

Cambridge University Press
978-0-521-13124-7 - Melancholia: The Diagnosis, Pathophysiology, and Treatment of Depressive Illness
Michael Alan Taylor and Max Fink
Frontmatter
[More information](#)

Melancholia

This book provides a comprehensive review of melancholia as a severe disorder of mood, associated with suicide, psychosis, and catatonia. The syndrome is defined with a clear diagnosis, prognosis, and range of management strategies, differentiated from other similar psychiatric, neurological, and general medical conditions. It challenges accepted doctrines in the classification and biology of the mood disorders and defines melancholia as a treatable mental illness. Described for millennia in medical texts and used as a term in literature and poetry, melancholia was included within early versions of the major diagnostic classification systems, but lost favor in later editions. This book updates the arguments for the diagnosis, describes its characteristics in detail, and promotes treatment and prevention. The book offers great hope to those with a disorder too often misdiagnosed and often fatal. It should be read by all those responsible for the management of patients with mood disorders.

Michael Alan Taylor is Professor of Psychiatry Emeritus at Rosalind Franklin University of Medicine and Science, North Chicago, IL and Adjunct Clinical Professor of Psychiatry at the University of Michigan School of Medicine, Ann Arbor, MI, USA.

Max Fink is Professor of Psychiatry and Neurology Emeritus at the State University of New York at Stony Brook, USA.

Cambridge University Press
978-0-521-13124-7 - Melancholia: The Diagnosis, Pathophysiology, and Treatment of Depressive Illness
Michael Alan Taylor and Max Fink
Frontmatter
[More information](#)

Melancholia

The diagnosis, pathophysiology, and
treatment of depressive illness

Michael Alan Taylor, M.D.

Professor of Psychiatry Emeritus at Rosalind Franklin
University of Medicine and Science, North Chicago, IL,
and Adjunct Clinical Professor of Psychiatry at the
University of Michigan School of Medicine,
Ann Arbor, MI, USA

Max Fink, M.D.

Professor of Psychiatry and Neurology Emeritus,
State University of New York at Stony Brook, USA



Cambridge University Press
978-0-521-13124-7 - Melancholia: The Diagnosis, Pathophysiology, and Treatment of Depressive Illness
Michael Alan Taylor and Max Fink
Frontmatter
[More information](#)

CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY PRESS
Cambridge, New York, Melbourne, Madrid, Cape Town, Singapore,
São Paulo, Delhi, Dubai, Tokyo

Cambridge University Press
The Edinburgh Building, Cambridge CB2 8RU, UK

Published in the United States of America by Cambridge University Press, New York

www.cambridge.org
Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9780521131247

© M. A. Taylor and M. Fink 2006

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception
and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements,
no reproduction of any part may take place without the written
permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2006
This digitally printed version 2010

A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library

ISBN 978-0-521-84151-1 Hardback
ISBN 978-0-521-13124-7 Paperback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or
accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in
this publication, and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is,
or will remain, accurate or appropriate.
Every effort has been made in preparing this book to provide accurate and
up-to-date information which is in accord with accepted standards and
practice at the time of publication. Although case histories are drawn
from actual cases, every effort has been made to disguise the identities of
the individuals involved. Nevertheless, the authors, editors and publishers
can make no warranties that the information contained herein is totally
free from error, not least because clinical standards are constantly
changing through research and regulation. The authors, editors and
publishers therefore disclaim all liability for direct or consequential
damages resulting from the use of material contained in this book. Readers
are strongly advised to pay careful attention to information provided by
the manufacturer of any drugs or equipment that they plan to use.

Contents

	<i>List of patient vignettes</i>	<i>page</i> ix
	<i>Preface</i>	xi
	<i>Acknowledgments</i>	xv
1	Melancholia: a conceptual history	1
	Origins of the concept	2
	The psychodynamic interruption	6
	The recognition of melancholia in psychiatric classification	7
	Notes	10
2	Melancholia defined	15
	Melancholy	15
	Manic-depressive illness	18
	Psychotic depression is melancholia	24
	Depression with catatonia or stupor is severe melancholia	30
	Melancholia defined by a specific event	32
	Notes	37
3	Defining melancholia by psychopathology	45
	DSM depression categories and diagnostic criteria	46
	Consensus and empirical approaches defining a syndrome	51
	Psychopathology data supporting the validity of melancholia	53
	The nature of melancholia	56
	Conclusions	58
	Notes	59
4	Defining melancholia: laboratory tests	62
	Neuroendocrine measures in mood disorders	62
	The hypothalamic–pituitary–adrenal axis	64
	The hypothalamic–pituitary–thyroid axis	72
	Electrophysiologic measures	72

