

Cambridge University Press

978-0-521-16977-6 - Judging State-Sponsored Violence, Imagining Political Change

Bronwyn Leebaw

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

## JUDGING STATE-SPONSORED VIOLENCE, IMAGINING POLITICAL CHANGE

How should state-sponsored atrocities be judged and remembered? This controversial question animates contemporary debates on transitional justice and reconciliation. This book reconsiders the legacies of two institutions that transformed the theory and practice of transitional justice. Whereas the International Military Tribunal at Nuremberg came to exemplify the promise of legalism and international criminal justice, South Africa's Truth and Reconciliation Commission promoted restorative justice and truth commissions. Bronwyn Leebaw argues that the two frameworks share a common problem: Both rely on criminal justice strategies to investigate experiences of individual victims and perpetrators, which undermines their critical role as responses to systematic atrocities. Drawing on the work of influential transitional justice institutions and thinkers such as Judith Shklar, Hannah Arendt, José Zalaquett, and Desmond Tutu, Leebaw offers a new approach to thinking about the critical role of transitional justice – one that emphasizes the importance of political judgment and investigations that examine complicity in, and resistance to, systematic atrocities.

BRONWYN LEEBAW is currently an assistant professor in the political science department at the University of California, Riverside. Her interest in transitional justice, restorative justice, and human rights has led her to South Africa, Bosnia-Herzegovina, and The Hague, Netherlands. Leebaw has published several articles on these topics in journals such as *Perspectives on Politics*, *Human Rights Quarterly*, and *Polity*.

Cambridge University Press

978-0-521-16977-6 - Judging State-Sponsored Violence, Imagining Political Change

Bronwyn Leebaw

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

---

JUDGING  
STATE-SPONSORED VIOLENCE,  
IMAGINING  
POLITICAL CHANGE

BRONWYN LEEBAW

University of California, Riverside



CAMBRIDGE  
UNIVERSITY PRESS

Cambridge University Press  
978-0-521-16977-6 - Judging State-Sponsored Violence, Imagining Political Change  
Bronwyn Leebaw  
Frontmatter  
[More information](#)

CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY PRESS  
Cambridge, New York, Melbourne, Madrid, Cape Town,  
Singapore, São Paulo, Delhi, Tokyo, Mexico City

Cambridge University Press  
32 Avenue of the Americas, New York, NY 10013-2473, USA

[www.cambridge.org](http://www.cambridge.org)  
Information on this title: [www.cambridge.org/9780521169776](http://www.cambridge.org/9780521169776)

© Bronwyn Leebaw 2011

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception  
and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements,  
no reproduction of any part may take place without the written  
permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2011

Printed in the United States of America

*A catalog record for this publication is available from the British Library.*

*Library of Congress Cataloging in Publication data*  
Leebaw, Bronwyn Anne.

Judging state-sponsored violence, imagining  
political change / Bronwyn Anne Leebaw.  
p. cm.

ISBN 978-1-107-00058-2 (hardback) – ISBN 978-0-521-16977-6 (paperback)

1. International police. 2. Transitional justice. 3. Political violence. 4. Crimes against  
humanity. 5. Intervention (International law) 6. Truth commissions – South Africa –  
History. 7. War crime trials – Germany – Nuremberg. I. Title.

KZ6374.L44 2011  
342.08-dc22 2010039406

ISBN 978-1-107-00058-2 Hardback  
ISBN 978-0-521-16977-6 Paperback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for  
external or third-party Internet Web sites referred to in this publication and does not guarantee  
that any content on such Web sites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.

Cambridge University Press  
978-0-521-16977-6 - Judging State-Sponsored Violence, Imagining Political Change  
Bronwyn Leebaw  
Frontmatter  
[More information](#)

---

*To Teo, Nadia, and John*

Contents

<i>Acknowledgments</i>	<i>page ix</i>
1 Introduction: Transitional Justice and the “Gray Zone”	1
2 Human Rights Legalism and the Legacy of Nuremberg	31
3 A Different Kind of Justice: South Africa’s Alternative to Legalism	58
4 Political Judgment and Transitional Justice: Actors and Spectators	91
5 Rethinking Restorative Justice	119
6 Remembering Resistance	145
7 Conclusion: The Shadows of the Past	172
<i>Select Bibliography</i>	189
<i>Index</i>	205

Cambridge University Press

978-0-521-16977-6 - Judging State-Sponsored Violence, Imagining Political Change

Bronwyn Leebaw

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

## Acknowledgments

I have many extraordinary people to thank for their role in helping me complete this project. I am grateful to the professors at UC Berkeley who worked with me on this project at its earliest stages. The late, dearly missed Michael Paul Rogin was an incredible mentor and aided me in formulating the ideas that would come to frame this project. Hanna Pitkin patiently read through multiple early drafts of core chapters and provided encouragement when it was most needed. Wendy Brown, Bob Kagan, and Robert Post all provided essential support, thoughtful comments, and challenging criticism that deepened my thinking on these issues in crucial ways. I am also grateful to professors Beatriz Manz, Theodor Meron, Nancy Scheper-Hughes, and Paul Thomas for insightful comments that informed my thinking.

