For decades, policy-makers in government, development banks and foundations, NGOs, researchers and students have struggled with the problem of how to protect people who are displaced from their homes and livelihoods by development projects. This volume addresses these concerns and explores how debates often become deadlocked between ‘managerial’ and ‘movementist’ perspectives. Using development ethics to determine the rights and responsibilities of various stakeholders, the authors find that displaced people must be empowered so as to share equitably in benefits rather than being victimized. They propose a governance model for development projects that would transform conflict over displacement into a more manageable collective bargaining process and would empower displaced people to achieve equitable results. This volume will be valuable for readers in a wide range of fields including ethics, development studies, politics and international relations, as well as policy-making, project management and community development.

Peter Penz is Professor Emeritus in the Faculty of Environmental Studies and former Director of the Centre for Refugee Studies at York University, Canada. His publications include Consumer Sovereignty and Human Interests (1986) and Political Ecology: Global and Local (co-editor, 1998).

Jay Drydyk is Professor of Philosophy at Carleton University, President of the International Development Ethics Association, and Fellow of the Human Development and Capability Association. With Peter Penz he co-edited Global Justice, Global Democracy (1997).

Pablo S. Bose is Assistant Professor in the Department of Geography at the University of Vermont. He is currently undertaking a research project with community organizations and service providers on transportation, mobility and access issues for refugees resettled in North America, from the perspective of environmental justice.
DISPLACEMENT BY DEVELOPMENT

_Ethics, Rights and Responsibilities_

PETER PENZ,
JAY DRYDYK
AND
PABLO S. BOSE
To our families
Contents

List of tables page ix
Acknowledgements xi

1 Introduction 1

PART I  FUNDAMENTALS 15
2 Problems of polarization 17
3 Defining displacement for and by development 41

PART II  FROM COST–BENEFIT ANALYSIS TO ETHICS 59
4 Cost–benefit analysis and compensation 63
5 Guidelines and rights 84
6 The development ethics framework 116

PART III  FROM VALUES TO RESPONSIBILITIES 153
7 Ethical outcomes 157
8 Ethical procedures 187
9 From rights to responsibilities 210
10 International responsibilities and rights regarding displacement 243
Contents

PART IV  REALIZING RESPONSIBILITIES  261

11  Narmada revisited  263

12  Starting points and future directions  288

Bibliography  305

Index  327
Tables

Table 1.1 Central concepts
Table 3.1 Forms of displacement by development
Table 3.2 Modes of direct displacement for development (or resettlement)
Table 3.3 Modes of indirect displacement by development (or resettlement)
Table 3.4 Forms of harm that can result from displacement
Table 9.1 Rights regarding displacement for development
Table 9.2 Some responsibilities that need to be exercised, in order to realize the four rights
Table 9.3 Types of agency relevant to displacement for development
Table 9.4 Procedural rights and the agents with corresponding responsibilities
Table 10.1 International rights of displaced and other project-affected people and the international agents with corresponding responsibilities
Acknowledgements

This book is the culmination of two team projects jointly entitled ‘Ethics of Development-Induced Displacement’ centred at York University in Canada and headed by Peter Penz, with a partner team at Jawaharlal Nehru University (JNU) in New Delhi and Jay Drydyk at Carleton University in Ottawa. Pablo S. Bose was Project Coordinator at York University until he took a position at the University of Vermont. One project received substantial funding from the Social Sciences and Humanities Research Council of Canada. The other project was funded by the Shastri Indo-Canadian Institute (with funding from the Canadian International Development Agency) and focused on displacement by development in India and, to a more limited extent, in Canada.

At a crucial moment Michael Cernea, previously with the World Bank and a leading authority in the field, was instrumental in persuading Peter Penz to persist in pursuing funding for the project and was also subsequently supportive. Mention also needs to be made of crucial help in meeting the deadline for the proposal to the Shastri Institute in New Delhi. Atiya Kidwai’s son was crucial in providing technical and logical assistance under high pressure and in subsequent complicated troubleshooting, when his dog had eaten an airline ticket for Peter Penz.

The York team members were crucial to the overall development of the project. Two of them, Peter Vandergeest (sociology) and Pablo Idahosa (African studies), together with the then Project Coordinator, Pablo S. Bose, took charge of and edited the volume of cases (Development’s Displacements: Ecologies, Economies, and Cultures at Risk, UBC Press, 2006), based on research produced by graduate researchers at York University at the time, who have since gone on to take faculty positions at various universities and positions at other organizations. Another team member, Shubhra Gururani (anthropology), raised the issue of displacement by development neglect, in relation to her study of people forced to move from the north of India into slums in New Delhi. Two team members, Darryl Reed (social science) and
Wesley Cragg (philosophy), had other projects for which they had responsibilities as leaders, but were very helpful in early discussions about the direction and structure of the project. Pablo S. Bose (environmental studies), as coordinator of the project in its latter stages, was pivotal. The York component of the project was initially housed in the Faculty of Environmental Studies, but was soon transferred to the Centre for Refugee Studies, when Peter Penz became its Director. At Carleton University, it was based in the Department of Philosophy, where Jay Drydyk became Chair. The work of graduate researcher Ron Elliott in that department should be mentioned in particular; it forms the initial basis for what Drydyk developed as Chapter 5 in this volume.

The project team at JNU in India consisted of Atiya Habeeb Kidwai (urban and regional planning); Kusum Chopra (economics); and M. H. Qureshi (geography). A number of studies were carried out by them and their graduate researchers, ranging from displacement by the development of new towns and ports, to displacement in relation to bonded labour. Discussions with those project colleagues, as well as these studies, have shaped the present volume.

After the project was launched, former Prime Minister of India I. K. Gujral not only agreed to give the keynote address at an important project workshop in New Delhi, but also challenged us to take seriously that the issue involves a genuine dilemma for policy-makers. With respect to this volume in particular, Clive Southey, an economist at Guelph University in Canada, brought to our attention the importance of focusing on cost–benefit analysis and wrote a draft of a chapter. Although in the end a different orientation was adopted for that chapter to fit the general approach of the volume, his intervention was critical to its shape.

Our initial thinking about rights and duties benefited from critical discussion at conferences of the Canadian Society for the Study of Practical Ethics (CSSPE) and the International Development Ethics Association in 2002.

The development ethics framework that provides a normative foundation for our approach was developed beginning in 2005 by Jay Drydyk, aided by a sabbatical research grant and travel funding from Carleton University. He benefited from detailed discussion of Chapter 6 by David Crocker. In applying this framework to the ethical dilemmas of displacement by and for development, he received helpful feedback from Des Gasper and others attending the 2005 Conference of the Human Development and Capability Association, in addition to participants in the 2005 annual meeting of the Canadian Society for the Study of Practical
Ethics. His work on the disempowering accountability flaws in the Jamuna Bridge case (Chapter 8) was aided by David Crocker, A. B. Rukooko and others at a 2006 Conference of the International Development Ethics Association at Makerere University, Uganda.

The chapters on Narmada and movementist perspectives on displacement were aided by constructive discussions with John R. Wood (political science) at the University of British Columbia and Ali Sauer (environmental studies) at York University.

One or other of us has also had constructive discussions with Tony Oliver-Smith, Chris de Wet, Chris McDowell, Michael Cernea, Sam Pillai, Medha Patkar, Sheila Gruner, Sharlene Mollett and David Szablowski on issues of development and displacement. We are extremely grateful for their feedback and contributions.