International Cooperation:
The Extents and Limits of Multilateralism

A number of new approaches to the subject of international cooperation were developed in the 1980s. As a result, further questions have arisen, particularly with regard to the methods and limits of cooperation and the relationship between cooperation and the debate over multilateralism. *International Cooperation* considers these questions, identifies further areas for research, and pushes the analysis of this fundamental concept in international relations in new directions. Its two parts address the historic roots and modern development of the notion of cooperation, and the strategies used to achieve it, with a conclusion that reaches beyond international relations into new disciplinary avenues. This edited collection incorporates historical research, social and economic analysis, and political and evolutionary game theory.

I. William Zartman is the Jacob Blaustein Distinguished Professor Emeritus of International Organization and Conflict Resolution at the Paul H. Nitze School of Advanced International Studies of the Johns Hopkins University. He is the author of a number of books, including *Cowardly Lions: Missed Opportunities for Preventing Deadly Conflict and State Collapse* (2005) and *Negotiation and Conflict Management: Essays on Theory and Practice* (2008), and editor of *Imbalance of Power: US Hegemony and International Order* (2009) and *Peacemaking in International Conflict: Methods and Techniques* (2005). He is recipient of the Lifetime Achievement Award of the International Association for Conflict Management.

The late Saadia Touval, former professor and Dean at Tel Aviv University, taught at Johns Hopkins University’s Paul H. Nitze School of Advanced International Studies from 1994 to 2007. He was the author of a number of books including *The Peace Brokers: Mediation in the Arab–Israeli Conflict, 1948–1979* (1982) and *Mediation in the Yugoslav Wars* (2001).
International Cooperation:
The Extents and Limits of Multilateralism

Edited by
I. William Zartman

and

Saadia Touval

The Nitze School of Advanced International Studies,
The Johns Hopkins University
To the late Saadia Touval,

warm friend, close colleague, twin
## Contents

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>List of figures</th>
<th>page ix</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>List of tables</td>
<td>xi</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>List of contributors</td>
<td>xii</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Acknowledgements</td>
<td>xv</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

1 Introduction: return to the theories of cooperation  
I. WILLIAM ZARTMAN AND SAADIA TOUVAL 1

### Part 1 Multilateral meanings of cooperation

2 Debating cooperation in Europe from Grotius to Adam Smith  
ALEXIS KELLER 15

3 The two sides of multilateral cooperation  
CHARLES DORAN 40

4 Deconstructing multilateral cooperation  
FEN OSLER HAMPSON 60

5 Negotiated cooperation and its alternatives  
SAADIA TOUVAL 78

### Part 2 Multiple strategies of cooperation

6 Synthesizing rationalist and constructivist perspectives on negotiated cooperation  
P. TERRENCE HOPMANN 95

7 The shadow of the past over conflict and cooperation  
ALLISON STANGER 111

8 Chicken dilemmas: crossing the road to cooperation  
JOSHUA S. GOLDSTEIN 135
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Chapter</th>
<th>Title</th>
<th>Author(s)</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>9</td>
<td>Conflict management as cooperation</td>
<td>I. William Zartman</td>
<td>161</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10</td>
<td>Status concerns and multilateral cooperation</td>
<td>Deborah Welch Larson and Alexei Shevchenko</td>
<td>182</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11</td>
<td>Asymmetrical cooperation in economic assistance</td>
<td>Jean-Claude Berthélemy</td>
<td>208</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12</td>
<td>Conclusion: improving knowledge of cooperation</td>
<td>Saadia Touval and I. William Zartman</td>
<td>227</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

