

#### ADVANCE PRAISE FOR FREEDOM BOUND

"Freedom Bound is a truly magisterial work by one of the finest minds currently working in the field of legal history. It is about no less a topic than the origins of modern America – and, in particular, about the law that framed its genesis and its early development. In this exceptionally erudite study, Christopher Tomlins succeeds in achieving an unusual 'thickness' of description, notable alike for its breadth and depth, its subtlety and its comprehensiveness. Even more, he brings an acute analytic eye to a story of enormous complexity, making this a must-read for anyone with a serious interest in either modern American history or law and society."

- John Comaroff, University of Chicago and American Bar Foundation

"Beautifully written, deeply researched, and elegantly argued, *Freedom Bound* is legal history that changes the way we understand U.S. history. Tomlins masterfully retells the story of America's founding by following the developing relationships among labor, law, and civic identity. While focused on early America, *Freedom Bound* speaks broadly to questions about freedom and equality that continue to define the nation's history into the twenty-first century."

- Laura F. Edwards, Duke University

"An ambitious effort to remake the landscape of the history of the origins of American culture, Tomlins' learned and masterful volume may well turn out to be the most important work published in American history over the past quarter century. Transcending the conventional disciplinary categories – England and America, colonial and national – that contribute to the myopia of so many scholars, he leads his reader through a complex, sober, penetrating, and highly persuasive analysis of the fundamental and interactive role of labor, law, and civic imperatives in shaping American society from the late sixteenth century to the American Civil War. Challenging many existing orthodoxies, including the depiction of the American Revolution as a sharp break with the colonial past, it deserves the careful attention of any serious student of not only the American past, but of the establishment of settler, colonial, and national regimes all over the globe."

- Jack P. Greene, The Johns Hopkins University

"Take time to savor this magisterial book, the fruit of decades of research and reflection. Christopher Tomlins brilliantly revises our understanding of the ideas and practices that shaped the lives of working people, households, and politics, in an account that stretches from England's Atlantic empire to the eve of the U.S. Civil War. Be warned: many familiar generalizations lie shattered."

- Linda K. Kerber, University of Iowa

"Christopher Tomlins has written a passionate, provocative, brilliant book about how law enabled English colonizers to justify taking what was not theirs and then to keep and work what they had taken. With wide-ranging erudition, he uncovers the legalities that shaped what the English expected to find; what they saw; how they interpreted what they found; how they justified what they did; and what social, political, and legal structures they erected in America. *Freedom Bound* is, by any standard, a magisterial work of stunning originality."

- Bruce H. Mann, Harvard Law School



"This sweeping and superb magnum opus is a fascinating account of intricate patchworks of disparate legal systems and codes that ranges all across British North America. Law was anything but a national singularity; rather, it encompassed plural discourses and institutions. The constantly evolving relationship between various freedoms and unfreedoms gives the work a powerful and poignant story line."

- Philip Morgan, The Johns Hopkins University

"From the beginnings of colonization of the American mainland to the American Civil War, few historians have the knowledge or stamina to rewrite the narrative of American history on such a broad scale. Christopher Tomlins does and has: Freedom Bound is the story of how, from its first imaginings, freedom was bound, limited to white males, secured by the land Native Americans had claimed and populated and by the productive and reproductive labor of wives and slaves. Colonial America is not a time apart; rather it is, in Tomlins' retelling, the formative era of modern America. This is a demanding book – demanding in length, in the range of methodologies it so expertly employs, but most of all in its conclusions. Majestic. Unrelenting. Haunting. Unanswerable."

- Barbara Young Welke, University of Minnesota

"Tomlins shows how the vast expanse of land available to British colonizers in North America created the conditions for unfreedom. Scarce labor – free and bound – had to be policed. As a technology of power, law was core to the project of creating the blueprints for the plural forms of colonial governance that provided flexibility in disciplining labor. *Freedom Bound* takes us from British workshops to the marchlands of North America, from America's initial European settlement to its struggle, after independence, as an expansive republic with the legacy of slavery. More importantly, with deftness, intellectual ambition, and remarkable erudition, it forces us to reconsider how new worlds harbor both potential utopias and dystopias. One word best describes this book: magisterial."

