# International Security in Practice

How do once bitter enemies move beyond entrenched rivalry at the diplomatic level? In one of the first attempts to apply practice theory to the study of International Relations, Vincent Pouliot builds on Pierre Bourdieu's sociology to devise a theory of practice of security communities and applies it to post-Cold War security relations between NATO and Russia. Based on dozens of interviews and a thorough analysis of recent history, Pouliot demonstrates that diplomacy has become a normal, though not a self-evident, practice between the two former enemies. He argues that this limited pacification is due to the intense symbolic power struggles that have plagued the relationship ever since NATO began its process of enlargement at the geographical and functional levels. So long as Russia and NATO do not cast each other in the roles that they actually play together, security community development is bound to remain limited.

VINCENT POULIOT is Assistant Professor in the Department of Political Science at McGill University. His PhD, on which this book is based, was awarded the 2009 Vincent Lemieux Prize by the Canadian Political Science Association. Cambridge University Press 978-0-521-12203-0 - International Security in Practice: The Politics of NATO-Russia Diplomacy Vincent Pouliot Frontmatter <u>More information</u>

Cambridge Studies in International Relations: 113

International Security in Practice

EDITORS Christian Reus-Smit Nicholas J. Wheeler

EDITORIAL BOARD James Der Derian, Martha Finnemore, Lene Hansen, Robert Keohane, Rachel Kerr, Colin McInnes, Jan Aart Scholte, Peter Vale, Kees Van Der Pijl, Jutta Weldes, Jennifer Welsh, William Wohlforth

*Cambridge Studies in International Relations* is a joint initiative of Cambridge University Press and the British International Studies Association (BISA). The series will include a wide range of material, from undergraduate textbooks and surveys to research-based monographs and collaborative volumes. The aim of the series is to publish the best new scholarship in International Studies from Europe, North America and the rest of the world.

| Cambridge University Press  |
|---|
| 978-0-521-12203-0 - International Security in Practice: The Politics of NATO-Russia Diplomacy |
| Vincent Pouliot   |
| Frontmatter   |
| More information  |
|   |

Cambridge Studies in International Relations

- 112 Columba Peoples Justifying ballistic missile defence Technology, security and culture
- 111 Paul Sharp Diplomatic theory of international relations
- 110 John A. Vasquez The war puzzle revisited
- 109 Rodney Brucea Hll Central banking as global governance Constructing Financial Credibility
- 108 Milja Kurki
   Causation in international relations
   Reclaiming causal analysis
- 107 Richard M. Price Moral limit and possibility in world politics
- 106 Emma Haddad The refugee in international society Between sovereigns
- 105 Ken Booth Theory of world security
- 104 Benjamin MillerStates, nations and the great powersThe sources of regional war and peace
- 103 Beate Jahn (ed.) Classical theory in international relations
- 102 Andrew Linklater and Hidemi Suganami
   The English School of international relations
   A contemporary reassessment
   Series list continues after index

Cambridge University Press 978-0-521-12203-0 - International Security in Practice: The Politics of NATO-Russia Diplomacy Vincent Pouliot Frontmatter More information

# International Security in Practice

The Politics of NATO-Russia Diplomacy

VINCENT POULIOT



| Cambridge University Press  |
|---|
| 978-0-521-12203-0 - International Security in Practice: The Politics of NATO-Russia Diplomacy |
| Vincent Pouliot   |
| Frontmatter   |
| More information  |
|   |

CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY PRESS Cambridge, New York, Melbourne, Madrid, Cape Town, Singapore, São Paulo, Delhi, Dubai, Tokyo

Cambridge University Press The Edinburgh Building, Cambridge CB2 8RU, UK

Published in the United States of America by Cambridge University Press, New York

www.cambridge.org Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9780521122030

© Vincent Pouliot 2010

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2010

Printed in the United Kingdom at the University Press, Cambridge

A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library

Library of Congress Cataloguing in Publication data

Pouliot, Vincent, 1979– International security in practice : the politics of NATO–Russia diplomacy / Vincent Pouliot.
p. cm. – (Cambridge studies in international relations ; 113)
ISBN 978-0-521-19916-2 (hardback)
1. Security, International. 2. North Atlantic Treaty Organization–Russia (Federation) 3. Russia (Federation)–Foreign relations. I. Title. II. Series. JZ5930.P68 2010 327.4701821–dc22 2009043235

ISBN 978-0-521-19916-2 Hardback ISBN 978-0-521-12203-0 Paperback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this publication, and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate. Cambridge University Press 978-0-521-12203-0 - International Security in Practice: The Politics of NATO-Russia Diplomacy Vincent Pouliot Frontmatter More information

> Diplomacy is letting someone else have your way. Lester B. Pearson, Nobel Peace Prize (1957)

| Cambridge University Press  |
|---|
| 978-0-521-12203-0 - International Security in Practice: The Politics of NATO-Russia Diplomacy |
| Vincent Pouliot   |
| Frontmatter   |
| More information  |
|   |

