INTERNATIONAL MIGRATION IN THE AGE OF CRISIS AND GLOBALIZATION

The international mobility of people is a main feature of the global economy of today and yesterday. However, external openness is often more favorable to the mobility of goods and money than people across different periods of the world economy including times of crisis, globalization, nationalism, and autarkic trends. Immigration augments the labor force in receiving countries and provides many of the bodies and minds that are essential to any vibrant economy. The international mobility of human capital and talented individuals is critical to the transfer of knowledge, ideas, fresh capital, contacts, and entrepreneurial capacities. This book, which promotes a freer and more humane regime for the mobility of people, is based on a blend of theory and empirical evidence comprising varied country examples and rich historical material ranging from the mid-19th century to the early 21st century. It discusses the conceptual underpinnings of the push-and-pull factors of current migration waves and their impacts for development on the source and receiving countries. The analysis reviews the historical context under which various migration experiences have taken place – both in periods of internationalism and in periods of nationalism – in order to contribute to debates on the desirability of and the tensions and costs involved in the current process of international migration and globalization. These issues are relevant during times of both economic crisis and slumps and times of economic growth and prosperity.

Andrés Solimano is founder and President of the International Center for Globalization and Development in Santiago, Chile. Dr. Solimano is a former Country Director at the World Bank, Executive Director at the Inter-American Development Bank, and former Regional Adviser at the U.N.’s Economic Commission for Latin America and the Caribbean in Santiago. He has published several books and articles on a variety of subjects including the international mobility of talent, economic growth, globalization, international migration, inequality, macroeconomic management, and political economy. Dr. Solimano is a member of the founding board of the Chilean Society for Public Policy; the editorial board of the Central Banking, Analysis, and Economic Policies Series of the Central Bank of Chile; and the board of the magazine Mensaje. He received his Ph.D. in economics from MIT.
International Migration in the Age of Crisis and Globalization

*Historical and Recent Experiences*

ANDRÉS SOLIMANO

International Center for Globalization and Development, CIGLOB, Santiago, Chile
To my wife Bernardita, daughters Gracia and Paula, and son Pedro.

To the memory of my late mother Sofia. To my father Ivan.
“Give us your tired, your poor, your huddled masses yearning to breathe free.”

_Inscription on the Statue of Liberty, New York, erected in 1886_

“A Third World invasion of the United States, the largest in History, is taking place today along our undefended two-thousand-mile border with Mexico; _La Reconquista_, the reconquest of the American Southwest by Mexico, is underway.”

Patrick J. Buchanan, former U.S. Presidential Candidate,  
_ State of Emergency, 2006_

“Realizing potential global welfare gains from migration may require not just allowing individuals to emigrate from low-income countries in larger numbers but also allowing them to sort themselves across receiving countries according to labor markets’ reward to skill.”

_Professor Gordon H. Hanson, University of California, San Diego, International Migration Expert, 2008_

“The new directive on return of immigrants in Europe establishes criteria for the deportation of irregular immigrants in 27 member states and prison terms from 6 to up to 18 months for undocumented immigrants.”

_Law Resolution of the European Parliament, approved June 2008_

“We were very generous with the Europeans who arrived in our land in the last century, and the truth is that it is not fair for our people to get a denigrating treatment (in Europe).”

_Michelle Bachelet, former President of Chile, the 35th Presidential Summit of MERCOSUR countries, Tucuman, Argentina, July 2008_

“When European migrants arrived in America, they took possession of thousands of hectares of land, mines, natural resources and exploited our people, while on the contrary, the Latin American people in Europe are not exploiting anyone, (and) they are not taking possession of thousands of hectares of land and mines, they are not destroying the natural resources.”

_Evo Morales, President of Bolivia, the 35th Presidential Summit of MERCOSUR, Tucuman, Argentina, July 2008_
Contents

Acknowledgments page xv

1. Introduction: Understanding the Trends, Themes, and Strata of International Migration 1
   1.1 International Migration: Incentives and Drive 3
       a. People Are Now Migrating Internationally in Patterns that Differ from Historical Patterns 4
       b. Free Immigration Has Evolved into Visas, Walls, Deportation 6
   1.2 Eight Critical Themes Underscore the International Migration Process 8
       a. Critical Theme I: Why Is International Migration Such a Contentious Issue and Internal Consensus So Difficult to Reach? 8
       b. Critical Theme II: Migration Flows Have Flourished in Periods of Capital Mobility and Globalization, and Have Declined in Periods of Crisis and Economic and Political Nationalism 9
       c. Critical Theme III: Migration as a Consequence and Mitigation of Income Disparities in Our Global Society 10
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Contents</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>e. Critical Theme V: Why Are Talented Elites More Internationally Mobile than Workers? 12</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>f. Critical Theme VI: Don't Always “Blame” the North: International Migration Is also a Response to Economic and Political Failures in the South 15</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>g. Critical Theme VII: The Rise of Irregular Migration and the Fragmentation of Global Labor Markets 17</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>h. Critical Theme VIII: A Multilateral Framework for Regulating International Migration? 18</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.3 Setting the Stage: A Brief Tour of the Book 19</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