- Steven Wilf, University of Connecticut



#### FREEDOM BOUND

Freedom Bound is about the origins of modern America – a history of colonizing, work, and civic identity from the beginnings of English presence on the mainland until the Civil War. It is a history of migrants and migrations, of colonizers and colonized, of households and servitude and slavery, and of the freedom all craved and some found. Above all, it is a history of the law that framed the entire process. Freedom Bound tells how colonies were planted in occupied territories, how they were populated with migrants – free and unfree – to do the work of colonizing, and how the newcomers secured possession. It tells of the new civic lives that seemed possible in new commonwealths, and of the constraints that kept many from enjoying them. It follows the story long past the end of the eighteenth century until the American Civil War, when – just for a moment – it seemed that freedom might finally be unbound.

Christopher Tomlins is Chancellor's Professor of Law at the University of California, Irvine. Since 1992 he has been a member of the research faculty of the American Bar Foundation in Chicago. Tomlins began his career at La Trobe University in Melbourne; he has also taught at the Marshall-Wythe Law School, College of William & Mary in Virginia; at Northwestern University Law School; and at Tel Aviv and Haifa Universities in Israel. His interests and research are castvery broadly-from sixteenth-century England to twentieth-century America and from the legal culture of work and labor to the interrelations of law and literature. He has written or edited six books, including, most recently, the multivolume Cambridge History of Law in America, co-edited with Michael Grossberg. His publications have been awarded the Surrency Prize of the American Society for Legal History, the Littleton-Griswold Prize of the American Historical Association, and the Hurst Prize of the Law and Society Association. Tomlins currently edits two Cambridge University Press book series: Cambridge Historical Studies in American Law and Society and Cambridge New Histories of American Law (with Michael Grossberg).



# **Freedom Bound**

LAW, LABOR, AND CIVIC IDENTITY IN COLONIZING ENGLISH AMERICA, 1580–1865

**Christopher Tomlins** 





#### CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY PRESS

Cambridge, New York, Melbourne, Madrid, Cape Town, Singapore, São Paulo, Delhi, Dubai, Tokyo, Mexico City

Cambridge University Press 32 Avenue of the Americas, New York, NY 10013-2473, USA

www.cambridge.org Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9780521137775

© Christopher Tomlins 2010

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2010

Printed in the United States of America

A catalog record for this publication is available from the British Library.

Library of Congress Cataloging in Publication data Tomlins, Christopher L., 1951-Freedom bound: law, labor, and civic identity in colonizing English America, 1580-1865 / Christopher Tomlins.

> p. cm. Includes index.

ISBN 978-0-521-76139-0 (hardback) 978-0-521-13777-5 (pbk.)

1. Labor-United States-History. 2. United States-Colonization.

3. Labor laws and legislation-United States-History.

4. United States-History-Colonial period, ca. 1600-1775.

5. United States-History-Revolution, 1775-1783. 6. United States-History-1783-1865. 7. United States-Economic conditions-To 1865. 8. United States-Social conditions-To 1865. 9. National characteristics,

American. I. Title. нр8о68.т66 2010

331.0973′0903-dc22 2010019216

ISBN 978-0-521-76139-0 Hardback ISBN 978-0-521-13777-5 Paperback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party Internet Web sites referred to in this publication and does not guarantee that any content on such Web sites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.



For Francis Barker (1952–1999)
Fierce mourning; fierce hope.



See, I have this day set thee over the nations and over the kingdoms, to root out, and to pull down, and to destroy, and to throw down, to build, and to plant.

Jeremiah 1:10

We are guests who enter through a door underneath a suspended sign that sways in the breeze, a door behind which eternity and rapture await us.

Walter Benjamin, "The Image of Proust"

Ban' ban' Ca-caliban, Has a new master, get a new man. Freedom, high-day; high-day freedom; freedom high-day, freedom. William Shakespeare, *The Tempest*, 2.2.179–82



### Contents

Tables and Figures		page xi		
Ack	nowledgments	xiii		
Pro	ologue Beginning: "As much freedome in reason as may be"	1		
	Part I Manning, Planting, Keeping			
1	Manning: "Setteynge many on Worke"	21		
2	Planting: "Directed and Conducted Thither"	67		
3	Keeping (i): Discourses of Intrusion	93		
4	Keeping (ii): English Desires, Designs	133		
Part II Poly-Olbion; or The Inside Narrative				
5	Packing: New Inhabitants	193		
6	Unpacking: Received Wisdoms of Law and Work	231		
7	Changing: Localities, Legalities	296		
	Part III "What, then, is the American, this new man?"			
8	Modernizing: Polity, Economy, Patriarchy	335		
9	Enslaving: Facies Hippocratica	401		
10	Ending: "Strange Order of Things!"	509		
Appendices to Chapter 1		571		
Index		599		