_Bibliography_ 238  
_Index_ 266
Figures

3.1 Multilateralism

6.1 Absolute versus relative gains in a “mixed motive” game

7.1 Traditional v. suspicious TFT, 2 DK, 256 players

7.2 Traditional v. suspicious TFT, RWR, 256 players

7.3 Traditional v. suspicious TFT, FRN, 256 players

7.4 Traditional v. suspicious TFT, FRN, 10,000 players

7.5 Traditional TFT, DC v. DB learning, 2DK, 10,000 players

7.6 Traditional TFT, DC v. DB learning, RWR, 10,000 players

7.7 Traditional TFT, DC v. DB learning, FRN, 10,000 players

7.8 Traditional TFT, DB v. DC learning, FRN, 256 players

7.9 Suspicious TFT, DC v. DB learning, 2DK, 10,000 players

7.10 Suspicious TFT, DC v. DB learning, RWR, 10,000 players

7.11 Suspicious TFT, DC v. DB learning, FRN, 10,000 players

8.1 The structure of Chicken

8.2 The bargaining sequence in Chicken

8.3 Transition from PD to Chicken in bargaining

8.4 Trends in cooperation in iterated Chicken and PD psychology experiments

11.1 Comparison by region of multilateral aid with bilateral aid net of the bilateralism effect

11.2 Comparison within Asian region of multilateral aid with bilateral aid net of the bilateralism effect

11.3 Comparison within sub-Saharan African region of multilateral aid with bilateral aid net of the bilateralism effect

Grid snapshot 1 Traditional TFT, 2DK, 256 players, random seed 1, tick count 1

Grid snapshot 2 Traditional TFT, 2DK, 256 players, random seed 1, tick count 3

Grid snapshot 3 Traditional TFT, 2DK, 256 players, random seed 1, tick count 5
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>x</th>
<th>List of figures</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Grid snapshot 4</td>
<td>Traditional TFT, 2DK, 256 players, random seed 1, tick count 7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Grid snapshot 5</td>
<td>Traditional TFT, 2DK, 256 players, random seed 1, tick count 9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Grid snapshot 6</td>
<td>Traditional TFT, 2DK, 256 players, random seed 1, tick count 11</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
# Tables

11.1 Summary of estimation results (final equation) ............................... page 214
11.2 Multiplier effect of bilateral variables on aid received by recipients ............ 215
11.3 Implicit shift of aid resources due to bilateralism: the “bilateralism effect” (US$ billion per year) ............... 216
11.4 Implicit shift of aid resources due to geopolitical factors (US$ billion per year) .......... 217
11.5 Correlation between the two components of bilateral aid and multilateral aid .... 218
11.6 Correlation between the bilateralism effect and growth (averages over 1980s and 1990s) ........ 220
Contributors

JEAN-CLAUDÉ BERTHÉLEMY is Professor of Economics at the University of Paris 1 Panthéon-Sorbonne, where he received his PhD in 1984. He was Director of the CEPIII (Centre d’Etudes Prospectives et d’Informations Internationales), the leading French think tank specializing in international economics, from 1998 to 2000. Before holding that position he had worked for about seven years for the Organization of Economic Cooperation and Development, where he was Head of Division at the Development Centre. He has also collaborated with other international organizations such as the World Bank, the International Monetary Fund, the African Development Bank, the United Nations Development Programme, and The World Institute for Development Economics Research. He has published numerous articles on development economics in referred journals, as well as eleven books, related to a variety of subjects such as economic growth analysis, development finance, and peace economics. Among other professional affiliations, he is a member of the European Development Research Network, of which he was elected vice-president in 2004. In recognition of his significant contributions to development economics, he was in November 2003 awarded the Luc Durand-Réville prize by the French Académie des sciences morales et politiques.

CHARLES DORAN is Andrew W. Mellon Professor of International Relations and Director of the Global Theory and History and Canadian Studies Programs at the Paul H. Nitze School of Advanced International Studies, The Johns Hopkins University. His recent books are Power Cycle Theory and Global Politics (2003, special issue of International Political Science Review), Democratic Pluralism at Risk: Why Canadian Unity Matters and Why Americans Care (2001) and Systems in Crisis: Imperatives of High Politics at the Century’s End (1991). His doctorate is from The Johns Hopkins University. charles.doran@att.net

JOSHUA S. GOLDSTEIN is Professor Emeritus of International Relations at the American University in Washington. He is author of International
List of contributors

Joshua Goldstein is a professor of political science at Stanford University. He has written several books, including "Relations" (9th ed., 2010), "How Gender Shapes the War System and Vice Versa" (2001), and "Long Cycles: Prosperity and War in the Modern Age" (1988). His doctorate is from the Massachusetts Institute of Technology. jg@joshuagoldstein.com