2. Why People Move or Stay Put: International Migration Is the Result of Compelling and Conflicting Factors 22

2.1 Cross-Country Income Differentials throughout the World Are Wider than Ever 25

2.2 People Need to Make More Money for Their Families: Remittances That Are Sent Back Home 27

2.3 Immigrants Want a Better Standard of Living: Social Services, Safe Communities, Healthy Environment, and Overall Security 28

2.4 Communal “Ties” May Precede Economics in the Decision to Migrate 30

2.5 Beyond National Comparisons: Buoyant Cities and Mega-Regions Attract Migrants 31

2.6 Economic and Financial Crises in Developing and Wealthy Nations Are a Macroeconomic Catalyst for Migration Flows 32

2.7 Political Instability, Civil War, and the Dissolution of Empires Force or Compel People to Migrate 34

2.8 Why People Might Not Migrate: Migration Entails Financial, Family, and Social Costs 38

2.9 Concluding Remarks about Why People Migrate 39
3. What Happens When International Migration Happens?
   The Dilemmas Posed by Migration 41
   3.1 Dilemma I: Illegal Migration – A Conflict between
      Economic Logic and the Law? Does Economic
      Logic also Conflict with Immigrants’ Rights? 42
      a. How Effective Are Immigration Restrictions? 46
      b. All Immigrants Face a Marginalizing Set of Rights 47
   3.2 Dilemma II: Does a Country Export People or
      Import Capital? Or Do People and Capital Move
      in Tandem? 49
      a. Instability 51
      b. Economic Opportunity 52
      c. Natural Resources 54
   3.3 Dilemma III: Are Income Convergence
      and Restricted Migration Compatible? 55
      a. The Magnitude and Speed of Wage Convergence
         across Countries Will Depend on the Size
         of Migration 55
   3.4 Dilemma IV: Does Immigration Boost Economic
      Growth in Destination Countries? 59
   3.5 Dilemma V: Does Emigration Retard Growth in Origin
      Countries? Brain-Drain Effects 60
   3.6 Dilemma VI: Are Remittances the Only Benefit
      of “Exported” People for the Origin Country? Or
      Can a Brain Drain Ultimately Have Positive Effects? 63
      a. At a Macroeconomic Level, Remittances from
         Migrants Are Currently a Growing and Relatively
         Stable, Market-Based “External” Source of
         Developmental Financing 66
      b. Depredatory Migration: The Medical Brain Drain 72
      c. Brain Circulation: The Case of International
         Students 74
   3.7 The New Developmental Effects of Migratory Talent
      Can Supersede the “Brain Drain” If Return Migration
      and Diaspora Contacts Are Present 68
      a. Return Migration Is Not Yet a Guarantee 71
      b. Depredatory Migration: The Medical Brain Drain 72
      c. Brain Circulation: The Case of International
         Students 74
## Contents

3.8 Concluding Remarks about What Happens When People Migrate  

4. How Empires, Policy Regimes, and Economic Imperatives Influenced the Mobility of Capital and People in the 20th Century  

4.1 The Patterns of Capital and Labor Mobility Confirm Their Parallel Movement  


4.3 Global Capital Markets Moved Freely, Expanding Global Commerce and Transactions  

a. London Was the World’s Financial Center  

4.4 Capital Flows Drove Labor Flows  

4.5 Migration Patterns to Resource-Rich, Higher-Wage Countries: Who They Were and Why They Migrated  

a. Liberal Immigration Policies and Politics Gradually Became More Restrictive toward the End of the Period, Affecting Migration Patterns  


a. Global Capital Markets Were Disrupted  

b. A Backlash against Globalization Restricted Immigration Flows but Did Drive Political Migration  

4.7 Rising Nationalism Was an Important Determinant of Migration Flows during the Period  

4.8 1945–1971/73: Reconstruction and the Bretton Woods Era Brought Stability to Incipient Capital Mobility and Provided a Basis for Accelerating Immigration in Today’s World  

4.9 1971/73–Today: The Second Wave of Globalization – Floating, Freer Capital Mobility Has Been Accompanied by Rising Migration
Contents

4.10 Capital Flows in the Second Wave of Globalization Have a Different Direction, Composition, and Origin than in the First Wave 110
   a. Managed Migration Has Yielded to Growing Pressures for People's Mobility 113

