

Cambridge University Press

978-0-521-13475-0 - Justice in America: The Separate Realities of Blacks and Whites

Mark Peffley and Jon Hurwitz

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

---

## Justice in America

### *The Separate Realities of Blacks and Whites*

As reactions to the O. J. Simpson verdict, the Rodney King beating, and the Amadou Diallo killing make clear, Whites and African Americans in the United States inhabit two different perceptual worlds, with the former seeing the justice system as largely fair and color-blind and the latter believing it to be replete with bias and discrimination. Drawing on data from a nationwide survey of both races, Mark Peffley and Jon Hurwitz tackle two important questions in this book: what explains the widely differing perceptions, and why do such differences matter? They attribute much of the racial chasm to the relatively common personal confrontations that many Blacks have with law enforcement – confrontations seldom experienced by Whites. And more importantly, the authors demonstrate that this racial chasm is consequential: it leads African Americans to react much more cynically to incidents of police brutality and racial profiling, and also to be far more skeptical of punitive anticrime policies ranging from the death penalty to the three-strikes laws.

Mark Peffley is a Professor of Political Science at the University of Kentucky.

Jon Hurwitz is a Professor of Political Science at the University of Pittsburgh.

They are the coeditors of *Perception and Prejudice: Race and Politics in the U.S.* (1998) and the journal *Political Behavior*. Their articles have appeared in numerous journals, including *American Political Science Review*, *American Journal of Political Science*, *Journal of Politics*, *International Studies Quarterly*, and *Political Psychology*.

Cambridge University Press

978-0-521-13475-0 - Justice in America: The Separate Realities of Blacks and Whites

Mark Peffley and Jon Hurwitz

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

---

CAMBRIDGE STUDIES IN PUBLIC OPINION  
AND POLITICAL PSYCHOLOGY

**Series Editors**

DENNIS CHONG, *Northwestern University*

JAMES H. KUKLINKSI, *University of Illinois, Urbana-Champaign*

Cambridge Studies in Public Opinion and Political Psychology publishes innovative research from a variety of theoretical and methodological perspectives on the mass public foundations of politics and society. Research in the series focuses on the origins and influence of mass opinion; the dynamics of information and deliberation; and the emotional, normative, and instrumental bases of political choice. In addition to examining psychological processes, the series explores the organization of groups, the association between individual and collective preferences, and the impact of institutions on beliefs and behavior.

Cambridge Studies in Public Opinion and Political Psychology is dedicated to furthering theoretical and empirical research on the relationship between the political system and the attitudes and actions of citizens.

Books in the series are listed on the page following the Index.

Cambridge University Press

978-0-521-13475-0 - Justice in America: The Separate Realities of Blacks and Whites

Mark Peffley and Jon Hurwitz

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

---

# Justice in America

*The Separate Realities of Blacks and Whites*

**MARK PEFFLEY**

*University of Kentucky*

**JON HURWITZ**

*University of Pittsburgh*



**CAMBRIDGE**  
UNIVERSITY PRESS

Cambridge University Press

978-0-521-13475-0 - Justice in America: The Separate Realities of Blacks and Whites

Mark Peffley and Jon Hurwitz

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY PRESS

Cambridge, New York, Melbourne, Madrid, Cape Town, Singapore,  
São Paulo, Delhi, Dubai, Tokyo, Mexico City

Cambridge University Press

32 Avenue of the Americas, New York, NY 10013-2473, USA

[www.cambridge.org](http://www.cambridge.org)

Information on this title: [www.cambridge.org/9780521134750](http://www.cambridge.org/9780521134750)

© Mark Peffley and Jon Hurwitz 2010

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2010

Printed in the United States of America

*A catalog record for this publication is available from the British Library.*

*Library of Congress Cataloging in Publication data*

Peffley, Mark.

Justice in America : the separate realities of blacks and whites / Mark Peffley, Jon Hurwitz.

p. cm. – (Cambridge studies in public opinion and political psychology)

Includes bibliographical references and index.

ISBN 978-0-521-11925-2

1. Discrimination in criminal justice administration – United States – Public opinion. 2. Discrimination in law enforcement – United States. I. Hurwitz, Jon. II. Title. III. Series.

KF9223.P44 2010

345.73'05-dc22 2010007238

ISBN 978-0-521-11925-2 Hardback

ISBN 978-0-521-13475-0 Paperback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party Internet Web sites referred to in this publication and does not guarantee that any content on such Web sites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.

