Capitalism, For and Against

Political philosophy and feminist theory have rarely examined in detail how capitalism affects the lives of women. Ann Cudd and Nancy Holmstrom take up opposing sides of the issue, debating whether capitalism is valuable as an ideal and whether, as an actually existing economic system, it is good for women. In a discussion covering a broad range of social and economic issues, including unequal pay, industrial reforms, and sweatshops, they examine how these and other issues relate to women and how to analyze effectively what constitutes “capitalism” and “women’s interests.” Each author also responds to the opposing arguments, providing a thorough debate of the topics covered. The resulting volume will interest a wide range of readers in philosophy, political theory, women’s studies, and global affairs.

Ann E. Cudd is Professor of Philosophy and Associate Dean for Humanities, University of Kansas. She is the author of Analyzing Oppression (2006), and co-edited (with Anita Superson) Theorizing Backlash (2002) and (with Robin Andreason) Feminist Theory (2005).

Nancy Holmstrom is Professor Emerita and former Chair of Philosophy at Rutgers University Newark. She is the author of numerous articles on core topics in social philosophy and is the editor of The Socialist Feminist Project: A Contemporary Reader in Theory and Politics (2002).
Capitalism, For and Against
A Feminist Debate

Ann E. Cudd

and

Nancy Holmstrom
Contents

List of tables and figures v
Acknowledgments vii

Part I 1

1 For capitalism as a feminist ideal and reality 3
Ann E. Cudd
1 Introduction 3
2 The empirical case for capitalism as an actually existing system 29
3 The theoretical explanation of capitalism’s success 62
4 Feminist critiques of capitalism 97
5 Fetishism 116
6 Enlightened capitalism: a feminist capitalist manifesto 125

Part II 131

2 Against capitalism as theory and as reality 133
Nancy Holmstrom
1 Introduction 133
2 Capitalism in theory: ideals and limits 145
3 Capitalism in reality 213
4 Human interests are women’s interests 244
5 Conclusion: what is the alternative? and what should feminists do now? 252
# CONTENTS

## Part III

<p>| | |</p>
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>Ann Cudd's reply to Nancy Holmstrom</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>Nancy Holmstrom's reply to Ann Cudd</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*Bibliography* 323
*Index* 345
Tables and figures

Table 1.1  Fertility transitions  page 44
Table 1.2  HDI, GDI, and GEM rankings 2008  update for selected countries  56
Figure 1.1  Life expectancy versus income  36
Figure 1.2  Female life expectancy versus per capita income  55
Figure 1.3  Fertility versus per capita income  55
Our biggest debt of gratitude goes to Professor Louise Antony, first for organizing the panel at the American Philosophical Association convention in December 2006 on Feminism and Capitalism, for inviting us both to speak (and thus introducing us to each other), for her comments on our presentations, and then for supporting our book project at every point. Without Louise this book would not exist. We also thank our commentator on that panel Professor Christine Koggel for generous and helpful comments, as well as the audience of the session. Ann particularly thanks Almas Sayeed for her extended discussion of the papers after the session.

Louise subsequently persuaded us to pursue a publication venue for our debate, and this ultimately led us to propose the present book to Cambridge University Press. We are grateful to Hilary Gaskin, our editor, and several anonymous reviewers for their comments, criticism, and suggestions on our proposal and manuscript. In developing the proposal for the book we were helped greatly by the advice of Jay Hullitt, philosopher and publisher of Hackett Books, who, among other things, gave us the idea for our title. We thank Jeff Dean for his advice on the manuscript. Joe Braun helped with background research, and Matt Waldschlagel constructed the index for this book, and we thank them both.

Ann would like to thank Joe Braun, Pinfei Lu, audiences at Butler University, Bowling Green State University, and the Institute for Philosophy at National Tsing Hua University in
Taiwan, as well as her students in her Fall 2009 Philosophy of Social Science seminar for helpful discussions of portions of the book. She would also like to thank the University of Kansas for research support, as well as her colleagues in the Office of the Dean of the College of Liberal Arts and Sciences for covering for her when she was out of the office either working on this book, or hiking, or skiing in Colorado (they were never sure which). Most of all, Ann thanks her husband, Neal Becker, for help both intellectual and personal with this project.

Nancy would like to thank Gertrude Ezorsky, Sam Farber, Milton Fisk, and Richard Smith, who read her initial contribution in its entirety; Johanna Brenner for her ongoing political and personal support; and the participants in the Spring 2009 meeting of Socialist Feminist Philosophers in Action (SOFPHIA), who read a portion of the manuscript: Sandra Bartky, Sarah Begus, Ann Ferguson, Anna Gotlib, Jack Hammond, Don Hanover, Margaret McLaren, Marlisa Moschella, Mecke Nagel, Kathy Russell, Karsten Struhl, and, in particular, Jessica Kyle, who wrote extensive comments. Nancy would especially like to thank Richard for his loving support and for taking time away from his own work to help with hers. She looks forward to doing the same for him.

Finally, we would also like to thank one another for the extremely cooperative and productive working relationship we forged in spite of our disagreements.