#### Contents

| Li            | st of figures and tables  | page x     |
|---------------|---|------------|
| Pr            | eface   | xi         |
| Abbreviations |   |            |
| 1             | Introduction  | 1          |
| Pa            | rt I: Restoring the practical logic of peace                            | 9          |
| 2             | The logic of practicality: a theory of practice of security communities | 11         |
| 3             | A "sobjective" methodology for the study of practicality                | 52         |
| Pa            | rt II: The symbolic power politics of NATO–Russia diplomacy             | 93         |
| 4             | The logic of practicality at the NATO-Russia Council                    | 95         |
| 5             | The early steps: NATO, Russia and the double enlargement, 1992–1997     | 148        |
| 6             | The fallout: NATO and Russia from Kosovo to Georgia, 1998–2008          | 194        |
| 7             | Conclusion  | 231        |
|               | bliography<br>dex   | 251<br>275 |
| 110           |   | 275        |

### Figures and tables

| Figure 2.1 | Diplomacy in interstate relations  | 43  |
|------------|--|-----|
| Table 2.1  | Constructivist interpretations of the logic of appropriateness             | 19  |
| Table 2.2  | Two ways of knowing in psychological theory                                | 25  |
| Table 2.3  | Two ideal types of knowledge   | 29  |
| Table 4.1  | Three indicators of the embodiment of diplomacy                            | 96  |
| Table 7.1  | Evolving (mis)match of positions and dispositions in NATO–Russia relations | 236 |
| Table 7.2  | Practice theory and IR theories  | 249 |

#### Preface

I have long been convinced that the practice of diplomacy is just as necessary to International Relations (IR) theory as the latter is to the former. While I am far from the first to put forward such an argument, in this book I try to substantiate it with a new perspective on international politics largely inspired by Pierre Bourdieu's sociology. As powerful as theory may be to explain the origins and structure of contemporary practices, abstract models and concepts generally are unable, in and of themselves, to account for the practical logics that make everyday action possible and meaningful. Hence my recourse to *practice theory*, an oxymoron that aptly captures the particular bent of this book.

One generation after the end of the Cold War, continuing tensions in security relations between the North Atlantic Treaty Organization (NATO) and Russia constitute something of a tragedy in international politics. Despite some progress, both sides have missed a rare opportunity to genuinely pacify and finally move beyond self-fulfilling security dilemmas. Things obviously did not have to go that way; if this book can help explain what went wrong and why in the post-Cold War Russian-Atlantic relationship, it will have achieved more than I can hope. In a pragmatic spirit, my analysis starts with the world as its actors have (erratically) shaped it. I am not normatively attached to current forms of interstate diplomacy and I do hope that better alternatives are in the making. In the meantime, however, I believe that IR scholarship should try to illuminate, in a rigorous and thorough fashion, the political and social dynamics that too often produce self-defeating outcomes on the international stage. The task I set myself in this book is thus primarily analytical. Its critical implications are in showing, first, how things could have been otherwise in NATO-Russia diplomacy and, second, what prevented both sides from taking a direction more favorable to peace.

#### CAMBRIDGE

Cambridge University Press 978-0-521-12203-0 - International Security in Practice: The Politics of NATO-Russia Diplomacy Vincent Pouliot Frontmatter <u>More information</u>

xii

Preface

An impressive number of people have helped with the completion of this book. It started as a PhD dissertation at the University of Toronto, where I was blessed with the mentorship, supervision and now friendship of Emanuel Adler. Emanuel will have a deep and lasting influence on my thinking and I learned a great deal from his constant stimulation and intellectual exchange. As well as being a first-rate mind, he is also a very kind and supportive human being who will inspire my own professorship for long years to come. I am also grateful to David Welch and Stefano Guzzini, the other two dissertation committee members, who provided very useful advice along the way.

During my PhD years and later, a number of scholars were kind enough to read my works and comment on them extensively, demonstrating in and through practice that debate and critique are the real engines of social scientific refinement. Among them I am especially indebted to Alexander Wendt, who generously encouraged me and shared his thoughts with me on my theoretical works very early on; to Michael Williams, who was a tremendous source of intellectual and personal inspiration in using Bourdieu in the study of international security; as well as to Iver Neumann, who enthusiastically communicated his passion for social theory and Russian politics at a later stage of writing. Other members of the academic community who generously helped along the way include, with apologies to those inadvertently omitted: Amar Athwal, Steven Bernstein, Janice Bially Mattern, Christian Büger, Jeffrey Checkel, James Der Derian, Raymond Duvall, Henry Farrell, Karin Fierke, William Flanik, Frank Gadinger, Catherine Goetze, Patricia Greve, Lene Hansen, Matthew Hoffman, Ted Hopf, Jef Huysmans, Patrick Jackson, Markus Kornprobst, Érick Lachapelle, Niels Lachmann, Anna Leander, Halvard Leira (and other NUPI staff), Catherine Lu, Gale Mattox, Frédéric Mérand, Jennifer Mitzen, Daniel Nexon, T. V. Paul, Liliana Pop, Edward Schatz, William Schlickenmaier, Nisha Shah, Ole Jacob Sending, Jean-Philippe Thérien, Trine Villumsen, Antje Wiener and Ruben Zaiotti. Many thanks to each of them for their valued contribution to my thinking.

