Pediatric Bioethics

This volume offers a theoretical and practical overview of the ethics of pediatric medicine. It will serve as a fundamental handbook and resource for pediatricians, nurses, residents in training, graduate students, and practitioners of ethics and health care policy. Written by a team of leading experts, Pediatric Bioethics addresses those difficult ethical questions concerning the clinical and academic practice of pediatrics, including an approach to recognizing boundaries when one is confronted with such issues as end-of-life care, life-sustaining treatment, extreme prematurity, pharmacotherapy, and research. Thorny topics, such as what constitutes best interests, personhood, or distributive justice, and public health concerns, such as immunization and newborn genetic screening, are also addressed.

Geoffrey Miller is Professor of Pediatrics and Neurology at the Yale University School of Medicine, as well as a member of the Yale Bioethics Center and the Child Neurology Society Bioethics Committee.
Pediatric Bioethics

Edited by

GEOFFREY MILLER

Yale University School of Medicine
For Tricia
Contents

Contributors ix

Preface xiii

A. THE FOUNDATION: THEORY AND PRINCIPLES
1 Virtues and Goals in Pediatrics 3
   G. Kevin Donovan and Edmund D. Pellegrino
2 Contributions of Ethical Theory to Pediatric Ethics: Pediatricians and Parents as Co-fiduciaries of Pediatric Patients 11
   Laurence B. McCullough
3 Using the Best-Interests Standard in Treatment Decisions for Young Children 22
   Loretta M. Kopelman
4 The Moral and Legal Status of Children and Parents 38
   Sadath A. Sayeed
5 The Ethics of Pediatric Research 54
   Jonathan D. Moreno and Alexandra Kravitt
6 Truth Telling in Pediatrics: What They Don’t Know Might Hurt Them 73
   Christine Harrison
7 Pediatric Ethics Committees 87
   Mark R. Mercurio

B. GENETICS AND THE NEWBORN
8 Newborn Screening 111
   Lainie Friedman Ross
9 Presymptomatic Genetic Testing in Children 125
   Kimberly A. Quaid
## Contents

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Chapter</th>
<th>Title</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>10</td>
<td>Extreme Prematurity: Truth and Justice</td>
<td>141</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Geoffrey Miller</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11</td>
<td>Disorders of Sex Development</td>
<td>149</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Alice D. Dreger and David Sandberg</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>C.</td>
<td>Therapies</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12</td>
<td>Rationality, Personhood, and Peter Singer on the Fate of Severely Impaired Infants</td>
<td>165</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Eva Feder Kittay</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>13</td>
<td>The Ethics of Controlling Reproduction in a Population with Mental Disabilities</td>
<td>173</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Paul A. Lombardo</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>14</td>
<td>Pediatric Innovative Surgery</td>
<td>186</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Angelique M. Reitsma</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>15</td>
<td>Conjoined Twins</td>
<td>203</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Alice D. Dreger and Geoffrey Miller</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>16</td>
<td>Ethics and Immunization</td>
<td>219</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Joel E. Frader and Erin Flanagan-Klygis</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>17</td>
<td>Psychotropic Drug Use in Children: The Case of Stimulants</td>
<td>231</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Ilina Singh</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>D.</td>
<td>End of Life</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>18</td>
<td>Brain Death, Minimal Consciousness, and Vegetative States in Children</td>
<td>247</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Geoffrey Miller and Stephen Ashwal</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>19</td>
<td>The Forgoing of Life-Sustaining Treatment for Children</td>
<td>262</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Sadath A. Sayeed and Geoffrey Miller</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Index</td>
<td>285</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Contributors

Stephen Ashwal, M.D.
Distinguished Professor of Pediatrics, Loma Linda University.

G. Kevin Donovan, M.D., M.L.A.
Professor of Pediatrics and Founder and Director of Oklahoma Bioethics Center, Oklahoma University.

Alice D. Dreger, Ph.D.
Associate Professor of Clinical Medical Humanities and Bioethics, Guggenheim Fellow, Feinberg School of Medicine, Northwestern University, Chicago.

Erin Flanagan-Klygis, M.D.
Assistant Professor of Pediatrics and Religion, Health, and Human Values, Rush University, Chicago, and Medical Director of the Rush Pediatric Palliative Care Program.

Joel E. Frader, M.D.
Professor of Pediatrics, Medical Humanities and Bioethics, Northwestern University, Chicago. Former chairman of the Committee on Bioethics of the American Academy of Pediatrics and former president of the American Society of Bioethics and Humanities. Fellow of the Hastings Center.