vi	Contents	
	Conclusions	76
	Notes	78
5	Examination for melancholia	85
	Examination strategy	86
	Examining mood	87
	Examining psychomotor functioning	88
	Examining for vegetative signs	88
	Examining for psychotic features	89
	Examining for suicidal thoughts	90
	Examining cognition	90
	Examining for personality disorder	91
	Rating scales of depression	91
	Notes	95
6	The differential diagnosis of melancholia	97
	Non-melancholic depressive mood disorders	97
	Melancholia in children and adolescents	103
	Melancholia in the elderly	104
	Melancholia in a patient with a psychotic disorder	106
	Distinguishing melancholia from anxiety and obsessive-compulsive disorders	108
	Distinguishing melancholia from drug-related depressive-like states	109
	Melancholia associated with general medical illnesses	110
	Avolitional, apathetic, and bradykinetic syndromes	112
	Neurologic disease associated with apathy and depression-like syndromes	113
	Notes	118
7	Suicide in melancholia	125
	Errors in suicide prevention	126
	Suicide risk assessment	134
	The effect of specific treatments on suicide rates	139
	Management of the suicidal melancholic patient	143
	Notes	146
8	Electroconvulsive therapy for melancholia	153
	ECT in melancholia	155
	ECT for psychotic depression	157
	ECT and suicide risk	159
	ECT for catatonia and depressive stupor	161
	ECT in pregnancy and postpartum depression	163
	ECT in children and adolescents	165
	ECT in the elderly	170
	ECT and characterological conditions	171

vii	Contents	
	ECT in unipolar and bipolar depression	172
	Conclusion	174
	Notes	174
9	Achieving effective ECT	181
	Patient selection	181
	Technical considerations	183
	Conclusions	190
	Notes	190
10	The validity of the pharmacotherapy literature in melancholia	196
	Industry influence undermines conclusions about newer agents	197
	Head-to-head comparisons are biased to favor newer drugs	199
	Antidepressant drug efficacy: TCA versus pure SSRI	201
	Antidepressant drug efficacy: pure SSRIs compared to non-TCA agents	204
	Conclusions	206
	Notes	207
11	Basic pharmacotherapy for melancholic patients	211
	Acute treatment	212
	Combining drugs and psychotherapy	218
	Continuation and maintenance treatment	219
	Pharmacotherapy for melancholia	220
	Treatment of severe melancholia	222
	Optimizing treatments for manic-depressive illness	229
	Notes	231
12	Pharmacotherapy for melancholic patients in complicating circumstances	239
	Melancholia in pregnancy and breast-feeding	239
	Melancholia in childhood and adolescence	244
	Melancholia in old age	250
	Melancholia with co-occurring alcohol or drug abuse	255
	Melancholia with co-occurring neurologic disease	257
	Melancholia co-occurring with general medical conditions	261
	Melancholia with co-occurring personality disorder	265
	Summary recommendations	266
	Treatment-resistant depression	268
	Notes	273
13	Proposed treatments for melancholia	284
	Light therapy	284
	Transcranial magnetic stimulation	286
	Magnetic seizure therapy (MST)	288
	Vagal nerve stimulation (VNS)	289

viii	Contents	
	Glucocorticosteroid receptor agonists	289
	Targeted neurotransmitter system agents	290
	Hormones	291
	Herbal remedies	292
	Notes	294
14	The pathophysiology of melancholia	298
	Genetic predisposition	299
	Environmental factors	303
	Abnormal stress response	307
	Abnormal neurochemical functioning	311
	Abnormal brain structure	317
	Abnormal brain metabolism	318
	Electrophysiologic abnormalities	320
	Cognitive deficits	327
	Why some melancholic patients have manic episodes	328
	Conclusions	330
	Notes	333
15	Future directions	346
	Changing the DSM classification of depression	347
	Changing the DSM diagnostic criteria for melancholia	348
	Changing the standards of pharmacotherapy research	349
	Changing treatment guidelines: endless drug trials elicit chronicity	351
	Improving the education of medical practitioners in mood disorders	351
	Studies of the mechanism of convulsive therapy	353
	Preventive approaches to reduce the burden of melancholia	354
	Pharmacogenetics	359
	The pathophysiology of melancholia	360
	Coda	364
	Notes	365
	<i>References</i>	371
	<i>Index</i>	522