John Haslam, Carrie Parkinson and the rest of the team at Cambridge University Press provided timely guidance in the final stages of production. I am also grateful to my research assistants Virginia DiGaetano and Séverine Koen, who not only helped with copyediting but also pushed me to clarify important parts of my argument. In addition, Cambridge University Press 978-0-521-12203-0 - International Security in Practice: The Politics of NATO-Russia Diplomacy Vincent Pouliot Frontmatter More information

#### Preface

xiii

I want to thank the editors and publishers of the Journal of Peace Research (Sage), International Organization (Cambridge University Press) and International Studies Quarterly (Wiley Blackwell) for allowing me to reuse and build upon already published materials. Chapter 1 contains a summary of my "Pacification Without Collective Identification: Russia and the Transatlantic Security Community in the Post-Cold War Era," Journal of Peace Research 44(5): 603–20; Chapter 2 is a revised and expanded version of "The Logic of Practicality: A Theory of Practice of Security Communities," International Organization 62(2): 257–88; and Chapter 3 draws on and further develops "Sobjectivism': Toward a Constructivist Methodology," International Studies Quarterly 51(2): 359–84.

A number of institutions provided invaluable practical support, in particular by making possible the many trips abroad that my methodology required. Many thanks to the Trudeau Foundation (including Lloyd Axworthy), the Social Sciences and Humanities Research Council of Canada (SSHRC), the Fonds québécois pour la recherche sur la société et la culture (FQRSC) and the University of Toronto's School of Graduate Studies, Centre for International Studies and Department of Political Science. I also want to thank Jocelyne Mathieu and Tanya Mogilevskaya who helped organize my stay in Moscow through the Université Laval's Centre Moscou–Québec. I finally want to acknowledge my many interviewees who spared some of their precious time to meet with me and made the whole project much more interesting.

My deepest debt of gratitude goes to my partner Magdaline Boutros, who staunchly stayed on my side throughout the PhD's hardships and beyond. I discussed many of the ideas below with her first, and she turned out to be at once my toughest critic and my strongest supporter. My most sincere thanks for all the happiness – past, present and future.

I dedicate the book to my parents, Lorraine and Claude, whose delicate care and stimulating upbringing lie behind much of what follows.

| Cambridge University Press  |
|---|
| 978-0-521-12203-0 - International Security in Practice: The Politics of NATO-Russia Diplomacy |
| Vincent Pouliot   |
| Frontmatter   |
| More information  |
|   |

## Abbreviations

| ABM    | Anti-Ballistic Missile (treaty)           |
|--------|---|
| BBC    | British Broadcasting Corporation          |
| CFE    | Conventional Forces in Europe (treaty)    |
| CIS    | Commonwealth of Independent States        |
| CSCE   | Conference on Security and Cooperation in |
|        | Europe                                    |
| CSTO   | Collective Security Treaty Organization   |
| EAPC   | Euro-Atlantic Partnership Council         |
| EU     | European Union                            |
| G8     | Group of Eight                            |
| IFOR   | Implementation Force                      |
| IR     | International Relations                   |
| ISAF   | International Security Assistance Force   |
| KFOR   | Kosovo Force                              |
| NAC    | North Atlantic Council                    |
| NACC   | North Atlantic Cooperation Council        |
| NATO   | North Atlantic Treaty Organization        |
| NRC    | NATO-Russia Council                       |
| OSCE   | Organization for Security and Cooperation |
|        | in Europe                                 |
| PfP    | Partnership for Peace                     |
| РЈС    | Permanent Joint Council                   |
| SACEUR | Supreme Allied Commander Europe           |
| SCO    | Shanghai Cooperation Organization         |
| SFOR   | Stabilization Force                       |
| SHAPE  | Supreme Headquarters Allied Powers        |
|        | Europe                                    |
| SORT   | Strategic Offensive Reductions Treaty     |
| START  | Strategic Arms Reductions Treaty          |
| UN     | United Nations                            |
|        |   |

. \_ .....

xiv

| Cambridge University Press  |
|---|
| 978-0-521-12203-0 - International Security in Practice: The Politics of NATO-Russia Diplomacy |
| Vincent Pouliot   |
| Frontmatter   |
| More information  |
|   |

Abbreviations

xv

| UNPROFOR | United Nations Protection Force     |
|----------|-------------------------------------|
| US       | United States of America            |
| USSR     | Union of Soviet Socialist Republics |
| WTO      | World Trade Organization            |
|          |                                     |