# **Tables and Figures**

## Chapter 1

1.1	European Migration, Servant Migration, and	
	Population Estimates, Maryland and Virginia, 1600–1700	page 37
1.2	European Servant Migration and Persistence	
	in Population, Maryland and Virginia, 1600–1700	38
1.3	Indentured Servants in the Chesapeake Labor	Ü
	Force, 1640–1700	40
1.4	Slaves and Servants in Population, Chesapeake Colonies	41
	Slaves and Servants in the Chesapeake Labor	
Ü	Force, 1640–1700	41
1.6	Immigration to the Delaware Valley, 1680–1780	43
	Servant Immigration to the Delaware Valley, 1680–1780	44
	Delaware Valley Servant Population, and Pennsylvania	11
	European Population Based on Immigration	
	Estimates, 1680–1780	45
1.0	Servants in Philadelphia Population and Workforce	46
	Slaves in Philadelphia Population and Workforce	48
	Slaves and Servants in Philadelphia Population	49
	Slaves and Servants in Philadelphia Population	10
	and Workforce	50
		Ü
Ann	andiag to Chapter 1	
App	pendices to Chapter 1	
Aı	Eighteenth-Century Migration to the Thirteen Mainland	
	Colonies, by European Ethnic Group	576
$\mathbf{A}_{2}$	Eighteenth-Century Migration to the Thirteen Mainland	
	Colonies, by European Ethnic Group and Status	581
$A_3$	European Servant Migration and Persistence in Population,	
	Maryland and Virginia, 1600–1700: Alternate Estimates	586
$A_4$	Servant Persistence in the Maryland Population, 1640–1760	588
$A_5$	Servant Incidence in the Virginia Population, York	
	County, 1660–1700	589
A6	Servant Incidence in the Philadelphia Population and	
	Workforce, 1720–1775 (Adapted from Salinger Estimates)	590
A7	Slave Incidence in the Philadelphia Population and	
•	Workforce, 1720–1775 (Adapted from Salinger Estimates)	590



xii	Tables and Figures	
A8	Servants and Slaves in the Philadelphia Population	
	(Adapted from Salinger Estimates)	591
A9	Servants and Slaves in the Philadelphia Population	
	and Workforce (Adapted from Salinger Estimates)	592
Fig	ure – Appendices to Chapter 1	
Aı	Computation of Attrition Rates, Seventeenth-Century	
	Chesapeake	585



# Acknowledgments

My first and enduring acknowledgment must be of the extraordinary richness of scholarship in the field of early American history. The work for this book has taken me the better part of fifteen years. Had I imagined at the outset it would take me so long to reach a point at which I felt I could stop, I doubt I would have started.

For all the years I worked on this book I was fortunate to be a member of the research faculty of a unique institution, the American Bar Foundation. Throughout, I enjoyed not only the Foundation's material support but also the friendship of an immensely accomplished and distinguished group of colleagues. Such is the collective collegiality of the American Bar Foundation that it seems almost invidious to single out particular individuals from among my colleagues. Nonetheless, I should especially like to thank John Comaroff, Carol Heimer, Bonnie Honig, Beth Mertz, and Laura Beth Nielsen, not just for stimulating conversations in and out of seminars but also for simple acts of kindness and encouragement at moments of difficulty. I should also like to thank former ABF Director Bryant G. Garth, his successor, Robert L. Nelson, and the Foundation's Board of Directors for their consistent support of the work involved.

Others at the Foundation, Lila Stromer and Crina Archer in particular, helped me by undertaking their part of different tasks in which we were both involved with such dazzling efficiency that I could spend more time on this work than might otherwise have been possible. Relatively early on, I benefited from the talented and vigorous assistance of Tamara Kay, Brian Roraff, and Andrew Cohen, all of whom have long since made important careers for themselves elsewhere. Since then I have practiced relentless self-sufficiency. My fellow historians at the Foundation – Bill Novak, Dylan Penningroth, and Victoria Woeste – were, all things considered, remarkably tolerant of my reclusive habits.