Patient vignettes

2.1	A woman with melancholia (Hopewell-Ash)	<i>page</i> 17
2.2	A woman with melancholia (Hopewell-Ash)	17
2.3	A man with melancholia (Hopewell-Ash)	17
2.4	A woman with melancholia (Hopewell-Ash)	17
2.5	A woman with cycloid psychosis (Hopewell-Ash)	22
2.6	A man with a psychotic melancholia (DSM-IV Casebook)	28
2.7	A man with psychotic melancholia (Fink)	28
2.8	A woman with Cotard syndrome (Hansen and Bolwig)	29
2.9	A woman with melancholia (Taylor)	30
2.10	A catatonic woman with psychotic melancholia (Kalhbaum)	31
2.11	A 15-year-old girl with psychotic melancholia and catatonia (Hoch)	32
2.12	A woman with a postpartum melancholia (Protheroe)	35
2.13	A woman with postpartum melancholia (Hamilton)	35
3.1	A man with an apathetic frontal lobe syndrome meeting criteria for major depression (Vaidya and Taylor)	49
5.1	A melancholic man with a psychotic depression (Taylor)	89
6.1	An epileptic man with brief depressions (Taylor)	116
7.1	An 87-year-old woman with a psychotic depression (Taylor)	128
7.2	A 44-year-old melancholic man misdiagnosed with PTSD who committed suicide (Taylor)	130
7.3	A hospitalized depressed woman with a suicide plan (Taylor)	131
7.4	A melancholic woman who received poor treatment (Taylor)	132
7.5	A 30-year-old man with a “postpartum” melancholia (Taylor)	133
7.6	A man who refused hospitalization and committed suicide (Taylor)	133
7.7	A 70-year-old man who hanged himself (Taylor)	137
7.8	A 21-year-old woman who made a suicide attempt following a psychodynamic interview (Taylor)	145
8.1	A 66-year-old woman with melancholia (Fink)	157
8.2	A professor of surgery describes his psychotic depression (Nuland)	158
8.3	A former medical school dean describes his depression (Rosenberg)	160
8.4	A 58-year-old woman with melancholia and catatonia misdiagnosed as having Alzheimer’s disease (Fink)	162

x	Patient vignettes	
8.5	A psychotically depressed mother who killed her five children (Ottosson and Fink)	164
8.6	A 16-year-old boy with melancholia unresponsive to medications and psychotherapy who responded to ECT (Fink)	168
8.7	A 17-year-old boy with manic delirium who responded to ECT (Fink)	168
8.8	An 8 1/2-year-old girl with melancholia and catatonia, unresponsive to medications, who responded to ECT (Cizadlo and Wheaton)	169
8.9	A 76-year-old melancholic man with a recent surgical repair of an aortic aneurysm who responded to ECT (Fink)	170
8.10	A 68-year-old man with Parkinson’s disease and depression who responded to ECT (Fink)	171
8.11	A woman with hypochondriasis (Roueché)	171
8.12	A woman with manic-depressive illness (Sienaert and Peuskens)	173
11.1	A man with a psychotic depression (Taylor)	223
12.1	A pregnant woman with a psychotic depression (Taylor)	240
12.2	A 78-year-old depressed woman; antidepressant medication-associated status epilepticus (Taylor)	253
12.3	A 26-year-old woman with recurrent depression not adequately evaluated (Taylor)	269

Preface

*O Lord, all my desire is before you;
From you my groaning is not hid.
My heart throbs; my strength forsakes me;
The very light of my eyes has failed me.
My friends and neighbors stand back
Because of my affliction;
My neighbors stand afar off.**Psalm 38*

At any point in time on this planet, almost two and a half times as many persons are depressed as are demented. Counting all variations on the theme, about 10% of men and 20% of women are at lifetime risk for experiencing a depressive illness. Based on numbers of persons affected, the World Health Organization estimates that depressive illnesses are the fourth highest cause of medical disability and premature death worldwide in years of illness, treatments required, lost productivity during episodes, and death rates.¹

Ten to 15% of depressed persons die by suicide. This rate translates into about one million persons annually, worldwide, and 30000–90000 persons annually in the USA. The first figure is the accepted count and the latter figure is estimated from analyses that acknowledge underreporting. In the USA, suicide is the 11th leading cause of death. Most persons over age 50 have known at least one individual who has committed suicide. Among depressed persons, sufferers of melancholia have the highest suicide rates.