4.11 Concluding Remarks about the Historical Analysis of Capital and Labor Mobility 115

   5.1 The Developmental Gaps between Latin America and Europe and the New World Have Reversed since the 19th Century 120
      a. Argentina in Focus: The Country Has Reversed Its Course from Massive European Immigration to Emigration to Europe 123
      b. Emigration from Latin America Is Outpacing Immigration in the Late 20th and Early 21st Centuries 125
      c. Emigration from Latin America and the Caribbean Is Primarily to One Destination County – the United States 128

   5.2 The Socio-demographic Characteristics of Latin American Migration: Women and Educated Persons Are Two Prominent Groups 131

   5.3 The Emigration of Elites: The Disproportionate Numbers Beg for Action from the Global Community 135

   5.4 The Determinants of Migration to, from, and within Latin America Mirror Those throughout the Developing World 138
      a. Developmental Gaps Are Persistent in Latin America 139
      b. Growth Crises and Financial Crises Are Endemic in Latin America 142
      c. Political Crises and Internal Violence Are also Serious in Latin America 143
5.5 Remittances in Latin America: The Money Emigrants Send Back Home Is a Prominent Source of Financing for the Domestic Economies of Origin Countries

a. Remittances Affect Economic Development in Latin America in Diverse Ways

b. Remittances Are Used for Current Spending, Durable Goods Purchases, and Education

c. Remittances Seem to Reduce Poverty, but Evidence Is Mixed on the Extent to which They Do So

5.6 Concluding Remarks about the Latin American Experience

6. Who Migrates and What They Offer: A Focus on People and Elites with Talent, Knowledge, and Entrepreneurial Skills

6.1 The Concept of Elites

6.2 The Value of Talent and the Value of Political Connections – Each Has Economic Rewards to Elites

6.3 Inside the Talented Elite: A Variety of International Market Destinations Exist for Different Types of Talent

a. Where Productive Talent Moves


c. Where Health and Cultural Talent Moves

d. Mobility in International Public Organizations

e. Mobility in Multinational Corporations and International Banks

6.4 The International Market for Talent Is Characterized by a Concentration of Rewards among a Few

a. Winners-Take-All Market Theory in Talent Markets

6.5 Talent Concentrates in the North because the Costs Are as Attractive as Its Rewards

a. Earnings Differences and Developmental Gaps in the South Are Large

b. The Concentration of Talent, Capital, and Technology Can Reach a Critical Mass
### Contents

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>c. Driving Away Talented Elites Are the Costs of Doing Business, Distorted Rewards, and Rent-Seeking in Origin Countries</td>
<td>176</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>d. Special Immigration Policies Can Attract Foreign Talent</td>
<td>179</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.6 The Return Flow: Concentration in the North, Talent Circulation and Outsourcing</td>
<td>182</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.7 Empirical Evidence Shows that Talented Elites Will Be Going to Economies that Are at the Top of the Developmental Ladder</td>
<td>184</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.8 The Use of Talent Is Another Way to Look at Its Distribution in the Global Economy</td>
<td>185</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>a. The Number of Nobel Prizes in the Sciences Is Another Measure</td>
<td>186</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.9 A Much More Even Distribution of International Talent Is Devoted to Culture and the Arts</td>
<td>187</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.10 Concluding Remarks about the Mobility of Talented Elites</td>
<td>188</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7. A Fair and Orderly International Migration Process Requires a Global Social Contract</td>
<td>190</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7.1 Recap of Some of the Main Themes</td>
<td>192</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7.2 Where Do We Go from Here?</td>
<td>196</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7.3 The Institutional Vacuum Should Be Filled – What an International Organization Can (and Can’t) Do</td>
<td>203</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**References**  
207

**Index**  
215
This book, written in an independent capacity by the author, reflects a decade of research on international migration. This research started at the World Bank and continued at the UN-ECLAC, UNU-WIDER, and then at the International Center for Globalization and Development. The book was initiated while the author was a Visiting Fellow at the Watson Institute for International Studies of Brown University in early 2008. The invitation of Barbara Stallings, then Director of the Watson Institute, is very appreciated. Special thanks and appreciation go to Thomas G. Good, senior editor, friend, and collaborator for his important professional contribution and commitment to improve the style, sharpen ideas, and make this book more forceful and amenable to the reader. At Cambridge University Press, I want to express my great appreciation to Scott Par- ris, Senior Editor of Economics and Finance, for his enthusiastic interest in this project and continuous support; recognition also goes to Adam Levine, also at Cambridge University Press. Also I want to thank the per- ceptive comments and suggestions from three anonymous referees of the book. Part of the historical research of Chapter 4 was done jointly with Nathalie Watts and thanks go to her. I want to acknowledge the research assistance from Diego Avanzini and Caroline Serpell to some chapters of this book. Daniel San Martin prepared the index very effectively.