Beyond the American Bar Foundation I have had the support and understanding of some wonderful people. Ann Tomlins has somehow found more room in her life for my preoccupations than I have any right to expect, and I thank her and love her for it. Our daughters, Jasmin and Meredith, have grown to adulthood alongside this book, but I have tried to make sure they did not have to live with it – they have their own lives to live. Michael Grossberg and Bruce Mann have been as good friends as anyone could want. So has Kunal Parker, whose many conversations



xiv

### Acknowledgments

have introduced me to much that I would otherwise have left unread. Laura Edwards, Bruce Mann, Barbara Welke, and Steven Wilf all read the manuscript in its entirety and have helped me make it much better than it was when they first saw it. I owe a major debt to Laura and to Barbara in particular for the time they spent discussing aspects of the book with me. Ron Levi and Mariana Valverde, Paul Craven and Doug Hay, Marianne Constable and Hilary Soderland all read, listened to, commented on, or criticized one or another aspect of the manuscript. I have tried to follow their advice - their reactions have always been telling, their company always a delight. Farley Grubb genially shared resources from his immense archive of migration and indentured servitude, David Barry Gaspar and April Lee Hatfield courteously answered my questions about aspects of their published research, Andrew Fitzmaurice offered acute, laconic observations on my conception of English colonizing, Linda Kerber spurred me on by wondering pointedly what I was up to. My dear friend Fredrika Teute took time from her own unforgiving schedule to read an early draft of the prologue and made suggestions whose reverberations reach far into the substance of the book. Over the many years of thought and research, countless scholars have generously read and discussed scores of papers offered to seminars and conferences all over the United States and far beyond - from Toronto to Vancouver to Sydney to Tel Aviv to Glasgow. All have helped me to arrive at what appears here. Among the many others who have also helped me at one time or another, in one way or another, I should like to mention two in particular – Laurie Rofini of the Chester County Archives for her enthusiastic interest and passion for ice hockey, and Cary Carson of Colonial Williamsburg for his sheer bonhomie.

At Cambridge University Press, Frank Smith, a friend now for more than twenty years, patiently listened to my halting attempts to explain what the book was about, and trusted me to translate them into serviceable prose. In that task I have been greatly assisted by Karen Verde's copyediting. Jeanie Lee, Shelby Peak, and Bindu Vinod have carefully kept track of the many tasks required to prepare the manuscript for production. Errors of fact or interpretation that remain despite all our best efforts are, of course, my responsibility.

I began writing the first complete draft of the manuscript of this book during the spring of 2008, whilst a member of a research working group on the history of legal transplants at the Institute for Advanced Studies of Hebrew University in Jerusalem. The group was organized by two gifted Israeli legal historians, Ron Harris and Assaf Likhovski, and included Morty Horwitz, Amalia Kessler, Pnina Lahav, Steven Wilf, and Yoram Shachar. A more congenial group of colleagues and friends one could not hope to find, nor a setting more marked by empire after empire that could remind one more starkly of the long and layered world history of the conjunctions that I try to address here – of migrations, forced and unforced; of colonizing and displacement; of time; of work; and of the work of law.



### Acknowledgments

 $\mathbf{X}\mathbf{V}$ 

There, late one Saturday afternoon, I decided that if I ever finished this book I would dedicate it to the memory of a friend from long ago, whose own work has had a pronounced impact on me. I wish he were alive still, to tell me what he thought of mine.