Christine Harrison, Ph.D.
Director of Bioethics at the Hospital for Sick Children, Toronto, Canada. Former president of the Canadian Bioethics Society and currently chair of the Canadian Paediatric Society Bioethics Committee.

Eva Feder Kittay, Ph.D.
Professor of Philosophy, State University of New York at Stonybrook.
Contributors

Loretta M. Kopelman, Ph.D.
Professor of Medical Humanities and former chair of the department, Brody School of Medicine, East Carolina University. Founding president of the American Society for Bioethics and Humanities and recipient of the Barholome Award in Pediatric Ethics from the American Academy of Pediatrics. Former member of the Institute of Medicine and currently a Fellow of the Hastings Center.

Alexandra Kravitt
Intern, University of Pennsylvania Center for Bioethics.

Paul A. Lombardo, Ph.D., J.D.
Professor of Law at Georgia State University’s College of Law.

Laurence B. McCullough, Ph.D.
The Dalton Tomlin Chair in Medical Ethics and Health Policy in the Center for Medical Ethics and Health Policy, Baylor College of Medicine, and Professor of Medicine and Medical Ethics. Former president of the Society for Health and Human Values.

Mark R. Mercurio, M.A., M.D.
Associate Professor of Pediatrics and Director of the Pediatric Bioethics Program, Yale University.

Geoffrey Miller, M.A., M.Phil., M.D.
Professor of Pediatrics and Neurology, Yale University. Member of the Yale Bioethics Center and the Child Neurology Society’s Bioethics Committee.

Jonathan D. Moreno, Ph.D.
David and Lyn Siljen University Professor and Professor of Medical Ethics and of History and Sociology of Science, University of Pennsylvania. Senior Fellow at the Center for American Progress and a member of the Institute of Medicine.

Edmund D. Pellegrino, M.D.
Chairman, President’s Council on Bioethics, Professor Emeritus of Medicine and Medical Ethics, Georgetown University.

Kimberly A. Quaid, Ph.D.
Professor of Medical and Molecular Genetics and Director of the Predictive Testing Program, Indiana University. Member of the Indiana University Center for Bioethics and chair of the Ethical, Legal, and Social Implications Study Section of the National Human Genome Research Institute of the National Institutes of Health.
Contributors

Angelique M. Reitsma, M.A., M.D.
Associate at the University of Pennsylvania Center for Bioethics.

Lainie Friedman Ross, M.D., Ph.D.
Carolyn and Matthew Bucksbaum Professor of Clinical Medical Ethics and Associate Director, Maclean Center for Clinical Medical Ethics, University of Chicago.

David Sandberg, Ph.D.
Associate Professor of Pediatrics and Child Behavioral Health, University of Michigan.

Sadath A. Sayeed, J.D., M.D.
Instructor in Global Health and Social Medicine, Harvard University, and Neonatologist at the Children’s Hospital Boston. Member of the Harvard University Program in Ethics and Health.

Ilina Singh, Ph.D.
Wellcome Trust University Lecturer in Bioethics and Society and Associate Director of BIOS, Centre for the Study of Bioscience, Biomedicine, Biotechnology, and Society, London School of Economics.
I cannot really define what is meant by the term “bioethics.” It seems to mean different things to different people, depending on their situation and perspective. I do appreciate that it encompasses more than norms and codes of conduct for health professionals. Its sources are many and include the heterogeneous tentacles of moral philosophy; the instinctual nature of cultural norms; the development and wrangling compositions of common and statutory law; and lessons from history, the humanities, the social sciences, and the study of human nature. With such broad and variable origins, it is not surprising that the questions that concern bioethics give rise to such vigorous debate, for they entail the age-old arguments about how we might treat each other as individuals, as special or privileged persons, as groups, and within a state, and how these things should be prescribed and proscribed. Underlying all of this is the recognition and government of harmful behavior, potential or otherwise, that has been, is, and evidently will be practiced by human beings, often with the participation of health professionals in clinical and academic medicine. At particular risk from this harm are vulnerable populations such as children. This book presents approaches to this concern that arise in pediatric bioethics. The contributors represent the fields of philosophy, medicine, law, and the social sciences. A broad array of topics is addressed, including theory and principles, genetics and the newborn, therapies, and end-of-life issues. The intention is that from these contributions the reader will be able to derive a good ethical approach to the practice of pediatrics and avoid poorly reasoned responses to ethical questions – responses that are cloaked in misinterpreted word and fashionable phrase. As Hannah Arendt wrote in *Eichmann in Jerusalem: A Report on the Banality of Evil*, “There is a strange interdependence between thoughtlessness and evil.”

Geoffrey Miller
Yale University
2009