Depressive illness is increasing in frequency among persons born closer to the present (a period effect), and first episodes are occurring at younger ages (a cohort effect). These trends result in more ill persons with more years of illness.

Of the persons who kill themselves annually in the USA, nearly 50% (15000–45000 individuals) seek help from a physician within the 3 weeks before they commit suicide – a sad sign of a public health failure because suicide is preventable. In treating depressed patients, psychiatrists meet *minimal* standards of care about 80% of the time, whereas generalist physicians, who see most sufferers of depression, meet the standards of care only 20% of the time. Although the mood is often recognized, a depressive illness is frequently interpreted as disappointment, bereavement, or

demoralization, and is ignored as the brain disease that it is. Although misfortune can precipitate a depressive episode, once the sequence of pathophysiologic events that become a depressive illness unfolds, the changes in brain functioning sustain the expression of the illness. Depressive illness is highly responsive to proper treatment, but more often than not, depressed persons are inadequately treated.

Many forms of depressive illness are recognized. The most prominent are identified as the mood disorders of major depression, dysthymia, bipolar depressive disorder, and depressive illnesses associated with a general medical condition. To this list are added specifiers of frequency (single or recurrent), severity, psychosis, catatonia, and pattern (typical or atypical). Other syndromes of depressive mood are found throughout the *Diagnostic and Statistical Manual* (DSM) classification system. This varied taxonomy lacks supporting psychopathological or pathophysiological evidence and, as a consequence, the taxonomy lacks validity. Reliable diagnosis, prognosis, selection of treatment, and outcomes for sufferers of depressive illness are often poor.² Decades of research, however, identify a central pathophysiology in the neuroendocrine system. This theme is *melancholia*, and identifying this syndrome clarifies diagnosis, prognosis, and treatment for more successful outcomes.

Melancholia is a severe disorder of mood, often fatal, that has been described for millennia in medical texts and by poets, novelists, and playwrights. Melancholia is definable by measurable signs and symptoms, characteristic neuroendocrine and neurophysiologic profiles, and its treatment-responsiveness to electroconvulsive therapy (ECT) and to pharmacodynamically broad-spectrum antidepressant drugs. Melancholia is often associated with stupor, catatonia, psychosis, suicide, and manic-depressive illness.³ Melancholia is a lifelong process with a genetic risk.

Early *International Classification of Diseases* (ICD) editions and DSM-I and DSM-II classifications identified melancholia, but these classification systems were not helpful in prescribing newly introduced treatments (e.g., insulin coma, psychosurgery, convulsive therapy) that were found to be effective in schizophrenia and then in manic-depressive illness. The efficacy of psychotropic drugs was also weakly correlated with heterogeneous DSM categories, discouraging the search for treatment response as a feature of classification. The DSM-III and subsequent classifications, introduced as operationally defined and more “scientific,” produced no better results. To achieve the approval of the largest segments of the diverse memberships of professional organizations, the DSM definition of mood disorder became overly broad and criteria for the diagnosis of major depression overly liberal. The “worried well” with characterological depressive moods were conflated with melancholia into the category of “major depression.” The neuroendocrine, neurophysiologic, and psychopathologic delineators of melancholia were confounded, and discarded as diagnostic and prognostic clinical laboratory aids. Under the DSM-III system, the dexamethasone suppression test (DST) identified melancholia in 50% or more of depressed patients, but rather than concluding that the other 50% represented different forms of distress, the DST was discarded as a measure of melancholia.⁴

In the decades after the introduction of DSM-III, intrusive actions of the pharmaceutical industry encouraged a weakening of criteria to justify the use of antidepressant

drugs in the largest number of persons. The safety and efficacy of the older, no longer patentable agents (tricyclic antidepressants, monoamine oxidase inhibitors, and lithium) were maligned through aggressive marketing that relied on unsound industry-sponsored comparison studies. Academic psychiatry went to the highest bidder.⁵

In response to weakened criteria and confusing classification, we reintroduce melancholia as the classic depressive illness with definable diagnostic criteria and effective treatment algorithms. We write this book for physicians and other health care professionals who treat severely ill depressed patients. It is intended to spur better modeling of disorders in psychiatric classification schemes.⁶ Our approach is that of the clinician-scientist, not the bench researcher, although we detail the biology of depressive illness and the evidence that it is a brain disease.