Cambridge University Press

978-0-521-13475-0 - Justice in America: The Separate Realities of Blacks and Whites

Mark Peffley and Jon Hurwitz

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

## Contents

<i>List of Tables</i>	<i>page</i> viii
<i>List of Figures</i>	ix
<i>Acknowledgments</i>	xi
1 Introduction	I
2 Racial Bias in the Justice System: Reality and Perception	28
3 The Role of Fairness	68
4 The Consequences of Fairness: Polarized Reactions to Police Brutality and Racial Profiling	111
5 The Consequences of Fairness: Support for Punitive Crime Policies	140
6 Conclusions	187
<i>Appendix A: National Survey and Survey Items</i>	215
<i>Appendix B: Examining Reciprocal Effects of Unfair Treatment and Neighborhood Discrimination</i>	225
<i>References</i>	227
<i>Index</i>	253

Cambridge University Press

978-0-521-13475-0 - Justice in America: The Separate Realities of Blacks and Whites

Mark Peffley and Jon Hurwitz

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

## Tables

2.1	Reports of Unfair Treatment by Police by Race	<i>page</i> 42
2.2	Fear of Crime by Race	46
2.3	Predicting Unfair Treatment from Social and Political Factors, Blacks	50
2.4	Predicting Perceived Seriousness of Neighborhood Discrimination	59
3.1	Predicting System Fairness Beliefs across Race of Respondent	92
3.2	Predicting Attributions of Black Treatment	103
4.1	Predicting Responses to the Police Misconduct Experiments	125
5.1	Percentage Support for the Death Penalty, by Race and Experimental Condition	158
5.2	Percentage Support for Prisons, by Race and Experimental Condition	162
5.3	Predicting Support for the Death Penalty across Race and Experimental Condition	171
5.4	Predicting a Better Way to Reduce Crime: Prevention vs. Punishment	178
A.1	NRCS Sample Characteristics and 2000 Census, Percentages	216
B.1	TSLS Analysis of Unfair Treatment and Police Stopping Blacks More	226

Cambridge University Press

978-0-521-13475-0 - Justice in America: The Separate Realities of Blacks and Whites

Mark Peffley and Jon Hurwitz

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

## Figures

2.1	Perceptions of Neighborhood Discrimination, by Race of Respondent	<i>page</i> 43
2.2	Percentage of Whites and Blacks Living in Neighborhoods (Zip Codes) of Varying Racial Concentration	49
2.3	Predicted Probability of at Least One Incident of Unfair Treatment, Blacks	51
2.4	Substantive Impact of Select Predictors on Neighborhood Discrimination	61
2.5	Predicted Values of Perceived Neighborhood Discrimination from Percent Black	64
3.1	Racial Differences in Beliefs about System Fairness and Attributions of Black Treatment	89
3.2	Predicting System Fairness from Neighborhood Discrimination	95
3.3	Substantive Impact of Select Predictors on System Fairness for Whites	96
3.4	Impact of Ideology on System Fairness across Education	98
3.5	Reducing Racial Polarization in System Fairness under Hypothetical (simulated) Conditions	99
3.6	Substantive Effects of Select Predictors on Black Treatment	104
4.1	Probability of Judging a Fair Police Investigation, Police Brutality Experiment	127
		ix

Cambridge University Press

978-0-521-13475-0 - Justice in America: The Separate Realities of Blacks and Whites

Mark Peffley and Jon Hurwitz

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

x

*List of Figures*

4.2	Probability of Maximum Sentence for Guilty Officer, Police Brutality Experiment	129
4.3	Probability of Judging Search Unreasonable, Stop-and-Search Experiment	132
4.4	Probability of Believing Men vs. Police, Stop-and-Search Experiment	133
5.1	White-Black Percentage Differences in Crime-Policy Attitudes	152
5.2	Mean Approval of the Three-Strikes Laws by Race and Experimental Condition	165
5.3	Whites' Probability of Death-Penalty Support for Racial Argument across Attributions of Black Treatment	175
5.4	Probability of Strong Preference for Prevention vs. Punishment in Order to Reduce Crime across Percent Black	180
5.5	Probability of Strong Preference for Prevention vs. Punishment across County Crime Rate	182



Cambridge University Press

978-0-521-13475-0 - Justice in America: The Separate Realities of Blacks and Whites

Mark Peffley and Jon Hurwitz

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

---

## Acknowledgments

This, of course, is a project for which we owe many people much gratitude. The National Race and Crime Survey (NRCS), which provides the data for the analyses that follow, was funded by the National Science Foundation (NSF Grant # 9906346). We are particularly grateful to Doris Marie Provine, former director of the Law and Society Division of the NSF, for her assistance with this grant. The School of Arts and Sciences at the University of Pittsburgh provided a generous subsidy for this project. For this we are indebted to Peter Koehler, the former dean of the School of Arts and Sciences, and Ray Owen, the former chair of the Department of Political Science. We are also grateful for support from a Research Committee Grant from the Office of Research and Graduate Studies at the University of Kentucky. We also wish to acknowledge support from the Richard D. and Mary Jane Edwards Endowed Publication Fund.