Many elements of this manuscript have appeared in earlier drafts as published articles, or chapters or essays in edited collections. Research for Chapter 1 first appeared as "Reconsidering Indentured Servitude: European Migration and Labor Force in the Early American Case," *Labor History*, 42, 1 (February 2001), 5-43, republished in part by permission of Taylor & Francis Ltd, and in revised and updated form as "Indentured Servitude in Perspective: European Migration to the North American Mainland and the Composition of the Early American Labor Force, 1600-1775," in Catherine Matson, editor, The Economy of Early America: New Directions (University Park, Pa., 2005), 146-82, republished in part by permission of Pennsylvania State University Press. Chapter 1 is a further and final revision and the most complete statement of that work. Significant elements of Chapter 1 and Chapter 2 were included in "Law, Population, Labor," in Michael Grossberg and Christopher Tomlins, editors, The Cambridge History of Law in America (Cambridge and New York, 2008), 211–52, republished in part by permission of Cambridge University Press. A summary version of Chapters 3 and 4 will appear as "The Legalities of English Colonizing: Discourses of European Intrusion upon the Americas, c. 1490-1830," in Shaunnagh Dorsett and Ian Hunter, editors, Law and Politics in British Colonial Thought: Transpositions of Empire (London and New York: Palgrave-MacMillan, 2010). A partial and preliminary version of Chapter 4 first appeared as "The Legal Cartography of Colonization, the Legal Polyphony of Settlement: English Intrusions on the American Mainland in the Seventeenth Century," Law and Social Inquiry, 26, 2 (Spring 2001), 315–72 [reprinted in Analyzing Law's Reach: Empirical Research on Law and Society (Chicago, 541-97], and in even more truncated form as "Law's Empire: Chartering English Colonies on the American Mainland in the Seventeenth Century," in Diane Kirkby and Catharine Coleborne, editors, Law, History, Colonialism: The Reach of Empire (Manchester, 2001), 26-45, republished in part by permission of Manchester University Press. A summary version of Chapters 5 through 7 appeared as "Early British America, 1585-1830," in Paul Craven and Douglas Hay, editors, Masters, Servants, and Magistrates in Britain and the Empire, 1562–1955 (Chapel Hill, 2004), 117–52, republished in part by permission of University of North Carolina Press. Elements of Chapter 8 were first sketched in "Subordination, Authority, Law: Subjects in Labor History," International Labor and Working Class History, 47 (Spring 1995), 56-90, and "Why Wait for Industrialism? Work, Legal Culture and the Example of Early America – An Historiographical Argument," Labor History, 40, 1 (January 1999), 5–34, republished in part by permission of Taylor & Francis Ltd. A summary version of Chapter 9 appears as "Transplants and Timing: Passages in the Creation of an



xvi

### Acknowledgments

Anglo-American Law of Slavery," Theoretical Inquiries in Law, 10, 2 (2009), 389-421. Chapter 10 (and also the introduction to Chapter 9) is informed by "Law's Wilderness: The Discourse of English Colonizing, the Violence of Intrusion, and the Failures of American History," in John Smolenski et al., editors, New World Orders: Violence, Sanction and Authority in the Early Modern Americas, 1500–1825 (Philadelphia, 2005), 21–46, republished in part by permission of University of Pennsylvania Press; a somewhat more extended version was published as "In a Wilderness of Tigers: The Discourse of English Colonizing and the Refusals of American History," Theoretical Inquiries in Law, 4, 2 (2003), 505–43. Chapter 10 is also informed by my work on Walter Benjamin, on display in "To Improve the State and Condition of Man: The Power to Police and the History of American Governance," Buffalo Law Review, 53, 4 (Fall 2005), 1215-71; "The Threepenny Constitution (and the Question of Justice)," Alabama Law Review, 58 (2007), 979-1008; "The Strait Gate: The Past, History and Legal Scholarship," Law, Culture and the Humanities, 5, 1 (February 2009), 11-42; "Revolutionary Justice in Brecht, Conrad and Blake," Law and Literature, 21, 2 (Summer 2009), 185–213; and "Toward a Materialist Jurisprudence," in Daniel W. Hamilton and Alfred L. Brophy, editors, Transformations in American Legal History, II: Law, Ideology, and Methods - Essays In Honor of Morton J. Horwitz, Volume II (Cambridge, Mass., 2010). Throughout, the book bears the mark of thoughts first expressed in "The Many Legalities of Colonization: A Manifesto of Destiny for Early American Legal History," in Christopher L. Tomlins and Bruce H. Mann, editors, *The Many Legalities of Early America* (Chapel Hill, 2001), 1-20, and "Constellations of Class in North America and the Atlantic World," in Simon Middleton and Billy G. Smith, editors, Class Matters: Early North America and the Atlantic World (Philadelphia, 2008), 213-33.

Excerpts from *Illuminations* by Walter Benjamin, copyright © 1955 by Suhrkamp Verlag, Frankfurt a.M., English translation by Harry Zohn copyright © 1968 and renewed 1996 by Houghton Mifflin Harcourt Publishing Company, reprinted by permission of Houghton Mifflin Harcourt Publishing company (epigraphs in the frontispiece and to Chapter 10). The epigraph to Chapter 7 from Julius Goebel's "King's Law and Local Custom in Seventeenth Century New England," *Columbia Law Review*, 31, 3 (March 1931), 418, is reprinted by permission of the Columbia Law Review Association, Inc. The epigraph to Chapter 8 from Carole Pateman's *The Sexual Contract* (Stanford: Stanford University Press), 87, is reprinted by permission of Carole Pateman.

Irvine, California February 2010



FREEDOM BOUND