We set the historical stage and describe the remarkably consistent conceptual image of melancholia over millennia. We describe the disorder and review studies that systematically delineate melancholia, mirroring the historical record, and validating melancholia as a definable syndrome. Laboratory findings that support the melancholia syndrome and its variations (e.g., psychotic depression) are presented. We offer a systematic examination for the classic psychopathology of melancholia.

A variety of labels have splintered the melancholia concept. We show these to be variations of melancholia. We offer criteria on how to separate melancholia from depressive-like syndromes that have been inappropriately attached to it, and from other conditions in which apathy and psychomotor slowing are features. Suicide is a principal risk in melancholia, and we discuss the recognition of suicide and suicide prevention. Convulsive therapy is the syndrome's most effective treatment and we discuss how to maximize its effect. We detail medication management of patients suffering from melancholia. Newly proposed treatments are critiqued. We review the evidence that depressive illness is a lifelong process, discuss its pathophysiology, and offer the evidence that melancholia is an expression of brain dysfunction. Finally, we offer our conclusions that melancholia is a syndrome that warrants separate classification in the mood disorders category. We present prevention strategies, and how research needs to be refocused to provide a better understanding of melancholia.

We come to this book after decades of treating depressed patients, often those so severely ill that their deaths seemed imminent. One of us, (MAT) has been a career-long student of descriptive psychopathology in the nineteenth-century tradition, detailing the characteristics of patients with mania, depression, psychosis, and catatonia. He has been a teacher of neuropsychiatry for medical students, psychiatric residents, neurologists, and psychologists. He prescribes and administers ECT. The other (MF) has encouraged the development and administration of modern ECT, which is recognized as the most powerful antidepressant treatment. He has an extensive experience in clinical and experimental psychopharmacology, in the electrophysiology of psychoactive drugs, and in psychopathology.

Together, we have witnessed the birth and infancy of the psychopharmacology era and experienced its promises to treat patients with mood disorders better. We are

xiv Preface

concerned about the effects on psychiatric practice, education, and research, as well as on popular culture that we see in the unhealthy relationships between academia and the pharmaceutical industry. Despite the escalation of new agents, remission rates are lower than ever and “treatment resistance” is said to be common.⁷

We write this book, however, with optimism because we know that when physicians “get it right” – the diagnosis and treatment – depressed patients have a good response and many achieve remission of their symptoms and return to productive lives. There is nothing more elating in clinical psychiatry than to see an animated and cheerful person who only a few short weeks before was immobilized with indecision and overwhelmed by apprehension, gloom, and thoughts of death.

To understand melancholia is to understand depressive illness and the care of patients with mood disorder. If we improve this understanding, we will have achieved our goal.

NOTES

- 1 Murray and Lopez (1996); Uston *et al.* (2004).
- 2 At a 2003 presentation of brain metabolic abnormalities in depressive illness to a large group of depression researchers, the chairperson opened the session by stating that the present DSM depression taxonomy was inconsistent with clinical evidence and unhelpful in research and clinical practice. The audience agreed. (University of Michigan Depression Center symposium series: M.A. Taylor, personal observation.)
- 3 We prefer the classic term “manic-depressive illness” to that of “bipolar disorder.” It offers historical continuity and captures the essence of the disease better. Chapters 2 and 5 discuss manic-depressive disorder and its relationship to melancholia.
- 4 Chapter 4 provides a discussion of laboratory tests for melancholia.
- 5 Chapter 10 discusses industry influence on antidepressant treatment trials.
- 6 We have taken a similar approach in presenting the evidence for catatonia as a distinct syndrome (Fink and Taylor, 2003; Taylor and Fink, 2003).
- 7 Montes *et al.* (2004).

Acknowledgments

Documenting points of view is never easy, and gathering supporting citations is a daunting task. Toward that effort Georgette Pfeiffer tirelessly compiled and corrected our large list of citations. We are in her debt.

We are also grateful to Drs. Bernard Carroll and Edward Shorter who helped us understand the history of the melancholia concept and its pathophysiology.