Fen Osler Hampson is Chancellor’s Professor and Director of the Norman Paterson School of International Affairs, Carleton University, Ottawa. His recent works are "Nurturing Peace: Why Peace Settlements Succeed or Fail" (1996) and "Multilateral Negotiations: Lessons From Arms Control, Trade, and the Environment" (1999). He holds a PhD from Harvard. fen_hampson@carleton.ca

P. Terrence Hopmann is Professor of International Relations and Director of the Conflict Management Program at the Paul H. Nitze School of Advanced International Studies, The Johns Hopkins University. He is Professor Emeritus of Political Science at Brown University, where he also served as Director of the Global Security Program in the Thomas J. Watson Jr. Institute of International Studies. His recent research has focused on conflict management by regional security institutions, especially the Organization for Security and Cooperation in Europe. His major book is "The Negotiation Process and the Resolution of International Conflicts" (1996). His doctorate is from Stanford. pthopmann@jhu.edu

Alexis Keller is Professor of History of Legal and Political Thought at the University of Geneva. He is a former fellow of the Carr Center for Human Rights Policy at the Kennedy School of Government, Harvard University. Most recently, he has edited "What is a Just Peace?" (2006) and "Counterterrorism: Democracy's Challenge" (2008). He is currently working on a book entitled "Defending Justice among Nations (1650–1850)". His doctorate is from the University of Geneva. Alexis.Keller@droit.unige.ch

Deborah Welch Larson is Professor of Political Science at the University of California, Los Angeles. Her research draws on cognitive social psychology to explain foreign-policy decision making, as in "Origins of Containment: A Psychological Explanation" (1985). She is the author most recently of "Anatomy of Mistrust: U.S.–Soviet Relations during the Cold War" (1997) and "Good Judgment in Foreign Policy: Theory and Application" (2003, with Stanley Renshon). She holds a Stanford PhD. dlarson@polisci.ucla.edu

Alexei V. Shevchenko is Assistant Professor at the Department of Political Science, California State University Fullerton. His research
interests include international relations theory and the foreign policies of China and Russia. His previous work appeared in *No More States? Globalization, National Self-Determination, and Terrorism*, ed. Richard N. Rosecrance and Arthur A. Stein (2006), *Communist and Post-Communist Studies*, and *International Organization*. His doctorate is from UCLA. ashevchenko@fullerton.edu

**ALLISON STANGER** is the Russell Leng Professor of International Politics and Economics, chair of the Political Science Department, and Director of the Rohatyn Center for International Affairs at Middlebury College. Her most recent book is *One Nation Under Contract: The Outsourcing of American Power and the Future of Foreign Policy* (2009). A mathematics major as an undergraduate, she received her PhD in political science from Harvard University. stanger@middlebury.edu

The late **SAADIA TOUVAL** was Adjunct Professor and Associate Director of the Conflict Management Program at the Paul H. Nitze School of Advanced International Studies, The Johns Hopkins University. He was former Professor and Political Science Department Chair and Dean at Tel Aviv University. He is the author of *The Peace Brokers* (1982) and *Mediation in the Yugoslav Wars* (2002) among others. His doctorate is from Harvard.

**I. WILLIAM ZARTMAN** is the Jacob Blaustein Distinguished Professor Emeritus at the Nitze School of Advanced International Studies (SAIS) of The Johns Hopkins University, and member of the Steering Committee of the Processes of International Negotiation (PIN) Program at the International Institute of Applied Systems Analysis (IIASA) in Vienna. He is author of *Cowardly Lions: Missed Opportunities to Prevent Deadly Conflict and State Collapse* (2005) and *Negotiation and Conflict Management: Essays on Theory and Practice* (2007) among others. His doctorate is from Yale and his honorary doctorate from the Catholic University of Louvain. zartman@jhu.edu
I am grateful to SAIS and the US Institute of Peace for their generous support for this project and to Isabelle Talpain-Long for carefully shepherding the manuscript through to completion. Thanks too to Julia Lendorfer for indexing. I am above all grateful for the chance to work with my friend, colleague, and twin Saadia Touval on this work, our last and lasting of a long list of collaboration.