I learned a great deal about transitional justice through my work with Eric Stover and Harvey M. Weinstein at the UC Berkeley Human Rights Center, and through ongoing conversations with many individuals that were involved at the Human Rights Center while I was there, especially Patrick Ball, Laurel Fletcher, Laurie Lola Vollen, and Gilles Peress.

I am grateful to the many scholars, leaders, and activists based in South Africa who took time out of their demanding schedules to meet with me during my visits – the first of which was many years ago. The late Peter Biehl, Linda Biehl, Richard Goldstone, Rhoda Kadalie, Dumisa Ntzebeza, Fazel Randera, Fiona Ross, Hugo Van der Merwe, Charles Villa-Vicencio, Nomfundo Walaza, and many others, generously shared their thoughts with me. The Centre for the Study of Violence and Reconciliation in Johannesburg and the Trauma Center for Survivors of Violence and Torture in Cape Town allowed me to make use of their facilities. Hylton Alcock, Mary Galvin, Mike Metelits, and Nicky Nathan opened their homes to me on my visits and showed me around. My deepest thanks go to the many people, too numerous to name, in South

Cambridge University Press

978-0-521-16977-6 - Judging State-Sponsored Violence, Imagining Political Change

Bronwyn Leebaw

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

Africa, Bosnia-Herzegovina, and the Hague, Netherlands, who gave their time in interviews and discussions about transitional justice institutions.

I am grateful to the Institute for the Study of World Politics and the Hewlett Foundation for grants that supported my work on this project. I also want to thank the University of California, Riverside, for providing grants, sabbatical leave, and maternity leave, which made it possible for me to complete this book. I am especially grateful to Shaun Bowler and Monique Davis-Brooks for their assistance and patience in helping me navigate the logistics of leave taking. Prior to the current budget crisis, UC Riverside was able to hire an incredible pool of talented young scholars that have established a fantastic and nurturing intellectual community here. As fellow members of a working group on Gandhi's legacy, Farah Godrej, June O'Connor, and David Biggs contributed to my thinking on reconciliation and resistance. In the department of political science, I have been lucky to have colleagues that are thoroughly engaging, inspiring, and unpretentious. Chris Laursen provided thoughtful feedback on the manuscript and saved me from some embarrassing mistakes. A special thanks to David Pion Berlin, Juliann Allison, and Feryal Cherif, who have been involved in organizing the departmental human rights colloquium. I am also grateful to my students, graduate and undergraduate alike, for what they have taught me about the themes that animate this book.

This book has benefited a great deal from the thoughtful comments and counsel of colleagues that I have had the fortune to meet at conferences over the years. As discussants on various conference panels, W. James Booth, John F. Burke, Javier Couso, Mark Drumbl, Victor Peskin, Naomi Roht-Arriaza, and Brad Roth provided extremely valuable feedback. As fellow panelists or participants in conferences, Stephen Esquith, Chimène Keitner, Helen Kinsella, Nesam Mcmillan, David Mendeloff, Daniel Philpott, Jamie Rowen, Chandra Sriram, Andrew Valls, and Leslie Vinjamuri commented on drafts or presentations of this work in ways that enriched my thinking. Dean Mathiowetz not only provided intellectual nourishment from the very beginning, but also detailed comments and criticisms that greatly improved Chapter 4. I am especially grateful to Ruti Teitel for her constructive feedback and generous encouragement. I am also grateful to Amy Ross for taking the time to share her wisdom and experience when I was beginning this project, and to Peter Agree for his support and insight along the way. All of these people have contributed to my thinking on the ideas developed in this book. Of course, any errors and limitations of the book are mine alone.

I am deeply grateful to my editor at Cambridge University Press, John Berger, and to the anonymous reviewers who provided incredibly thoughtful

and constructive feedback on my original manuscript. For advice and encouragement throughout the process, I am grateful to Tracy Fisher, Jennifer Hughes, Hong Anh Ly, Bronwen Morgan, Karthick Ramakrishnan, and Brinda Sarathy. Wayne Leebaw, Ellen Leebaw, and Danya Leebaw provided an endless supply of moral support. Finally, I am especially grateful to John Cioffi, for his love and his wisdom, and to our children, Teo and Nadia, for joyfully slowing me down.