The NRCS was conducted by the Survey Research Program (SRP) at the University of Pittsburgh, under the auspices of the University Center for Social and Urban Research (UCSUR). Scott Beach, the program director at the SRP, was enormously helpful through all phases of the data collection process; he was ably assisted by Mike Bridges, the senior survey research specialist, and Laurel Person, the fieldwork supervisor for CATI Operations. We are also grateful to Director Richard Schultz at UCSUR, who continued this project to fruition – long after we had run out of money. Finally, we wish to convey our thanks, and our thoughts, to the family of Steve Manners,

Cambridge University Press

978-0-521-13475-0 - Justice in America: The Separate Realities of Blacks and Whites

Mark Peffley and Jon Hurwitz

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

the program director at the SRP when we began this project who was monumentally helpful, encouraging, and optimistic. Unfortunately, he passed away far too early in life.

Numerous colleagues, friends, and anonymous reviewers have read, and provided invaluable comments on, various portions of this manuscript. Our ideas and interpretations benefited immeasurably from several opportunities to present our research to keen scholars at invited talks at the University of Minnesota Symposium on Political Psychology, Washington University, the Chicago Political Behavior Workshop at Northwestern University, the New York Political Psychology Workshop at Columbia University, the Conference on “Race, Inequality, and Incarceration” at Stanford University, the University of Nebraska, Vanderbilt University, the Netherlands Institute for Advanced Study, and the “Diversity and Democratic Politics Workshop” at Queens University. In particular, we are thankful for the comments of Darren Davis, Martin Gilens, John Sullivan, James Gibson, James Druckman, Benjamin Page, Paul Brewer, Leonie Huddy, Stanley Feldman, Rick Lau, Devon Johnson, Lawrence Bobo, Jennifer Eberhardt, Robert Weisberg, Elizabeth Theiss-Morse, John Hibbing, Joe Soss, Charles Taber, Michael Dawson, Tom Nelson, Michael Cobb, Dietlind Stolle, Allison Harrell, and Devah Pager.

Our colleagues and friends who provided a constant sounding board of encouragement and advice deserve special mention: Robert Rohrschneider, Richard Fording, Stephen D. Voss, Matt Gabel, and Margo Monteith, as well as David Barker, Marc Hetherington, Jennifer Victor, and Barry Ames.

Lee Sigelman provided sage advice on our NSF proposal, and we were often guided by his work in the area. Lee’s wonderful wit, friendship, and mentorship will be sorely missed.

We are especially grateful for the advice and assistance from the editors of this series: Dennis Chong, who was extremely helpful at every turn, and Jim Kuklinski.

Several graduate students provided important contributions to this project while authoring excellent dissertations. James (Mac) Avery worked for two years as a research assistant using his insight and skill to prepare the survey data, write statistical code, and perform statistical analysis. Jeff Fine supervised a small crew of undergraduate research assistants to download and “geocode” the contextual

Cambridge University Press

978-0-521-13475-0 - Justice in America: The Separate Realities of Blacks and Whites

Mark Peffley and Jon Hurwitz

Frontmatter

[More information](#)*Acknowledgments*

xiii

data, which was merged with the survey data. Stephanie McLean conducted research and data analysis and, additionally, served as a sounding board for numerous ideas central to this project.

We also are indebted to a number of graduate students who have provided a great deal of research assistance. At the risk of omitting anyone, this list includes Kristen Coopie, Brent Dupay, Marc Hutchison, Jason Kehrberg, Terra Miskovich, Stephanie Muraca, Ramesh Sharma, Sam Weiser, Becky Zajdel, and Lawrence Zigarell.

Paul Sniderman deserves special mention – for his mentoring, intellectual insights, and friendship. Paul has done far more than his share to stimulate discussion, debate, and research within the community of scholars who study political persuasion and racial politics. He has shown patience with, and support for, this project, providing invaluable help from start to finish. It is not an exaggeration to claim that this book would be far less interesting and far less thoughtful without his assistance. For all of his help and kindness, we are deeply appreciative.

Our greatest gratitude must go to our immediate families: Kathy Kalias and Rebecca Peffley, and Rebecca Dick-Hurwitz and Joanna Hurwitz. They have not seen much of us while this book has been in process. We will leave it up to them as to whether this is good or bad. Finally, we would be remiss if we did not mention the support we received from Kevin Peffley and Louise Peffley, and Sidney and Rhoda Hurwitz.

*Note:* Portions of Chapter 4 are based on “Explaining the Great Racial Divide: Perceptions of Fairness in the U.S. Criminal Justice System,” *Journal of Politics* 67 (3) (2005): 762–83. Copyright © Southern Political Science Association 2005. Reprinted with the permission of Cambridge University Press.

Portions of Chapter 5 are based on “Persuasion and Resistance: Race and the Death Penalty in America,” *American Journal of Political Science* 51 (4) (2007): 996–1012. Copyright © Midwest Political Science Association 2007. Reprinted with the permission of Wiley-Blackwell.