Study of Religion; and Journal for the Scientific Study of Religion. Professor Barrett's inspiration for studying cognitive development comes from his two children, Skylar and Sierra. When not pursuing his academic interests, he enjoys athletics,



viii

NOTES ON CONTRIBUTORS

singing and playing guitar, cooking, and relieving his wife Sherry Barrett from primary child-care duties.

STEWART ELLIOTT GUTHRIE (Ph.D., Yale University, 1976) is Professor of Anthropology at Fordham University and a founding member of The Anthropology of Religion Section of the American Anthropological Association. Professor Guthrie writes on religion, anthropomorphism, and animism. His publications include, among others, "Anthropomorphism" in Encyclopaedia Britannica (forthcoming); Faces in the Clouds: A New Theory of Religion (Oxford University Press 1993; paperback 1995); A Fapanese New Religion: Rissho Kosei-kai in a Mountain Hamlet (University of Michigan CJS Monographs in Japanese Studies Vol. 1, 1988); and "A Cognitive Theory of Religion" (Current Anthropology 21 (2): 181–203, with CA treatment, 1980). Professor Guthrie has worked for some twenty years on a cognitive account of religion, supported by grants from the Fulbright Commission, the National Science Foundation, the National Endowment for the Humanities, the American Council of Learned Societies, and the Japan Foundation. He has just completed a term as Fulbright Professor of Comparative Religion at the University of Turku, Finland.

MATTI KAMPPINEN (Ph.D., University of Turku, 1989) is Senior Lecturer in Comparative Religion at Turku University, Finland. Professor Kamppinen has been a research fellow at the Academy of Finland and Cornell University. He also is affiliated with the Finland Futures Research Centre at the Turku School of Economics and Business Administration. Professor Kamppinen has conducted anthropological research in the Peruvian Amazon and western Finland, where he studied cultural models of illnesses and risks. Currently, he is investigating cultural models of time and the impacts of information technology on time perspectives. His publications include A Historical Introduction to Phenomenology (Croom Helm 1987, co-authored with Seppo Sajama); Cognitive Systems and Cultural Models of Illness (Academia Scientiarum Fennica 1989); Consciousness, Cognitive Schemata and Relativism (Kluwer Academic 1993, edited); and Consciousness in Philosophy and Cognitive Neuroscience (Lawrence Erlbaum 1994, co-edited with Antti Revonsuo). His most recent publication is a monograph, Angelic Times (in Finnish), which deals with cultural time perspectives.



Notes on contributors

ix

- E. THOMAS LAWSON (Ph.D., University of Chicago, 1963) is Professor and Chair of Comparative Religion at Western Michigan University. His research focuses upon employing the resources of cognitive science as a means to develop an explanatory understanding of religious ideas and practices, particularly rituals. His publications include Rethinking Religion: Connecting Cognition and Culture (Cambridge University Press 1990) which he co-authored with Robert N. McCauley; Religions of Africa: Traditions in Transformation (Waveland Press 1998); and numerous articles in encyclopedias and scholarly journals. His article "Religious Ideas and Practices" was recently published in the MIT Encyclopedia for Cognitive Science (The MIT Press 1999). He is the editor of Numen: An International Review for the History of Religions, and has received numerous awards and fellowships including The Distinguished Faculty Scholar Award, The Michigan Association of Governing Boards Award, and the Alumni Award for Excellence in Teaching.
- ROBERT N. MCCAULEY (Ph.D., University of Chicago, 1979) is Professor of Philosophy at Emory University in Atlanta, Georgia. He is the co-author, with E. Thomas Lawson, of *Rethinking Religion*: Connecting Cognition and Culture (Cambridge University Press 1990); and the editor of The Churchlands and Their Critics (Blackwell Publishers 1996). He has also published in such journals as Philosophical Psychology; Philosophy of Science; Synthese; Method & Theory in the Study of Religion; Journal of the American Academy of Religion; and History of Religions. Professor McCauley has received awards or fellowships from the Council for Philosophical Studies, the American Council of Learned Societies, the Lilly Endowment, the National Endowment for the Humanities, and the American Academy of Religion. He served as President of the Society for Philosophy and Psychology from 1997 to 1998. The winner of numerous teaching awards, Professor McCauley was the inaugural Massee-Martin/NEH Distinguished Teaching Professor at Emory University (1994–1998).
- PATRICK MCNAMARA (Ph.D., Boston University, 1991) is Assistant Professor, Department of Psychiatry, Boston University School of Medicine. He has published widely on catecholaminergic influences on higher cortical functions, frontal lobes, the cognitive



X NOTES ON CONTRIBUTORS

science of dreaming, biomedical ethics of organ and tissue donation, philosophy of memory and mind, and neuropsychological correlates of religion. His book, *Mind and Variability: Mental Darwinism, Memory and Self* (Praeger 1999) applies Darwinian selectionist ideas to problems of memory and identity. Dr. McNamara currently is completing another book on executive cognitive functions of the human frontal lobes.

ILKKA PYYSIÄINEN (Ph.D., Helsinki University, 1993) is Associate Professor of Comparative Religion at the Universities of Turku and Helsinki, Finland. Currently Professor Pyysiäinen is Senior Research Associate at the Academy of Finland. His publications include Beyond Language and Reason. Mysticism in Indian Buddhism (Academia Scientiarum Fennica 1993); Belief and Beyond (Åbo Akademi 1996); Jumalan selitys [God Explained] (Otava 1997); and a number of articles in, e.g., Asian Philosophy; Method & Theory in the Study of Religion; and Numen. He is currently doing empirical research on "the religious" as a cognitive category.

BENSON SALER (Ph.D., University of Pennsylvania, 1960) is Professor Emeritus of Anthropology at Brandeis University and a founding member of the Anthropology of Religion section of the American Anthropological Association. He has also taught at The University of Connecticut and in the summer program at Colombia University. From 1978 to 1979 he was the Sir Isaac Wolfson Visiting Professor at the Hebrew University of Jerusalem. He has carried out ethnographic fieldwork among Maya-Quiche in Guatemala and among Wayú (Guajiro) in northern Colombia and Venezuela. He is currently engaged in studying the "alien abduction phenomenon" in the United States. His publications include Los Wayú (Guajiro) in Los aborígenes de Venezuela, vol. III, pp. 25–145. (Fundación La Salle de Ciencias Naturales, Caracas 1988); Conceptualizing Religion: Immanent Anthropologists, Transcendent Natives, and Unbounded Categories (E. J. Brill 1993, paperback by Berghahn Books 2000); and a co-authored work, UFO Crash at Roswell: The Genesis of a Modern Myth (The Smithsonian Institution Press 1997).

FRANCISCO J. VARELA (Ph.D., Harvard University, 1970) lives and works in France, where he is Director of Research at the Centre Nationale de la Recherche Scientifique (CNRS), a senior member of CREA, Ecole Polytechnique, and Head of the Neurodynamics



Notes on contributors

Unit at LENA (Laboratory of Cognitive Neurosciences and Brain Imaging) at the Salpetrière Hospital, Paris. His interests have centered on the biological mechanisms of cognitive phenomena and human consciousness, at both the level of experimental research in cognitive neuroscience and conceptual foundations. He has contributed 150 articles to scientific journals on these matters, and he also is the author and/or editor of thirteen books, including *The Embodied Mind* (The MIT Press 1992); and, more recently, *Naturalizing Phenomenology: Contemporary Issues in Phenomenology and Cognitive Science* (Stanford University Press 1999); and *The View from Within: First-person Methods in the Study of Consciousness* (Imprint Academic 1999).

© in this web service Cambridge University Press

www.cambridge.org

хi